

Transferring a deep learning model to map sediment and ecological properties based on satellite images from the Wadden Sea to Oman

> Maaike Breedveld 6511651

> > MSc Thesis February 2024

Supervisors: Elisabeth Addink, Wiebe Nijland, and Logambal Madhuanand

# Contents

Ał	bstract:	3
1.	. Introduction	
2.	. Background	6
	2.1 Deep learning models	
	2.1.1 Structure of Convolutional Neural Networks (CNNs)	
	2.1.2 Autoencoders	
	2.2 Deep learning method for tidal flats	
	2.2.1 Autoencoder model	7
	2.2.2 Feature extraction	7
3.	. Data & Methods	
	3.1 Study area	
	3.1.1 Geomorphology & hydrodynamics	
	3.1.2 Ecology	11
	3.1.3 Compared to the Wadden Sea	11
	3.2 Data collection	11
	3.2.1 Field data	11
	3.2.2 Satellite images	14
	3.3 Preprocessing field data	14
	3.3.1 SLC failure data gaps	15
	3.3.2. Masking	
	3.4 Models	16
	3.4.1 Training model	16
	3.4.2 Feature generation	
	3.4.3 Random Forest (RF) model	
	3.5 Scenarios	17
	3.5.1. No change	
	3.5.2. Finetuning	
	3.5.3. Freezing	18
	3.5.4. From scratch 64	18
	3.5.5. From scratch 32	
	3.5.6. Sentinel	18
	3.5.7 No change 2015	18
4.	. Results	19
	4.1 Field data	
	4.2 Gap filling & image selection	21

7.	References	32
6.	Conclusion	32
	5.5 Challenges and potential improvements	31
	5.4. Generalization	31
	5.3 Comparing to performance in the Wadden Sea	30
	5.2 Landsat versus Sentinel	30
	5.1 Performance of transfer learning techniques	29
5.	Discussion	29
	4.6 Cross-validation accuracy Sentinel 2	29
	4.5.2 Cross-validation accuracy of the different scenarios	28
	4.5.1 Cross-validation accuracy of the environmental variables	25
	4.5 Cross-validation accuracy Landsat 7	25
	4.4 Features	25
	4.3 Training	24

#### Abstract:

Worldwide tidal flats fulfil important ecological and economical roles. However, they are under increasingly high pressure. For effective management consistent monitoring of sedimentary and ecological variables is needed. To overcome the limitations of field sampling and traditional satellite image-based methods, a new deep learning-based method was proposed by Madhuanand et al. (2023) to predict sediment and ecological properties of tidal flats based on satellite images. This method uses a ResNet50-based deep learning model to generate features that are used as additional information on top of the original image for a random forest model to predict environmental variables. While satisfactory results were reached for the Wadden Sea it was unknown how well this method would be able to generalize to other tidal flat regions. Here the predictive performance of the method was tested for the tidal flats in Bar Al Hikman, Oman, using Landsat 7 and Sentinel 2 images and different transfer learning techniques. The tested scenarios include literal transfer without finetuning, finetuning, finetuning after freezing, and training from scratch. The prediction accuracy was evaluated for the median grain size, silt content, complete biomass, complete species richness, crab biomass, and crab species richness. It was found that the predictive accuracy of the model was much lower compared to the original accuracy achieved for the Wadden Sea. Similar to for the Wadden Sea the sediment properties had the highest cross-validation accuracy from the tested variables while the accuracy for species richness was low. The scenario using the pre-trained model without any additional training reached the highest cross-validation accuracy. A closer inspection of the results suggested that random forest predictions are sensitive to multi-year data and temporally separated field and imagery data. The remnants of data gaps from the SLC error of the Landsat 7 images were present in the generated features and could thus also have contributed to the low prediction accuracies. Therefore, when using this method focus should be on using satellite images without data gaps, using temporally closely matching field and satellite data, and predicting only one year at a time for the random forest model.

#### 1. Introduction

Tidal flats are characterized by a high biodiversity and productivity and play an important ecological and economic role in many regions. The shallow waters make the tidal flats important nurseries for fish, crabs, and shrimps (Reise, 2012), and provide important foraging areas for waterbirds (Bom et al., 2018). The food and habitat provided are also of economic value by sustaining fisheries (Burt, 2014; Dissanayake et al., 2018). These fisheries are important for both the local population and the export. An example are the crabs in Oman which are valuable seafood items for both the domestic market and the export (Hehanna et al., 2013). Overall, the yearly global value of the services provided by intertidal mudflats is estimated to be around US\$ 5.2 · 10<sup>12</sup> 2007\$ (Dissanayake et al., 2018; Costanza et al., 2013). However, worldwide tidal flats are under pressure caused by coastal development, sea-level rise, coastal erosion, reduced sediment fluxes, subsidence, eutrophication, non-nutrient pollutants, and overfishing (Lever at al., 2001; Murray et al., 2019). This causes changes in biodiversity and species richness in many coastal environments (Lever et al., 2001).

Consistent monitoring of sedimentary and ecological variables is important for effective management of these regions (Miloslavich et al., 2018). Due to the nature of tidal flats, sampling can be challenging. If possible, it is often time-consuming and expensive. In recent years satellite images have been used for monitoring due to their ability to cover large areas at a time and reach hard-toreach locations. While satellite images have a low resolution, they can still give information about sediment and ecological characteristics on the ground by using their relation to large-scale geomorphological structures and spectral information.

Tidal flats have a diverse geomorphology with a combination of channels and flats. Sediment and ecological properties can be linked to these geomorphological structures. Sediment properties are related to the energy conditions of the environment. At locations with higher flow velocities like large deep channels courser grained sandy sediments are often present, while the less energetic shallow flats contain more muddy sediment. Previous research has shown that sediment characteristics can be linked to the tidal channel distribution and intertidal DEM (Choi et al., 2011). The spatial distribution of macrobenthos is also closely related to environmental variables like surface elevation (Lee et al., 2013), sediment characteristics (Compton et al., 2013; Yoo et al., 2007), and temperature (Koo et al., 2005, 2007). Van der Wal et al. (2008) found for example that in their study area in the Netherlands the total macrobenthos biomass could be partly explained by the median grain size, mud content, and elevation. The temperature on tidal flats can be influenced by exposure time and water content in the sediment (Koo et al., 2007). Characteristics like moisture content and the presence of channels or flats can be taken from satellite imagery.

The uniform spectral nature of tidal flats however makes traditional spectral analysis challenging. Deep learning methods have been shown to be able to learn to extract complex structures and information from satellite images (Willcock et al., 2018). Therefore, deep learning models have been used increasingly for complex analysis tasks. One such deep learning-based method was developed by Madhuanand et al. (2023) to predict sediment and ecological properties from satellite images for the tidal flats in the Wadden Sea. Using a relatively low demanding method they reached satisfactory results. If their method would be able to generalize for other intertidal mudflats this could elevate the need for extensive field sampling and aid effective management.

There are however two main restrictions that can limit the use of deep learning models (Iman et al., 2023). Firstly, successful training of a deep learning model requires an extensive training dataset of at least thousands to tens of thousands of training images. Obtaining the required amount of data can be time-consuming or even impossible (Zhuang et al., 2020). By using a related existing dataset to initialize the model this training cost can be reduced. Secondly, the training of a deep learning model takes extensive time and process power. Deep transfer learning (DTL) was developed to help alleviate these restrictions and improve the performance of deep neural networks (Iman et al., 2023).

The concept of transfer learning in neural networks was first introduced in the 1990s by Lorien Pratt with the goal of improving the learning speed of neural networks (Pratt, 1993). It is inspired by the way humans learn new tasks by building on their previous experiences. It builds on concepts from psychology, neurobiology, and symbolic machine learning (Pratt, 1933). Similar to how synapses in the brain come pre-wired, the idea behind transfer learning is to use initialized weights from a network pre-trained on a source dataset as an improved starting point for training compared to randomly initialized weights. Intuitively, successful learning requires some connection between the two learning activities, in other words, the source and target domains should be linked by a higher-level common domain (Zhuang et al., 2020; Weiss et al., 2016).

Many transfer learning methods make use of the fact that different layers in convolutional neural networks (CNNs) learn features with different degrees of generalization (Yosinski et al., 2014; Neyshabur et al., 2020). The shallower parts of the network deal with more general features (e.g. edge detection, colour blobs) and are similar for most CNNs trained on images (Yosinski et al., 2014). Deeper into the network the learned features become more dataset-specific. For transfer deep learning the focus is generally on these general features which are applicable for both the source and target dataset. Multiple studies show that models pre-trained on a source dataset can effectively be used to improve training on a different target dataset (Iman et al., 2023). Most works utilize the CNN activations from the fully connected layers while using features from convolutional layers has received limited attention (Hu et al., 2015).

DTL is applied in a large variety of situations with a large variety of approaches. There are different ways to categorize DTL based on the homogeneity of the source and target data, the label-setting aspects, or the applied approaches (Iman et al., 2023). Based on the used approach DTL can be divided into four categories: instance-based, feature-/mapping-based, parameter-/network-/model-based, or relational-/adversarial-based (Pan and Yang, 2010; Tan et al., 2018). The most used approaches within DTL are model-based approaches (Iman et al., 2023). Model-based approaches focus on adjusting the network and include pretraining, freezing, finetuning, and adding fresh layers. These methods can be applied on their own but are usually combined (Iman et al., 2023). The easiest way to transfer information is literal weight transfer where the weights of the pre-trained model are transferred and used for the new task. This does not allow the model to learn any new information within the target dataset. Therefore, this is often combined by methods that require the model to also train on the target dataset like finetuning, freezing, and/or adding new layers to the model (Iman et al., 2023).

There are some complications that might occur when transferring a deep learning model. One of these problems is negative transfer (Zhuang et al., 2020). This happens when the source and target dataset or task are too dissimilar and transferring reduces the performance of the model. Another problem is catastrophic forgetting (Iman et al., 2023). This refers to the loss of learned skills by a trained model after further training on a target dataset. Freezing the lower-level layers of a transferred model or only training newly added layers should reduce the risk of catastrophic forgetting (Iman et al., 2023). Indeed, previous research pointed out that models sometimes perform less when applied to a different geographical or temporal setting (Tong et al., 2021).

The aim of this study is to transfer the deep learning method developed by Madhuanand et al. (2023) to Bar Al Hikman, Oman, to test if this method can be generalized and applied to a different geographic region. To answer this question the cross-validation accuracy of the median grain size, silt content, complete biomass, complete species richness, crab biomass, and crab species richness was evaluated and compared for several scenarios. Scenarios include training from scratch and the transfer learning methods of literal transfer, finetuning, and freezing. These scenarios will be tested on Landsat 7 images which match the temporal range of this study and on a Sentinel 2 image for which the method was developed but which does not match the temporal range. To answer the main question the following sub-questions will be answered:

- How can the scan line error of the Landsat 7 images be resolved?
- What is the cross-validation accuracy of each learning technique for the sediment and ecological variables using Landsat 7 images?
- What is the cross-validation accuracy of each learning technique for the sediment and ecological variables using a Sentinel 2 image?

## 2. Background

# 2.1 Deep learning models

Deep learning models have become increasingly popular because of their ability to describe complex relationships with non-linear data. In particular, convolutional neural networks (CNNs) have become popular for performing tasks like image classification and segmentation (Iman et al., 2021; Pires de Lima & Marfurt, 2019; Hu et al., 2015).

# 2.1.1 Structure of Convolutional Neural Networks (CNNs)

A convolutional neural network is a type of deep neural network that contains at least one convolutional layer (Ketkar & Moolayil, 2021). A convolutional layer uses a mathematical operation called a convolution which convolves the input image or feature map with a kernel or filter. The output of this convolution is a new feature map. The kernel can have different sizes and has weights and biases associated with it. These weights and biases are optimized during the training of the network. CNNs also typically contain pooling layers. These are layers that reduce the spatial dimensions of the feature maps while maintaining the main important structures. This downsampling reduces the dependence on the location of features and reduces overfitting (Goodfellow et al., 2016). Most commonly max pooling is used which takes the maximum value within a chosen local window to produce the downscaled output map. Several convolutional and pooling layers are often followed by one or several fully connected layers at the end of the model.

CNNs and other deep learning models learn by backpropagation. By evaluating a cost or loss function the model evaluates how well the output corresponds to the desired output. During training the objective of the model is to minimize this cost function and find the global, or in practice often local, minimum in the loss landscape. One of the most well-known methods to achieve this is the gradient descent (Rumelhart et al., 1986). It calculates the partial derivative of the total error with respect to each weight in the network for each input-output combination. It then accumulates the partial derivatives of all these input-output combinations to update the weights proportionally. As this method evaluates all training data before taking one step down the loss domain this method is computationally expensive. Therefore, many models now use the stochastic gradient descent (SGD). It works similarly to the gradient descent, but it is done for a random sample of the training data called a batch. This speeds the model up while keeping the accuracy similar.

An important variable that determines the performance of the deep learning model is the learning rate. The learning rate determines the step size of the gradient descent. If the learning rate is too high the gradient descent can overshoot the local minimum resulting in a model that fails to converge (LeCun et al., 1998). On the other hand, if the learning rate is too small training will take a long time. As a result, it is important to choose an appropriate learning rate for a given task. An often-applied method uses a dynamic learning rate that adapts to the stage of learning. The models often start with a higher learning rate to quickly approach a local minimum. When this local minimum is approached the learning rate is reduced to prevent overshooting and help the model converge.

## 2.1.2 Autoencoders

An autoencoder is a specific type of neural network that is useful for learning representations of the data without supervision (Bank et al., 2023). As a special type of encoder/decoder architecture it consists of an encoder, which compresses the input through encoded layers, and a decoder, which up-samples the encoded layers again to create an output. Autoencoders learn to reconstruct the input images. By trying to minimize the difference between the input and the output images they

learn key features that contain spatial and textural information describing the input image. These features containing spatial and textural information can then be used as additional information next to the spectral data for predicting environmental and ecological variables from the satellite images (Madhuanand et al., 2023).

## 2.2 Deep learning method for tidal flats

Madhuanand et al. (2023) developed a deep learning method to predict sediment and ecological properties from satellite images in the Wadden Sea. They used an autoencoder model to generate features from Sentinel 2 images which could be used as additional information to train a random forest model. In the following part their method will be described in more detail.

# 2.2.1 Autoencoder model

To learn representative features of the input data a regularized version of the autoencoder called the variational autoencoder (VAE) was used. The backpropagated loss is calculated as a combination of the reconstruction and regularization loss as in the equation below.

$$L = \lambda_1 L_m + \lambda_2 L_k$$

Where  $L_1$  is the reconstruction loss,  $L_2$  is the regularization loss, and  $\lambda_1$  and  $\lambda_2$  are weights. The reconstruction loss is derived from the mean squared error (MSE). It tries to optimize the model by minimizing the differences between pixels in the reconstructed image and the input. The regularization loss is calculated from the divergence loss which tries to keep the learned distributions close to a standard distribution. The two losses were combined with a weight. The optimal performing weights determining the relative contribution of the reconstruction and regularization loss to the total backpropagated loss were determined by Madhuanand et al. (2023) to be 1 and 0.001 respectively with the reconstruction loss thus having a higher weight.

The used VAE uses the ResNet-50 structure. ResNet-50 is a residual neural network. These types of neural networks contain skip connections that bypass layers in the model. These skip connections are implemented to increase the performance of very deep neural networks (He et al., 2016). They are used to extract both low-level and high-level features (Madhuanand et al., 2023). The structure of the model can be seen in Figure 1. The ResNet-50 model contains 49 convolutional layers and one fully connected layer. It also contains 2 pooling layers, one max pooling after the first convolutional layer and one average pooling before the fully connected layer. After the patches move through this encoder it moves through several up-sampling layers. These up-sampling layers used rectified linear unit (ReLU) activation to introduce non-linearity (Madhuanand et al., 2023).

# 2.2.2 Feature extraction

Each of the blocks in the encoder contains features that describe the input patches. When moving through the encoder the number of features increases while their dimensions decrease. The first layer containing 64 features of 32x32 pixels each was selected to be used to generate the features for the random forest model and is up-sampled through bilinear interpolation. This layer was chosen to minimize uncertainties introduced by up-sampling and to keep the number of features low to prevent increasing computational demands. To reduce the border effect when the features are up-sampled, the patches are created with an overlap of 30%.



Figure 1 Structure of the ResNet-50 architecture.

## 2.2.3 Random forest model

The prediction of the variable of interest is done using a random forest regression model. The method was chosen because it had proven to be able to fit models with many input variables even with non-linearity or collinearity. To tune the random forest using cross-validation the data is split into a training dataset (90%) and a validation dataset (10%). A k-fold cross-validation was implemented to optimize the number of observations when fitting the trees. They specifically used a 10-fold cross-validation which was repeated three times to reduce variance in the model performance.

# 3. Data & Methods

In the section the used methods will be described. This section will start with a description of the study area (section 3.1). This is followed by a description of the data collection (section 3.2) and preprocessing steps (section 3.3). After this, the used models and used parameters are discussed (section 3.4. Finally, a short description is given of the different scenarios (section 3.5). An overview of the used methods and procedures can be found in the flow chart on the next page (figure 2).



\*Model training uses one of these methods depending on the scenario:



Figure 2 Overview of the used workflow. At the top the overall workflow. The blue lines depict data used for Sentinel 2 scenarios while the yellow lines represent the Landsat 7 scenarios. The training of the deep learning model depends on the used scenario and is explained in more detail in the bottom part for each method.

#### 3.1 Study area

#### 3.1.1 Geomorphology & hydrodynamics

This study focussed on the intertidal mudflats in Barr Al Hikman, Oman. The mudflats are located on the narrow continental shelf along the Arabian Peninsula in the Arabian Sea and form the connection between the inland sabkhas and the Arabian Sea. They can be divided into three subareas: Khawr, Shannah, and Filim (figure 3). Together they have an estimated area of around 190 km<sup>2</sup>. The mudflats



Figure 3 Location of the studied tidal flats in Filim, Khawr, and Shannah in Bar Al Hikman in Oman.

contain bare mudflats, seagrass meadows, intertidal pools, reef structures, and channels (Bom et al., 2018). Each of these features uniquely influences the water dynamics, soil structure, and physical and chemical properties in its area and thereby influences the spatial distribution of flora and fauna.

The sediment on the mudflats originates from both the sea as well as from wind-blown deposits (Bom et al., 2018). Environmental parameters were estimated for a part of Shannah by Bom et al. (2020). They estimated that the intertidal elevation differences are up to 2.2 m and that the median grain size ranges between 136 and 249  $\mu$ m. The sediment depth ranges between 0 and 20 cm with shallower sediment depths at locations with reef structures (Bom et al., 2020). The tidal cycle in Barr

Al Hikman is a combination of diurnal and semidiurnal. The average tidal range is around 1.5 m but can be up to around 3.5 m during springtides.

Along the coast of Oman there is nearly continuous upwelling. The strength of the upwelling is influenced by the monsoon winds (Bom et al., (2018). From June to August monsoon winds monsoon winds come from the south-west. This causes increased upwelling around the coast bringing nutrient-rich water and increasing productivity (Bom et al., 2018). From December to February the winds change to north-easterly which reverses the water currents.

# 3.1.2 Ecology

Barr Al Hikman is well-known for its large diversity of marine life and abundant birdlife. The area is an important habitat for many species of fish and crustaceans of economic value (Bom et al., 2018). Primary production on the intertidal mudflats takes place by phytoplankton, seagrasses, epiphytes, and microphytobenthos. Estimates take the primary production of the Barr Al Hikman area, including the subtidal and mangroves, to be up to 160.000 tons g C yr<sup>-1</sup> placing it among the most productive exclusive economic zones (EEZs) that include internationally important intertidal mudflats larger than 5000 ha (Bom et al., 2018).

Benthic invertebrates (e.g. bivalves, gastropods, polychaetes, and crustaceans) are important for the ecology of intertidal flats. They form an important link between the primary producers and secondary consumers including fish and birds and are usually the starting point for the characterization of food webs in intertidal mudflats (Bom et al., 2018). Of most interest are the macrozoobenthic invertebrates which are all benthos > 1 mm. They form the main food supply for birds and marine predators in Barr Al Hikman (Bom et al., 2018). Barr Al Hikman has a benthic community with at least 97 identified species. Most of these species belong to the gastropods, bivalves, or brachyuran crabs. A field campaign in 2008 showed standing stock densities of the same order of magnitude as for other international intertidal mudflats (Bom et al., 2018). The same field campaign also showed that the main benthic biomass of Barr Al Hikman consists mainly of gastropods and bivalves, while crustaceans and polychaetes contribute less to the total biomass. Over 78% of the biomass density was made up of three species: *Pirenella arabica, Cerithium scabridum*, and *Pillucina fischeriana*. With the exception of crabs little is known about the interannual variations in the benthic community.

## 3.1.3 Compared to the Wadden Sea

When comparing the tidal flats in Bar Al Hikman to the studied area in the Wadden Sea the variables of interest differ substantially. The tidal flats in Oman have a much higher median grain size with a mean of 190  $\mu$ m in Oman compared to 145  $\mu$ m in the tested region in the Wadden Sea (Madhuanand et al., 2023). The silt content of the tidal flats in Oman is also much lower compared to the Wadden Sea, with a mean of 6.3% to 13% (Madhuanand et al., 2023). For the ecological variables, the tidal flats in Oman have a lower biomass and richness compared to the Wadden Sea.

## 3.2 Data collection

# 3.2.1 Field data

Field data was collected by Bom et al. (2017, 2020) during eight field campaigns in 2008 and 2011-2015. Geocoded ecological data on the biomass and taxonomy of macrobenthos was collected during each of these campaigns. During the 2008 campaign all macrobenthos were collected while the campaigns from 2011-2015 focused only on crabs. Sediment data on median grain size and silt content was collected during the 2011 campaign. The 2008 campaign took samples in each of the regions Filim, Khawr, and Shannah. The other campaigns sampled only in Shannah. An overview of

Campaign	#  of points	# of points with ecological data
2008	282	254
2011	458	125
2012 March	84	7
2012 November	440	227
2013	137	97
2014	168	78
2015 March	115	61
2015 November	121	93
Campaign	$\#  ext{ of points}$	# of points with sediment data
2011	66	66

Table 1 Number of field data points for each field campaign in Oman.

the number of field data points for each campaign can be found in Table 1. The locations of the field samples for each campaign are given in Figure 4 for sediment properties and Figure 5 for the ecological variables.



Figure 4 Field collection locations of the sediment properties collected during the field campaign in 2011. Image acquisition date is 14 February 2008 and is in true colour.



Figure 5 Locations of the field sampling points. The points with no recorded biomass are excluded in the analysis. Image acquisition date is 14 February 2008 and are shown in true colour.

#### 3.2.2 Satellite images

Satellite images were collected to match the temporal availability of the field data between 2008 and 2015. While the original method used Sentinel 2 images, this satellite only launched mid 2015 making it unsuitable for the collection of sufficient training images within the desired time range. Instead, Landsat 7 images were used. Launched in 1999 and operational until 2022 this satellite covered the entire desired temporal range. While Landsat 7 ETM+ data suffers from a failed scan line corrector (SLC) from 2003 onwards other open-source sensors were deemed unsuitable because of their inability to cover the entire desired temporal range (Sentinel 2 and Landsat 8) or failure to cover the desired region (Spot). Based on the results of Madhuanand et al. (2023) only the blue, green, red, and near-infrared(NIR) bands were used. These bands have a spectral range of 0.45-0.52 µm for the blue band, 0.52-0.60 µm for the green band, 0.63-0.69 µm for the red band, and 0.77-0.90 µm for the NIR band. The spatial resolution of the images is 30m.

The models were trained using Landsat 7 images for the years 2008 and 2011-2015 which correspond to the years during which field data was collected in Oman. Only satellite images with exposed tidal flats and no cloud cover over the tidal flats were selected. A total of 21 images complied with these requirements.

To test the effect of the different sensor and SLC error the prediction ability was also tested using a Sentinel 2 image, which the model was originally developed for in the Wadden Sea. As mentioned before, because of the launch date of Sentinel 2 not enough images were available within the field campaign timeframe to train the VAE model. Therefore, only one image was collected corresponding to the field date of the last campaign in December 2015. The selected image was acquired on 18 December 2015. It was chosen based on its relatively good exposed tidal flats and close temporal proximity to the field data.

The image taken on 18 December 2015 was selected This image was then used to generate features and train the random forest model. The spectral ranges of the four used bands are 0.458-0.523  $\mu$ m for the blue band, 0.543-0.578  $\mu$ m for the green band, 0.650-0.690  $\mu$ m for the red band, and 785-899  $\mu$ m for the NIR band and they have a spatial resolution of 10 m.

## 3.3 Preprocessing field data

The biomass and taxonomy of each collected macrobenthos was stored separately in the dataset. For each sample location, the biomass of all the collected macrobenthos was summed to get the total biomass. The species richness was calculated by evaluating the total number of different species for each sample location based on the recorded taxonomy. Points with no recorded macrobenthos were excluded from the analysis which resulted in a slightly lower number of data points (table 1). Because of the limited number of points for each campaign for the crab data these points were all combined in the random forest model, resulting in 688 data points for crab biomass and crab richness. Since the November 2012 campaign did have a similar number of points as used by Madhuanand et al. (2023) the predictive performance for crab data of this year was also evaluated separately from the other crab data. For the complete biomass and richness from 2008 there were 254 data points. All 66 sediment samples could be used.

The histograms of the field data showed that the distribution is skewed towards the lower values with some higher values extremes (section 4.1, figure 7). In particular, the biomass shows this pattern strongly. A logarithmic correction was applied to create a more normal distribution (figure 8).

#### 3.4 Preprocessing satellite images

To prepare the Landsat 7 images for training of the VAE model a few steps had to be taken which will be described in more detail below.

## 3.3.1 SLC failure data gaps

From 2003 onwards Landsat 7 ETM+ images suffer from a failed scan line corrector which results in large strips of data gaps within the images. Before these images can be used by the model these data gaps have to be filled. Different techniques have been suggested to deal with these data gaps (e.g. Hossain et al., 2015; Scaramuzza & Barsi, 2005; Yin et al., 2016). These techniques broadly fall into two categories. Single image techniques use interpolation techniques to fill the data gaps using the data surrounding the gaps. A drawback of these techniques is that they create made-up data and that inherent textures tend to get lost. Multiple image techniques use a second image to fill the data gaps. Since the data gaps do not occur at the same location for each image, data from different images can be used to fill the gaps. The advantage of this technique is that it uses real data with inherent textures. As deep learning models use texture this is an important advantage. A disadvantage is that there is a spectral offset between the different images and that geomorphological changes can occur between the two moments in time. Histogram matching is a method that aims to reduce these spectral differences. However, it is quite sensitive to differences in radiance due to for example clouds, snow, or reflection of water (Scaramuzza & Barsi, 2005).

After testing different filling techniques and visually comparing the results it was found that the multiple-image techniques produced the best results (see section 3.1). As histogram matching was computationally more intensive while not visually improving results this study chooses to fill the data gaps by simply using data from other images without any corrections. When choosing the specific image to fill the gaps three criteria were taken into account. The most important criterion was that the image chosen to fill the gaps must fill the data gaps as much as possible. This means that the data gaps had to be filled completely or at a maximum only left a limited amount of 1-to-2-pixel wide gaps at the edge of the area of interest (figure 6). The second criterion was that the filling image had to



0 1.5 3 km

Figure 6 Examples of types of gap fills between two true colour images at the most southwest tip of Filim. a) unsuitable filling image; filling images does not fill the gaps, (b) accepted filling image; filling image left a limited amount of 1-to-2-pixel wide gap, and c) preferred filling image; filling image completely fills the data gaps is the study area.

be taken within a specific time frame from the target image. When evaluating this criterium seasonal years were used where a new year starts after the monsoon season taking place from June to September. Preferably images taken within in same seasonal year were used and the filling image should not be more than two seasonal years away from the target image. This aims to reduce the effect of changes occurring over time like changing geomorphology. Finally, images with the lowest tidal difference were preferred to minimize discontinuities caused by different tidal elevations. Leftover 1-2 pixel wide gaps in a limited part of the study area were filled using a median filter with a 5 by 5 window.

#### 3.3.2. Masking

Before the images were passed to the model the land and open sea were masked out. The extent of the tidal flats was based on the maximum extension of the tidal flats within our data set. The landward extension was taken from two images taken during high tide. A small border around the land and sea was kept to account for some error. The tidal flats in the region of Filim were separated from Khawr and Shannah by this masking.

#### 3.4 Models

The models used are developed by Madhuanand et al. (2023). They consist of a training model based on Resnet 50, a model that generates features, and a random forest model that predicts the variables of interest. They will be described in more detail below.

## 3.4.1 Training model

The training model uses the pre-processed Landsat 7 images to train the deep learning model based on Resnet 50. First, each image was cut into smaller patches which form the input from which the deep learning model will learn. These patches had a size of 64x64 or 32x32 pixels depending on the scenario being tested (see section 3.5) and had an overlap of 10%. This resulted in a total number of 9,009 patches for a patch size of 64x64 and 36,582 patches for a patch size of 32x32. These patches were then divided into a training (80%) and validation (20%) dataset. As a result, the training dataset for scenarios using a patch size of 64x64 contained 7,207 patches while the remaining 1,802 patches were used for validation. For scenarios with a patch size of 32x32, the training dataset contained 29,265 patches while the validation dataset contained 7,317 patches. The training model was then trained for 100 epochs at the end of which the model was saved to be used to generate features. The hyperparameters used for each scenario can be found in Table 2.

Scenario	Patch size	Learning rate	Epochs	Batch size	Training images	Feature generation images
No change	64	-	-	-	-	Landsat 7
Finetuning	64	0.000001	100	32	Landsat 7	Landsat 7
Freezing	64	0.000001	100	32	Landsat 7	Landsat 7
Scratch 64	64	0.00001	100	32	Landsat 7	Landsat 7
Scratch 32	32	0.00001	100	32	Landsat 7	Landsat 7
No change 2015	64	-		-	-	Landsat 7
Sentinel no change	64	-	-	-	-	Sentinel 2
Sentinel finetuning	64	0.000001	100	32	Landsat 7	Sentinel 2
Sentinel freezing	64	0.000001	100	32	Landsat 7	Sentinel 2
Sentinel scratch 64	64	0.00001	100	32	Landsat 7	Sentinel 2
Sentinel scratch 32	32	0.00001	100	32	Landsat 7	Sentinel 2

Table 2 Hyperparameters used for training and the image source used for training and feature generation for each of the different scenarios.

## 3.4.2 Feature generation

The models trained by the training model and the model from Madhuanand et al. (2023) trained on the Wadden Sea were used to generate features from a given input image. These features are taken from the first layer which contains 64 features of 32x32 pixels. To match the input size these features are up-sampled to 64x64 pixels. For each field campaign an input image was chosen to be close to the field data collection date and to have the lowest possible tidal elevation. The tidal elevation was estimated from the tidal gauge located in Masirah. An overview of the used Landsat 7 images can be found in Table 3 and seen in Figure 4. For the Sentinel scenarios (section 3.5.6) 64 features were generated for the single Sentinel 2 image.

## 3.4.3 Random Forest (RF) model

From the produced 64 features and the original images with four spectral bands values were extracted at the locations of the field data. The random forest model then built a random forest to predict the field data variable of interest based on these values. A random forest with 800 trees and a maximum depth of 20 was used. The minimum samples for a split was set to 10 with the minimum samples per leaf being 2. The hyperparameters for the RF model can be found in Table 3. Compared to the setting used by Madhuanand et al. (2023) the number of splits used was decreased to 5 and the number of repeats to 2 to account for the lower number of field data points available.

## 3.5 Scenarios

Different transfer methods were tested in the paper. These are referred to as scenarios throughout the paper. They differ in how the model used for the feature generation was trained and which images were used to generate the features. An overview of the used hyperparameters and used training data per scenario can also be found in Table 2 in section 3.4.1.

## 3.5.1. No change

In this scenario, the easiest and basic transfer learning method of literal weight transfer without any further training was applied. Thus, the model from Madhuanand et al. (2023) trained on the Wadden Sea was used for feature generation without any further training on the tidal flats in Oman. As the model from Madhuanand et al. (2023) used a patch size of 64x64 this scenario also uses a patch size of 64x64.

## 3.5.2. Finetuning

The target tidal flats in Oman differ from the tidal flats in the Wadden Sea. These regional differences can be important for environmental predictions but are not yet learned by the model trained on the Wadden Sea. The expectation is that finetuning of the model on images of the tidal flats of Oman will increase the predictive performance. Thus, the trained model from Madhuanand et al. (2023)

Hyperparameters	Values
Nbr. of trees	800
Max. depth	42
Min. samples split	10
Min. samples leaf	2
Nbr. of splits	5
Nbr. of repeats	2
Random state	42

Table 3 Hyperparameters used for the random forest model.

was used to initialize the weights of the training model which was then trained on images from Oman. Since the model has been pre-trained the learning rate was reduced by a factor of 10 compared to training from scratch to prevent weights from changing too quickly and forgetting of learned information (Li et al., 2020). Therefore, a learning rate of 0.000001 was used for this scenario.

## 3.5.3. Freezing

Literature suggests finetuning to be a suboptimal transfer learning technique because of catastrophic forgetting (Iman et al., 2023). Freezing has been suggested as a technique to prevent catastrophic forgetting by not updating the shallow layers which contain more general features likely suitable for similar tasks (Iman et al., 2023). For this scenario, the weights were again initialized by the weights from Madhuanand et al. (2023). However, in contrast to the previous scenario now all layers with the exception of the last two were frozen. This way the model could keep the general information learned on the Wadden Sea dataset while the last two layers could adapt to new region-specific information. Again, since the model has been pre-trained the lower learning rate of 0.000001 could be used.

# 3.5.4. From scratch 64

This scenario uses the same model structure as the model used by Madhuanand et al. (2023) and a patch size of 64x64. However, instead of using the pre-trained weights the model was trained from scratch from randomly initialized weights to see how the model structure and setup would perform on the new region without transfer learning.

# 3.5.5. From scratch 32

The pixel resolution of Landsat 7 of 30 m is much larger than the 10 m pixel resolution of the Sentinel 2 images that the model was originally based on. As a result, a patch size of 64x64 pixels is quite large for the tidal flat region of Oman. It results in only 7,207 training patches and 1,802 validation patches which is quite little to train a deep learning model, for which, as said, preferably tens of thousands of patches are used. To see the effect of using a lower patch size the model structure was adapted to work with a patch size of 32x32 pixels which resulted in a much larger training dataset of 29,265 training patches and 7,317 validation patches. The hyperparameters are kept the same as in the scratch 64 scenario.

## 3.5.6. Sentinel

The quality of the Landsat 7 images could influence the performance of the model as inconsistencies between the original image and the image used to fill the SLC error gaps can be picked up and learned by the model. To get an idea of this influence the same scenarios mentioned above were also applied to a Sentinel 2 image. This is the same type of image that the model was developed for in the Wadden Sea. Compared to Landsat 7, Sentinel 2 images have a higher resolution of 10 m. As Sentinel 2 image collection started only at the end of 2015 the temporal resolution is reduced for these scenarios and only a single image collected in December 2015 was used.

## 3.5.7 No change 2015

To also test the effect of the lower temporal resolution without the added effect of the different sensor one Landsat 7 scenario was repeated while using only one Landsat 7 image for the feature generation. Similar to the Sentinel scenarios the image used for this was the December 2015 image. Because of its results, the trained model of Madhuanand et al. (2023) was used like in the other 'no change'-scenarios.

#### 4. Results

#### 4.1 Field data

The median grain size in the study area ranged between 102.3 and 507.6  $\mu$ m with a mean of 190.8  $\mu$ m. The silt content ranged from 1.08% to 15.2% with a mean of 6.30%. The biomass, measured as ash-free dry mass (AFDM), ranged from 0.027 to 207.8 gAFDM/m<sup>2</sup> with a mean of 22.2 gAFDM/m<sup>2</sup> full biomass collected in 2008 and from 0.0002 to 1.7 gAFDM/m<sup>2</sup> with a mean of 0.10 gAFDM/m<sup>2</sup> for only crabs collected during the 2011-2015 campaigns. The full species richness ranged between 1 and 15 with a mean of 4. The crab richness ranged between 1 and 6 and had a mean of 1.



Figure 7 Histograms of the field data show a skewed distribution towards the left with some higher extremes.



Figure 8 Histograms of the data after the logarithmic transformation. The distributions shifted towards the right and have fewer extreme outliers.

As can be seen from the histogram in Figure 7 the distributions of all variables are skewed toward the left with some extreme outliers for the higher variables. In particular, for the biomass, crab biomass, and crab richness are the lower values much more frequent. After the logarithmic transformation the amount of extreme outliers is reduced (figure 8). Only for the crab species richness does the transformation not seem to change the distribution strongly. The effect of the logarithmic transformation their distribution seems slightly skewed to the right.

#### 4.2 Gap filling & image selection

Comparing the results of different gap-fill methods it can be seen that there are clear differences (figure 9). When using an interpolation technique the gap fills are smoother than the surroundings. If a second image is used to fill the gaps the filled regions have more texture. However, the spectral differences are more pronounced. The difference in water level between two images creates a clear difference between the original image and the filled stripes.

To find the most optimal images to combine for multi-image gap filling an overview was created which evaluated each image combination based on the criteria mentioned in section 3.3.1. This overview can be seen in Table 4. It gives an overview of how well an image fills the gaps, how many seasonal years they are separated, and the tidal elevation difference. Of the 21 images that had to be filled, 13 were filled with an image acquired within a seasonal year. 5 images were selected that did not fill the entire data gap but left a 1-to-2-pixel wide gap to be filled with interpolation.



*Figure 9* The results of different gap fill techniques. (a) interpolation using median focal statistics with a 7x7 window, (b) interpolation using inverse distance with a 7x7 window, (c) filling with a different image without corrections, (d) filling with a different image using global histogram matching.

01/02/         15/12/         29/11/         06/06/         1           2013         2014         2014         20         2         2           466         52         33         119         347           518         518         438         347           518         518         438         347           518         518         438         347           518         518         438         347           518         518         438         347           518         518         438         347           519         518         438         347           518         518         538         347           519         518         518         347           510         359         343         347           521         354         355         341           521         356         314         356           521         356         448         356           145         556         451         356           170         348         256         341           556         451         356           <	01/02/         15/12/         29/11/         06/06/         13/01/         2           2013         2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2           466         53         33         119         347         347           434         518         433         347         119         347           434         518         433         347         119         399           435         518         433         347         119         399           435         518         433         347         119         399           435         518         433         347         119         399           435         518         513         569         314           110         399         341         203         569           511         71         86         741         203         560           511         730         255         341         560         561           511         512         512         505         505         505           513         513         512         512         505         505           5	01/02/         15/12/         29/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/           2013         2014         2014         2014         2013         28/12/           456         52         33         119         847         215         254           451         511         210         85         317         254         254           451         513         453         347         119         85         254           513         433         347         113         399         171         256           433         85         85         85         171         399         170         255           434         171         86         314         256         341         256         341           433         85         914         258         341         256         341           501         736         736         736         736         167         167           4445         736         914         253         944         673         164           4445         546         441         356         167         736           4445         546	01/02/         15/12/         29/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/           450         52/14         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013           451         52/14         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013           451         511         01/9         711         26/12/         2013         2013           451         518         51         317         2119         55         55           518         518         43         1119         658         51         70           431         171         399         177         399         170         51         51           431         171         56         314         215         56         51         51           431         516         51         56         51         51         51         51           443         51         54         54         56         56         51         56           431         536         341         556         54         56         56         56         56         56         56         56         56         <	01/02/2013         13/11/2         29/11/2         06/06/2         13/01/2         28/12/2         18/05/2         02/05/2           466         52         33         113/01         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013           416         518         52         33         119         347         2116         551         703           414         518         433         347         1119         665         521         792           518         513         513         2013         2013         2013         2013           414         518         347         1119         665         521         792         792           511         513         511         399         1171         399         177         793           511         513         511         399         177         2013         7013         7013           511         513         511         513         511         714         7145           513         513         513         514         215         514         716           513         513         514         215         514         716         <	01/02/         15/12/         29/14/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         13/01/         26/10/<	01/02/12/12/2         29/14         06/16         13/14/2         011/2         20/14         20/14/2 <th2< th=""><th>01/07/15/12/2         20/11         02/11         20/12         20/10         26/03/1         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2000         2000         2000         2000         2001         &lt;</th></th2<>	01/07/15/12/2         20/11         02/11         20/12         20/10         26/03/1         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         10/03/1         2000         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2001         2000         2000         2000         2000         2001         <
15/12/     29/11/     06/06/     1       2014     2014     201     2       2014     2014     20     2       51     33     119     3       51     43     347     3       51     43     347     3       51     43     347     3       51     43     347     3       51     43     35     347       51     35     347     3       177     36     314     2       300     314     2     341       301     355     341     3       302     314     2     3       303     314     2     3       304     355     341     3       305     314     3     3       3170     355     341     3       318     353     174     3       318     353     177     3       310     373     3     3       311     426     3     177       311     426     3     3       312     426     3     3       313     426     3       341     372	15/12/2014         29/11/2014         213/01/2         2           2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2           518         11         06/06/13/01/2         347         347         347           518         43         347         315         347         316           518         43         347         119         347         319           518         43         347         119         399         314           518         43         347         319         399         314           518         58         347         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         314         399         316         <	15/12/2014         29/11/2014         06/06/2014         2014         28/12/2013           2014         2014         2014         2014         2013           50         33         119         347         203           518         433         317         319         254           518         433         317         319         254           518         58         317         399         170           518         58         317         399         170           519         58         314         258         341           317         58         314         258         341           317         58         314         258         341           399         314         258         341         355           317         560         314         256         341           317         560         314         560         364           317         355         341         560         343           317         356         341         560         343           316         376         350         343           316         350	15/12/2014         29/11/2014         06/06/2014         13/01/2013         18/05/2013           2014         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013           50         33         119         347         2013         2013         2013           518         319         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013           518         319         347         1119         668         501         3           518         317         399         170         369         501         3           517         86         314         205         648         501         3           171         86         314         205         341         174           509         314         203         341         174           501         56         314         203         501         50           171         86         314         203         314         271           503         314         203         167         76         167           170         355         410         76         76         76           510         505	15/12/         29/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/         02/05/           2014         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013           5014         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013           51         91         347         119         655         551         792           51         51         51         521         792         792           51         51         51         521         792           51         51         51         792         792           51         51         51         792         792           51         53         51         793         792           51         71         919         551         792           51         51         714         292         51         792           51         51         714         293         291         793           51         51         51         792         51         791           51         51         51         51         51         51           51	13/11/1         29/11/1         06/06/1         13/01/2         28/11/2         07/11/2         29/04/1         20/10/2         26/03/1           2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2011         26/03/1           2014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2011         2014         2014         2011         2014           2014         3014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2011         2014         2014         2011         2014         2014         2011         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011         2014         2014         2011         2011         2014         2014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2014         2014	13/12/12         23/11/1         07/11/1         29/04/12/01/2         26/03/1         20/13         20/13         20/13         20/13         20/14	13.112         29.11         66/06         13./01         26/13         11./01         2011         2011         2011         2011         2010         26/03         10./03         26/03         10./03         26/03         10./03         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011         2011         2011         2013         201
9/11/ 06/06/ 1 2014 2014 2 33 119 433 347 433 347 433 347 433 347 86 341 86 238 314 228 314 228 314 228 314 228 314 228 315 317 410 305 445 317 428 177 428 177 428 239 353 177	9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         2           314         2014         2014         2           38         119         347         347           453         347         119         347           453         347         119         347           453         347         119         347           453         347         119         399           453         171         399         344           453         347         119         399           314         228         314         208           314         228         341         402           314         228         341         402           314         228         448         673           314         228         341         569           314         228         345         673           315         395         167         51           315         395         167         505           316         512         505         167           317         512         505         505           317         512         512 <td< td=""><td>9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/           014         2014         2013         2013           38         119         347         202           453         347         119         663           453         347         119         653           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           564         314         255         341           314         228         341         255           314         228         341         255           314         228         560         563           314         238         167         756           511         560         750         243           355         167         516         243           350         167         756         243           101         277         505         64           456         512         740         171           372         586         586</td><td>9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/           33         119         347         2013         2013           38         119         347         2013         2013           438         119         347         2013         2013           458         119         658         521           458         117         399         170         3           561         717         393         170         3           562         314         215         58         51           563         314         215         56         51           564         217         394         177         56         56           514         228         314         273         57         56           514         526         54         56         56         56           514         560         76         76         76         56           515         516         516         76         76         76           516         516         516         76         76         76           517         516         516         516</td><td>9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/03/         02/05/           38         119         2014         2013         2013         2013           38         119         347         2013         2013         2013           458         119         347         2013         2013         2013           458         119         551         752         553         553           458         117         399         177         792           458         314         255         581         792           458         314         255         583         359           569         171         393         1774         445           314         258         341         1774         445           314         259         589         569         576           314         250         341         1774         445           314         250         356         576         571           314         250         351         673         571           314         250         351         271         271           350         104</td><td>9/11         06(06/         13/01         28/12/         18/03/         02/103/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/           014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011         2011         2011         2011         2011           014         214         2014         213         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011<td>111         06/06/         13/01         28/12/         18/03/         02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           113         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         20/10         26/03/         10/0           138         119         8/1         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011</td><td>111         06/06/<ta> <ta>13/01</ta>              2014             2014             2014             2014             2011             26/03             10/03             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             20113             2014</ta></td></td></td<>	9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/           014         2014         2013         2013           38         119         347         202           453         347         119         663           453         347         119         653           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           453         171         399         170           564         314         255         341           314         228         341         255           314         228         341         255           314         228         560         563           314         238         167         756           511         560         750         243           355         167         516         243           350         167         756         243           101         277         505         64           456         512         740         171           372         586         586	9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/           33         119         347         2013         2013           38         119         347         2013         2013           438         119         347         2013         2013           458         119         658         521           458         117         399         170         3           561         717         393         170         3           562         314         215         58         51           563         314         215         56         51           564         217         394         177         56         56           514         228         314         273         57         56           514         526         54         56         56         56           514         560         76         76         76         56           515         516         516         76         76         76           516         516         516         76         76         76           517         516         516         516	9/11/         06/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/03/         02/05/           38         119         2014         2013         2013         2013           38         119         347         2013         2013         2013           458         119         347         2013         2013         2013           458         119         551         752         553         553           458         117         399         177         792           458         314         255         581         792           458         314         255         583         359           569         171         393         1774         445           314         258         341         1774         445           314         259         589         569         576           314         250         341         1774         445           314         250         356         576         571           314         250         351         673         571           314         250         351         271         271           350         104	9/11         06(06/         13/01         28/12/         18/03/         02/103/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/           014         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011         2011         2011         2011         2011           014         214         2014         213         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011 <td>111         06/06/         13/01         28/12/         18/03/         02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           113         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         20/10         26/03/         10/0           138         119         8/1         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011</td> <td>111         06/06/<ta> <ta>13/01</ta>              2014             2014             2014             2014             2011             26/03             10/03             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             20113             2014</ta></td>	111         06/06/         13/01         28/12/         18/03/         02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           113         2014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         20/10         26/03/         10/0           138         119         8/1         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2011	111         06/06/ <ta> <ta>13/01</ta>              2014             2014             2014             2014             2011             26/03             10/03             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2013             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             2014             20113             2014</ta>
6/06/ 1 014 2 87 87 87 87 87 87 86 86 841 174 445 98 895 8395 177 277 236	6/06/ 13/01/ 2 014 2014 2 119 347 119 171 399 86 314 2 171 399 86 314 2 228 2 228 2 228 2 341 6 228 2 341 6 228 2 341 6 740 2 177 51 2 177 51 2 177 51 2 277 50 5 512 740 2 512 740 2 513 7 513 7 514 7 515 7 516 7 517 7	6/06/         13/01/         28/12/           014         2014         2013           119         347         222           87         315         254           347         119         658           171         399         170           86         314         255           171         399         170           86         314         255           171         399         170           87         319         658           341         255         341           228         314         255           341         256         341           238         569         341           341         560         341           358         356         343           351         560         243           351         505         64           512         505         64           512         540         171           256         550         64           512         563         64           512         540         171      513         540         171  <	6/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/           014         2013         2013         2013           119         347         2013         2013           87         315         2013         2013           87         315         2013         2013           87         315         2013         2013           87         315         2013         2013           87         315         2013         501           117         399         170         501           86         314         255         501           911         303         174         255         501           917         503         341         174         271           914         653         104         271         167           917         603         104         271         167           917         616         710         710         271           915         516         518         750         551           917         510         513         514         551           917         510         513         514         515	6/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/05/         02/05/           014         2013         2013         2013         2013           119         847         202         55         55         55           57         315         2013         2013         2013         2013           57         315         2013         2013         2013         2013           57         315         2013         2013         2013         2013           57         315         2013         2013         2013         2013           51         311         658         551         792         792           171         399         177         274         445         274           2013         3013         1174         255         583         592           311         569         341         1774         271         445           174         402         167         776         771           311         569         104         271         271           445         736         351         776         271           445         746         771         771 </td <td>6/10         13/01         28/12         18/103         02/03         16/104         23/11         07/11         29/14         13/04         20/10         26/103           014         2014         2013         2014         2014         2010         26/03         2011         2011         2011         2010         26/03         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013</td> <td>6/10         13/01         28/12         18/03         02/03         16/14         28/13         10         26/03         10/13         20/10         26/03         10/13           014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         750         744         773           119         347         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         750         744         773           119         350         170         355         11         452         264         100         425         373         447         747         747           117         350         214         743         364         365         445         747         747         747           117         366         116         446         751         740         365         740         761         747         747         747           117         369         116         743         746         747         747         741         741         741         741         <t< td=""><td>6/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         10/03/<!--</td--></td></t<></td>	6/10         13/01         28/12         18/103         02/03         16/104         23/11         07/11         29/14         13/04         20/10         26/103           014         2014         2013         2014         2014         2010         26/03         2011         2011         2011         2010         26/03         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013	6/10         13/01         28/12         18/03         02/03         16/14         28/13         10         26/03         10/13         20/10         26/03         10/13           014         2014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         750         744         773           119         347         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2014         750         744         773           119         350         170         355         11         452         264         100         425         373         447         747         747           117         350         214         743         364         365         445         747         747         747           117         366         116         446         751         740         365         740         761         747         747         747           117         369         116         743         746         747         747         741         741         741         741 <t< td=""><td>6/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         10/03/<!--</td--></td></t<>	6/06/         13/01/         28/12/         18/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         16/03/         10/03/ </td
	3/01/2 2014 2 347 345 349 349 309 359 569 569 569 569 569 569 5140 51 167 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51	3/01/ 28/12/ 0014 2013 347 2023 315 254 119 658 399 170 314 255 391 658 341 569 569 569 569 560 561 167 736 505 518 505 64 740 171 58 627	3/01/28/12/         28/12/2013         18/03/2013           347<2013	3/01/         28/12/         18/05/         02/05/           0014         2013         2013         2013           347         202         55         203           347         202         55         203           347         203         2013         2013           347         203         501         70           341         269         571         792           314         256         581         70           314         256         583         350           314         256         581         76           314         256         402         673           314         256         402         673           314         256         402         673           403         167         704         274           403         167         776         274           316         273         274         274           403         167         776         274           316         274         274         274           403         263         351         274           326         241         274	3/01/         28/12/         18/03/         02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/           014         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2011	3/11         28/12/         18/05/         02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/         10/03/         20/03/ <td>3/01         25/12         18/03         02/03         16/04/2         23/11         07/11         29/04         13/04/2         20/10         20/103         10/03/2</td>	3/01         25/12         18/03         02/03         16/04/2         23/11         07/11         29/04         13/04/2         20/10         20/103         10/03/2
28/12         18/05         02/05         16/04/           2013         2013         2013         2013           222         55         35         2013         2013           254         87         355         11         65           255         551         772         445         73           2170         84         772         445         73           341         174         445         95         12           341         174         445         95         12           341         174         445         95         12           341         174         445         95         12           341         174         445         95         12           167         267         271         76         76           167         271         271         76         76           167         271         271         76         76           161         271         271         275         76           216         51         52         275         275           173         535         56         716         76	IS/OS/         O2/OS/         IG/O4/           2013         2013         2013           3013         2013         2013           55         326         21           571         792         445           574         73         53           174         445         73           402         673         356         11           174         445         73           402         673         356         12           402         673         356         12           403         76         73         356           404         73         356         12           167         104         243         76           571         74         76         347           571         74         76         76           571         67         243         76           571         67         247         76           571         67         275         77           584         73         540         77           584         73         541         74           584         73         8	02/05/         16/04/           2013         2013           2013         2013           2013         2013           201         2013           255         21           355         11           732         445           274         73           274         73           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         76           271         77           271         77           271         77           275         775           176         714           714         714           731	16/04/ 2013 21 11 11 11 12 21 21 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24 24		07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011           2064         158         393         406         444           201         624         859         405         447           204         100         425         373         4476           204         100         426         373         4776           204         100         426         373         4776           205         101         426         373         4776           205         101         426         373         4771           205         101         426         373         4771           205         740         740         751         118           205         740         353         465         751           205         177         205         206         205           205         176         353         465         256           205         170         253         465         256           2170 <td>07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2064         158         393         406         444         173           170         624         859         405         447         141           170         624         859         405         447         141           170         624         859         405         9010         203           344         190         426         373         447         141           170         624         373         447         141           171         201         426         373         447         141           171         627         286         563         564         564           171         612         731         116         275         205           171         627         731         117         201         201           171         628         446         152         205         215</td> <td>07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         01/03/           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2013         2008           2016         158         393         406         444         173         346           2014         190         425         373         4476         141         378           2015         190         426         373         447         143         376           2016         190         426         373         447         141         376           2017         021         346         457         392         456         373           2017         021         457         392         457         146         376           2016         141         456         373         447         146         593           2017         2018         456         753         147         146         593           2017         2018         751         124         146         593         124           2018         440         353         446         146         593         541</td>	07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2064         158         393         406         444         173           170         624         859         405         447         141           170         624         859         405         447         141           170         624         859         405         9010         203           344         190         426         373         447         141           170         624         373         447         141           171         201         426         373         447         141           171         627         286         563         564         564           171         612         731         116         275         205           171         627         731         117         201         201           171         628         446         152         205         215	07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         01/03/           2012         2012         2012         2011         2011         2013         2008           2016         158         393         406         444         173         346           2014         190         425         373         4476         141         378           2015         190         426         373         447         143         376           2016         190         426         373         447         141         376           2017         021         346         457         392         456         373           2017         021         457         392         457         146         376           2016         141         456         373         447         146         593           2017         2018         456         753         147         146         593           2017         2018         751         124         146         593         124           2018         440         353         446         146         593         541
S/12/         18/03/         02/03/         16/04/         23/11/           2013         2013         2013         2013         2012           222         55         55         55         51         45           224         51         792         445         45           254         55         55         55         56           170         341         792         445         45           341         792         445         45         56           341         174         445         75         56         16           341         174         445         75         56         16           341         174         445         75         56         16           167         164         445         75         56         16           167         174         271         76         75         56           167         271         77         245         76         16           168         357         67         40         76         16           168         271         77         247         275         216	IS, (05,         O2, (05,         IG, (04,         23,11,1           2013         2013         2013         2012           51         2013         2013         2012           51         355         11         45           51         792         445         45           51         792         445         46           51         792         445         73         566           51         792         445         73         566           51         792         445         73         566           51         745         73         566         167           51         445         73         566         167           51         445         73         736         167           51         104         243         736         167           51         271         74         243         736           51         271         74         243         736           51         271         74         243         243           560         840         243         243         243           551         275	02/05/         16/04/         23/11/           2013         2013         2012           2013         2013         2012           2013         2013         2012           2013         2013         2012           2014         73         566           355         11         452           274         73         566           359         12         451           274         73         566           415         95         566           359         12         451           673         326         167           104         243         736           271         76         549           271         76         549           271         74         540           271         74         540           540         493         540           622         275         218           616         414         907           731         384         109	16/04/2013         23/11/2012           2013         2012           21         21           21         14           11         48           13         566           14         1           12         48           73         566           12         48           73         566           98         395           326         167           243         736           243         736           243         736           947         849           243         167           243         736           243         736           243         203           243         203           243         203           275         218           2179         672           414         907           384         109	23/11/ 2012 2012 565 483 481 481 481 481 566 569 569 569 569 569 569 569 569 569	29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/           2012         2012         2011         2011           2012         2012         2011         2011           158         393         405         444           190         425         373         476           624         859         61         910           190         425         373         476           624         859         61         910           191         426         373         476           191         426         373         476           191         426         373         477           191         426         373         477           191         426         373         477           192         740         58         791           103         353         466         384           103         354         100         958           103         354         100         740           103         354         505         516           103         354         758         516           235         563         543 <td>29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           150         393         405         444         173           190         425         373         4476         141           624         540         61         910         203           191         426         373         4476         141           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         383         466         384           103         383         460         383         493           103         383         460         384         493           103         414         384         466         341           450         100         730         740         123           454</td> <td>29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         01/03/           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011         2008           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011         2008           1190         425         303         405         444         173         346           190         426         373         4476         141         378           1910         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4477         141         376           1911         420         383         466         383         1174         693           1013         586         586         586         326         326         326           1173         627         238         446         146         693         367           118         384         466         383         466         341         366         367</td>	29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011           150         393         405         444         173           190         425         373         4476         141           624         540         61         910         203           191         426         373         4476         141           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         373         447         140           191         426         383         466         384           103         383         460         383         493           103         383         460         384         493           103         414         384         466         341           450         100         730         740         123           454	29/04/         13/04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         01/03/           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011         2008           2012         2012         2011         2011         2011         2008           1190         425         303         405         444         173         346           190         426         373         4476         141         378           1910         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4476         141         376           1911         426         373         4477         141         376           1911         420         383         466         383         1174         693           1013         586         586         586         326         326         326           1173         627         238         446         146         693         367           118         384         466         383         466         341         366         367
28/12/         18/05/         02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/           2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2012           222         55         55         55         51         2012         2012           224         57         356         11         452         2012         2012           224         57         356         11         452         2012         2012           254         57         356         11         452         2012         2012           255         553         356         11         452         2013         2013           251         756         167         745         766         345         2013           341         174         444         753         356         177         2013           351         174         756         451         756         515         516         516           167         164         275         275         275         275         275         276           167         261         261         261         261         2616         216         216      <	IS/OS/         O2/OS/         IG/O4/         23/11/         O7/11/           2013         2013         2013         2012         2012           51         2013         2013         2012         2013           51         325         211         2013         2013           51         325         211         445         246           51         732         445         445         248           51         732         445         73         566           51         745         745         263         177           402         73         356         177         263           174         445         73         566         345         177           402         673         356         167         511         177           403         736         736         513         756         514           416         73         347         346         516         515           517         275         347         549         275         516           518         276         347         349         276         516           518	02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/           2013         2013         2012         2012           2013         2013         2012         2012           226         21         45         206           326         21         45         206           732         445         48         170           274         73         566         345           274         73         566         346           274         73         566         346           274         73         566         346           275         326         167         563           271         746         748         563           271         746         748         563           271         746         540         553           276         347         540         553           347         749         754         518           540         493         756         518           541         907         673         518           541         907         673         518           541         907         673	16/04/2011/2012         23/11/2012         07/11/2012           2013         2012         2012           21         514         296           11         452         264           13         466         348           145         468         346           73         566         343           73         566         346           98         395         177           98         395         177           98         395         177           98         395         177           98         395         177           91         460         563           947         549         516           949         493         275           493         493         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218         218           275         218	23/11/     07/11/       2012     2012       2012     2012       514     296       48     170       48     263       481     263       481     263       566     345       569     513       569     513       736     513       940     622       493     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       218     218       219     218       218     218       219     218       218     218       219     218       218     218       219     218       218     218       219     218       218     218       219     218       210     201	13./04/         20/10/         26/03/           2012         2011         2011           2012         2011         2011           303         405         444           303         405         446           304         457         910           425         373         476           304         457         910           426         373         476           341         457         392           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           414         354         465           416         354         958           417         354         740           418         354         740           418         354         745           418         354         745           418         354         745           419         354         <	13./04/         20/10/         26/03/         10/03/           2012         2011         2011         2011           303         405         444         173           425         573         446         73           426         573         447         141           859         61         910         203           416         733         476         141           859         61         910         203           417         457         392         255           740         753         477         140           740         58         731         141           740         58         731         147           741         67         731         146           414         354         465         152           414         354         466         341           65         109         740         123           610         109         958         341           610         703         956         341           610         709         740         123           610         709         740	13./04/         20/10/         26/03/         10./03/         01./03/           2012         2011         2011         2013         2008           303         405         444         173         346           425         373         446         73         346           426         373         4476         173         346           426         373         4476         141         376           341         457         392         225         294           440         379         477         140         379           440         379         477         140         379           440         379         225         294         465           740         58         791         177         693           740         383         460         389         226         294           171         627         229         295         294         296           171         627         289         241         203         296           171         384         466         384         296         296           1118         384         466
S/12/         18/05/         02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/           2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2012           225         55         55         55         51         2012         2013         2013           225         55         55         55         54         206         156           254         57         274         752         2012         2012         2012           254         55         55         55         56         345         100         524           254         792         445         73         564         366         345         100           341         174         445         75         563         101         575         507           341         174         445         756         177         507         107           341         174         445         756         177         507         107           341         174         246         756         177         507         107           341         174         246         756         516	IS/(0x)         02/(0x)         IG/(04/         23/11/         07/11/         20/04/           2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2012           55         526         21         45         20         15           571         792         445         48         100         624           581         792         445         48         101         624           581         792         445         48         100         624           582         355         11         482         204         106           583         355         11         482         205         101           174         445         73         566         345         101           174         445         73         566         515         616           271         74         746         746         746         106           271         74         746         516         105           167         746         746         516         106           271         747         746         746         107           104         244         7	02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012           326         21         45         26         158           355         415         45         170         624           274         73         566         348         100           274         73         566         348         100           274         73         566         348         101           415         95         356         1177         277           673         326         167         348         101           104         243         736         513         614           271         243         736         513         612           347         347         340         275         103           347         349         276         103         672           614         493         276         103         454           105         414         907         454           106         275	16 (04/20111)         23 / 11/2012         29 / 04/2012           2013         2012         2012         2012           21         511         07 / 11/201         2012           21         512         2012         2012           21         514         296         158           11         452         264         190           73         566         348         190           73         566         348         190           98         395         177         277           98         395         177         277           91         461         263         191           92         395         177         277           935         736         513         612           943         736         513         103           947         949         276         179           943         949         216         454           179         672         218         454           179         672         218         454           179         672         218         454           179         673         516	23/11/         07/11/         29/04/           2012         2012         2012           514         296         158           452         264         190           451         170         624           453         345         191           451         263         348         191           451         263         348         191           451         263         348         191           451         263         348         191           569         513         613         614           569         513         613         614           569         513         610         612           569         513         613         103           569         513         613         613           493         216         613         454           612         454         633         453           503         100         633         454           601         100         533         454           103         103         633         454           503         100         535	20/10/2011         26/03/2011           2011         2011           2011         2011           405         444           573         476           61         910           457         910           457         791           457         791           457         292           457         292           456         58           58         118           731         118           731         118           584         465           109         958           109         958           109         740           563         516           563         516	20/10/ 2011         26/03/ 2011         10/03/ 2011           2011         2011         2011           405         444         173           573         476         141           61         910         203           457         910         203           457         910         203           457         910         203           457         910         203           58         563         54           627         223         915           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           731         118         499           732         956         341           109         740         123           563         546         546           740         740         123           756         549         541           756         546	20/10/         26/03/         10/03/         01/03/           2011         2011         2011         2008           405         444         173         346           573         4476         141         378           573         4476         141         376           573         476         141         376           457         392         225         294           573         477         140         379           574         791         174         693           58         563         54         465           58         591         174         693           58         591         174         693           58         591         174         693           58         592         294         201           581         118         499         201           591         123         642         642           591         123         642           592         294         123         642           503         296         331         238           504         546         533         541
S/12/         18/05/         02/05/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/           D013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2013           D13         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013           D14         S1         351         11/1         452         2012         2012         2013         2013           D15         T1         T45         561         11/1         29/04         13/04         2013           D15         T1         T45         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2013           D15         T1         T45         2013         11/1         2013         11/1         2013         2014         <	IS/OS/         O2/OS/         IG/OH/         23/11/         OT/11/         29/04/         I3/04/           2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2012           85         320         21         2012         2012         2012         2013         2013           87         355         11         452         204         13/04/         25           87         355         11         452         264         100         425           87         355         11         452         264         100         426           97         445         73         566         346         101         426           97         445         740         770         740         740           174         445         740         740         740         740           167         740         740         740         740         740           167         740         740         740         740         740           167         740         740         740         740         740           167         740         740         740         740 <td>02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013           325         11         482         266         155         393           355         11         482         264         190         425           356         11         482         264         190         426           274         73         456         245         101         426           356         11         482         264         101         426           274         536         543         101         426         541           356         157         263         101         426         541           274         543         740         740         740         740           104         243         746         551         672         561         177           271         243         740         740         740         740         740           271         245         540         541</td> <td>16 (04/ 2013         23 / 11/ 2012         07 / 11/ 2012         29 (04/ 2012         13 (04/ 2012           2013         2012         2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         204         13 (04/ 2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         204         120         426         241           73         566         343         170         624         840           740         243         263         117         277         210         426           95         395         177         263         101         426         241           740         234         263         117         277         2103         210           943         740         622         163         67         207         213           947         543         216         67         214         207           943         275         163         672         207         214           943         276         177         414         217         414           &lt;</td> <td>23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/           2012         2012         2012         2012           2012         2012         2012         2012           514         296         155         393           452         264         190         425           451         264         190         425           451         264         190         426           451         263         101         426           451         263         101         426           395         177         267         840           569         513         605         740           756         513         605         740           756         513         605         740           756         513         613         740           756         513         613         740           756         513         613         740           756         514         613         614           758         516         613         614           758         516         613         614           751         516         740&lt;</td> <td>26(03/ 2011 2011 444 477 910 910 910 910 2222 286 958 791 118 258 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256</td> <td>26(03/ 2011         10/03/ 2011           2011         2011           444         173           476         141           910         225           921         225           910         225           791         174           791         174           255         54           791         174           252         395           253         354           254         228           118         205           955         341           740         123           256         341           740         123           256         341           740         236           955         354           740         236           740         123           258         331           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232</td> <td>26 (03/ 2011         10 (03/ 2013         01 (03/ 2008           2011         2011         2008           444         173         346           476         141         378           910         225         294           910         225         54           911         225         54           912         225         54           913         174         693           791         174         693           791         174         693           252         395         124           813         228         291           914         174         693           923         924         201           915         228         341           918         152         642           740         123         642           740         123         642           740         123         642           740         233         341           843         233         47           843         233         642           843         233         47           843         233</td>	02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013           325         11         482         266         155         393           355         11         482         264         190         425           356         11         482         264         190         426           274         73         456         245         101         426           356         11         482         264         101         426           274         536         543         101         426         541           356         157         263         101         426         541           274         543         740         740         740         740           104         243         746         551         672         561         177           271         243         740         740         740         740         740           271         245         540         541	16 (04/ 2013         23 / 11/ 2012         07 / 11/ 2012         29 (04/ 2012         13 (04/ 2012           2013         2012         2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         204         13 (04/ 2012         2012         2012           21         11         452         204         120         426         241           73         566         343         170         624         840           740         243         263         117         277         210         426           95         395         177         263         101         426         241           740         234         263         117         277         2103         210           943         740         622         163         67         207         213           947         543         216         67         214         207           943         275         163         672         207         214           943         276         177         414         217         414           <	23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/           2012         2012         2012         2012           2012         2012         2012         2012           514         296         155         393           452         264         190         425           451         264         190         425           451         264         190         426           451         263         101         426           451         263         101         426           395         177         267         840           569         513         605         740           756         513         605         740           756         513         605         740           756         513         613         740           756         513         613         740           756         513         613         740           756         514         613         614           758         516         613         614           758         516         613         614           751         516         740<	26(03/ 2011 2011 444 477 910 910 910 910 2222 286 958 791 118 258 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 653 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256 256	26(03/ 2011         10/03/ 2011           2011         2011           444         173           476         141           910         225           921         225           910         225           791         174           791         174           255         54           791         174           252         395           253         354           254         228           118         205           955         341           740         123           256         341           740         123           256         341           740         236           955         354           740         236           740         123           258         331           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232           549         232	26 (03/ 2011         10 (03/ 2013         01 (03/ 2008           2011         2011         2008           444         173         346           476         141         378           910         225         294           910         225         54           911         225         54           912         225         54           913         174         693           791         174         693           791         174         693           252         395         124           813         228         291           914         174         693           923         924         201           915         228         341           918         152         642           740         123         642           740         123         642           740         123         642           740         233         341           843         233         47           843         233         642           843         233         47           843         233
S/12/         18/05/         02/03/         16/04/         33/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/           2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2011         20/10/           2013         2013         2013         2013         2013         2012         2013         2011           202         55         55         55         51         2012         2013         2011           203         51         792         44         170         457         373           204         75         44         75         54         373         457           210         2014         452         356         117         457         373           341         76         740         341         457         373           117         445         740         541         457         576           341         71         263         740         740         576           117         104         243         740         740         740           1167         271         103         740         740         740	IS/(0)         O2/(0)         IG/(04/         23/11/         O7/11/         29/04/         I3/04/         20/10//           2013         2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2011           55         526         21         45         206         158         393         405           571         792         445         566         343         100         425         373           581         792         445         792         446         792         457         201           581         792         445         793         566         343         100         425         373           581         274         792         445         793         101         426         373           174         445         740         541         740         541         457           667         101         426         541         171         627         512         516           167         740         541         740         541         740         541         541           167         541         740         541         176         541         541         <	02/03/         16/04/         23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013         20/10/           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2012         2011           2013         2013         2012         2012         2012         2013         2011           326         11         482         264         190         425         375           358         11         482         264         190         425         375           274         73         566         343         101         426         375           274         535         177         263         101         457         556           355         157         261         740         547         557         575           104         245         513         565         177         275         740         557           104         243         740         553         740         553         566         576           104         245         540         177         567         177	16 (04/ 2013         23 / 11/ 2012         07 / 11/ 2012         29 / 04/ 2012         13 / 04/ 2012         20 / 10/ 2011           21         11         452         2012         2012         2011           21         11         452         2012         2013         457           11         452         264         190         425         373           445         170         624         859         61         457           73         566         343         101         426         373           98         395         177         267         341         457           98         395         177         277         511         457           98         395         177         265         373         457           91         451         265         177         457         457           91         395         177         277         511         457           94         740         740         740         731           94         740         553         740         731           94         740         553         740         731           94	23/11/         07/11/         29/04/         13/04/         20/10/           2012         2012         2012         2011         20/10/           2012         2012         2012         2011         20/10/           452         2012         2012         2011         20/10/           451         206         156         353         405           451         2064         150         425         373           451         2063         101         426         373           451         263         101         426         373           395         177         263         101         457           563         513         106         414         457           563         513         565         740         55           564         177         267         177         627           561         103         553         567         501           561         565         176         553         460           563         516         672         673         673           516         516         516         516           517         673		10/03/2011           2011           173           173           141           141           141           141           141           225           225           225           225           225           226           241           174           228           232           341           123           331           2566           258      258	10/03/ 2011         01/03/ 2008           2011         2008           173         346           141         378           225         294           225         294           140         379           141         378           225         294           140         379           54         465           174         693           395         124           228         291           228         291           209         124           209         693           3915         124           201         124           203         124           203         124           203         201           203         201           203         642           331         138           566         47           232         731

Table 4 Images used for filling the SLC data gaps. Black line separate different seasonal years separated by the monsoon season. The closer to the black squares, the close the acquisition dates are. Within the black boxes containing the black squares are images within the same seasonal year. The error gaps of the image on the left are filled with the image on top. Values are absolute tidal differ



Seasonal years. Used image combination

20 568

10/03/2011 01/03/2008 14/02/2008

The images selected for feature generation can be found in Table 5. Most images had a tidal elevation below the mean tidal level of 1471 m (table 4). Two images were selected with a slightly higher tidal elevation in the absence of a better alternative. The image taken on 14 February 2008 has a tidal elevation corresponding to low water levels during spring tide. An overview of the images can be found in Figure 10.

Date	Tidal elevation (mm)
02/12/2015	1242
01/02/2015	1422.5
29/11/2014	1208.5
28/12/2013	768
23/11/2012	1560.5
13/04/2012	845.5
20/10/2011	1555.5
14/02/2008	329

Table 5 Tidal elevation of the images used to generate features.



Figure 10 Landsat 7 images used for feature extraction shown in true colour. Striping from the filled data gaps is still visible.



Figure 11 Training and validation loss during the training of the four different scenarios (a) finetuning, (b) freezing, (c) scratch 64, and (d) scratch 32.

#### 4.3 Training

For all four models trained the training loss showed a steep initial loss drop followed by a slower loss drop which until around epoch 20 after which the additional loss drop is minimal (figure 11). For the models trained from scratch the strongest loss drop occurred after the first epoch. For the model trained from patches with a patch size of 64x64 this initial strong loss drop is followed by a gradual drop that seems to continue to drop very slightly the rest of the epochs. For the model trained from scratch with a patch size of 32x32 the steep loss drop after the first epoch is followed by a slower loss drop until around epoch 20 after which the loss decreases only minimally. For the models that are finetuned from the pretrained model on the Wadden Sea the initial strong loss drop lasts for the first five epochs. After this the loss drops slightly slower for a few epochs before it reaches an almost stable state around 15 epochs. The final training loss was similar for the models trained from scratch for a patch size of 64x64, the finetuned model, and the partially frozen model. The model trained on patches of 32 pixels reaches a much lower training loss.

The validation loss shows similar patterns. The validation loss for the model trained on patches of 64x64 pixels shows a steep initial drop followed by a much more varying but overall declining trend. The model trained on the patches of 32x32 shows a strong fluctuation for the first 10 epochs but with an overall decreasing trend. After these first 10 epochs, the loss follows a slower decline until it reaches a mostly stable state after 50 epochs. The final validation loss of this model was much lower than for the other models. The validation loss for the models based on the pre-trained model were very similar (Figures 5a and b). The initial loss was larger than for the other two models. After a steep

initial drop the loss seems to quickly converge after around 10 epochs at a slightly lower level than for the model trained from scratch on patch of 64x64.

# 4.4 Features

While for each scenario about 23-29 of the 64 generated features are empty for the tidal flats area, the remaining features show a diverse range of patterns. A limited number of features only showed a few select small regions with values while the rest of the flats were empty. This type of feature occurred 7 times for the model trained on the Wadden Sea and 1-2 times for the other models. Some features seem to enhance edges with a specific aspect, others seem to sharpen the edges, and some others create larger more blurred areas. While some features seem to extract larger scale similar areas, others detect and enhance smaller structural variations. Some features are visible in the features like channels and the edges of tidal flats. A small selection of features created from different scenarios is given in Figure 12.

The features generated by the finetuned model and the partly frozen model are similar in the sense that the same features contain information or are empty for the tidal flat region. Their values are also similar with the finetuned model having slightly lower values with a mean of 1.15 compared to 1.20 for the partly frozen model. The features generated by the model trained on the Wadden Sea had much higher values with a mean of 4.24 for the non-empty features. The models trained from scratch have a mean of 1.11 and 0.99 for a patch size of 64x64 and 32x32 respectively.

# 4.5 Cross-validation accuracy Landsat 7

# 4.5.1 Cross-validation accuracy of the environmental variables

The cross-validation accuracy of the sediment properties exceeds the ecological predictions (table 6). For each scenario, the cross-validation accuracy was highest for the silt content with predictions ranging from 16.1% for the 'scratch 32'-scenario to 25.0% for the 'no change'-scenario. The predictions for median grain size ranged from 8.6% to 21.0% with the same scenarios performing the worst and best respectively.

For the ecological predictions the best cross-validation accuracy was reached for the complete biomass collected during the 2008 campaign. With predictions ranging from 16.3% to 19.0% these accuracies exceed those on crab biomass for which the cross-validation accuracy ranged from 3.08% to 5.57%. When only using the crab biomass of November 2012 the crab biomass cross-validation accuracy was lowest for the crab richness ranging from 1.71% to 3.56%. The cross-validation accuracy for the complete species richness ranged from 3.17% to 3.82%.

The cross-validation accuracy of the 'no change 2015'-scenario is lower than that of the 'no change'scenario for most variables. The crab biomass and crab richness now have negative R2 values. The cross-validation accuracy of the silt content and the full biomass had the best cross-validation accuracy under these conditions with 13.4% and 12.9% respectively. The complete species richness performed better compared to the 'no change'-scenario with a cross-validation accuracy of 9.0%.



Figure 12 Features generate for the image collected on 14 February 2008 with top: scratch 64, middle: scratch 32, and bottom: freeze.

Median orginsize	Silt	Biomass (all)	Richness (all)	Biomass crah	Richness crah	Biomass crah
2011	2011	2008	2008	2011-2015	2011-2015	nov. 2012
0.210	0.250	0.186	0.0382	0.0557	0.0356	0.141
0.198	0.214	0.163	0.0372	0.0363	0.0254	0.120
0.183	0.209	0.164	0.0381	0.0403	0.0253	0.126
0.173	0.201	0.190	0.0326	0.0439	0.0331	0.0836
0.0861	0.161	0.182	0.0317	0.030S	0.0171	0.113
6220.0	0.134	0.129	0.0903	-0.0119	-0.199	0.0725
je 0.134	0.113	<b>1</b> 460'0	0.0368	2400.0-	-0.190	0.00436
ve 0.149	94.90.0	0.0893	0.0238	-0.0106	-0.185	1400.0
0.152	0.063	£060.0	0.0226	-0.0102	-0.185	0.0072
4 0.180	0.158	0.1099	0.0303	-0.01224	-0.204	0.0147
0.154	260.0	0.0813	0,00,0-	-0.0175	-0.196	-0.02041
	Median grainsize 2011 0.210 0.198 0.198 0.183 0.183 0.173 0.183 0.173 0.0779 e 0.134 e 0.134 e 0.132 4 0.152	Median grainsize         Silt           2011         2011           2011         0.250           0.198         0.214           0.198         0.214           0.173         0.201           0.183         0.201           0.173         0.201           0.173         0.201           0.173         0.201           0.173         0.161           0.173         0.161           0.174         0.161           0.173         0.161           0.161         0.161           0.0134         0.161           0.0134         0.113           0         0.134           0.134         0.134           0.135         0.0676           0.135         0.0676           0.135         0.0676           0.135         0.0676           0.135         0.0676			Median grainsizeSiltBiomass (all)Richness (all)Biomass crab2011 $2011$ $2008$ $2008$ $2008$ $2011-2015$ $2011$ $0.210$ $0.250$ $0.186$ $0.0382$ $0.0557$ $0.198$ $0.214$ $0.163$ $0.0381$ $0.0403$ $0.193$ $0.209$ $0.164$ $0.0381$ $0.0433$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.190$ $0.0381$ $0.0433$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.190$ $0.0381$ $0.0433$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.164$ $0.0381$ $0.0433$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.161$ $0.1326$ $0.0433$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.161$ $0.1326$ $0.0433$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.190$ $0.0337$ $0.0433$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.132$ $0.0317$ $0.0433$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.132$ $0.0337$ $0.0317$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.0333$ $0.0336$ $0.0119$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.0372$ $0.0317$ $0.0047$ $0.149$ $0.063$ $0.0904$ $0.0238$ $0.00102$ $0.152$ $0.063$ $0.0904$ $0.0238$ $0.0106$ $0.150$ $0.0513$ $0.0303$ $0.0102$ $0.154$ $0.0914$ $0.0303$ $0.0102$ $0.154$ $0.0913$ $0.0313$ $0.0102$	Median grainsizeSiltBiomass (all)Richness (all)Biomass crabRichness crab $2011$ $2011$ $2008$ $2008$ $2001$ $2011-2015$ $2011-2015$ $2011$ $0.210$ $0.250$ $0.186$ $0.0363$ $0.0356$ $0.0356$ $0.198$ $0.214$ $0.163$ $0.0372$ $0.0363$ $0.0356$ $0.173$ $0.209$ $0.164$ $0.0372$ $0.0363$ $0.0254$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.190$ $0.0372$ $0.0363$ $0.0254$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.190$ $0.0326$ $0.0439$ $0.0253$ $0.173$ $0.201$ $0.190$ $0.0326$ $0.0439$ $0.0253$ $0.0779$ $0.161$ $0.182$ $0.0317$ $0.0233$ $0.0171$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.1326$ $0.0439$ $0.0233$ $0.0171$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.0903$ $0.0337$ $0.0333$ $0.0171$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.1326$ $0.0439$ $0.0171$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.0333$ $0.0333$ $0.0171$ $0.0779$ $0.134$ $0.0333$ $0.01199$ $0.0189$ $0.0149$ $0.0676$ $0.0993$ $0.0338$ $0.00167$ $0.190$ $0.152$ $0.0149$ $0.0676$ $0.0993$ $0.0226$ $0.00106$ $0.0186$ $0.152$ $0.0129$ $0.01090$ $0.0238$ $0.01026$ $0.0106$ $0.0186$ $0.152$ $0.0129$ $0.01026$ $0.01022$ $0.01026$ $0.0106$ $0.0196$

Table 6 Cross-validation accuracies (R2) for the different experiments.



Figure 13 Predicted values against the field samples for the 'no change'-scenario. (a) Median grain size, (b) silt content, (c) full biomass, (d) full richness, (e) crab biomass, and (f) crab richness.

When comparing the predicted variables with the real field values it can be seen that the higher values are often underestimated by the model while the lower values are overestimated (figure 13). When plotted against the field values the predicted ecological variables form a horizontal cloud instead of the desired 1-to-1 line. For the sediment properties there seems to be a small positive trend with the predictions for the high field variables being higher than expected. However, the range of the predicted variables is still lower than the range of the field variables.

#### 4.5.2 Cross-validation accuracy of the different scenarios

The 'no change'-scenario had the highest cross-validation accuracy for all but one variable. Only for the complete biomass collected in 2008 did the 'scratch 64'-scenario result in a higher cross-validation accuracy. The 'scratch 32'-scenario resulted in the lowest cross-validation accuracy for most variables. Only for the complete biomass and the November 2012 crab biomass did it reach higher

cross-validation accuracies than the 'finetuning'- and 'freezing'-scenario and the 'scratch 64'-scenerio respectively.

# 4.6 Cross-validation accuracy Sentinel 2

The scenarios using Sentinel 2 images for the feature generation and random forest model resulted in lower cross-validation accuracies for almost all tested variables compared to when Landsat 7 images were used. On average the cross-validation accuracy was 8.67 percent points worse. The cross-validation accuracy reached by the Sentinel scenarios was lower than the highest accuracy reached by the Landsat scenarios for each variable. When comparing the cross-validation accuracies of the Sentinel scenarios to their Landsat counterpart only the accuracy of the median grain size from the 'scratch 64'- and 'scratch 32'-scenario was higher. For crab biomass and species richness the cross-validation accuracy reached negative R2 values meaning the model could not fit that data.

There was no scenario that had a convincingly higher overall cross-validation accuracy compared to the other scenarios. The 'scratch 64'-model had the highest cross-validation accuracy for the sediment properties and complete biomass but had among the lowest accuracies for the other ecological variables. The scenario with the highest cross-validation accuracy on the Sentinel 2 image was the same as for the Landsat 7 images for the complete biomass, complete species richness, and crab biomass but differed for the other variables.

# 5. Discussion

# 5.1 Performance of transfer learning techniques

It was expected that the 'freezing'-scenario would have the highest predictive performance followed by the 'finetuning'-scenario. Both these models were pre-trained on a related source dataset with higher quality images without data gaps while also getting the opportunity to learn region-specific information during finetuning on the target dataset. However, it was found that the pre-trained model without any finetuning resulted in higher cross-validation accuracies. As literal transfer without finetuning is also the most straightforward transfer learning method this would be promising to be able to apply these models without having to train it yourself.

When looking at the Landsat scenarios the 'finetuning'- and 'freezing'-scenarios did outperform the models trained from scratch for the sediment properties, complete richness, and November 2012 crab biomass. It is thus likely that the pre-training of the model did provide valuable information useful for predicting the sediment and ecological variable.

The 'scratch 32'-scenerio had the worst performance. This scenario was included to increase the number of training patches. It was expected that this would result in a better trained model and better predictive results, at least compared to training from scratch with a patch size of 64x64. From the loss graphs this scenario seemed to indeed do best during training reaching much lower loss values compared to the models using less but larger patches. However, the cross-validation accuracy of this scenario was overall the lowest. Besides the lower accuracy of the prediction, the training of this model also took much more time.

On the Sentinel images the 'scratch 64'-scenario outperformed the 'no change'-model. The 'no change'-scenario did have the second highest cross-validation accuracies. The 'scratch 32'-scenario had again the lowest performance.

#### 5.2 Landsat versus Sentinel

Because of the suboptimal image quality of the Landsat 7 image due to the SLC error Sentinel 2 images were also used to predict the environmental properties. As these images have a higher quality and the original model was based on these images it was expected that the predictive results would be higher or at least similar to the Landsat 7 images. However, it was found that the cross-validation accuracies obtained based on the Sentinel 2 image were much lower compared to those obtained based on Landsat 7. This was especially surprising for the 'no change'-scenario. While the other models were trained at least partly on Landsat 7 data the model used for the 'no change'-scenario was only trained on Sentinel 2.

An explanation could be that the temporal matching of the images and field data is important. For the Landsat scenarios the field data was predicted based on images with an acquisition time as temporally close as possible, often within the same seasonal year. For the Sentinel scenarios, however, the predictions for all variables had to be based on a single image collected in 2015. As a result, there exists a time gap between the field data collection and the image that is used to predict the field data. The complete biomass collected in 2008 for example had to be predicted based on the image from 2015, almost 7 years later.

This is partly supported by the results of the 'no change 2015'-scenerio. When similar to in the Sentinel 2 scenario only one Landsat 7 image, also taken in December 2015, was used the cross-validation accuracy was also reduced strongly. The results from this scenario are more similar to the Sentinel 2 scenarios. This suggests that indeed using an image that is not temporally close to the field data decreases the accuracy of the predictions based on it.

Over time environmental variables like sedimentary and ecological variables can change. They may even vary seasonally or change suddenly due to extreme events. Stormy seasons can for example be associated with erosion while sedimentation can take place during calmer seasons (Belliard et al., 2019). Tidal channels may also migrate on a time scale of a couple of years (Zhao et al., 2022). Biomass may also change seasonally (Beukema, 1974) or year-to-year (Beukema et al., 1993). When the conditions have changed between the sampling and the acquisition date of the satellite image this causes a mismatch between the data. This can then reduce the cross-validation of the random forest model.

## 5.3 Comparing to performance in the Wadden Sea

Similar to the findings of Madhuanand et al. (2023) the model shows a higher predictive performance for the sediment variables compared to the ecological variables. Overall, however, the model had a lower predictive performance for the tidal flats in Oman compared to in the Wadden Sea. For the sediment properties and species richness the highest cross-validation accuracy reached in Oman is lower than the lowest cross-validation accuracy reported for the same variable by Madhuanand et al. (2023). The highest cross-validation accuracies of the complete biomass did fall within the range found by Madhuanand et al. (2023). Crab biomass and richness were not predicted for the Wadden Sea but the 2012 crab biomass does fall within the cross-validation accuracy range for biomass given by Madhuanand et al. (2023).

For the Wadden Sea a difference in predictive performance between areas was already observed (Madhuanand et al., 2023). This difference in predictive performance was attributed to a difference in the distribution of the data. As the range and the mean of the predicted variables differ between Oman and the Wadden Sea. As a result, the distribution might also be different, and this might have affected the performance of the model.

For Oman the availability of field data is also limited. While for the Wadden Sea each field campaign had over 200 field samples for Oman only the field campaign of 2008 and November 2012 had over 200 field samples. For the sediment characteristic only 66 field samples were available to train and test the random forest model which could have limited the predictive performance. For the crab biomass and richness the field data of the different years was combined to increase the number of field data points. However, this reduced the temporal resolution of the field data. By combining different years differences between years can increase the noise included in the model reducing the prediction accuracy.

#### 5.4. Generalization

There have been many experiments on different datasets that report positive gains from transfer learning. Mensink et al. (2012) for example performed multiple experiments comparing different pretrained models with training from scratch and found that pre-trained models outperformed the models trained from scratch for all experiments. Similar results were also found by Neyshabur et al. (2020) where the pre-trained models were also able to reach higher accuracies compared to models trained from scratch. The results of this study are partly in line with these observations. For the Landsat scenarios the pre-trained model indeed reached higher accuracies than the models trained from scratch. However, this was not the case for all variables, especially when also comparing the finetuning and freezing scenarios. For the Sentinel scenarios the model trained from scratch reaches higher accuracies compared to the pre-trained scenarios for most variables. Thus, the gains from using a pre-trained model seem to be lower during these experiments than as described literature.

The decrease in the accuracy of a pre-trained when applied to a new target dataset compared to its accuracy on the source dataset has also been previously described. Research on land cover classifications found that when applying a model trained on a dataset from one continent to a different continent the prediction performance of the model decreased (Tong et al., 2021). This problem of generalization is thought to be caused by a difference in the spectral distribution between the training and target images. Seasonal changes can also influence the generalization of DL models (Tong et al., 2021). A model trained on one season can be expected to have a lower performance when applied to images of a different season.

## 5.5 Challenges and potential improvements

The existence of the SLC failure gaps makes the Landsat 7 images suboptimal. By combining images from two different moments in time with a different tidal elevation the edge stripes keep being detectable. Differences in the spectral data between the two years generate edges that are picked up by the model in the same way that spectral differences within one image for example between flats and channels get picked up. If an input image has clear stripes the autoencoder model will try to reconstruct this resulting in it learning to create features related to these stripes. Features generated by edge detection like filters for example often do not only show the edges of channels and flats but also the edges of these stripes. Indeed, the effect of the stripes was visible in the generated features that were used in the random forest model, for example in feature 56 in Figure 12. This can cause confusion for the random forest model since these edges are an artifact from the input images and do not reflect the environmental conditions in which the field variables were collected. As a result the accuracy of the model will likely decrease. In total 45% of the field data points were located on or within a 5-pixel radius from these data gaps, which strongly affected the prediction accuracies of the random forest model.

Comparing the results of the 'no-change 2015'-scenarion and the 'Sentinel no change'-scenario the effect of the quality difference between the Sentinel 2 and Landsat 7 images used does not seem very

clear. However, since both of these scenarios use a single image temporally separated from their data they are both suboptimal. As a result, further investigation into the effect of the quality of the satellite images would be advised. Furthermore, an evaluation of the performance of the model in a different area with higher-quality satellite image availability and a larger field data set would be recommended.

## 6. Conclusion

This study looked at the transferability of the deep learning method to predict sediment and ecological variables developed by Madhuanand et al. (2023) for the Wadden Sea. The method is comprised of a VAE deep learning model and a random forest model. The VAE model is trained using satellite images and produces features. The random forest model then combines these features with the original satellite image and field data to predict sedimentary and ecological variables. In this study the cross-validation accuracy of the model was evaluated for the tidal flats in Bar Al Hikman, Oman, using Landsat 7 and Sentinel 2 images and field data collected in 2008 and 2011-2015. The cross-validation accuracies for the variables median grain size, silt content, biomass, species richness, crab biomass, and crab species richness were evaluated. Different scenarios representing different transfer learning techniques were tested which differed in the training of the deep learning model used to extract features. The cross-validation accuracies obtained using literal transfer without change, finetuning, freezing and training from scratch were compared.

The best-performing scenario used the pre-trained model without any further training in the study area in Oman. The model trained from scratch with a patch size of 64x64 had the highest accuracies on the Sentinel images. Higher cross-validation accuracies were found when the random forest model was trained on single-year data and when images temporally close to the field campaign data were used.

Similar to the findings for the Wadden Sea the cross-validation accuracy was highest for the sediment properties. The cross-validation accuracy was lowest for the species richness. The cross-validation accuracies obtained for Oman were lower than those obtained by Madhuanand et al. (2023) for the Wadden Sea. This reduced accuracy when DL models are applied to a different region is in line with previous research on the generalization of deep learning methods.

The Landsat 7 images used in this study were suboptimal because of the data gaps caused by the SLC failure. These had to be filled with data from different images creating edges with spectral differences picked up by the deep learning model and visible in the generated features. As a result, they likely influenced the prediction accuracy.

While the cross-validation accuracies of the transfer attempts of this study were lower than preferred, indications have been found that using an improved dataset may result in better predictions. Focus should be on using satellite images without data gaps, using single-year data in the random forest model, and using temporally closely matched field and satellite data.

# 7. References

Bank, D., Koenigstein, N., & Giryes, R. (2023). Autoencoders. *Machine learning for data science handbook: data mining and knowledge discovery handbook*, 353-374.

Belliard, J. P., Silinski, A., Meire, D., Kolokythas, G., Levy, Y., Van Braeckel, A., Bouma, T.J. & Temmerman, S. (2019). High-resolution bed level changes in relation to tidal and wave forcing on a

narrow fringing macrotidal flat: Bridging intra-tidal, daily and seasonal sediment dynamics. *Marine Geology*, 412, 123-138.

Beukema, J. J. (1974). Seasonal changes in the biomass of the macro-benthos of a tidal flat area in the Dutch Wadden Sea. *Netherlands Journal of Sea Research*, 8(1), 94-107.

Beukema, J. J., Essink, K., Michaelis, H., & Zwarts, L. (1993). Year-to-year variability in the biomass of macrobenthic animals on tidal flats of the Wadden Sea: how predictable is this food source for birds?. *Netherlands journal of sea research*, 31(4), 319-330.

Bom, R. A., de Fouw, J., Klaassen, R. H., Piersma, T., Lavaleye, M. S., Ens, B. J., Oudman, T., & van Gils, J. A. (2017). Food web consequences of an evolutionary arms race: Molluscs subject to crab predation on intertidal mudflats in Oman are unavailable to shorebirds. *Journal of Biogeography*, 45(2), 342-354.

Bom, R.A., Philippart, C.J.M., Van der Heide, T., de Fouw, J., Campuysen, C.J., Dethmer, K., Folmer, E.O., Stocchi, P., Stuut, J.B.W., Van der Veer, H.V., & Al Zakwani, I. (2018). Barr Al Hikman: a pristine coastal ecosystem in the Sultanate of Oman: Current state of knowledge and future research challenges. NIOZ.

Bom, R. A., van Gils, J. A., Molenaar, K., Kwarteng, A. Y., Victor, R., & Folmer, E. O. (2020). The intertidal mudflats of Barr Al Hikman, Sultanate of Oman, as feeding, reproduction and nursery grounds for brachyuran crabs. *Hydrobiologia*, 847, 4295-4309.

Burt, J. A. (2014). The environmental costs of coastal urbanization in the Arabian Gulf. *City*, 18(6), 760-770.

Choi, J. K., Eom, J., & Ryu, J. H. (2011). Spatial relationships between surface sedimentary facies distribution and topography using remotely sensed data: Example from the Ganghwa tidal flat, Korea. *Marine Geology*, 280(1-4), 205-211.

Compton, T. J., Holthuijsen, S., Koolhaas, A., Dekinga, A., ten Horn, J., Smith, J., Galama, Y., Brugge, M., Van der Wal, D., Van der Meer, J., Van der Veer, H., & Piersma, T. (2013). Distinctly variable mudscapes: distribution gradients of intertidal macrofauna across the Dutch Wadden Sea. *Journal of Sea Research*, 82, 103-116.

Costanza, R., De Groot, R., Sutton, P., Van der Ploeg, S., Anderson, S. J., Kubiszewski, I., Farber, S., & Turner, R. K. (2014). Changes in the global value of ecosystem services. *Global environmental change, 26*, 152-158.

Dissanayake, N. G., Frid, C. L., Drylie, T. P., & Caswell, B. A. (2018). Ecological functioning of mudflats: global analysis reveals both regional differences and widespread conservation of functioning. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 604, 1-20.

Goodfellow, I., Bengio, Y., & Courville, A. (2016). Deep learning. MIT press.

He, K., Xiangyu, Z., Shaoqing, R., Jian, S. (2016). Deep residual learning for image recognition. *Proceedings of the IEEE Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern recognition (CVPR)*, 770-778.

Hossain, M. S., Bujang, J. S., Zakaria, M. H., & Hashim, M. (2015). Assessment of Landsat 7 Scan Line Corrector-off data gap-filling methods for seagrass distribution mapping. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 36(4), 1188-1215. Hu, F., Xia, G. S., Hu, J., & Zhang, L. (2015). Transferring deep convolutional neural networks for the scene classification of high-resolution remote sensing imagery. *Remote Sensing*, 7(11), 14680-14707.

Iman, M., Arabnia, H. R., & Branchinst, R. M. (2021). Pathways to artificial general intelligence: a brief overview of developments and ethical issues via artificial intelligence, machine learning, deep learning, and data science. *Advances in Artificial Intelligence and Applied Cognitive Computing: Proceedings from ICAI'20 and ACC'20*, 73-87.

Iman, M., Arabnia, H. R., & Rasheed, K. (2023). A review of deep transfer learning and recent advancements. *Technologies*, 11(2), 40.

Ketkar, N., & Moolayil, J. (2021). Convolutional Neural Networks. *Deep Learning with Python*. *Apress, Berkeley, CA*, 197-242.

Koo, B. J., Kwon, K. K., & Hyun, J. H. (2005). The sediment-water interface increment due to the complex burrows of macrofauna in a tidal flat. *Ocean Science Journal*, 40, 221-227.

Koo, B. J., Kwon, K. K., & Hyun, J. H. (2007). Effect of environmental conditions on variation in the sediment-water interface created by complex macrofaunal burrows on a tidal flat. *Journal of Sea Research*, 58(4), 302-312.

LeCun, Y.A., Bottou, L., Orr, G.B., Müller, K.R. (1998). Efficient BackProp. In: Neural Networks: Tricks of the Trade: Second Edition, *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, 1524.

Lee, S., Park, I., Koo, B. J., Ryu, J. H., Choi, J. K., & Woo, H. J. (2013). Macrobenthos habitat potential mapping using GIS-based artificial neural network models. *Marine pollution bulletin*, 67(1-2), 177-186.

Levin, L. A., Boesch, D. F., Covich, A., Dahm, C., Erséus, C., Ewel, K. C., Kneib, R.T., Moldenke, A., Palmer, M.A., Snelgrove, P., Strayer, D., & Weslawski, J. M. (2001). The function of marine critical transition zones and the importance of sediment biodiversity. *Ecosystems*, 4, 430-451.

Li, H., Chaudhari, P., Yang, H., Lam, M., Ravichandran, A., Bhotika, R., & Soatto, S. (2020). Rethinking the hyperparameters for fine-tuning. *ArXiv preprint arXiv:2002.11770*.

Madhuanand, L., Philippart, C. J., Wang, J., Nijland, W., de Jong, S. M., Bijleveld, A. I., & Addink, E. A. (2023). Enhancing the predictive performance of remote sensing for ecological variables of tidal flats using encoded features from a deep learning model. *GIScience & Remote Sensing*, 60(1), DOI: 10.1080/15481603.2022.2163048

Mehanna, S. F., Khvorov, S., Al-Sinawy, M., Al-Nadabi, Y. S., & Al-Mosharafi, M. N. (2013). Stock assessment of the blue swimmer crab Portunus pelagicus (Linnaeus, 1766) from the Oman Coastal Waters. *International Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, 2(1), 1-8.

Mensink, T., Uijlings, J., Kuznetsova, A., Gygli, M., & Ferrari, V. (2021). Factors of influence for transfer learning across diverse appearance domains and task types. *IEEE Transactions on Pattern Analysis and Machine Intelligence*, 44(12), 9298-9314.

Miloslavich, P., Bax, N. J., Simmons, S. E., Klein, E., Appeltans, W., Aburto-Oropeza, O., Andersen Garcia, M., Batten, S.D., Benedetti-Cecchi, L., Checkley Jr., D.M., Chiba, S., Duffy, J.E., Dunn, D.C., Fischer, A., Gunn, J., Kudela, R., Marsac, F., Muller-Karger, F.E., Obura, D., & Shin, Y. J. (2018). Essential ocean variables for global sustained observations of biodiversity and ecosystem changes. *Global Change Biology*, 24(6), 2416-2433. Murray, N. J., Phinn, S. R., DeWitt, M., Ferrari, R., Johnston, R., Lyons, M. B., Clinton, N., Thau, D., & Fuller, R. A. (2019). The global distribution and trajectory of tidal flats. *Nature*, 565(7738), 222-225.

Neyshabur, B., Sedghi, H., & Zhang, C. (2020). What is being transferred in transfer learning?. *Advances in neural information processing systems*, 33, 512-523.

Pan, S. J., & Yang, Q. (2009). A survey on transfer learning. *IEEE Transactions on knowledge* and data engineering, 22(10), 1345-1359.

Pires de Lima, R., & Marfurt, K. (2019). Convolutional neural network for remote-sensing scene classification: Transfer learning analysis. *Remote Sensing*, 12(1), 86.

Pratt, L.Y. (1993). Transferring previously learning backpropagation neural networks to new learning tasks. *Rutgers The State University of New Jersey, School of Graduates Studies*.

Reise, K. (2012). Tidal flat ecology: an experimental approach to species interactions. *Springer Science & Business Media*, 54.

Rumelhart, D. E., Hinton, G. E., & Williams, R. J. (1986). Learning representations by backpropagating errors. *Nature*, 323(6088), 533-536.

Scaramuzza, P., & Barsi, J. (2005). Landsat 7 scan line corrector-off gap-filled product development. In *Proceeding of Pecora*, 16, 23-27.

Tan, C., Sun, F., Kong, T., Zhang, W., Yang, C., & Liu, C. (2018). A survey on deep transfer learning. In: Artificial Neural Networks and Machine Learning–ICANN 2018: 27th International Conference on Artificial Neural Networks, Rhodes, Greece, October 4-7, 2018, Proceedings, Part III. *Springer International Publishing*, 270-279.

Tong, X. Y., Xia, G. S., Lu, Q., Shen, H., Li, S., You, S., & Zhang, L. (2020). Land-cover classification with high-resolution remote sensing images using transferable deep models. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 237, 111322.

Van der Wal, D. P. M. J. H. D., Herman, P. M. J., Forster, R. M., Ysebaert, T., Rossi, F., Knaeps, E., Plancke, Y.M.G. & Ides, S. J. (2008). Distribution and dynamics of intertidal macrobenthos predicted from remote sensing: response to microphytobenthos and environment. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 367, 57-72.

Weiss, K., Khoshgoftaar, T. M., & Wang, D. (2016). A survey of transfer learning. *Journal of Big data*, *3*(1), 1-40.

Willcock, S., Martínez-López, J., Hooftman, D. A., Bagstad, K. J., Balbi, S., Marzo, A., Prato, C., Sciandrello, S., Signorello, G., Voigt, B., Villa, F., Bullock, J.M., & Athanasiadis, I. N. (2018). Machine learning for ecosystem services. *Ecosystem services*, 33, 165-174.

Yin, G., Mariethoz, G., & McCabe, M. F. (2016). Gap-filling of landsat 7 imagery using the direct sampling method. *Remote Sensing*, 9(1), 12.

Yoo, J. W., Hwang, I. S., & Hong, J. S. (2007). Inference models for tidal flat elevation and sediment grain size: a preliminary approach on tidal flat macrobenthic community. *Ocean Science Journal*, *42*, 69-79.

Yosinski, J., Clune, J., Bengio, Y., & Lipson, H. (2014). How transferable are features in deep neural networks?. *Advances in neural information processing systems*, 27.

Zhao, B., Liu, Y., Wang, L., Liu, Y., Sun, C., & Fagherazzi, S. (2022). Stability evaluation of tidal flats based on time-series satellite images: A case study of the Jiangsu central coast, China. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science*, 264, 107697.

Zhuang, F., Qi, Z., Duan, K., Xi, D., Zhu, Y., Zhu, H., Xiong, H., & He, Q. (2020). A comprehensive survey on transfer learning. *Proceedings of the IEEE*, 109(1), 43-76.