



15 August 2022

Worded Wordlessness:

Music(k)al Ekphrasis and
Novel Musicking



Emily Evers
6632742
CLS RMA
Thesis

Supervisor: Dr. Kiene Brillenburg Wurth
2nd Reader: Dr. Susanne Knittel

Acknowledgements

In the first place, I would like to thank Dr. Kiene Brillenburg Wurth for her support throughout this thesis process. Your feedback, insightful comments and mentoring has most certainly been valued!

Secondly, I owe my thesis lab much gratitude for their help. Pascale, Eline and Rikst you have gone above and beyond in giving feedback, encouragement and generally being an all-around fantastic group to work with. Thank you also to Dr. Susanne Knittel for being such a wonderful thesis lab tutor.

Thanks is also due to my friends and family for their support. Special mentions belong to Janita and Willianne for feeding me dinner and keeping me sane. And finally, thank you to God for giving me the strength to complete my research.

Abstract

Instrumental music is typically considered a sounded medium. Yet, there are other ways of making music: in so called musical novels, instrumental music is mediated through words. The question is then raised: what makes a verbal representation of music of scholarly interest? This thesis explores answers to this question, trying to assess the aesthetic and affective value of musical ekphrasis. Combining W.J.T. Mitchell's understanding of representation alongside Ivan Delazari's idea of a musical experience and Christopher Small's notion of musicking, this research posits that both sounded and texted representations of music are equally 'real' forms of music and that literary representations invite readers to a particular kind of musickal experience. Small reframes music into *musick*, suggesting that music(k) is actually an activity, thereby turning attention away from objects (e.g. a composition) and towards relationships and interactive, music(k)al-social meaning. I argue that a literary form of music also constitutes musicking. This research thus investigates whether a novel can induce a *musickal* experience. That is, can literature generate a musical experience that goes beyond the traditional Western understanding of what "music", i.e. performing or listening, is? I contend that different factors – such as the way music(k)al ekphrasis is utilised, affordances of particular (formal) features and the arousal of affect — contribute to different kinds of musickal experiences. In a close reading of *The Music Shop* by Rachel Joyce I question how effective overtly musical descriptions are in creating a satisfying music(k)al experience. In *The Cellist of Sarajevo* by Steven Galloway I examine how a reader can be invited to 'hear' a composition without including a single description of the piece. Finally, in *The Prague Sonata* by Bradford Morrow I consider ways in which a *musickal* experience can be induced. Each of these novels work towards bringing different facets of musick to presence and illustrate how literature 'works' intermedially.

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	2
Abstract.....	3
Introduction	5
Chapter 1: Theoretical Grounding	14
Chapter 2: <i>The Music Shop</i>	31
Chapter 3: <i>The Cellist of Sarajevo</i>	43
Chapter 4: <i>The Prague Sonata</i>	55
Conclusion.....	64
Bibliography	69

Introduction

The other day I was at an orchestra rehearsal when our oboe player had a beautiful solo. This solo reminded her of her mother who had recently passed away and had also been a musician. When we arrived at that particular passage our oboist was so caught up in her emotions that eventually she was momentarily unable to play. All of us at that rehearsal were deeply moved by this encounter. The intensity and poignancy of this moment illustrated music's special ability to move people and after the rehearsal we discussed why anyone would want to experience music in any other way. What this discussion pointed towards was the fact that music is more than just a particular collection of sounds; rather it has the ability to create and call on a particular lived experience or induce affect.

The Medium of Music

Throughout the discussion my colleagues implied that music is only truly authentic in its instrumental¹ – thus its sounded – form and is unique in its ability to create a musically affective experience. The idea of music as a sounded, instrumental composition is indeed paradigmatic in Western culture (Small, Delazari, Sadie & Latham, Abbate, Jankélévitch). Yet this conception of (Western) music prescribes only certain actions as musical actions (e.g. playing western instruments) and neglects other forms of music-making (see Small, Abbate, Jankélévitch). However, looking at other activities – such as speaking about music, the process of writing music or the contexts in which music is performed – already suggests that music has reaches that go beyond the production of instrumental sound. Moreover, if we turn to conceptual art, there are clear examples of how non-musical activities, in the classical (Western) sense, may be musical in a different way. Music in conceptual art, for example, can function as an intermedium. An intermedium is “an object, performance or event hovering in-between existing media” (Brillenburger Wurth 116). Conceptual art, in that it pushes media boundaries, has paved the way towards intermedial art – towards art that falls *in between* mediums (see Higgins, Brillenburger Wurth, Dayan, Pereira, Breder, Rippl). This art that lies between mediums “results in a new form that cannot (yet) be clearly determined” (Brillenburger Wurth 115) and it “uses traits or methods of different media at the same time” (Brillenburger Wurth 148). Music does not necessarily have to be a piece but can exist in different medial locations.² Music(k) in novels can be seen as a form of such an intermedium.

¹ The voice is here included as an instrument.

² An obvious example where music exists outside of its “normal” practice is in musical paintings. Paul Klee's *In the Style of Bach*, and *Cooling in the Garden of the Torrid Zone* for example, are both technically paintings. However, with their musical symbols can also be conceived of as music scores.

Compositions 1960, by conceptual artist La Monte Young, are a case in point. Young composed a series of text-based compositions, where a “score” in the traditional sense does not exist. Instead, the composition consists of instructions which the performer is to follow to the best of their ability. For example, *Composition #4* instructs the performer to:

Announce to the audience that the lights will be turned off for the duration of the composition (it may be any length) and tell them when the composition will begin and end.

Turn off all the lights for the announced duration.

When the lights are turned back on, the announcer may tell the audience that their activities have been the composition, although this is not at all necessary. (Young)

This composition is clearly not a “normal” piece in the traditional sense. It is hard to categorize – it is both music and not music. The composition “itself” is not the focus but the emphasis is on its performative and affective dimensions. This performance can trigger different responses from its audience – bewilderment perhaps, or one might find it amusing. Regardless, the *Piano Piece* stretches the boundary of what music – and literature – is. *Composition #4* draws attention to how *any* sound can be a form of music, regardless of intentionality or awareness on the recipient’s behalf that something *is* music. *Composition #4* is similar to Cage’s *4’33”* where the performer is to sit at the piano for 4 minutes and 33 seconds, without playing a single note. Rather than the instrument’s sound, the sounds that arise naturally out of those silent minutes are the composition. Again, the process and the experience for the audience is more important than the piece. Similarly, Cage’s “Lecture on Nothing” and “Lecture on Something” (1950) are musical performances that have been constructed out of words rather than notes and where the performance carries more weight than what is being said (Pritchett 171). The impact of the sounds is much more important than the meaning of the words. These lectures are very close to musical novels in that music is scored through words. In effect, Young and Cage engage with the question of what is music and what can it do? What kind of experience can it create, and can this experience be transformative? Cage and Young’s compositions stretch the idea of what is traditionally understood to be “music” in the Western world. Implicitly their work suggests that “music” is an inadequate term to capture all of what “music” really is.

Musicking

Seeking to capture the overlooked in “music”, musicologist Christopher Small advocates talking about *musick* rather than music. Small believes that music is fundamentally an activity, not a thing. As such, any activity related to music making, in whatever capacity, constitutes musicking.

Setting up lighting for a music show, attending a concert, or promoting a concert are all forms of musicking. Small argues that a theory of musicking

is not just an affair for intellectuals and “cultured” people but an important component of our understanding of ourselves and of our relationships with other people and the other creatures with which we share our planet. (13)

Musicking is thus not only for elite people, but for *everyone*. Rather than focussing on the particular organisation of particular sounds, musicking is concerned with how relationships and musical or social meaning is established, developed or confirmed (216). A person’s perspective about particular values, priorities, or relationships with others can thus be revealed in the way in which one musicks. With its emphasis on how relationships are formed, represented and enacted, musicking is ultimately “a political act in the widest sense” (13). Evidenced through power relations, the political nature of musick also points to why examining how musicking works is important. In removing the focus on music’s audibility and towards musick as action opens up avenues for exploring whether music(k) in other mediums, such as conceptual art or literature, can also induce a music(k)al experience. If music can be presented and experienced by way of other media than sound production alone then, perhaps, literature can also be ‘music’, or at least have an impact in a way that is similar to audible music. The question then, for this thesis, is whether and to what extent, literature can function as a musical intermedium.

Small’s idea of musicking, while useful, ultimately remains focussed on how musicking contributes to an audible performance. That is, Small does not consider how musicking may exist in writing or reading about musick within other contexts, such as literary musicking. However, it is my contention that reading and engaging with musical novels should be seen as an important component of musicking. For one, musicking creates the possibility to expand the focus of analysis in musical novels. The analysis is no longer limited to mere descriptions of music, but also directs attention towards the context and relationships involved in musicking, such as the significance of a particular performance location or the particular choice of music. A second reason is that if musicking is really about participating in any kind of activity related to music, then it follows that the understanding of musicking should be broadened to include *all* activities available, such as whistling whilst cleaning, speaking about music – or, as is the case here, writing and reading about music. After all, reading a musical novel could be seen as a kind of musical performance with its own way of providing commentary on (political) relationships. Furthermore, if as Small contends that musicking is political, then surely it should be done in the fullest way possible? An analysis of the potential

impact of a literary music(k)al experience, using music(k)al ekphrasis as a guide, goes towards understanding and articulating this political potential.

State of the Art: Musical and Literary Interdisciplinarity

Writers and poets have long been interested in the musico-literary relationship. However, since the 19th and 20th century there has been a more invested interest in musical methods and themes (Bowie, Brillenburg Wurth, Neubauer, Kramer 1989, 2006, 2013, Dahlhaus). This interest affected artists' composition methods just as composers began to be interested in literary figures and other art forms. Particular literary and musical forms became simultaneously more dominant around the turn of the 19th century (Kramer 2013, Dahlhaus, Wolf, Small, Neubauer). The rise of the novel, for example, coincided with the rise of the symphony and the two art forms began to influence and inspire each other. This is evident in new musical genres like the symphonic poem (e.g. Franz Liszt's *Héroïde funèbre*, Jean Sibelius' *The Swan of Tuonela*), poems translated into an orchestral setting (e.g. Gustav Mahler's *Symphony No. 2 Resurrection*), or literary figures inspiring musical works (e.g. Richard Strauss' *Don Quixote*, Nikolai Rimsky-Korsakov's *Scheherazade*). At the same time, literature changed as authors began adopting "musical" methods in their writing. These methods often allowed readers to read as if they were listening – or at least what an author believed what musical listening was like – and see how music could be translated into a literary setting (Scher 2004, 1970, 1964, Wolf, Edgecombe, Bowen). This is evident in texts such as Virginia Woolf's *Mrs Dalloway* where the plot is structured like a fugue, or in the *Sirens* section of James Joyce's *Ulysses* where words represent music. Much research has been done on discerning and articulating inter- and trans-medial movement across these two disciplines (Kramer, Neubauer, McClary, Wolf, Scher). This research has helped show that artistic disciplines do not arise in isolation but develop in reference to each other.

The combination of music and literature is termed musico-literary intermediality. Steven Paul Scher identifies three forms of musico-literary relationships: literature in music, literature with music and music in literature (1968, 1970). Examples of literature in music include Richard Strauss's symphonic tone poem *Don Quixote*, which is a musical telling of Miguel Cervantes' novel of the same name, or Felix Mendelssohn's *A Midsummer Night's Dream* inspired by Shakespeare's play. In the literature-in-music relationship the literary component is subservient to the music which is the main object. In the literature-with-music category there is no hierarchy between the disciplines; both literature and music are equally important in, for example, an opera. In the music-in-literature relationship the hierarchy between literature and music is opposite to that of literature-in-music. Here music is used in the services of literature. Examples of music-in-literature include poetry such as "When the Nightingale Sings" (author unknown), or Yeats' "The Fiddler of Dooney" and novels

such as *Bel Canto* by Ann Patchett or Leo Tolstoy's *Kreutzer Sonata* where music is a key feature in the text. As this research is exploring the way in which musicking plays a role in novels, the focus will be clearly on music-in-literature intermediality. This kind of intermediality is often referred to as musicalized literature.

One key scholar in regards to musicalized literature is Werner Wolf. In his book *The Musicalization of Fiction* Wolf provides a comprehensive overview and analysis of how literature and music can be compared and analysed next to each other. After appreciating the work of other scholars (such as Scher, Calvin S. Brown and John Neubauer) he goes on to critique the kind of literature that is chosen for analysis, noting that "most discussions of 'musicalized literature' privilege lyrical poetry, thereby relegating attempts at a musicalization of fiction to a level of secondary interest – if fiction is discussed at all" (6). Because poetry has a rhythmic dimension, it is much easier to compare poetry and music – especially songs which have lyrics – to each other. In effect, Wolf's claim is that scholars have been too limited in their objects of analysis and largely ignored the potential of wider applications of musicalized fiction such as novels. To that end, Wolf explores the formal elements of how a text may or may not be musicalized. For example, his case study of Anthony Burgess' *Napoleon Symphony*, which follows the structure of a symphony and where chapters are titled as movements, explores whether novels can really be read the way a symphony is read (197).

Much valuable research has been done by Wolf in exploring how the two mediums can interact and inform each other. However, his focus on the formal elements results in neglecting the content of musico-literary intermediality. For example, Wolf has done little work on what happens to a piece of (non-verbal) music which has been written about (i.e. music in a novel as opposed to being heard). Questions such as *does the meaning of a piece change, or how is a piece of music transformed by being worded* are often not given their due attention. The scholar who gets the closest is Lawrence Kramer. Kramer cuts to the heart of non-verbal musico-literary intermediality when he asks the following questions:

In what sense can words, the essential instrument of interpretation, translate meanings formed in the non-verbal, seemingly non-referential medium of music? This cognitive question subdivides into the question of means (What is it we interpret in music? How do we know what we know about it?) and the question of content (When we put words in music's mouth, what kinds of things should we ask it to say?) (2006 xii)

Kramer identifies that the inherent difference between (non-verbal) music and literature is that literature and music give words a significantly different role in interpreting meaning. Kramer goes on

to answer his questions through close reading both compositions and literary texts which take a musical piece as the main plot device, such as the *Kreutzer Sonata*. In Kramer's close analysis of both Beethoven and Tolstoy's *Kreutzer Sonata*, Kramer carefully considers both how the meaning of the composition changes in the light of a close reading of the novel, as well as how to understand Tolstoy in the light of the musical analysis.

The Musico-Literary Experience

Rather than looking at how music's meanings can change through literature, an alternative area for research is looking at what musical literature can *do* for a reader. According to Ivan Delazari, a musical novel can stimulate a reader to have a musical experience (xxi, 6, 131). Looking at acousmatization, auricularisation and ocularization – three different techniques of describing music, and which will be described in more detail in the following chapter – Delazari considers how instrumental music may become present in the text and how the text itself may be a piece of music. Delazari is careful to note that musical novels *invite* the reader to a musical experience (137). That is, there is an awareness that not all readers respond the same way to a text because of one's background and attitude towards (musical) novels. What Delazari does point towards is how a text's form and content can lend itself to particular kinds of musical experiences.

Delazari's idea of a musical experience is very similar to the idea of a literary experience in general. In research done by Olivia Fialho, it was observed that readers

vividly imagined the setting and characters in texts (imagery), recognized aspects of themselves or others in characters (identification), enacted and embodied the experiences of a character (experience-taking), evaluated characters positively or negatively (character evaluation), felt sympathy and compassion for characters (sympathy), and noticed which words, phrases or sentences were particularly striking or evocative to them (aesthetic awareness). For the readers investigated, these particular experiences preceded new or deeper insights into themselves and others (self-other insights). (Fialho 8)

Fialho's research indicates that one of literature's role is to create an experience for its audience, a point echoed by Delazari in regards to musical literature. More significantly, the reading experience in Fialho's research often led to a transformative experience. According to Fialho for some readers, the "experience [of reading] seems to have transformative powers as it deepens our understanding of the position of self in the world" (6), an idea which runs parallel to Small's idea of political musicking. In other words, literature, like music, has the potential to transform its audience and articulate (political) relationships. What Fialho also talks about is how literature is able to be transformative because it engages with the reader on an affective and embodied level (6). The

concept of affect has been defined and applied in a myriad of ways, and which will be examined more thoroughly in the following chapter. Suffice to say for now, that affect is an embodied response to something. Art, including literature and music, can arouse affect by employing particular strategies that engage the reader and that gives rise to affective responses.

(Music(k)al) Ekphrasis

One of the strategies for sustaining an intensification is the use of ekphrasis. Ekphrasis has been used since ancient times (Goehr 390, Goldhill 3, Cunningham 57, Bruhn 552). Initially used only to refer to making a painting “come alive” through words (Bruhn 552-3), today ekphrasis also refers to “bring to presence” other media in a second medium, such as making paintings feel “present” in music, or musical descriptions in literature (Bruhn, Goehr, Saintsbury, Krieger, Mitchell 1994, 1984). Musical ekphrasis has generally been an overlooked topic (Goehr 390), with the exception of two key scholars: Siglind Bruhn and Lydia Goehr. Bruhn’s work has focussed on the relationship between (programme) music and the visual arts, considering how instrumental music is able to represent other objects without the use of words (554, 590). Like Bruhn, Goehr considers musical ekphrasis in its relationship to the visual arts. She does, however, go broader in that she also considers musico-literary ekphrasis (407). Goehr’s aim is to give a comprehensive view of musical ekphrasis in its multiple forms and consequently she only pays limited attention to what musical ekphrasis in literature can do. As such, Goehr’s work on exploring how music can be made present in literature is a useful starting point for my research project.

Research Aims

In exploring the musico-literary interdisciplinary movement, however, what seems to be forgotten is investigating how invocations and descriptions of music actually *work* in literary works. Although there has been some limited research on musical ekphrasis, this has mainly considered how music is described rather than at what it can do. However, looking at *how* these musical descriptions in novels work raises the question whether music can be experienced also by narrative means. Exploring how music may be experienced by narrative means is important because it may change and broaden the classical (Western) idea of music as a performance involving musical instruments, voice and sound. This raises the question *is music only something to be significantly experienced through a performance involving musical instruments, or is there more at stake than live sounds?* In this thesis, I explore the question: How may a novel create a music(k)al experience and what may this music(k)al experience look like? I seek to answer these questions through a poetical analysis of three English novels – *The Music Shop* by Rachel Joyce, *The Cellist of Sarajevo* by Steven Galloway and *The Prague Sonata* by Bradford Morrow – considering to what extent these novels are capable of creating music(k)al experiences and what techniques are employed of to create this

experience. Each case study uses different techniques to create music(k)al ekphrasis and emphasize different music(k)al activities. Furthermore, the novels articulate both how literature can speak about musicking as well as how musicking is an effective tool for understanding how a music(k)al novel may induce a music(k)al experience. In considering the role of musickal ekphrasis, this research has two main aims. The first aim is to expand the current narrow understanding of musicking by articulating how it can be present in the arts outside of music. The second aim is to contribute an additional perspective of musico-literary intermediality that goes further than formal or superficial levels of comparison. Together, these aims point towards validating the process of doing art (in the broad sense of the word), thereby showing that art is significantly much more than the final product it produces.

Case Studies

The corpus of the English-language musical novel is quite large. Delazari has rightly signalled that it can be difficult to identify what a musical novel is. Novels can be musical in a formal sense and in regards to their content (4-5). The degree in which the music appears in the content also varies greatly – in one novel it may be the main subject matter, whereas in another it may be more in the background. Where music is at the forefront of the novel, the plot often revolves around a particular musician, with (pop) singers being a popular choice (e.g. *Bel Canto* by Ann Patchard, *The Song of the Lark* by Willa Cather, *Hide and Seek* by James Patterson, *Sing* by Vivi Greene). Pianists and string players also feature regularly (e.g. *A Note of Madness* by Tabitha Suzuma, *Trio* by Sue Gee, *The Piano Teacher* by Janice Y.K. Lee, *Disturbance of the Inner Ear* by Joyce Hackett), with wind and brass instruments featuring less frequently. In most musical novels, the main characters' involvement with music is in creating music, whether that be in rehearsals, composing or performing, and at both amateur and professional levels. Musickal activities such as researching music, as in *The Prague Sonata* or listening to music as in *The Music Shop* appear much less frequently.³

Out of this large corpus, many texts would have been appropriate for this research. The selected case studies therefore are not the only texts which could have been chosen; they are, however, especially productive. A key selection criterion was that a range of musickal experiences would be explored. Consequently, each case study needed to explore a different musical activity. A second selection criteria was that the featured musical element is instrumental and not vocal. This does not exclude vocal music, as *The Music Shop* does refer to vocal music at times, but it is not the dominant type of music in the novel. The reason for instrumental music is so that the analysis can

³To give an indication: in a 2019 *The Guardian's* list of the "Top 10 musical novels", only two do not feature a performer.

remain focussed on musickal ekphrasis rather than a comparison on a word-lyric plane. A third selection criteria was that the music featured was Western classical music. Each musical genre has its own traditions and conventions, and as a classically trained clarinettist my own area of expertise is Western classical music. This is therefore the area where I have the most knowledge to interpret musicking present in the novels. Because the music to be examined is Western classical music, it is not surprising that the case studies are also from the Western – that is, anglophone – tradition. I want to emphasize here, however, that this angle is a choice of personal expertise and not an indication of the value of a particular musical genre.

To that end, the three selected case studies are *The Music Shop*, *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, and *The Prague Sonata*. *The Music Shop*, which is about a vinyl record shop owner, concentrates on how one listens to music and how listening to music can be a transformative experience. In *The Music Shop* I consider to what extent the faithful translation of musical sound in a written text is possible or even desirable. *The Cellist of Sarajevo* revolves around the siege of Sarajevo where the performance of Albinoni's *Adagio* becomes significant. Although I have noted that performance as musicking activity has been somewhat overrepresented, it remains a dominant mode of musicking and consequently bears examining. Further, despite the title, the cellist is actually not the dominant focal point. Rather, the novel pays attention to how other citizens in Sarajevo relate to and interact with the performance. *The Prague Sonata* centres on the discovery of a Beethoven sonata manuscript, which has been imagined into being by the author. Here musicology and music research is the musickal activity, which, as mentioned earlier, is an underrepresented topic. *The Prague Sonata* explores how musick functions in the imagination. These case studies will be analysed through close reading, examining literary devices and descriptions of musick in order to understand how musical ekphrasis aids in understanding musicking more thoroughly. Further, the role of musicking and musickal ekphrasis in the literary text will be explored: what do the descriptions contribute to plot or character development, for example? What kind of themes or messages emerge through their use in novels? Or, what kinds of musickal experiences is the reader invited to?

Chapter 1: Theoretical Grounding

The focus of this chapter is to establish a theoretical framework through which the case studies for this research will be analysed. The present chapter will start with a discussion of what music is and make a distinction between music and Small's notion of musick. The second section will consider how music(k) is given form and shape in texts. To explore how music(k) in literature can be conceptualized, I will rely on W. J.T. Mitchell's work on representation and the image. Although Mitchell's theory already dates back to the 1980s and is focused on the image, his characterization of representation still allows for a clearer analysis of music(k)al representation in a text. The third section considers one particular kind of music(k)al representation: musical ekphrasis. The fourth section takes up Ivan Delazari's idea that music in a text invites readers to a musical experience. It also combines Small, Mitchell and Delzari's theories to propose a new framework, namely of musickal experience through musickal ekphrasis. The final section explores in which ways a music(k)al experience may be created or induced by examining affect theory and affordance theory.

Music and Musicking

In Anglo-American and European circles there is a tacit understanding of what music is. When somebody talks to another person about music there is no need to first explain what is being talked about. Yet, when it comes to philosophically pinpointing what the substance of music is, suddenly the clarity disappears. In such debates, the meaning of "music" has been contested (Dahlhaus, Alperson, Kerman, Rink, Gant). Dictionaries tend to define music as particular arrangements of sounds (Merriam & Webster, Collins). The Cambridge Dictionary further adds that music is "intended to give pleasure to people listening to it". Along the same lines Sigmund Spaeth argues that music is "The Organization of Sound Towards Beauty" (author's emphasis, 7). However, music does not always work towards creating beauty. Sound can also be organized towards ugliness as Krzysztof Penderecki's *Threnody for the Victims of Hiroshima* clearly demonstrates. Dictionary definitions are further problematic because of their Eurocentric orientation. The Collins Pocket Dictionary, for example, defines music as "art form using a melodious and harmonious combination of notes", but it is particularly modern Western music that emphasizes the role of melody and harmony in music. The function of rhythm does not appear here although for many kinds of music it is the key component, such as in African music (Merriam). In Māori music melody is much more important than harmony (Barrow) and early Gregorian chant did not use harmony at all (Burkholder et al).

The various definitions of music mentioned above point towards an understanding of music as sound that is intentionally arranged, and therefore a human practice (Blacking 34. See also *How*

Musical is Man). However, that is by no means an uncontested stance. For example, Grégoire Herzog would argue that animals are also capable of creating music (4). Further, as was seen in the introduction, compositions such as Cage's *4'33''* or Young's *Compositions 1960* suggest that *all* sounds, organised or not, constitute music. To complicate defining music still further, there is a disjuncture between the general public and the academic community's conceptions of what music is. Bruno Nettl observes that whereas "most people do not consider composing, contemplating or even singing as the primary musical activity but instrumental performance" (5), in academic circles "far more attention has been given to composition than to [performance and improvisation]" (17). With the advent of performance studies, scholars have started paying more attention to the performative act of making music (Abbate, Cook 2006, 2004, Auslander, Taruskin, Davies, Bharucha et al.). However, in the field of musico-literary studies, Nettl's comment still has merit. When analysing music in novels, the point of analysis is often a particular music piece (Kramer, Wolf, Fisk, Newcomb, Karl & Robinson). In his analysis of Tolstoy's *The Kreutzer Sonata*, for example, Lawrence Kramer explores how an interpretation of Tolstoy's *Kreutzer Sonata* can inform an understanding of Beethoven's *Kreutzer Sonata* and vice versa. Music and word studies thus explore musico-literary interdisciplinarity from a too narrow angle. This is, in part, because scholars work from the premise that music is an object to be studied, rather than a process or an event.

As was noted in the introduction, Small would object to framing music as an object or tangible thing. Rather, Small suggests that music should be understood as an activity. 'Music', more precisely, is a verb, not a noun. As such, Small suggests that we reframe 'music' to 'to music' and its present participle "musicking'. In turning 'music' into a verb, Small re-evaluates what music is and what it is about. Any involvement with music making – singing as you vacuum clean, moving a piano for a performance, selling concert tickets or performing in one – is 'to music'. This means that anyone can 'music' – not just a select elite group (13). As noted in the introduction, Small argues that a theory of musicking is inherently a political matter (13). The reason why musicking is political is because:

The act of musicking establishes in the place where it is happening a set of relationships, and it is in those relationships that the meaning of the act lies. They are to be found not only between those organized sounds which are conventionally thought of as being the stuff of musical meaning, but also between the people who are taking part, in whatever capacity, in the performance; and they model, or stand as metaphor for, ideal relationships as the participants in the performance imagine them to be: relationships between person and person, between individual and society between humanity and the natural world even perhaps the supernatural world. (13)

In other words, understanding ‘music’ as ‘musicking’ turns attention away from objects (e.g. a score) and towards relationships and musical or social meaning. These relationships and meanings become political through power plays. For example, Small does not like attending symphonic concerts because to him they are a reflection of power imbalances and unmerited nostalgia (16, 43, 213). In his view, attending a symphonic concert—of any composer—reflects power imbalances not only because the experience requires listeners to sit silently, passively, and to be overawed by the music and virtuosity of the performers, but also because of the tyrannical power the conductor has over the musicians. Furthermore, Small associates symphonic concerts with grand, ostentatious concert halls which he feels has no relevance in today’s society. The relationships inherent in a symphonic concert do not align with Small’s principles and consequently, he chooses to musick in a different manner. Thus, when the emphasis is on how someone participates in the musickal world and what one’s way of musicking can say about them, the dynamics of musical meaning and (interpersonal) relationships change significantly.

The power of Small’s concept is that music is no longer limited to sounds produced in music. Rather, musicking can explain why music – and especially *all* forms of musickal activity – is such a valuable asset to society. It is to that end that musicking has been used to argue for general music education in schools, special education or therapy (Odendaal et al., Cappelen & Andersson, Hess, Juntunen et al., Boyce-Tillman). Musicking has, however, remained neglected in (musico-)literary studies. The question I would therefore like to raise in this thesis is: would musicking also be a workable concept for exploring literary approaches to music i.e. in the field of word and music studies? Although according to his own theory, musicking encompasses *any* activity related to music-making, Small still emphasizes that musicking is “first and foremost, *performing* and *listening*” (my emphasis, 214). That is, other activities such as reading about music are not necessarily part of Small’s definition. Reading programme notes at a concert would be a musickal act because it relates directly to the performance at hand; reading a novel about music is not directly related to the performative experience of sounded music. However, the concept of musicking has the potential to change the way in which music in literature is examined. Musicking allows the possibility of analysis that goes beyond descriptions of music as compositions or as performances. Musical ekphrasis turns into musickal ekphrasis. This is important because if musicking is really about participating in any kind of activity related to music, then it follows that the understanding of musicking should be broadened to include *all* activities available in musicking. If musicking is important because of its political potential, as Small contends, then surely it should be done in the fullest way possible, including literary musicking? An analysis of the presence of musicking in novels, using musical ekphrasis as a guide, goes towards understanding and articulating this political potential.

Though musicking thus emerges as a very useful concept in reorienting ourselves to music as an activity, there is still a certain danger to it: it threatens to exclude compositions and performances in the classical sense. But compositions and sound productions remain a key part of musical activities (Small, Kramer, Brown, McAuley et. al, Martineau). Therefore, throughout this research, I will be using both 'music' and 'musick', to be as inclusive as possible. When the term 'musick' is used, this will refer to the participating of musical activities in the broad sense of the word, including compositions and performing. When exclusively referring to scores, compositions or the audible production of sound, I will use the term 'music'.

Representation and Images

At the heart of my research is the question of the texted representation of music versus the sounded representation. Representation is a key term whose definition, like the term music, is contested. There are several reasons why knowing what representation is and how it functions is important. Firstly, the notion of representation also harks back to my opening question: why would one *read* about music, when the possibility of *listening* to it exists? Within the musical world, and especially the Classical music world, there is also a sense that music in novels is a poor imitation of the "real" thing (Delazari 6, Small 4). After all, as Walter Pater's famous saying goes, "All art constantly aspires towards the condition of music" (106) and literary representations of music are assumed to fall short in the light of "actual" music.⁴ Further, a discussion on representation allows for questions such as what modes of representation there are for objects – and more abstract things such as concepts – so that they are more easily accessible? More pertinently for this research – how does representation function when the "original" object is represented in another medium, such as sound into text?

The underlying assumption in a critique of literary representations of music is that audible music has unique qualities that are not easily transferrable to other mediums (Delazari 3, Bowie 3, Small 200). It thus follows that alternative representations of music can never reach the same excellence as in its audible form. For example, Small argues that "in musicking, in engaging in any capacity in a musical performance, we are articulating matters for which words are not only inadequate but are also unnecessary" (200). According to Small, then, words get in the way of being able to experience musick to its fullest depths. Delazari comments that a novel "forever fails to compete with music's physical, structural, and affective powers" (xxiii). Underlying in these

⁴ As Goehr points out, Pater's comment about all arts aspiring to the condition of music has been taken out of context to suggest exactly the opposite of what he meant (399). Pater here precisely opens the way for verbal and visual representations of music in other arts, arguing that other art forms are capable of being a kind of music. However, decontextualised, Pater's statement is often used to indicate music's superiority over other art forms (Goehr 400).

comments is the tacit argument that that worded representations of music(k) are a poor imitation of the superior sounded medium. The gap between literary and musical representations is thus seen in a negative light. However, there is an alternative perspective which sees literary music(k)al descriptions in a more positive vein: it creates the opportunity and space for productive intermedial experimenting (Smith, Radomil, Breder, Mitchell, Wolf). W. J. T. Mitchell's understanding of representation and images justifies exploring this alternative, intermedial perspective.

The strength of Mitchell's argument is that his conception allows for a different understanding of images where representation is not necessarily about being a direct copy of an object which indirectly creates a hierarchy between 'original' and 'copies' of objects. Rather, Mitchell's definition creates room for approaching representation "with an eye toward the relationships and processes through which representations are produced, valued, exchanged etc" (Vukcevic np). The focus on relationships between and within representations matches well with Small's idea of musicking. Both Small and Mitchell look at how music and images, respectively, are able to articulate relationships between people, objects and abstract concepts. Mitchell's article "What is an Image?" (1984) explores how these relationships come into play.

An "image" can refer to a wide range of things. Mitchell identifies three broad types of images: the graphic, mental and the verbal image. Mitchell argues that the graphic image has traditionally been given the highest rung on the image hierarchy scale. The graphic image is a tangible, material object, which everyone can physically see in front of them. Consequently, this is traditionally thought of as the "proper" use of the word 'image' and denoting mental and verbal images as suspect "illegitimate offspring" (507). The supposition that everyone can see the same thing is not the only reason why the graphic image is considered superior. Mitchell goes on to say that because a graphic image is material, people assume it is the "original" image – that is, the "real thing". As such, the "real thing" is equivalent to being the "truth". Anything that is not a material or graphic image, such as the mental image, is therefore considered an "illegitimate offspring" because it is only a copy of this "real" or "original" image (511).

That mental images have been relegated to the position of "illegitimate offspring" is because "we cannot point to them and say 'there – that is a mental image'" (510), in the way we can with a graphic image. Unlike the graphic image, each individual person constructs their own mental image and is thus not a tangible object in the same way that the graphic image is. A mental image can take various forms – such as remembering an event from childhood, seeing a particular colour, or consists of (abstract) concepts.

Another “illegitimate offspring” of the graphic image is the verbal image. A verbal image relates to the way language works to create pictures. There are two angles from which a verbal image can be considered. The first way is where a verbal image is seen as “metaphoric, figurative or ornamented language, a technique that deflects attention away from the literal subject of the utterance and toward something else” (513). That is, a verbal image is created when poetic language shifts the attention away from a tangible object and towards its representation in the new medium. Alternatively, a verbal image can be explained as when “words signify [nothing] other than our old friends, the ‘mental image’ that have been impressed on us by experience” (514). In other words, there is an original impression or object. A person creates a mental image of this original, which is then written down. The written down version is the verbal image (517). This kind of verbal image is more tangible than the mental image – they are open to the public, so to speak. This is because there is a tangible object – a printed verbal image – and where a neighbour sees the exact same letters.

Mitchell argues that the basis for placing the graphic image above the mental image has been premised on the supposition that both the mental image and verbal image are only an imitation of the original (graphic) image. Furthermore, because they are one or two steps removed from the original, mental and verbal images are subject to interpretation, in a way that a graphic image is not. Mitchell deconstructs this hierarchy by arguing that the graphic image is *not* stable, and just as open to interpretation as the mental and verbal image is. Mitchell argues “that, contrary to common belief, images “proper” are not static or permanent in any metaphysical sense; they are not perceived in the same way by viewers any more than are dream images” (507). A graphic image is not an “object of truth” because the creation of the image is subject to contextual constraints. Subject choices, the use of particular materials, or the codes of representation all influence the shape of this graphic image. Once the image has been created, all people do not interpret it the same way: different people can see different things in the same material image. A more useful way, according to Mitchell, would be to see *all* images as a sign (517): the graphic, mental and verbal image are all different forms of a kind of hieroglyphics (517). This means that the hierarchy of each type of image becomes irrelevant because it does not exist. Mitchell is therefore more interested in *how* particular meanings have been attached to these hieroglyphics or signs in the first place (520), rather than *whether* these signs are the “truth” or are “fakes”. Assuming that all images are equal, then the premise that “you could just listen to music instead of reading it” no longer holds. Rather, these are two different representations of music which are equally valid. Because the forms of these representations are different, they hold different affordances, something which will be examined in more detail later.

As Mitchell's line of thinking illustrates, thinking about representation, and especially music(k)al representation, in terms of "original" and "not original" is problematic. Music(k) complicates identifying an "original" representation. Classically trained musicians create a sounded representation derived from a graphic representation i.e. the score, which for them is the "original" version. A composer, however, may have first had an idea in their mind before creating a graphic representation of that idea. The composer's original is thus the *mental* representation. Furthermore, ideas are often dependent on knowing what musical sounds sound like beforehand, which is often done through "live" experimenting. The question is then raised at what point did the sounds transition from being experimental to being (a part of) a "real" composition. The hierarchy between different modes of representation thus breaks down when what is "truly" the original is unclear. Literary descriptions of music are thus not able to be categorised as second-class citizens in the world of musical representation. Rather, literary and auditory representations are two different ways of experiencing music with different particular goals in mind.

Reinforcing the idea that locating the "original" image is irrelevant is the fact that images are not stable but change over time. The lines in a graphic image may fade over time. Something else to consider is the mental or auditory image of the score. A musician who reads the score, will interpret the same piece differently – that is, they have a different idea (mental image) of how that music should sound. As a practicing musician, I often have an 'image' in my mind of how I want to play something. Many musicians create this image intentionally and it is not only visual, but especially auditory: a musician can audibly 'hear' in their mind what they are about to play, and it can be problematic when this image is absent.

Ultimately, then, breaking down the hierarchy in images renders the whole question of "original" and "copy" moot. The assertion by musicians that literature is not an exact replica of sounded music remains true, but this does not mean that a literary image is inferior. The gap between text and music is an asset, not a problem. As Mitchell himself says: "The point, then, is not to heal the split between words and images, but to see what interests and powers it serves" (53). Or, as the case is here, the split between words and music has no need of healing but is rather a productive site for experimentation.

Through the exploration of images and the different modes of representation available, it has become clear that literary representations of music are just as valid as music "itself". Music in literature – a literary musicking if you will – is just as legitimate a form of musicking as music itself. Rather than there being a "fake" act of music(k)ing at play, musicking in literature points towards a new object, that is as valid and real as the non-existent, but assumed, original. Music in literature is

indeed a different way of giving a presentation of music to its audience than hearing or actively creating music. It is not, however, a step removed from creating or hearing “real” music; rather it is an instance of remediation. Consequently, the question of why someone would read about music rather than listen to it is the wrong question to ask as it assumes that reading replaces listening to, or participating, in music making. Rather, the question would be to ask, what does this particular mode of representation do? What does the auditory representation of music do, or what does literary representation of music afford? In order to answer these questions, a close examination of one particular form of representation is necessary, namely music(k)al ekphrasis, a term already encountered in the above.

Music(k)al Ekphrasis

The term ekphrasis was originally used in a much more limited sense than how it is used today. Ekphrasis used to only relate to the verbal description of pictures. At its core, ekphrasis is the verbal representation of a visual representation (Mitchell 1994 152). Ekphrasis was already used in ancient Greek times, especially in rhetoric. It was employed for different reasons and it

could bring a subject back to the present and to presence to explain an event, to win an argument or case, to create astonishment or wonder, to move listeners towards indignation or shock, or to render an argument or image vivid, clear, perspicuous, illuminating, and persuasive. (Goehr 395)

Ekphrasis was thus an effective tool to convince an audience in rhetoric. Today ekphrasis has a far wider scope and now also refers to other kinds of intermedial artworks, such as musical descriptions in literature, or literary moments in music.

Although *what* was included under the term ekphrasis has expanded, one key characteristic has remained unchanged. That is, ekphrasis continues to refer to a first medium making an object tangible in a second medium. Thus, George Saintsbury calls ekphrasis a “set description intended to bring person, place, picture &c., vividly before the mind’s eye” (491). Murray Krieger argues that literature imitates the artwork (265,267). Mitchell goes even further and argues that ekphrasis can be a mode of giving voice to a mute art object (1994 155). Ekphrasis thus goes beyond mere description of an object but attempts to make the absent object feel real in the second medium.

Musical ekphrasis thus exists in two directions. The first is where a piece of music brings to *presence* another artwork or text. Modest Mussorgsky’s *Pictures at an Exhibition*, for example, bring to life (imagined) paintings at a museum. Richard Strauss’ *Don Quixote* is an example of a novel being represented in music. The second direction is the opposite, where music is brought to mind in

another medium, such as music in a novel. Although writing in 2010, Lydia Goehr's observation that both forms of musical ekphrasis have not really been given their due attention by scholars (393) still stands today. An exception to this is Siglind Bruhn who has done a lot of work on the relation between (programme) music and the visual arts in her book *Musical Ekphrasis: Composers Responding to Poetry and Painting*. Although this is not my area of focus, Bruhn's work is still useful because of her emphasis on non-verbal music. Consequently, she speaks about the way in which instrumental music is able to articulate narratives or represent a second object without using words, and, more importantly, *how* instrumental music is able to do so.

Another important scholar in the field of musical ekphrasis is Goehr (already mentioned here above). In her article *How to do More with Words: Two Views of (Musical) Ekphrasis*, Goehr traces the trajectory of how musical ekphrasis came to be defined and used in its current form. In covering multiple forms of musical ekphrasis, Goehr also pays attention to musico-literary ekphrasis. In her analysis of ekphrasis in E.M. Forster's *Howards End*, Goehr notes that the musical passages are ultimately not about the music itself. Instead, Goehr questions whether one could "read Foster's description as a critique of 'unserious' listening practices in the concert hall" (407). This kind of questioning points towards answering what musical ekphrasis can do for literature, or asking what kind of themes or messages these musical moments articulate. Goehr's line of questioning resonates with Small's idea of musicking. Musicking is not there for its own sake, but is a way to probe different relationships. *Howards End* is a novel about social conventions and relationships; Goehr's questions give musical ekphrasis the space to contribute to that discussion. However, Goehr's attention on musical ekphrasis in novels is fleeting, which is unfortunate because there is much more which can be said about the role and value of musical ekphrasis in literature. One scholar who does delve more deeply into literary musical ekphrasis is Ivan Delazari with his concept of musical experiences.

[Auricularization, Ocularization and Acousmatization](#)

Although Delazari employs a different vocabulary than musical ekphrasis, in effect, the point of departure for the analyses of his case studies are ekphrastic passages. These ekphrastic passages mainly make use of three techniques: auricularization, ocularization and acousmatization.

Auricularization is a term which refers to the way in which a character articulates diegetic sound (Nelles 95) and which Delazari defines as "the term to embrace prose passages that foreground sound to make the reader hear, just like vivid descriptions make the reader see" (25).

Auricularization thus emphasizes the sounds of music. In contrast, ocularization, in Delazari's terms, is when "the auditory gives way to the visual – imaginary pictures that, once those images cease to be static and start moving along, may make up filmic storylines, with speculative events and

characters of their own” (xvii). That is, descriptions of sound are replaced by descriptions of (imaginary) images or narratives which are evoked by the music. When auricularization and ocularization is in use, the reader does not need to know musical terminology. When acousmatization is employed, however, a musical background is beneficial. Acousmatization “[is comprised of] references to specialized notions of music theory or lean upon those qualities of verbal narrative that are no less abstract than elements of musical form: motifs and parallelisms, risings and fallings, climaxes and framings” (xviii). That is, acousmatization makes use of musical jargon to describe the music. An author may, of course, use more than one technique at a time in order to strengthen the presence of music(k) in the novel. Although musical ekphrasis enables music to feel present in a novel, that is not the end goal. Rather, musical ekphrasis is a tool for a novel to induce a literary musical experience (7, 41). What this literary-musical experience entails will be explored in the following section through an examination of Delazari’s notion of musical simulacra.

Delazari and the Musical Experience

Word and music studies has been a rich field of research since the 1950s, if not since the late 18th century (Kramer, Goehr, Neubauer, Brown, Winn, Langer, Leppert, McClary, Scher, Wolf). These scholars have, in various ways, considered the relations between words and music. What scholars have mostly neglected to do, however, is to look closely at the effect and affect of worded descriptions of music. A very recent exception to this is Delazari who contends, in his 2021 book *Musical Stimulacra*, that wording music invites the reader to have a musical experience different in shape and form than a live listening or music-making experience is. Delazari argues that a literary musical experience is a mode for a reader to “recognize the verbal narrative as a window on music” (131) and a novel can thus give insight into the practice of music(k). A worded musical experience can be created in various ways and produce different affects as will be seen later in the close readings of *The Music Shop*, *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, and *The Prague Sonata*.

Delazari’s starting point for exploring literary representations of music is Baudrillard’s concept of simulacra, which can be defined as a sign that eclipses the reality it is supposed to mediate. There is a four-step process to reach the point where reality is replaced by an image. The first step is that an image “is the reflection of a profound reality” (6). Here an image or symbol functions as a likeness of the “original” object it mirrors; a symbol accurately describes reality. The second step is that an image “masks and denatures a profound reality” (6). The symbol or image now inaccurately describes reality. The third phase is that an “image masks the absence of a profound reality” (6). An image or symbol pretends to pretend to describe reality. The final phase is that an image “has no relation to any reality whatsoever: it is its own pure simulacrum” (6). That is, the image or symbol ultimately has no connection to the object that is being (re)presented. In fact, a

simulacrum is no longer a representation because the “original” object no longer exists. Similarly, Delazari argues that music is not tangible in the way an image is and because music is not considered an imitative art (like painting is), it does not have an “original” and consequently is situated in the fourth phase (xv). According to Delazari, music in fiction can be seen as a simulacrum because “it signifies nothing in the extraliterary reality, because its verbal surrogate is fictive anyway” (xv). In effect, Delazari argues that music in fiction is a double simulacrum because music in the “real” world is fictional and because the literary world does not exist in the “real world”, so music in that fictive setting cannot represent an “original” object. However, as Baudrillard points out, just because something is a simulacrum, this does not mean that it is not “true” or “real” (1). Just because the music in literature is not “real” it does not mean that it does not exist. In literary music, no reader “is tricked into thinking that the music is in, under, or behind the text, while for real, it is nowhere to be found” (xvi). Rather, a new conception of the point of music in novels is needed. Delazari suggests that “literary narrative is a pre-phase of musical experience – a pretext for readers to listen *for* some music in the text and, perhaps, *to* more music afterward” (xvi). One of the roles of literary evocations of music is, in other words, to create a musical experience both inside a text and to invite the reader to a musical experience outside of the text.

The idea of a musical experience runs parallel to the idea of a literary experience. Delazari notes that:

Verbal narrative is certainly different from instrumental music, both physically and perceptively, but the cognitive apparatus producing and receiving both kinds of stimulations is the same. Fiction, like music, emerges in the embodied mind’s eyes and ear. Physical interfaces of fiction and music (the sound of words or musical notes, both recordable in writing) are akin. (30)

Both musical and literary experiences can thus be considered as embodied performative acts (cf. Searle, Genette, Austin, J. Young, Delazari). In this sense, the gap between music and words is no longer so big – the two disciplines are not so far apart after all. Despite the very different toolsets for their modes of representations, both music and literature are ultimately closely related in that the aim is to provide their audience with an experience that is simulated in the mind (Delazari 15, 30, 33). Sounded music and worded music both offer its audience an experience using different tools and techniques, counteracting the idea that worded representations of music would be inferior, because they are derived, forms of music.

Delazari’s concept of musical experience is productive for exploring what happens to instrumental music that becomes worded. Consequently, it will provide the theoretical framework

for examining the case studies in this thesis. However, I do want to expand Delazari's concept by merging it with Small's idea of musick. Like Kramer, Wolf, Scher and others, Delazari continues to understand music as a thing. But, by its very nature the idea of musical experiences invites a reframing of understanding music as a verb and as an activity – that is, the idea of musicking. I will argue in my case studies that not only does a worded version of music provide a musical experience, it will invite the reader to a *musickal* experience. This distinction is important because musicking encompasses all activities related to the musical field. Like Small's idea that music is foremost a performative or listening activity, Delazari's understanding of the musical experience limits the reader to a performative (music-making) or listening experience. But as pointed out earlier, musicking suggests that musick exists in spaces beyond performing or listening. Bradford Morrow's *The Prague Sonata*, where music exists in an imagined form only, is a clear example of a reader being invited to a *musickal* experience, and not only a *musical* one, something which will be explored further in Chapter 4.

There are therefore two frameworks at play in this research for exploring worded music(k): one based in cognitive studies that takes music in fiction to be a simulacrum, and the other rooted in musicology and performance studies that takes any activity related to music-making as a valid form of music. By combining Delazari's idea of a musical experience with Small's concept of musicking space is created to expand the idea of musical ekphrasis. The function of musical ekphrasis – making music feel present in literature – is to afford a musical experience. In the light of Delazari and Small, a reader can also be offered a *musickal* experience. It follows then, that *musickal* ekphrasis is what invites the reader to have this musickal experience. Novels do not necessarily only recall to mind *music* but also *musick*. Mitchell has shown that the hierarchy of the "original" over the "copy" is a false theory and consequently music in fiction should not be marked as a poor imitation of the "real" thing but is equal to a sounded representation of music. Delazari goes a step further and suggests that a texted mode of music is not simply a representation of music but a different mode of experiencing music. Or, in Small's terms, a different musickal activity. And if musicking is political, as Small has asserted, it follows that a texted musickal experience is also political and able to explore relationships between self and the world. A texted musickal experience is therefore not only a window into music, as Delazari claims, but can also be a window into (political) relationships between the self and Other. This research thus looks into these windows by exploring three case studies. The window in the first novel, *The Music Shop*, shows that listening to music is both personal and relational. *How* one listens, and *what* a person listens to shapes not only a person's musical tastes but is also a reflection of that person's identity. One does not listen to music, but musicks by

listening. Although *The Music Shop* does make use of songs i.e. music that utilizes words⁵ which would seem to preclude the inclusion of *The Music Shop* as a relevant case study, I have chosen to include it for two reasons. The first reason is that when songs are chosen in the novel, they are chosen not only for the words, but also because of their affects. To put it differently, songs and instrumental pieces are treated equally in the novel and so the danger of analysing the words instead of the musical content is minimized. The second reason for inclusion is that when words are given priority, it is always in the service of enhancing the musical ekphrastic moments and the point of the analysis of *The Music Shop* is to show the various ways in which musical ekphrasis is realized. The window in the second novel, *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, reveals that music(k)ing can change behaviour. That is, engaging in musick can be transformative. In turn, power dynamics can be altered. The window in the final novel, *The Prague Sonata*, suggests that fictional music, i.e. music that does not exist outside of the novel, is a key element in crafting a comprehensive music(k)al experience.

Affect and Affordances

By combining Mitchell and Delazari, I propose that one could look at the worded representation of music as offering a particular music(k)al experience. What we have not yet discussed is *how* this music(k)al experience might be generated. For this, I turn to the notions of *affect* and *affordances*. As noted when discussing mediated representations in the context of Mitchell, instead of thinking some forms of representation as more or less “true” than others, different mediums are rather different ways of representing implying different “affordances”. Looking at affect will help us understand the idea of musical experience that is central to Delazari’s conceptualization of literary music.

Imagine for a moment going to a symphonic concert. Full of excitement you step into the concert hall and take your seat. When the concert begins the conductor walks out onto the stage; the audience applauds. Then the conductor lifts their arms and something magical begins. Music begins to play, and if it is a good concert, you are emotionally affected by it. At times the music is beautiful and makes you feel joyous on a deeper level than before. Another moment the music is bold and fierce, and your emotions travel along with that. Or, take the experience of reading a thrilling novel. The further into the novel, the more invested you are in the story. You live alongside

⁵ Compositions of Classical music, with the exception of vocal *lieder*, are not usually called a song, but a piece. Alternatively, it is called a composition or a work. Popular music and vocal Classical music tends to be called a song.

the characters, wincing when they do something stupid and celebrating their victories with them. Both of these scenarios are examples of affect at play, and we will turn our attention to it now.

Affect, as Eric Shouse points out, is very abstract because it “cannot be fully realised in language” (5). Consequently, it is difficult to identify affect or to say what it does. In fact, some scholars would argue that affect is an elusive phenomenon which escapes language and signification (Leys, Probyn, Massumi, Thrift, Scheer, Deleuze). Another factor that makes affect difficult to define is the fact that scholars have used affect both as synonymously with emotion and as something clearly distinct from emotions. Scholars such as Sara Ahmed and Charles Altieri tend to use affect synonymously with emotion. In contrast, Eric Shouse clearly differentiates between affect, emotions and feelings. Shouse defines affect as a “a non-conscious experience of intensity” (np). In other words, affect is the sensation of something before it is recognized as such; it is bodily and intra-relational rather than personal. When this affect is recognized and identified, it is translated into feelings. Finally, when this feeling is noted, it transitions into an emotion (Shouse np). Shouse follows the interpretation by Brian Massumi and Gilles Deleuze in this regard. For Deleuze, this experienced intensity that Shouse held to be affect is an important feature of art. Affect is an embodied mode of thinking, and what the artist can do with their art is to provoke its audience into thinking (Deleuze 161). Deleuze and Ernst van Alphen see affect as embodied and not-personal; it “precedes its expression in words and operates independently” (van Alphen 23). Although affect operates independently, it does not mean that it is not part of a social order. The transmission of affect is dependent on a social playing field – for example, other people, objects and an individual’s reaction to these players. Artistic texts can be one of these agents, and be active in awakening affect. They can do this actively, not in the sense of having intent or free will, but in the sense that they can sustain the sensation or intensification. According to van Alphen, “it is this sustaining of sensation that thrusts viewers into thinking, and into an encountered or embodied mode of critical enquiry” (23). Affect, then, can be seen as the underlying, embodied intensity that is a catalyst for thinking.

Affect is not only located in the body, but also in form (Armstrong, Hogan, Wimsatt, Brinkema, Levine). Caroline Levine maintains that form “always indicates *an arrangement of elements – an ordering, patterning, or shaping...* form, for our purposes, will mean all shapes and configurations, all ordering principles, all patterns of repetition and difference” (author’s emphasis 2-3). Form can thus be found in all kinds of experiences – artistic or otherwise – and the particular arrangements of elements can create or sustain affect. In literary terms such shapes and configurations can refer to, for example, narration, focalisation or the way the overall structure of a

novel is organised. Examples of musical form include timbre, pitch, rhythm and the way a composition is structured. An example of musical form is the way in which a concert setting is arranged. For example, in traditional symphonic concerts, the musicians sit on a stage with the audience in front of them; in experimental concerts, musicians may be seated next to the audience. While forms may be seen in all areas of life and art, it should be noted that different areas and mediums encourage or discourage certain forms, because of the way the medium works – its “affordances”. The notion of affordances suggests that particular arrangements of elements, i.e. form, lend themselves towards arousing (certain) affect(s).

The concept of affordance comes from design theory (Gibson, D. Norman, Baerentsen & Trettvik, Gaver, McGrenere & Ho) and refers to the way materials lend themselves to particular properties. For example, concrete lends itself to being strong and supportive. Its properties allow it to bear a lot of weight and is thus suitable as a foundation for buildings. In contrast, wood is more pliable and so its uses are more consistent with where that is valuable, such as the framework of a house. An element can have more than one affordance. The affordances are not limitless however – steel, for example affords both strength and smoothness, but it is not fragile like glass is. Levine also points out that objects “may also have unexpected affordances generated by imaginative users” (18), noting, for example, that a doorknob generally affords turning, but also can be used to hang clothes. In music, scholars have noted that particular conventions afford specific effects: “high sound volumes and timbres marked by high frequencies are heard as expressive of happiness and anger while low sound levels and timbres characterized by low frequencies are heard as expressive of sadness or tenderness” (J. Young 16, see also Juslin & Laukka, Scherer & Zentner, Cook, Bharucha et al.). Young specifically mentions how certain dynamics and timbres may afford a particular emotion or affect; other musical elements such as rhythm or melody also have their own affordances. However, as Levine notes, such conventions may also be repurposed by imaginative users.

In considering how affect and affordances are connected, Levine’s suggestion that “rather than asking what artists intend or even what forms *do*, we can ask instead what potentialities lie latent – though not always obvious – in aesthetic and social arrangements” (6) is helpful. In other words, an investigation of a particular set of forms can be examined for its affordances. It allows one to ask how those forms are utilized towards achieving affect or what potentialities are lying in the form. To put it in Delazari and Small’s terms – how do forms in musico-literary novels work towards creating a musical experience? And what kind of musical experiences do these forms create or sustain? To that end, the analyses in the following chapters of the cases studies, will include an examination of form – how do forms contribute to a music(k)al experience, and how do the

affordances of form lend themselves to particular affective and music(k)al experiences. First, however, it is necessary to have a closer look at what such music(k)al affects would be.

Music(k)al Affect

There is a huge debate in musicology regarding whether (instrumental) music has affective qualities. Music formalists “generally hold that music has no important link to emotion or that it is linked only to some special aesthetic emotion that is attendant upon experience of patterns of sound” (Young 2). That is, one may enjoy music for music’s sake and not because the listener is emotionally affected by it (see Zangwill, Kivy, Levinson, Hanslick 1986, 1957, Walker). In contrast, other scholars strongly argue that music *does* have affective properties (Young, DeNora, Adorno, Cochrane et. al, Cobussen & Nielsen). What these scholars have in common is an acknowledgement *that* music can be affective, even if not all pieces or recipients necessarily create or perceive it. As with general affect theory, musical affect can be located in different places. Cobussen & Nielsen place a strong emphasis on the embodiment of musical affect, going so far as to argue that “the main question here should not be what a specific sound or a piece of music could possibly mean but how they are able to influence subjects on a primary physical level” (100). The emphasis on the embodied aspect of affect is a useful starting point for this thesis as it creates space to explore multiple modes of musical representation. Embodied affect allows the question regarding the accuracy of the literary mode of musical representation to shift into asking how a particular mode of musical representation can influence one on a physical dimension. Another approach to musical affect is Theodor Adorno who suggests that (the right kind of) music can “aid enlightenment” (1973 15) and awaken a mode of consciousness. Adorno’s stance echoes van Alphen’s contention that art can provoke the recipient into thinking. Adorno’s approach comes close to semiotics. In musical semiotics the meaning of a composition is located in musical signs which can be decoded and interpreted (see Lerdahl & Jackendoff, Tarasti, Agawu, Lidov, and Monelle). Through semiotics one can thus gain insight into the affordances of the affective properties by decoding the meanings in musical signs. However, Tia DeNora argues strongly against using semiotic analysis to find affect, saying that “semiotics risks a kind of covert objectivism, a presumption that music’s meanings are immanent, inherent in musical forms as opposed to being brought to life in and through the interplay of forms and interpretations” (22). In effect, DeNora warns against hypostatizing musical signs, especially while ignoring other elements involved in creating musical affect. This is not to say that semiotic analysis is without value, but it is important to not “conflate ideas about music’s affect with the ways that music actually works for and is used by its recipients instead of exploring how such links are forged by situated actors” (DeNora 22). That is, affect in music is not present only in the music “itself”, but is at least partially contingent on social forces outside of the composition. Her

claim echoes van Alphen's view that affect in art works is contingent on social practices – or, on transmission between artworks and humans. Again, DeNora articulates this clearly in the following statement: “musical affect is contingent upon the circumstances of music's appropriation; it is ... the product of ‘human-music interaction’, by which I mean that musical affect is constituted reflexively in and through the practice of articulating or connecting music with other things” (34). Musical affect is thus not aroused purely through music, but is co-dependent on *musick*. That is, music “itself” does not produce affect on its own. As Small points out, musicking is concerned with how a person interacts in the world. It is these interactions and explorations, alongside music, that contribute to a music(k)al affect. Combining van Alphen and DeNora's definitions of (musical) affect brings us very close to Small's concept of musicking. Understood implicitly in musicking is that all aspects of making music create meaning together. Meaning is not lying inherent within an individual composition, ready for audience or scholars to identify and deconstruct. Rather, meaning is constructed through the interaction between different elements – between people, social conventions or forms – and their affordances.

Having now established the theoretical foundation, the following chapters will take up the three novels in order to explore whether the theory holds. In examining the case studies, attention will be paid to a variety of elements. This will include an exploration of how music(k)al ekphrasis is created in the novels, paying particular attention to form, auricularization, ocularization and acousmatization. These elements will be investigated in the light of what affects and affordances they raise which in turn will be discussed in terms of the music(k)al experience they offer the reader.

Chapter 2: *The Music Shop*

Joyce's *The Music Shop* was published in 2017. It is written in easy and colloquial English; chapters are usually quite short and range between being one and half pages to fourteen pages; the novel can be read in one or two sittings. Set in England in 1988, *The Music Shop* centres on Frank who sells vinyl records. Although Frank does not limit himself as to what kind of music he sells – Chopin, Beethoven, and Handel, but also Aretha Franklin, Miles Davies and the Beach Boys – he refuses to sell anything except for vinyls. Frank has a gift at knowing exactly which piece a customer *needs* to hear which is often different from what they *want* to hear. He does not play an instrument; rather his extensive musical knowledge stems from lessons with his unconventional mother, Peg. The focal point of the novel is Frank's relationship with Ilse. Ilse was a professional violinist but arthritis derailed her career. She leaves Germany for England and, ashamed by her musical failure, hides her background and refuses to even enjoy listening to music. Upon her request, Frank gives Ilse music lessons where he teaches her how to listen to music again. Although Frank does not know it at the time, the musical experience that Ilse needs is not to listen to musical sounds, but to hear his passion about music and how it affects people. In other words, musical affect is at the centre of the plot, making *The Music Shop* an exemplary novel for exploring musical ekphrasis and the musickal experience. In this chapter, I will argue that *The Music Shop* invites the reader to multiple kinds of musickal experiences. Furthermore, I will discuss the ways in which this novel may both stimulate and impede these musickal experiences.

In the first place, then, the reader is invited to experience a range of musickal experiences in *The Music Shop*. One of Joyce's most effective strategies to invite a reader to a musical experience is the way she has structured *The Music Shop*. As Delazari points out, the way a novel is structured can already set the reader up to being open for a musical experience in the content (37-41, 131). In other words, the form of the novel can afford the content a musical foundation. *The Music Shop* is divided into four sections and each section is set up as if it is one side of a vinyl. The first three "sides" are set in January, February, and Spring 1988 respectively. The final side, Side D, is set twenty-one years later in 2009. The further one is into the novel, the faster that time passes. Both Side A and Side B take place over a month. Side C takes place over three months and then there is a jump of twenty-one years to Side D. The time jump coincides with the metaphorical turning of the vinyl. A *Hidden Track*, where a reunited Frank and Ilse own a music shop together, closes the book. Before Side A begins, there is a prologue. The prologue begins with "There was once a music shop" (1) which immediately marks the music shop as an important location for the novel. The prologue goes on to describe the shop – it is messy, packed with vinyls; Frank is the owner with the gift of being able to find "the right rack in minutes" (2). The final sentence of the prologue repeats the

opening sentence: “There was a music shop” (2), emphasizing that music is going to be imperative to the story. The reader then comes across the title page of the first section: “SIDE A: JANUARY 1988” (3). Having previously ‘heard’ a description of the music shop and thus being virtually invited to a musical experience (Delazari 41), the reader is invited to understand the story structurally as music as well. Young points out that in music particular forms raise particular expectations (65). For example, in a concerto, the expectation is that a virtuoso soloist is accompanied by an orchestra. A new side on a vinyl can indicate a tonal shift. Thus in the novel when the reader thus sees “Side A” an expectation is raised that there will be a “Side B” in which there will likely also be a tonal or narrative shift. Form in *The Music Shop* suggests that that the entire novel can be seen as one large musical passage or composition. The reader is therefore invited to submit themselves to a musical affective response invoked by the novel as they would have experienced themselves when visiting the music shop in “real life”.

Another way in which the form is utilised to create a musickal experience is through Frank’s flashbacks which consistently interrupt the main plot. Frank’s flashbacks revolve around Peg’s music lessons and give insight into his childhood as well as explore his difficult relationship with Peg. Peg’s lessons gave Frank a feel for the particular affective properties of specific pieces. Because of her lessons, Frank knows that music can *do* things to people. Particular music pieces give people a particular musical experience. The flashbacks give insight not only into Frank’s upbringing, but also how certain pieces have affected Peg. The flashbacks always match what is happening in the main plotline. For example, when Frank wants to talk to Ilse about Bach, the next flashback is about Peg lesson on Bach’s cantatas (86, 87). When Father Anthony’s relationship to Frank is foregrounded in the main plot, the next flashback is about Vivaldi, the “red priest” (55-57). The flashbacks are always written in italics so it is always clear whether a chapter is part of the flashback or part of the main text. Interestingly, the flashbacks disappear completely in the final part of the novel; it in this section that Frank finally comes to terms with his complicated relationship with his mother. The structure of the novel thus illustrates that engaging with music is never only about a particular composition but about the social relations – in this case between Peg and Frank – that are encoded in that listening experience.

A second way in which *The Music Shop* facilitates a musickal experience is through the infusion of musical ekphrasis. Nearly every page has at least some ekphrastic moment, so the reader is inundated with musical descriptions of a wide range of music. These moments are located in two main circumstances. The first is in Frank’s shop when he finds the right music for his customers – for example, a man who only listens to Chopin finds, on Frank’s recommendation, solace in Aretha Franklin (9-12). The second is during the music lessons – between Peg and Frank, and between Frank

and Ilse. Consequently, a considerable amount of space is dedicated to describing music. What remains paramount in all of these descriptions is the characters' affective responses to the music they are listening to. In other words, focalisation is a strategy to afford multiple musickal experiences as each character listens to music in different manner.

In the first place, a key part of Peg and Frank's listening experience is contextualising the music they listen to. Before listening to Beethoven's *Moonlight Sonata*, for example, the reader becomes privy to Peg and Frank's lesson about the construction and meaning behind the composition. The key feature about the *Moonlight Sonata* is that it does not follow normal musical conventions. Most sonatas, especially in Beethoven's day, consisted of three movements. The first movement is usually fast, the second movement is slow, and the final movement is fast again (Rosen, A. B. Marx, Bergé, Hepokoski & Darcy, Schmidt-Beste). As Peg points out, the *Moonlight Sonata* breaks from that tradition and "It's slow, fast, fuck off" (138). Peg loves Beethoven because he breaks boundaries and that is how Peg likes to live – for instance, she has her son call her by her first name, rather than 'Mom' or 'Mother' (38). She never cooks (139), encourages swearing (137), and sleeping around (88). The reader is also informed about more than the broken conventions in the *Moonlight Sonata*. Despite the title, Peg observes, the *Moonlight Sonata* has nothing to do with the moon. Ludwig Rellstab, a German poet, coined this sonata the *Moonlight Sonata* after it conjured up images of sitting by a lake in the moonlight for him (Jones 43). The music in that sonata afforded the critic that particular musical experience (Jones 44), but Peg and then Frank have a very different musical experience. According to Peg, Beethoven wrote the *Moonlight Sonata* after finding out that Countess Julia, his seventeen-year-old student whom he is in love with, is about to be married to a count. History tells a different story – although this sonata is dedicated to Julia, Beethoven originally intended to dedicate a different sonata to her. Due to circumstances he was compelled to dedicate the *Moonlight Sonata* to Julia after all (Forbes 291, 296). Nevertheless, when listening to that piece Peg and Frank do hear a musical representation of the pain of love. That is, they *imagine* hearing a musicalization of the pain of love, both Beethoven's presumed pain and their own: "So he pours all those feelings into his piano sonata and he dedicates it to Julia" (138). It is only after listening to the *Moonlight Sonata* that Peg is able to tell Frank about her own painful journey in love (139). Frank's own pain in love is not situated in a romantic relationship, but in his relationship with his mother. Frank had always wanted a normal mother (250, 277), but Peg refused to be one. Peg's refusal to be normal complicates his love for her: he has a close bond with Peg, but detests that it makes him different in the eyes of his girlfriend and classmates (89, 169). Peg's interpretation of the *Moonlight Sonata* illustrates how "like any other human experience, our involvement with music is not purely aural but multisensory" (Delazari xxi). That is, a full experience of music

constitutes relying on other elements besides only hearing. Or, thinking along Small's terms, one's involvement with music is a *musickal* experience. Peg's life experience is a clear contributor to her emotional interpretation of the *Moonlight Sonata*. When Peg listens to the *Moonlight Sonata* she does not have a purely musical experience but she also affectively re-experiences the emotional pain of her lost relationships.

It is only once Peg has contextualised and emotionally interpreted the *Moonlight Sonata* that the reader is given an ekphrastic description of the piece:

The music starts softly. It's kind... The music builds up and down, but it never runs away, it just waits for [Julia]. And the higher notes go *up, up*, and the lower ones repeat the pattern, saying *yes, yes*... But then Beethoven does something else as well. He makes the higher notes lead the way... So we get to the second movement. And it's fast. It's happy. It's a bit of a surprise... But that's just a trick. Because then we get the third movement and it's like he's a different person. It's *wild*... It's *punk*. He takes everything that has come before and he kicks it sky high. (author's emphasis 145-6)

The formal elements of the *Moonlight Sonata* – the direction of the melody, the different tempi, the surprising structure – afford an affective musical experience for Peg. The workings of Peg's affective state illustrates DeNora's point that musical affect is aroused by both music and social elements "beyond" music. Peg is moved to sadness when listening to the *Moonlight Sonata*. Her life situation in conjunction with the formal elements create an affective response. She is so moved and caught up in her emotional state that once the piece has finished playing she remains lying on the floor (138). She is so affected that she cannot even provide for her son and cook him dinner (138). Years later, as Frank attempts to come to terms with his relationship with Peg, Frank relists to the *Moonlight Sonata* because it has become representative of broken relationships. Listening to this sonata tells him that "you don't find peace until you've been to hell and back" (146). The *Moonlight Sonata* thus becomes a musickal mode for representing Frank's affective response to broken relationships.

The *Moonlight Sonata* shows that Frank and Peg do not just describe music, but they *interpret* it. That is, songs and pieces are given narrative meaning and they draw connections between what they hear and what their "real life" experiences and principles are. Consequently, when they describe music, they tell stories. Frank and Peg tell stories about the composer's life, the origin of the composition and their own personal life. When Kit – Frank's assistant – and Maud – the tattoo artist next door – listen to music they have very different experiences. Consequently, the way in which they listen to music is described differently. Rather than finding a narrative to interpret, Kit

listens to the timbre of the sounds. As Kit is busy in the shop while Frank is out, he puts on Isaac Hayes's *Theme from Shaft*:

First there was the hi-hat ride pattern on cymbals, then *wah wah wah* went the guitar. After that, a full minute of piano, flute, punchy horn, funky bass, tambourine and heroic orchestra strings. It built and built like a river of water pressing towards the sea, until – *Shaft!* – at last here was Isaac Hayes with his smooth silky bass voice, sailing into the song like the coolest dude on a great big yacht. (author's emphasis 226)

Kit's method of musical description makes use of auricularization – when sound is foregrounded in the ekphrastic passage – focusing on timbre. Timbre can affect the perception of emotion in music (Hailstone et. al) and in the performance field timbre is often talked about as giving colour to sound. The colours of the sounds are important to Kit because he finds that he is missing colour in his personal life. Kit listens to a movie track because it allows him to pretend that he is famous and that his life has meaning, instead of being stuck with an ill mother and an abusive father (227). Unlike Peg and Frank, Kit does not listen to music to reflect his current emotional state. Rather, music allows Kit to imagine a different and better life for himself. Like Peg, Kit experiences an embodied musical affect. This embodiment manifests itself differently, however. Whereas Peg remains motionless on the floor, Kit impersonates “being Shaft, the complicated man” (228). He begins to swagger around the room and acts out the music by pretending to be “lethal to his enemies, tender with his women” (226). Kit and Peg's differing reactions showcases how music can move its listeners to having different reactions, depending on the piece a person listens to, as well as an individual's own situation and condition.

When Frank introduces Maud to Samuel Barber's *Adagio for Strings*, auricularization once again makes clear what this classical piece sounds like. The foregrounded sound is set up against rock music, which is what Maud usually listens to: “Barber. Adagio for Strings. She'd never even heard of the guy. Maud played Def Leppard, the louder the better” (69). Whereas Maud plays rock music as loud as she possibly can, the *Adagio* begins softly. The *Adagio* “built and built as if it were climbing a set of stairs, until the violins were practically screaming AHHHHHHHH – and then it stopped” (70). Not only is a contrast between different styles of music used to create a musical ekphrasis but the personification of instruments through non-lexical speech sounds are used. Violins cannot literally scream but the effect is conveyed that the gentle beginning of the *Adagio* grows so much that eventually the volume is very loud. The loud dynamic is reinforced by the non-lexical speech sound of AHHHHHHHH. The eight repetitions of the letter h, combined with capital letters as opposed to small letters, afford the sense of being overpowered by sound. The dash at the end

literally stops this sound thereby imitating the sounded representation of the Adagio. The personification of the violins affords a sense that Maud – and by extension the reader – feels a connection with what the violins are doing in the music. What Maud hears after the non-lexical speech sound is a fermata⁶ on a minim⁷ rest, but she does not use that terminology as she is not a professional musician. Rather, she is attentive to the embodied affective intensity the music has on her: “her heart swooped to her mouth” (70). Like Peg and Kit, Maud is having an embodied reaction to the diegetic music. Maud’s intense experience of Barber’s *Adagio* surprises her. Further, the *Adagio* creates a place for Maud to explore her emotions. Or as Deleuze and Van Alphen would say: art is provoking Maud to think experientially: “Life goes on, the music told her, even when you think it can’t” (70). The *Adagio* reminds Maud that “the human adventure is worth it after all” (70). Experiencing Barber’s *Adagio* affects Maud so much that she is compelled to re-evaluate her thoughts and ideas about her place in the world. In other words, Maud’s musickal experience is an existential one.

Peg, Frank, Kit and Maud’s approach listening to music differently. The way in which each character describes and listens to music reflects their idea of self, personal circumstances and how they relate to the world. Not only the way in which they describe music, but also their music selection gives insight into their character and way of being. Whereas Maud is dependent on Frank for her music selection, Kit has more agency in his musicking. Frank and Peg have even more agency in their music selection; they also have the power to select music for others. Their behaviour corroborates Small’s principle that the way one musicks is reflective of how one stands in relation to the world. As a consequence of their different approaches to listening, Peg, Frank, Kit and Maud have different ways of “recalling to mind” a musical piece in text. Consequently, the reader is “taught” how to “listen” to the pieces. Delazari suggests that when reading a musical novel, the “mind performs the text as music” (7). The extensive musical ekphrasis in *The Music Shop* gives the reader directions on how to “perform” the music in their mind, and in this way invites them to have a musical experience. Furthermore, the novel facilitates the possibility for the reader to have multiple kinds of musickal experiences. Peg and Frank’s way of listening to music is very different to how Kit and Maud listen to music but all are valid forms of musickal experiences.

Musical ekphrasis in the novel is, however, not only the worded and onomatopoeic descriptions of sounds, pitch, and volume, but also the description of rhythm and of silence. Silence

⁶ A fermata in music is a pause. A fermata symbol is placed above or below the note or rest that should be played longer than the duration of the original value (in this case for two counts). The fermata tends to be used to heighten a dramatic effect.

⁷ A minim is a rest worth two beats.

is important in the musical ekphrasis of Joyce, also because it is important in music. Zofia Lissa points out that in speech “silence emphasizes the critical moment of the situation, and in a tense atmosphere a silent gesture can be more eloquent and expressive than a spoken word” (444). In the same vein, music students are often told that rests are just as important, if not more important than the notes they play on their instrument. “No silence exists that is not pregnant with sound” says John Cage (135): silences have the power to afford different meanings. Zofia Lissa suggests that silence can “be the silence of expectation, horror, surprise, embarrassment, and also the overpowering silence of death” (444). It is in this sense that professional musicians talk about silences being rich. Beethoven’s dramatic pause after the powerful opening four notes heightens the affect of the silence. The silence affords anticipation. For Peg, silence is the appealing factor in music: “Silence could be exciting, it could be scary, it could be like flying, or even a really good joke... Silence was where the magic happened” (40). In other words, silence in music is a catalyst for heightening affect. The description of Handel’s *Hallelujah Chorus*, for example, illustrates that it is possible for a text to convey the pregnant musicality of silence:

Hallelujah. Hallelujah.

PAUSE.

HAL–LE–LU–JAH! (author’s formatting, 119)

The silence is created visually. The first ‘hallelujahs’ are written in italics; the second ‘hallelujahs’ are written in capital letters indicating that the sound is much bigger than the first ‘hallelujahs’. The exclamation mark at the end of the final hallelujah reiterates the grandeur of the sound. The word “pause” is also written in capital letters, implying that the silence is rich and grand. The smaller size of the letters, however, afford it the sense of quiet and silence. The word ‘PAUSE’ is given its own line and as it is a short word, visually the line is also very short. With the full stop at the end of the word, it almost feels like a breath is created. The meaning of the word *pause* further invites the reader to stop for a moment – to literally pause. Therefore, content and the form work together to create a sense of musical rhythm that matches the rhythm of Handel’s *Hallelujah Chorus*. In other words, here the reader is able to perform the *Hallelujah Chorus* in a way that imitates the sounded version.

A final way in which *The Music Shop* invites the reader to a musical experience is through the inclusion of an official Spotify playlist link. The playlist link takes the reader to a Penguin Books Spotify playlist which features the book’s key compositions. The link is given at the beginning of the novel, not at the end, indicating that the music can be listened to while reading the novel. The reader is thus encouraged to really *hear* the music as faithfully as possible, and not limit themselves

to a literary musical experience. That is, the text in the novel is not necessarily intended to stand alone from the musical sounds it talks about. The inclusion of an official playlist raises the question *why would one read about music, when one could simply listen to it?* Implicit in the argument for an official playlist is the idea that “real” music exists only as a sounded medium; any representation of music that is *not* sounded is therefore an incomplete imitation of the “real” thing (Delazari xxiii, Small 200). The playlist thus seems to reinforce the idea that the sounded representation is the most authentic way to experience music after all, and that the novel’s literary representation still falls short in truly capturing the musical experience. However, Mitchell has deconstructed the false theory that representations can be marked as either original and authentic or copies and inauthentic (507, 513, 529). Therefore, opposing Joyce’s literary representation and the playlist’s sounded representation fails to capture their unique ability to enhance the musickal experience. Delazari argues that “what comes first – our hearing of the music or our reading about it – matters little” (25) and that a literary representation of music offers room for a different, but equal, kind of musical experience (26, 138-9). For example, although the playlist may more directly bring the music’s sounds to its audience, Joyce’s novel is the catalyst for linking these unrelated pieces to each other. Furthermore, the playlist and the literary experience can work alongside each other – a reader is invited to have a double musickal experience. Words and sounds rely on different senses and consequently are able to sustain the affective musickal experience in complementary ways. Small observes that participating in *any* musical activity is important and valid. The quality of musicking is not informed by the form of representation it takes, but “good” musick is musick that successfully articulates “the concepts of the relationships of those who are taking part [in the musickal activity]” (213). Both the sounded representation of music – i.e. the playlist – and the texted representation – i.e. through the novel’s formal features as well as its ekphrastic passages – are used to sustain an affective intensification which explores characters’ musickal relationships in *The Music Shop*.

Thus far it has been seen that form and focalisation, through musickal ekphrasis, work together to create a varied musickal experience for the reader. In other words, the text uses auricularised musickal ekphrasis to arouse an affective musickal response. The texted representation of musick can thus be an aid for enhancing the musickal experience. However, at other the times, the text can impede this musickal experience. The disruption of the immersive and affective musickal experience can be observed in the description of silence in Beethoven’s *Fifth Symphony*, which sits in contrast to the texted silence of the *Hallelujah Chorus*. The opening of the *Fifth Symphony* – “Da da da dum” (39) – is filled with dramatic impact, with Peg describing it as “the most

famous four notes in history” (39). The three “da”s indicate the quavers⁸ and the “dum” represents the longer crochet.⁹ Peg appreciates the opening four notes of Beethoven’s 5th *Symphony* for their dramatic impact. The drama of the opening of Beethoven’s 5th *Symphony* is heightened through the silence that comes after these notes. For all the force of Beethoven’s 5th *Symphony*, the auricularized version is significantly less impactful. The reader only gets to experience a snippet of the 5th *Symphony* and the silence that Peg finds so important is disrupted by a dialogue between Peg and Frank. Rather than showing through form – for example spacing the lines differently as Joyce does elsewhere – that there should be silence, Frank and Peg talk through it:

‘Hear that?’ She lifted the needle.

‘What, Peg?’

‘You heard the little pause in the middle?’

‘Yes.’

‘You see? You see what Beethoven’s doing? There is a silence inside music too. It’s like reaching a hole. You don’t know what will happen next.’ (original italics 39)

The dialogue between Frank and Peg interrupts the ekphrastic moment of the opening of Beethoven’s symphony. Furthermore even the ekphrastic description of the *Fifth Symphony* itself does not reflect what the music is doing: “Da da da dum. *The sound crept out of the silence like a great beast emerging from the sea.* Da da da dum” (original emphasis, 39). The silence in the music is not silent in the novel. Rather, the novels fills the silence with words. In effect, the reader is stopped from performing the text as music. Instead of being able to feel – be affected by – the impact of the silence, the reader’s listening experience is interrupted by words.

There is a second, more serious way, in which *The Music Shop* may interfere with the reader’s musickal experience. Errors at climactic moments in the plot disturb the musickal experience, at least for the informed reader. The first climactic point is when Maud discovers Ilse’s secret past life as a professional musician. This discovery is the catalyst for Frank and Ilse’s conflict as Frank feels duped that he was teaching a professional musician how to musick. In the novel, Maud finds Ilse’s name and photo on the back of a vinyl sleeve of a recording of Vivaldi’s *Four Seasons*. In this recording Ilse was apparently the first violinist: “and no matter how many times Maud pointed at Ilse Brauchmann’s name next to *‘first violinist’*, Frank couldn’t take it in” (254). However, names of orchestral musicians are not printed on recordings. Orchestral musicians were not cared for then as “people were just exchangeable bodies” (van Tuijl) and consequently would not have been granted

⁸ The length of a quaver is half a beat.

⁹ A crochet is a full beat. A crochet is thus twice as long as a quaver.

this kind of recognition on a vinyl sleeve. Thus, Maud's discovery, which sets up the conflict between Ilse and Frank, is unrealistic. An informed reader – one who has insight into how the musickal world functions – will notice this mistake. When, after her secret has been exposed, Ilse attempts to explain her secret telling Frank that as arthritis set in her fingers “she was relegated from first violinist to second, then third, then fourth” (264). As with Maud's discovery, this is not possible as third and fourth violins simply do not exist in an orchestra. The trajectory of the downfall of Ilse's career is thus unrealistic and for an informed reader this affords that Ilse becomes a much less believable character. Consequently, the novel fails to sustain affect and instead impedes the musickal experience.

The second climax in *The Music Shop* occurs twenty years later. After Ilse's secret was exposed Frank and Ilse part ways and Frank's life falls apart. Twenty years after the incident, Ilse returns to England from Germany in an attempt to reconnect with him. Maud, Kit and Ilse decide to organise a flash mob to sing the *Hallelujah Chorus* at a shopping mall where Frank always eats his lunch “to wake the fucker up. You need to do it big time” (321). Since Peg's death, Frank has never been able to listen to the *Hallelujah Chorus* because of its painful associations. Listening to the *Hallelujah Chorus* is the key to ‘waking’ Frank up because it will affect him deeply; to put it in Shouse's terms – musickal art will provoke him into an embodied mode of reflection (22). Consequently, this particular performance of the *Hallelujah Chorus* has critical implications. Ilse is reluctant to play the violin to accompany the singing because she has not touched a violin for twenty years (333, 334).¹⁰ When she begins to play anyway, she finds that “her body knows what to do” (340). What follows is a detailed description of how Ilse plays the violin. Some of that description is correct, such as the position of the chin and the chin rest. Most of it is not. For example Ilse's “left hand opens around the scroll” (340) but a professional violinist would hold it at the neck (Van Tuijl). Later Ilse “positions her left hand at the neck, supporting it between her thumb and forefinger, with her other fingers curled around the struts” (340), despite the violin needing to be supported by the neck, jaw and collarbone (van Tuijl, Taylor, Auer, Rush, Havas); neither does a violin have struts¹¹ Although the pinky finger belongs on the wooden part, when Ilse picks up the bow, apparently she places her “pinky finger on the screw” (340). Ilse's playing technique, as described in the novel, is

¹⁰ That Ilse has not touched a violin is highly improbable considering her career as a violin teacher, though not completely impossible. Even teachers who have arthritis will at times demonstrate on the instrument how something is to be played. One of my piano teachers, for example, had arthritis and was in a wheelchair. She could not perform as a concert pianist anymore, but she still regularly played small sections of pieces to her students to illustrate what she expected of us. So while Ilse may not be able to play professionally anymore, she most likely would still have played the violin in lessons on occasion.

¹¹ Struts are lengths of wood glued to the inside of a guitar soundboard to enhance the guitar's sound (Lewney & Richardson, Sloane, Zintel, Schile, Sandberg).

thus faulty. For an informed reader the errors impede the musickal experience. Ilse's playing is supposed to be a climactic moment in the novel that invites an affective musickal experience. However, when I showed this chapter to music colleagues – both violinists and other instrumentalists – they laughed at the absurdity of the descriptions. For an informed reader, the errors draw attention to the text's failure to “bring to presence” musick. The musickal experience is, in this case, a frustrated one.

The Music Shop has shown that it is possible to invite a reader to a musickal experience through narrative means. It has been seen that the form of *The Music Shop* opens up the invitation to a musickal experience; musickal ekphrasis, alongside a playlist, is employed to bring to presence the sounds and emotions which the characters hear and feel; the focalisation of different characters' mode of musicking allows the reader to have various kinds of musickal experiences simultaneously. Thus, form, musickal ekphrasis, sound and focalisation work together to sustain affect throughout the novel and simulate a musickal experience.

The attention to detail is paradoxically what enriches the musical experience and simultaneously mars it. On the one hand, Joyce is successful in representing *music* as compositions are regularly brought to life well. On the other hand, her attempts to convey *musick* – activities surrounding the music i.e. Ilse's performance – are less convincing and the musickal experience falls short in those moments. At some moments, the reader is subliminally affected; at other moments a reader may not have a musical experience at all, depending on their background. As Delazari points out:

The experience of reading and musicalizing fiction may transport us to musical sounds, acousmatic forms and visual story-images. How powerful this virtually musical destination is depends on where we depart in terms of our experiential background and competence.

(Delazari 137)

A reader who has less musickal knowledge, for example, will perhaps not notice the errors in *The Music Shop* and thus affect will be sustained for them. A musickally informed reader may have precisely the opposite problem where the errors do detract from the reading experience. The reactions of my musical colleagues towards mistakes in novels seem to confirm Delazari's observation that

It may be (and, anecdotally, is) the case that connoisseurs are allergic to fictional treatments of their areas of expertise, while readers who are not professionals become engaged much more willingly and deeply. (12)

Musickal connoisseurs may have more trouble with fictional treatments because it overrides their suspension of disbelief. In contrast, an uninformed reader is likely more able to immerse themselves in the musicko-reading experience, precisely because the errors do not stand out to them. Small argues that how one musicks is a window into a person's being. Although Small is focused on musick performances, how one approaches literary musick seems to do the same. How a reader approaches a music(k)al novel, and what background knowledge they bring, informs the reading experience. An informed reader may reject Ilse's musicking but identify with Kit or Maud's mode of musicking, for example. Alternatively, an uninformed reader may become a more informed reader precisely because of Peg and Frank's contextualising mode of musickal engagement. *The Music Shop* thus shows that literary texts have a range of techniques at hand that can invite the reader to musickal experiences, but acceptance or rejection of that invitation is very much up to the reader's discretion.

Chapter 3: *The Cellist of Sarajevo*

The first case study, *The Music Shop*, exemplified a musical novel that detailed characters' musickal experiences through a musickal ekphrasis that depended on minute worded descriptions of sound, pitch, volume and silence characters' experiences. There it was seen how a text may attempt to "translate" the sounded medium into a texted medium. It was seen that, although effective for some readers, for informed readers the emphasis on details meant that *The Music Shop* was not consistently effective in creating musical ekphrasis or a musickal experience. Reflecting on Joyce's errors, a musician colleague commented "it would have been better if she had just focussed on the feelings or the memories that were created" (van Tuijl). "Better" is perhaps a strong word, as Joyce certainly also pays attention to musick's affective qualities for her characters, but van Tuijl's point raises an interesting question: are direct descriptions of music needed to raise a music(k)al experience, or are there alternative strategies? It is my contention that although musical ekphrasis is less visible an emphasis on non-musical elements are capable of effectively creating a musickal experience. Furthermore, I argue that an engagement with musick can be transformative and thus reshape power dynamics. To explore how that may be possible I turn to Steven Galloway's *The Cellist of Sarajevo*.

The Cellist of Sarajevo was published in 2008 and is slightly longer than *The Music Shop*. Like *The Music Shop*, *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is written in easy English. The tone in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is less colloquial and more formal than in *The Music Shop*. *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is based on the siege of Sarajevo, an historical event in the early 90s. From 1992 till 1995, Bosnian Serbs besieged Sarajevo. The siege was instigated in reaction to Bosnia and Herzegovina declaring independence from Yugoslavia. Sarajevo is surrounded by hills, making it easy for the Serbs to hide there and shoot into the city. The siege of Sarajevo was a particularly bloody and violent episode in the Bosnian war as it was besieged by heavy artillery, tanks, snipers and small arms (King, Donia, Maček, Andreas, Judah). One noteworthy moment in the siege is what inspired Galloway's novel. Vedran Smailović was a professional cellist in various orchestras in Sarajevo. During the siege he continued playing in public – not in a concert hall anymore, but in ruined buildings, under threat of snipers. At one point, twenty-two people were killed at once while they were waiting in line for bread. To honour these people, Smailović played Albinoni's *Adagio in G minor* for twenty-two days (Thompson & Ibrahimefendić, Deats, Naythons, Hamer, Hadžiosmanović). Galloway's novel is inspired by Smailović's actions, but does take some liberties. For example, Galloway compresses the entire siege into a couple of weeks. Furthermore, the cellist in the novel always plays the *Adagio* in the same place, whereas Smailović performed in different locations across the city (Hadžiosmanović 30). In the

afterword of *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, Galloway emphasizes that his novel, though inspired by real historical events, remains a work of fiction (225).

There are four threads in plot of *The Cellist of Sarajevo* and each thread focalises one of the main characters: the Cellist, Dragan, Kenan and Arrow. After a bomb kills twenty-two people waiting in line for bread across the street where he lives, the Cellist decides to play Albinoni's *Adagio in G minor* every day at four o'clock for twenty-two days in honour of those killed. Dragan crosses the city in search of bread and meets an old friend, who is then shot. Although the friend survives, Dragan is understandably shaken and begins to ask himself questions about the value of life and what constitutes life or death. Along his travels, Dragan only hears the cellist from afar but even this minimal contact is enough to affect him. Kenan traverses sniper-filled Sarajevo to collect water for his family. The spring is bombed when he is there, and he barely escapes. When he makes his way back to his house, he also meets a friend, with whom he goes to the market. Once at the market Kenan hears the cellist performing in the distance and is compelled to make his way towards the cellist. Like Dragan, Kenan's musical experience with the cellist gives him the impetus needed to change his attitude towards the city and the war. Arrow is a sniper and she is the character who has the closest contact with the cellist. She is tasked with protecting the cellist from enemy snipers who will try to kill him and therefore hears the cellist's performances repeatedly. Like Dragan and Kenan, Arrow is profoundly affected by the cellist's music and as a direct result of her interaction with his music, she changes her behaviour significantly. The characters are unaware of the others' existence; they never meet each other. Even Arrow does not speak to the cellist, despite her important role in maintaining his survival and the cellist never acknowledges his audience. Yet, there is still a strong sense of cohesion in the novel. Despite the frequent focalization changes throughout the novel, the tone is similar for all the characters. There is a sense of one omniscient narrator who ties all the characters together. The characters are also connected through their questions about life and death. They are further connected through the fact that the cellist's performances is the catalyst for their affective and embodied responses.

The Cellist of Sarajevo is structured like a unconventional theme and variations. The opening chapter is told from the perspective of the cellist and sets up the themes. The novel is then divided into four sections. Each section is divided into smaller chapters and each chapter focalises one of the main characters. The larger sections are not split equally: sections one and four have three chapters each; section three has eight chapters and the third section has five chapters. Neither are the chapters the same length either: the chapters on either ends of the novels are shorter, averaging about four pages, whereas the chapters in the middle sections average between fourteen and sixteen pages, with the largest chapter being seventeen pages long. The characters are given

different amounts of the space in the text: only the opening chapter focuses on the cellist; Kenan and Dragan are given six chapters each, while Arrow is given seven chapters. The ordering of the chapters seems arbitrary: although the first and final sections includes a chapter from each character, in section two the order of the chapters is as follows: Kenan, Arrow, Dragan, Arrow, Kenan, Dragan, Arrow, Kenan. In section three the order is once again different. Each section, chapter and character can be seen as variations on the main theme. In hindsight, it can be seen that the order of the chapters is not so random after all. The ordering of the chapters is done according to the character's proximity to the cellist. The novel's progression is a structural crescendo where the characters become more and more involved in the cellist's performances. Thus, unlike *The Music Shop* where the structure of the novel clearly imitates a musickal form, *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is much more subtle and the reader becomes aware of its musickal properties later in the reading process. Thus the invitation to a musickal experience in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is more hidden than in *The Music Shop*, shifting the emphasis away from listening to music to engaging with musick's affective properties.

In contrast to *The Music Shop*, which worked with multiple pieces, *The Cellist of Sarajevo* concentrates on one piece only: Albinoni's *Adagio in G minor*. The novel establishes the historical and cultural context of Albinoni's *Adagio* in the opening chapter. The context is important for the reader to know as it situates the character's affective responses. The *Adagio in G minor* was commonly attributed to Tomaso Albinoni (1671-1751) and is an eight-minute composition for solo cello and (orchestral) accompaniment, though today many arrangements for different instrumentations have been made. The cellist in the novel certainly would have had to play an arrangement as he performed the *Adagio* without accompaniment. Albinoni was a Venetian composer who lived during the Baroque period. Albinoni was a prolific composer who was recognized for his operas during his lifetime (Talbot). Today Albinoni is much more recognized for his instrumental music. Johann Sebastian Bach, one of the Great Composers in Classical music, was inspired by and looked up to Albinoni, even going so far as composing two fugues on themes by Albinoni. Bach also used Albinoni's bass lines for harmonic exercises to his students (Norwich). In other words, Albinoni was a top rate composer and anything by him was pre-disposed to being regarded as good music. After Albinoni's death, his works were housed in the Dresden library. Near the end of World War II, Dresden was intensely bombed by the Allies. During the Dresden bombing the library was destroyed, along with Albinoni's manuscripts. Charred fragments of a manuscript were found among the ruins by Italian musicologist Remo Giazotto. It is from that fragment that Giazotto reconstructed the *Adagio*. Giazotto was a leading expert on Albinoni and wrote his biography. Giazotto also catalogued Albinoni's compositions and so was well-versed in Albinoni's

musical style. At first Giazotto claimed that when he was working on Albinoni's output, he had found a fragment of a manuscript where four bars of a bass line were written down. Based on this fragment, Giazotto "completed" the piece, turning it into an eight-minute full work for organ, string orchestra and solo cello (Talbot, Thompson & Ibrahimefendic, machado et. al, Harling-Lee, Gianturco). In later years, Giazotto changed his story and said that he composed the *Adagio* completely by himself, albeit following Italian Baroque rules. By then, however, the *Adagio's* reputation was set as being Albinoni's composition. Today, that reputation has shifted only somewhat and it is commonly referred to as Albinoni's *Adagio in G minor* by Giazotto.

It is unclear whether Kegan, Dragan and Arrow know the historical context of the *Adagio*. When the novel provides a condensed version of the context, they have not yet been introduced. At this point in the novel, the reader is still misled to believe that the cellist will be the main protagonist. Kegan, Dragan and Arrow do not seem to know the piece: they refer to it as the cellist's performance or piece, never using its name or showing awareness of its context. The context therefore serves to give the reader insight as to why the cellist lends the *Adagio* so much affective power. "Knowing more" than the characters themselves further allows the reader to understand and explain why the characters are so affected by the cellist's performances. Galloway condenses this context into one short paragraph but he is able to set the scene and capture the politicization of the *Adagio*. It is no accident that the cellist chooses *this* particular piece to play as opposed to any other piece in the cello repertoire. Of course the *Adagio* is beautiful, full of pathos and able to affect its audience. Albinoni was renowned for his beautiful melodies, and the *Adagio* is noted particularly for its mournful properties (machado et. al, Thompson et. al). But the *Adagio* is not unique in this regard – many pieces are beautiful and able to move its audience. Rather it is the context, its unique construction in the midst of destruction, that makes it such a suitable piece for the cellist's purpose. That knowing how a character is affected by the cellist is much more important than the "musicness" of the *Adagio*. Further, knowing how it "truly" sounds like is demonstrated by the fact that there is no description of the composition at all – that is, there is no moment of musical ekphrasis. Rather, engagement with the *Adagio* redirects the character's – and by extension the readers – attentions elsewhere. So when the reader eventually "hears" the piece in the novel, they do not hear particular notes, but rather principles of construction and destruction being set up against each other through the listening experiences of the *Adagio's* audience. It is precisely the piece's ability to construct different things – hope, happy memories, or a renewed moral compass – that is the focus of the novel, not the music "itself". That the musical object is not the focus reinforces the idea of musicking. How one musicks – the kinds of pieces one chooses to play, under

which circumstances one performs or otherwise engages with music – is of much more relevance than the “thing” itself in *The Cellist of Sarajevo*.

That the *Adagio* is never directly represented in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* does not mean that its presence is hidden. As R. Murray Schafer astutely notes, “what is missed is just as important as what is listened to, perhaps more so” (61). In *The Cellist of Sarajevo* the absence of music becomes to be felt as a gap in the lives of the characters because they are surrounded by a soundscape of warfare instead. In fact, the soundscape is a prominent feature in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* except when talking directly about how the composition itself sounds. The warfare soundscape is characterized by two things: its volume and the isolation of sound from other senses.

In the first place, the noisiness of the warfare soundscape is established right at the outset in the novel. The opening paragraph narrates the bombing of Dresden, where the *Adagio*'s fragments were found:

It screamed downward, splitting air and sky without effort. A target expanded in size, brought into focus by time and velocity. There was a moment before impact that was the last instant of things as they were. Then the visible world exploded. (1, 3)

The word “screamed” indicates that the noise is loud; it cannot be missed. Further, the word “scream” affords emotions of fear and terror, indicating that the soundscape is not a pleasant one. The fear and terror indicated in the first sounds is reinforced by the fact that once the bomb hits, the “visible world” longer exists. The bomb’s scream thus heralds destruction and only a “charred manuscript fragment” (1) remains behind. The opening paragraph is repeated two more times in the first chapter. The second time the screaming bomb precedes the destruction of the Opera Hall. In the third and final iteration of the opening paragraph the tense changes: whereas the first two iterations were set in the past, the final reading is set in the present: “It *screams* downward... Then the visible world *explodes*” (my emphasis, 5). Although the bomb is “screaming”, the past tense in the first two iterations of opening paragraph affords a sense of distance from the destruction. That distance is lost when the present tense is used. The bomb’s sound, and the accompanying destruction, is hitting much closer to home now.

The cellist is not the only character who hears noises of destruction around him; Dragan, Kenan, and Arrow do too. When a sniper shoots at the intersection Dragan is about to cross “there’s a sharp crack of gunfire” (33), and later he hears “the cripes smack of a rifle” (36). As Kenan walks to the spring, “he can’t help hearing gunfire in the distance” (39). When he arrives, the spring is shelled and he “hears the telltale whistle of an incoming shell” (138). When the shell hits he hears “the

loudest noise he thought the world could contain” (138) and his “ears are ringing” (138); in the aftermath of the bombing, Kenan’s soundscape is filled with air sirens and ambulances racing to collect the injured (141); a woman “begins to shriek” (139) and other people are “screaming, running, shouting, moaning” (141). As Arrow does her duties around the city, she is focussed on sounds: she “hears another mortar hit as she reaches the ground” (14), and “begins to notice the percussion of mortars affecting her hearing” (15). The noise of warfare is so constant that the rare occasion that the enemy is not firing weapons into Sarajevo, Arrow notes that “the absence of shelling is almost like music” (82). Dragan, Kenan and Arrow thus experience sound as the harbinger of death and destruction.

Sound also has other connotations in *The Cellist of Sarajevo*. Katie Harling-Lee observes that sound is isolated from other senses as “in the *Cellist of Sarajevo*, sound is described as it is perceived rather than as it is created which leads to delays in perception” (374), and consequently “sight and sound [are] disconnected” (374). This means that characters are reliant on sound to make sense of their world. In the bombing of Dresden the mortar is first heard before its impact is experienced (1). When a sniper shoots and misses Dragan “he feels the shot an instant before he hears it. There is a sharp zip, a rush of air as a bullet snaps past his left ear, then the harsh blast of a gun” (79). In fact, sound becomes “paramount for survival” (Harling-Lee 374) as “you never hear the shell that kills you” (374). Sound is thus a measure for indicating whether you were alive or not, as hearing the shell or the bullet means that you have not been killed. Whereas Kenan, Dragan and Arrow listen to the soundscape of warfare to stay alive, the cellist needs a different kind of listening for his survival. The cellist does not only want to stay alive physically, but also spiritually and therefore he needs to hear music. The destruction of the Opera Hall is the first step in breaking the cellist’s spirit (3). Each day at home, he forces himself to play “until he feels his hope return (2). That hope is dwindling though and the cellist notices that the *Adagio* is less and less capable of mustering hope (3). It is for this reason that the cellist has a limited number of performances left. He must therefore be selective about when he performs the *Adagio* so that he does not run out of hope. When the bomb that kills twenty-two people waiting in line for bread hits, the cellist disassociates (3). When he comes to, the cellist finds that “he has dropped his bow on the floor” (4). He also sees a woman’s handbag “soaked in blood and sparkled with broken glass” (4), and feels intuitively that “there’s a great connection between the two objects” (4). The woman’s handbag should not be bloodied; neither does the bow belong on the floor. A bow on the floor does not produce music, much less an affective *Adagio* that gives hope to a troubled city. The object which allowed the cellist to make music has separated itself from his body illustrating that warfare has penetrated Sarajevo into the home and not only on the street. The sounds of warfare are everywhere, and no one is exempt from hearing them. Once the

cellist understands what has occurred, he knows that the *Adagio* is no longer only for himself but also for his fellow citizens too.

Rather than sound being the harbinger of destruction, the cellist determines that sound should become the harbinger of hope. The cellist thus picks up his bow from the ground and decides to publicly perform the *Adagio* for twenty-two days right where the bomb landed, thereby challenging the soundscape of war. When the cellist attends to his music the disconnect between sound, hope and the tragic circumstances of Sarajevo's situation disappears. Hope returns to the city's inhabitants when the cellist controls the sound that is produced. A sound produced from the body creates wholeness and the possibility for living, thereby defying death – a theme which, as will be seen later, Kenan, Dragan and Arrow concern themselves with. Music(k) thus provides a life-giving experience that encourages the characters to keep on living.

On the one hand, then, sound in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is a catalyst for destruction: buildings and cultural artefacts are destroyed, people are injured or killed. However, on the other hand, sound can also be used as the catalyst for beauty and hope. The kind of sound the cellist produces sits in contrast to the war's noise. Whereas mortars scream, injured people shriek, and shells whistle, the cellist creates an atmosphere of stillness and beauty. On days that the cellist has lost all hope, "then he and his cello will coax Albinoni's *Adagio* out of the firebombed husk of Dresden and into the mortar-pocked, sniper-infested streets of Sarajevo. By the time the last few notes fade, his hope will be restored" (2). This kind of sound affords hope, rather than fear. The cellist chooses to play Albinoni's *Adagio* because "that something could be almost erased from existence in the landscape of a ruined city, and then rebuilt until it is new and worthwhile, gives him hope" (1). Performing Albinoni's *Adagio* is thus a political statement: it tells the enemies that hope will not be stamped out – or at least, not yet. The fact that it was created out of rubble and damage and that in the midst of such terror and ugliness something beautiful still is able to emerge is powerful. In effect, it is *music(k)* – the elements related to music making – which make the *Adagio* so powerful and not only the music "itself". Small argues that the "act of musicking can articulate and reveal to us some of our deepest values" (221). The choice to play the *Adagio* in the context of noisy warzone reveals how important hope is to the cellist and points to the affective properties of music(k).

The cellist is not the only person to be affected by the *Adagio* in *The Cellist of Sarajevo*. For Kenan, Arrow and Dragan the *Adagio* is the medium which instigates transformation. When Kenan and Arrow hear the cellist perform, they do not "hear" the *Adagio*. Instead, the music is "heard" through ocularization. That is, rather hearing what the *Adagio* sounds like, they "see" a Sarajevo that

is not overwhelmed by the horrors of war. As Kenan listens to the *Adagio* being performed on the bombed street,

the building behind the cellist repairs itself. The scars of bullets and shrapnel are covered by plaster and paint, and windows reassemble, clarify and sparkle as the sun reflects off glass. The cobblestones of the road set themselves straight. Around him people stand up taller, their faces put on weight and colour. Clothes gain lost thread, brighten, smooth out their wrinkles. (182)

The *Adagio* heals the city in Kenan's imagination. Physical and emotional damage does not exist anymore. Buildings are no longer destroyed (182), Kenan goes out for dinner with his family (183) and then sends his daughter to a movie with a boyfriend that he does not approve of (184). People's spirits are lifted and even the despondent cellist regains his former glory during the performance (182). When Arrow hears the cellist play, pleasant memories of a Sarajevo before the war are evoked:

Her mother is lifting her up, spinning her around and laughing. The warm tongue of a dog licks her arm. There's a rush of air as a snowball flies past her face... In a movie theatre, a boy she likes kisses her and puts his hand on her stomach. (64)

The cellist's music allows Arrow to live in the past, which is much more pleasant than the present. In fact, for Arrow ocularization is so strong that "when the first notes sound they are, to her, inaudible. Sound has vanished from the world" (63). The cellist's music allow Arrow and Kenan to block the sounds of war and enter a different world. The transformed Sarajevo only lasts as long as the performance, however. When the music stops, the magic of a healed city disappears and Kenan is forced to face a reality where people die and bodies are piled into vans (184). When the cellist is gone, Kenan even wonders whether the performance actually even happened (185), or whether he simply imagined the whole thing. When the music is finished, Arrow needs to kill the enemy sniper for her own protection (64). As sounds of beauty fade, the stark reality of a besieged Sarajevo reappears.

Although the *Adagio* does not transform Sarajevo – the shelling continues, people continue to be injured or killed, the war does not stop – its performances certainly transforms those who engage with it. As a direct consequence of listening to the cellist's performances on the street, Kenan and Arrow change their behaviour. Although the performance lasted no longer than ten minutes, Kenan is profoundly affected by the cellist's playing and he decides he wants to live emotionally after all. What Kenan has experienced is not only a *musical* but also a *musickal*

experience. Before hearing the cellist, Kenan had become so disheartened by the fact that men were shooting into his city, killing it slowly that he had given up caring for anyone besides his own family. As an act of self-preservation, Kenan leaves his neighbour's water cans behind near the spring. Although Kenan has not physically died in the water collection point bombing, he has emotionally. Kenan's chance interaction with the cellist's performance on his way home resurrects him. After taking a detour, Kenan happens to hear the cellist's performance in the distance, and inches closer to the performance. Despite previously thinking that "it was a bit silly, a bit maudlin" (182), Kenan becomes drawn to the cellist. After all, what "could the man possibly hope to accomplish by playing music in the street? It wouldn't bring anyone back from the dead, wouldn't feed anyone, wouldn't replace one brick. It was a foolish gesture, [Kenan] thought, a pointless exercise in futility" (182). Kenan sees a big discrepancy between the cellist's actions and what is actually happening in the city. Kenan has not simply heard some music, but the context in which he listens has a profound effect on his listening experience. The stakes of the performance are much higher here on the street than in a concert hall. The cellist's performance is a political statement intended to defy the enemy; Kenan's choice to seek out the performance is also a political statement that shows that he stands with the cellist. The cellist's performance of the *Adagio* – a piece that affords a hope for a better future and allows for beauty to rise out of a terrible situation – compels Kenan to challenge death by retrieving his neighbour's hidden water cans after all. Thus, although the novel does not make the reader "hear" the music, it certainly allows them to see music's potential power to transform. The *Adagio* gives Kenan the impetus to live courageously: rather than living only for himself, Kenan now also takes care of others. Kenan's behaviour is his way of healing the city and not allowing the enemy to win after all.

Like Kenan, the performances on the street affect Arrow deeply. As Arrow hears the music afternoon after afternoon, she becomes more and more invested in the music – or rather, in the ethical questions the music poses. As Shouse points out, affect can "shock to thought" (30), and this is exactly what happens to Arrow. Although previously she had justified her role in the war, now she questions whether she had been ethical after all (35, 60, 96, 132). In fact, she finds that "she didn't have to be filled with hatred. The music demanded that she remember this, that she know to a certainty that the world still held the capacity for goodness. The notes were proof of that" (221). Arrow hears hope and love in the *Adagio*, which for a long time has stood in contrast to her actions. The music thus compels her to change her behaviour, and "she hasn't fired her rifle since killing the sniper the men on the hills sent for the cellist" (220). Indeed, she goes so far as to defy a direct order to kill someone. As she is about to fire her rifle, she closes her eyes to focus. But then "she hears music, and, this time, she does not fire" (197). Arrow and Kenan had doubted whether the cellist's

actions would stop the killings; it has saved at least one person's death. The *Adagio* has become so powerful that it is forceful enough to stop death after all.

At the moment of Arrow's own death, she once again finds comfort in the *Adagio*. Throughout *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, death was accompanied with the sounds of war. When Arrow is about to be shot, she does not perceive these sounds anymore. Rather, Arrow recalls the *Adagio* she heard the cellist play all those afternoons. Paradoxically, when Arrow faces death, she surrounds herself with the sounds of hope. The cellist's soundscape, as opposed to the war soundscape has helped Arrow reclaim and reconstruct her identity. And so Arrow chooses to die. Although she could have shot the men who come to her apartment to kill her, she chooses not to put up a fight. But she is still able to have the last word and reveals her real name: "I am Alisa" (223). This is said both in a "strong and quiet" (223) voice, reflecting the tone of the cellist and the *Adagio*. It is quiet, but full of political power, in great contrast to the noise of the warfare soundscape.

Kenan and Arrow are not the only ones who adapt their behaviour because of the cellist. Inspired by the cellist, Dragan chooses to walk, rather than run, across intersection despite this giving the sniper a better chance of shooting him. Dragan has not heard the cellist play, but has only heard about him. This is already enough to inspire Dragan: if the cellist can reclaim one part of the city, then so can he. The cellist's bold action to deliberately place himself in danger to bring life back to the city motivates Dragan to act in a similar way. Dragan is aware that he looks reckless walking across the intersection but, like the cellist's performances, he is making a deeply political statement:

Perhaps the people watching him [walk] think he's snapped, that he's gone catatonic and doesn't care anymore whether he lives or dies. They'd be wrong. He cares now more than ever. (217)

Dragan's act of walking instead of running reclaims the city. Dragan had actively tried to remember what the city was like before the war but "more and more it seems like there has never been anything here but the men on the hills with guns and bombs" (27). Dragan had been holding on to an image of the city of the past as a coping mechanism (28-30) but has lost that battle. The cellist's musical political statement stimulates Dragan to make one of his own: walking across a dangerous intersection says that the city is his, and he does not live in a state of fear. Dragan thus has an embodied affective response as he literally moves his body differently as a result of the cellist's actions. Dragan's musical experience therefore shows that direct contact with an audible *Adagio* is not necessary to affect its audience. Even minimal interaction with the cellist's musicking is enough to create an embodied affective response, demonstrating the extent of the cellist's subversiveness.

A surprising set of characters are also affected by the cellist's performances, namely the enemy snipers sent to shoot the cellist. Like the Sarajevans, the Serbs are aware of the political statement the cellist is making through his performances and send a sniper to shoot the cellist. Although the first sniper had the shot to kill the cellist, he does not. The sniper's mission is to kill the cellist, but he fails to do so because he ends up listening to the performance instead. Arrow allows the first sniper to listen to the entire performance, before killing them anyway (64). Arrow is reluctant to shoot, which surprises her because normally she is happy to shoot her enemies. But Arrow has noticed the sniper's own reluctance and observes that the cellist's performance has connected them to each other. Arrow shoots the first sniper anyway because she knows that otherwise they will kill the cellist, but it is the first time that – due to the cellist's performance – that Arrow is forced to confront her deep discomfort in her role in the war (133). The first sniper is replaced by a second sniper. This time, Arrow does not kill the sniper until all twenty-two performances are completed (220). Arrow is confident that this sniper will not kill the cellist until the cellist has completed his mission. Like the first sniper, the second enemy sniper is deeply moved by the cellist's performance and cannot bring themselves to kill the cellist either. Although the enemy snipers' manner of musicking is very different than that of the cellist, both actions are political ways of participating in musickal practice. While the cellist is producing the performance and the enemy snipers are listening, both modes of musicking signal the affective power of music and musick. The snipers' movements – and their bullets – are stopped by the music. Affective movement thus leads to a stop in physical movement. The enemy snipers' reactions – or rather, inaction – to the cellist's statement reminds the reader of the powerful tool that music is in its ability to move people affectively, and to suggest courses of action that would normally otherwise not occur. *The Cellist of Sarajevo* thus shows that musick is capable of reframing political power dynamics: a cellist performs on a street and consequently people's behaviour changes. They physically do something different as a direct result of the cellist's influence on them. The cellist's actions effects an embodied affective change. They decide to take risks by walking instead of running, begin to care for others, and most significantly, choose life over death.

Music "itself" is never in the foreground in *The Cellist of Sarjevo*. What the *Adagio* sounds like is never described in auricalized terms. Yet, music(k) is not relegated to the background either; its presence permeates the novel. All of the character's actions are interpreted through their relation with the cellist's musick. What is significant is that a *musical* experience is not necessary but a *musickal* experience one is enough to induce transformation. That is, one does not need to "hear" the *Adagio* to stimulate an affective experience, but simply engaging with it is adequate. Dragan, after all, only hears *about* the cellist. When other characters, such as Arrow or Kenan, do listen to

the *Adagio* they *see* rather than *hear*. The use of ocularization rather than auricularization is precisely what directs the reader's attention to music's affective and transformative properties. These properties – i.e. its affordances – are more important than the medium in which the music(k) is presented or engaged with. A musickal experience is not created by music alone but especially by the context – the situation in which the *Adagio* was composed, the location of its current performances, and a recipient's state of mind all influence the affectivity of the musickal experience. Musicking through literature is another element that contributes to the holistic musickal experience. As *The Cellist of Sarajevo* shows, a novel can encompass different musickal effects and consequently point the reader to music's transformative capabilities. Thus, a musicko-literary novel can also create a musickal experience that works subversively or reframes political power relationships depending on the properties it takes.

Chapter 4: *The Prague Sonata*

The first case study, *The Music Shop*, looked at how representations of sound can or cannot be translated into words. The second case study, *The Cellist of Sarajevo*, considered how a text can create a music(k)al experience whilst only indirectly describing the composition. The analysis of both novels showed to what extent music can be “recalled to mind” and whether a reader can have a musickal experience through literature. Both these novels focus on the dominant modes of musicking i.e. listening and performing. Furthermore, the music in the novels were literary representations of existing sounded versions. In other words, there was ‘real’ music ‘before’ the text. In the final case study, Bradford Morrow’s *The Prague Sonata* (2017), not only does the focus shift to other forms of musicking, such as composition, but the novel’s music is also imagined. Meta Taverner, *The Prague Sonata*’s main character, is gifted a fragment of an original Beethoven manuscript by the original owner’s friend and is tasked with finding the other fragments. Meta attempts to find them by travelling to Prague as well as verify its authenticity. This Beethoven manuscript, however, does not exist in ‘real’ life but has been given form only in the novel’s fictional world. Because the music on that manuscript is exclusively a texted representation, it is impossible for the reader to know what the music “truly” sounds like and neither can they look it up and listen to it, because it simply does not exist. Yet, in an interview published on his website, Morrow insists there is a “realness” to the sonata. When Morrow was asked whether there was a “real” Prague Sonata, he replied that he “hates to say no, because the sonata is very real to me. But if you Google it, you won’t find it in the catalogue of any classical composers” (np). Morrow’s answer implies that although the Prague sonata feels real to him, it is not a real piece of music because it is only imagined. However, Mitchell’s understanding of the image suggests that all modes of representation are equally “real”. A tangible object like a “real” manuscript is as much a representation of music as sound represented in words is. Instead of focusing on capturing what Morrow’s novelistic composition sounds like exactly, I suggest that *The Prague Sonata* creates room for each reader to “compose” their own sonata and in this way blurs the boundaries between “real” and “imagined” music(k) and asks how literature functions as an intermedium in mediating a music that is already musick. Furthermore, it allows one to ask *can a reader listen to a music that exists in an imagined or fictional form only?* In effect, this question examines the capabilities of musickal ekphrasis – can musickal ekphrasis “bring to presence” something that which is not there? In this chapter I suggest that there are a range of techniques that enable a novel to give presence to a fictional musick. Although *The Prague Sonata* does give a framework for how this sonata could sound like it is ultimately up to the reader to use their imagination to create their own piece. The reader thus works alongside the novel to co-bring this fictional sonata to presence.

In the first place, then, let us consider how the Beethoven sonata is given presence in the novel. Although the reader cannot listen to an audible sonata, they are given frames of reference in which to create a mental image. One frame of reference is acousmatization – the use of technical musical jargon – which not only represents music’s sounds but also simultaneously indicates the affective characteristics of the sonata. Each movement is described in multiple moments throughout the novel. This means that the reader is not inundated with acousmatized detail at once but the descriptions build onto each other. When Meta initially plays through the second movement she notes the “flurry of demisemiquavers” (60), that “brazen in its initial runs, the music settled now and again, only to move away into knotty clusters of sixteenth notes” (46), and that “the brief final section combined rising and falling arpeggios” (53). When Meta plays the second movement to a friend in Prague, he remarks “Bloody excellent, the setup in A-flat major, then off the cliff into the doloroso of C minor” (95), thereby contributing a new frame of reference for the reader to create a mental image of the sonata. Furthermore, for an informed reader, terms like “sixteenth notes”, and “A-flat modulating to C minor” are useful in conjuring a mental image of the sonata as they can give sounded form to these descriptions. More significantly, specific musical elements often lend themselves to particular kinds of sounds. For example, the “flurry of demisemiquavers” indicates that there are moments where the music moves faster and with flourish. The sonata’s keys afford particular expressive characteristics. For example, Ernst Pauer marked A-flat major as the key for death, judgement, eternity and darkness and C minor is expressive of “softness, longing, sadness, solemnity, dignified earnestness and a passionate intensity” (np). The tonality thus not only indicates the notes likely to be used in the score, but also indicates a change of mood from death and judgements to something that is sad and passionate.

Like the second movement, the third movement of the sonata is treated acousmatically, however, jargon terms are explained more thoroughly. When Meta performs the third movement of the sonata for the first time, the reader is told that

For all its occasional idiosyncrasies, flashes of genius, it was soon clear this was an archetypal third-movement rondo with its constant return of the opening line. And just what any listener would expect – though sonatas could be unruly little monsters that defied cut-and-dried theory – was a resolution at the end. The human ear begs for the reassurance of the tonic key. *Dah dah. We’re home.* (original emphasis 274)

The references to the music’s structure gives the musical reader an immediate impression of what this movement could sound like. Although an uninformed reader may perhaps not understand all the musical terms, they are still able to gain insight into the sounds through the explanations that

are paired with the jargon terms. For example, regarding the rondo, the reader is told that opening line – the first theme – constantly comes back. Later in the novel, an expanded explanation is offered:

To rub out all the inharmonious voices, [Meta] turned her mind to rondos. Deliciously sane, sane-making rondos. Rondos in which the musical theme was stated, followed by a subordinate theme, then back to the main theme to reassure the listener – sometimes with a simple ornament or filigree – before a second subordinate theme emerges, all in an amity of braiding, a settled pattern. (268)

The structure of a rondo is thus made accessible so that the reader has an additional tool to create the sonata's sound in their mind. That is, the novel "translates" the acousmatized language for the uninformed reader. Another example is the reference to returning to the home key at the end of the piece. Kathryn Marie Kalinak rightly observes that Western music is centred on tonality (10). Tonality is a "musical system revolving around a single tone or note, which functions as a center of gravity: it is a focal point around which the rest of the notes are organized" (10). A composition usually begins and ends on this single tone and in that particular composition it is considered the "home" note and termed the tonic. For example, in Mozart's clarinet concerto in A major, the "home" note is A and consequently both the first and last notes in the piece are an A. All harmonies and melodies are built in relation to the tonic. Although the tonality may move away from the original tonic, the end will always return back to the home note. As a musical form, returning to the tonic affords a sense of stability and of completeness (Kalinak 12). The tonic, as *The Prague Sonata* tells the reader, feels like coming home. Acousmatization in *The Prague Sonata* thus functions as a literary device for rendering music in text and affords the informed reader the ability to create complex sounds in their mind. Moreover, the novel translates acousmatization for the uninformed reader so that they too may follow the descriptions and also create these sounds for themselves. Thus the novel enables both the informed and uninformed reader to "bring to presence" an imagined music. Musickal ekphrasis thus sustains the reader's imagination, much like a text or artwork may sustain affect.

A second frame of reference to "call to mind" the musick in the fictional sonata is through references to musical styles. The first musical style reference *The Prague Sonata* relies on is that of other composers. Early in Meta's research, it is already established that stylistically the sonata fits in the Classical Period, which is then later confirmed by multiple sources. Mandelbaum, Meta's mentor, does "recognize similarities to C. P. E. Bach. Stray hints of Mozart and Haydn. Steibelt, Weber. Dussek" (62). Although the sonata follows many of the conventions of that period, it has some marked differences that mark it as unique: "Haydn's too polite for a lot of this" (60), and Meta

notes that “there are hints of late Mozart, stylistically traditional for the time but with some very weird, totally idiosyncratic stuff going on too” (49). There are also “notated dynamics that were more extreme than anything she’d seen in Mozart” (261). Because the sonata breaks with the conventions of the 18th century, musicologist Kohout suggests that “it’s most likely a nineteenth-century pasticcio, the work of some earnest amateur imitating some earlier masters” (89). Along the same vein, Wittmann, another musicologist says that

whoever concocted this nifty *mélange* really knew his stuff. An impressive amalgamation of phrases and technical conceits borrowed from Mozart and Clementi. Some traditional transitions and modulations sounding fresh. Too much Beethoven, not enough Beethoven. It’s really quite a mess, for all its corrupt instances of beauty and clear moments of inspiration... as a forgery it’s a brilliant, messy stew. Riddled with anachronisms, impossible musical moves for the era it purports to come from. (112)

The sonata is thus paradoxically both from and not from the 18th century. The 18th century attribution to the Prague sonata is therefore both useful for the reader and unhelpful at the same time. The references to the 18th century gives clues as to the style and characteristics of the novel’s sonata, while simultaneously leaving room for the reader to imagine how it might differ from that time period. The references to the other composers provides the reader with a stylistic framework in which to curate the sonata’s sounds. The reader is given a palette of musical styles to choose from and it is up to them to put these pieces together to give the sonata its form.

The second stylistic reference is much more specific and is one of the biggest clues that indicates what the sonata sounds like. When perusing the second movement Meta asks Mandelbaum, “don’t you hear some of [Beethoven’s] Opus 81a here, that first passage? The *adagio* *allegro*’s reversed to *allegro adagio*—” (61). Opus 81a is late Beethoven sonata in three movements. The first movement of a typical sonata is fast, or in musical terms, *allegro*. However, the first movement in Opus 81a opens with a slow theme – *adagio* – before switching to *allegro* with the main theme. The structure in the Prague Sonata’s second movement is reversed: instead of opening with a slow, like a “normal” sonata would, the introduction is *allegro*. The demisemiquavers point towards the fast tempo. After the *allegro* opening, the music “settles” (46) into the slower *adagio*. Further, like the Prague Sonata, Opus 81a is also written A-flat and C minor and, as Meta points out, Beethoven “was constantly revising and reshaping early ideas” (61, see also Kinderman 2012 & 2020, Clubbe, Tunbridge, Swafford). The novel thus suggests that the musical material in the Opus 81a could thus be reusing ideas from the Prague Sonata. Although a reader cannot look up the Prague sonata, they certainly can look up Opus 81a and in that way get a sense of the style and mood of the

Prague sonata's second movement. In this way Morrow creates links and relationships between the "unreal" sonata and existing pieces, just like a "real" piece would have. The fictive sonata is seen as "real" as a "real" music piece and *The Prague Sonata* functions as a texted musical score – rather than notated musical signs – to represent the sonata's sounds.

Although the Prague sonata does not exist as a tangible musically-notated score, it does not mean that it does not exist. Just because an image exists only in the reader's mind, it does not mean it is not "real". In fact, Mitchell argues that *any* image – mental, material or otherwise – is dependent on the mind's ability to make sense of the world (1984 504, 508-511). That is, even a material image requires mental imaginings to function. Because a gap exists between the "real object" and its material representation, one needs to work imaginatively to see the represented object in the material image. As Mitchell says, "the world may not depend upon consciousness, but images of the world clearly do" (509). Mental and material images thus co-depend on each other for their existence. Consequently, material and mental images can be "put in the same category" (Wittgenstein 89) and are equally "real" constructions of an object. Morrow's worded composition and the reader's imagined version can thus be considered as two authentic modes of musical representations and are as real as a material, "real" composition would be. That the reader's version may differ from Morrow's – or another reader's imagination – is not a problem. Delazari ascertains that the reader's "mental image of the music is true, since no further verification is possible" (110). Not only is verification impossible, it is unnecessary. The imagined music is not a faulty rendition of the 'original'. No longer simply "listening" to music in the text, the reader must "compose" the music themselves. Exact faithfulness to the (novel's texted) score is not necessary. In fact, "the performer has the right to make any changes he or she feels like making in the work" (Small 217). Although Small is referring to an instrumental performer here, the reader is also a kind of performer. Morrow gives clues as to the Prague sonata's conventions, affects and affordances, but ultimately it is up to the reader to create or "compose" the composition's sound. In other words, the sonata's verbal descriptions assists the reader in composing the sonata, but the reader is free to regulate the performance in a way that matches their imagination. *The Prague Sonata* thus stimulates the reader into actively participating in musick and hence shifts from inviting the reader to a musical experience to a *musickal* experience.

What has been looked at so far in *The Prague Sonata* is "calling to mind" the fictive Beethoven sonata. As musick, *The Prague Sonata* also articulates relationships between self and the other and between the self and the world. Small contends that musicking's function is to explore and evaluate relationships and musical meaning (89, 133, 215). Although the novel is ostensibly about finding an original Beethoven manuscript, a secondary aspect is to illustrate the political potential of

musicking which is done in through exploring different characters' ways of engaging in the musickal world. In *The Prague Sonata* musicking is the way to give a voice to the embodied but unarticulated feelings for Meta, Otylie – the original manuscript owner – and Wittmann – a musicologist in Prague. The way Otylie musicks, for example, is very different to how Wittmann behaves which is again different to how Meta engages in the musickal world. The medium of the novel affords that these three modes of musicking are set up in relation to each other and magnify musick's political propensities.

In the first place, then, an examination of Meta's mode of musicking reveals that she is concerned with making herself look good in front of other people. At the beginning of the novel Meta is a reluctant musicologist as she sees would much rather have been a "real" pianist – that is, a professional pianist able to play difficult repertoire well – and was well on her way to achieving this goal. She was a student at the Julliard School of Music, which is one of the most prestigious music colleges in the world but a car accident destroys her hand. All of Meta's performances after the accident reinforce to Meta her sense of failure and inadequacy. Although after her accident, Meta manages to play with "wonderful competence" (27), this pales in comparison to her previous ability to "achieve not competence but incandescence, even transcendence" (27). Rather than playing in Carnegie Hall – her "promised land" (93) – she now plays "from time to time before audiences of schoolchildren" (367) and finds "herself placing third or fourth in competitions, never first as she used to" (93). Meta has failed at being an elite musician and finds her alternative career unfulfilling at first as she feels like she is an inferior musician. "Musicology's been a great fallback since I lost my concert career" (73), she tells a friend, and later talks about "abandoned dreams of a concert career" (92). Musicology is seen as the career choice for when someone "fails" as a concert pianist – rather than as a legitimate career in its own right. As the novel progresses, however, Meta becomes more and more invested in the Prague sonata. She confides to her friend that finding the other fragments of the Prague Sonata "gives me another shot at what I'd been working for all my life. This is my chance for meaning" (73). Though she does not always realise it, Meta has a hunger to be seen as a member of the elite by others. However, as Meta continues her research into the Prague sonata and verifies its authenticity Meta begins to realise that there is much more to the musicological field than she had previously thought. Meta begins to worry less about what other people think of her and starts to rely on her own capabilities and consequently her hunger to be a professional pianist diminishes. Rather than being a failed pianist, Meta is now establishing herself as a serious musicologist, who also plays piano (512). Thus the novel articulates how Meta sees herself in relation to others: she has a hunger to be seen as a member of the elite and only finds satisfaction when she reaches that goal.

In the second place, for Otylie musicking is a way to make sense of the world. Life itself is understood in musickal terms. When the Germans arrive in Prague in 1939, she sees the fear of her neighbours: “So many different tones of fear, she thought. Chromatic scales of terror, dissonant chords of dread” (8). Dissonant chords are not pleasant to listen to and afford a sense of disquiet and instability, consequently reflecting the affective and embodied emotions that her neighbours feel. Further, Otylie finds that the sounds and structures of war resemble that of music – “wailing bassoon sirens” (3), “piccolo whistles of the falling bombs” (3), and “dirges of the defeated are the closing theme in any symphony opened by the fanfare of victors” (4) make up war’s soundscape. Reinforcing music’s association with war is the manuscript which Otylie’s father gifted her before his death in World War I. The manuscript represents to Otylie the loss of her father to whom she was close. The connections between war, music and her father were too painful for Otylie to continue enjoying participating in musickal activities and so she resolves two things: “She would never again listen to men who talked war. And she would never sing or play music as long as she lived” (5). War and music are painfully and closely connected for Otylie and so her resolutions protect her from the pain of both these things. Otylie shuts herself off for musickal experiences for a long time, refusing to play or listen to music. Her world does not make sense to her, and neither does musicking so she refuses to engage with it for a long time. As Otylie begins to recover from the traumas of both World Wars, she is able to take up musick again. She teaches (375), dances a polka with her second husband (417). As she starts to make sense of the world, she comes to the realization that “understanding was a fluid thing because, like music, it flows and shifts and reinvents itself with every passing moment. Worthy of reaching toward, yes, always. But finally beyond our human grasp” (454). As Otylie points out, one of the properties of music is that it’s grasp is elusive. Understanding works in the same way. Music shifts and changes and is not a tangible object that one can hold onto and grasp. Otylie sees understanding life’s pathway in the same way – understanding how the world works changes and is not something tangible. Rather, it is something that is felt, and something to move along with, like Otylie’s own development in how she considers the place of music. Although music can be a thing of destruction, Otylie’s comes to see that music can also be constructive. This is reinforced in the scene where Otylie is overcome with emotions when Meta brings her the second and third movements of the sonata. When Meta shares the news that she has found those movements, Otylie is at first disoriented and begins to cry when she sees the manuscripts in front of her for the first time in many years (469). Rather than seeing music as destruction, now that the fragments are back together in one place, Otylie understands music as being able to connect people to each other. She feels close to her friend Irina, who had looked after the second movement and passed it on to Meta, but has since passed away. Despite never having

seen her after the war, Otylie still feels the connection to Irina because Irina looked after and cared for the manuscript so well. Otylie's experience exemplifies Small's assertion that "how we like to musick is who we are" (220). Otylie's initial dislike of musick is informed by her traumatized identity; her later appreciation of musick is shaped by her recovery.

In the third and final place, Wittman's mode of musicking sits in complete contrast to how Otylie and Meta musick. When Wittmann, one of Mandelbaum's old colleagues, finds out that Meta is in possession of a manuscript he tells her it is worthless because it is only an excellent fake (111). Knowing that the manuscript is actually likely to be an authentic Beethoven manuscript, he goes behind her back to locate the other movements and, anticipating the monetary value of such a manuscript, also look for buyers of the manuscript. In short, he wants to get rich. His involvement in musicology is much more about personal gain than about the cultural impact this kind of music might have. Not only that, Wittmann wants to regain some of his former glory as a celebrated musicologist with power like he had during World War II. There, he was able to influence to a large extent the musicology scene in Prague, and it made him feel powerful. Wittmann had so much influence that his "name was once floated for a top position in the ministry of culture" (228). After the fall of Germany in Prague due to losing the war, Wittmann lost a lot of his influence and power. Being able to take credit for finding the sonata will restore some of that lost glory. When Meta leaves Prague with both the second and the third movements of the sonata, Wittmann is enraged because he has lost not only the fragments, but also any ability to claim credit. Consequently, he goes so far as to publish a newspaper article claiming that Meta has stolen the manuscripts and that a cultural artefact has thus been removed from Prague's care (446, 465, 489). If he cannot have the glory for the manuscript, then neither will Meta. Wittmann's mode of musicking thus shows how musick can serve ends that are not always ethical. There is thus a way to do musicking poorly and the novel comments on the way in which musicking can be politically oppressive rather than enriching.

An examination of *The Prague Sonata* shows that it is possible for narrative to bring to presence not only imagined music, but also fictional *musick*. That is, whereas musical ekphrasis recalls to mind compositions, musickal ekphrasis makes musicking become present and articulates how musicking can be politicized. Early on in Meta's research process, Gerrit – a journalist and eventually Meta's boyfriend – observes that "even if [the manuscript] proved to be a minor composition, it had political and human implications that went beyond music" (152). It is not just the Prague manuscript that has political and human implication, however. Not only music, but especially *musick* has political and human implications. As was noted in the introduction, Delazari argues that

the literary narrative is a prephase of a musical experience (xvi). The literary narrative can go further: it can be a pre-phase of a *musickal* experience. *The Prague Sonata* shows the reader that musicking is to be found all around them, if only one would pay attention. Furthermore, literary narrative is not only a pre-phase of a musickal experience but an experience in and of itself. Life itself is music(k). Moreover, a music(k)al life is a rich life. Musicking is not simply about making music, and interpreting music is not simply about the musick itself, but about articulating relationships between people, and between people and other objects in the world (Small 9, 10, 142). A novel, through a texted representation of music, is able to portray – create an image of – these relationships that are often not articulated but only felt. In short, the music gives an insight into the human heart and its emotional state, or rather its affects. Literary musicking plays a role in developing those relationships. All through *The Prague Sonata* elitist hierarchies are broken down: music research and music performances are equally political; imagined and sounded representations of music are equally “real”. The novel also equalizes the informed and uninformed readers. Both the informed and uninformed reader are equally invited to a musickal experience. Although there are places where an informed reader may be able to create a fuller image than an uninformed reader, the novel allows *all* readers to take an active part in their musicking. The uninformed reader, who can be considered an uninformed musician, is no longer reliant on others to create their musickal experience. Instead, the uninformed reader is empowered to create a music(k)al experience that is appropriate to their situation. It shows that there are multiple modes of musicking and how one does so is an expression of their values. In other words, through musickal ekphrasis, characters are able to articulate their feelings and be (musickally) political. Otylie, for example, declines invitations to musick for a long time, because musicking articulated a relationship that reminded her of death and separation. Kahout and Wittmann show that musicking can be used for unscrupulous political ends. *The Prague Sonata* further invites the reader to musick as well. *The Prague Sonata* suggests that musicking is affectively powerful, and it invites all of its readers to engage with musick – in whatever way that may be appropriate.

Conclusion

Reframing the Musicko-Literary Experience

One of the questions that was asked at the beginning of this thesis was *is music only something to be significantly experienced through a performance involving musical instruments, or is there more at stake than live sounds?* The concept of musicking suggests that what is at stake is not the sounds that are produced, but the political implications and relationships that emerge in the process. However, musicking does not occur in a vacuum but within social contexts and through the workings of various mediums, including literature. Narrative musick helps form those contexts and shapes ideas, tastes and articulates relationships between people. Musickal literature is thus a tool that directs the audience's attentions to particular aspects of musicking that would otherwise go unnoticed. As Delazari points out:

Reading about music may prompt us to go and listen, just as reading about a place could encourage us to go and see. At the same time, fiction does not make this (re)action mandatory. It commits us to listening without compelling us to listen: The urge is all ours. Reading may help us hear – in actual music – what we would not hear otherwise (137).

Although Delazari talks specifically about music, i.e. music in sounded form, his comment can of course be expanded to include musicking. Reading may help us not only hear, but also do – in actual musicking – what we would otherwise not do. In other words, reading about musick may prompt us to participate more consciously in musick and further be more aware of all the places and moments where musick may be located. Musickal literature is thus a window into musicking. Joyce's *The Music Shop* relied predominantly on auricularization to "translate" or "bring to mind" the "real" music. A reader is invited to "listen" to the music in this novel, on the basis of ekphrastic descriptions. But Joyce also shows how one does not have to choose either to listen to or to read music. The inclusion of the official playlist, for example, shows that it is not an either/or situation. Rather, both reading and listening to music(k) can be done alongside each other and in fact, the two forms can enrich each other. The ekphrastic passages can show what to listen out for in pieces. Furthermore, because *The Music Shop* treats instrumental music, Classical, Jazz, Pop and other kinds of music as equals, the reader is also invited to listen to a variety of musical genres and appreciate them all for what they bring to the table. What unites all these genres is the fact that they can move the listener. Their affective properties is what makes them all excellent cases of musicking. *The Music Shop* encourages the reader to listen to music throughout and after the reading experience. The novel invites the reader to *really* listen – to listen to particular things in the music, such as the richness of silences, so that music(k)al affect can be paid the recognition it deserves.

That music(k)al affect can provoke one into responding with an embodied mode of thinking was the point of the discussion in the second case study, *The Cellist of Sarajevo*. The idea of what music(k) is, and what it can do is extended. Although a “real” piece remains the focal point, the emphasis, it has been noted, is not on the piece itself. Rather, the political context in the construction and subsequent performances of the *Adagio* is what made the piece so powerfully affective. Certainly, the *Adagio*’s affordances aid the characters’ affective responses, but *The Cellist of Sarajevo* also shows how the context in which music(k) is made can have a significant bearing on the affective properties of the said musickal event and can provoke embodied responses and modes of thinking. With an emphasis on ocularization – visualizing the affective properties of sound – the characters in the novel are provoked to embodied modes of thinking that ultimately provokes them to change their behaviour. The cellist’s audience thus have transformative experiences. The reader is considered to be a kind of audience member, and is consequently also invited to have a transformative musicko-literary experience.

The third case study, *The Prague Sonata*, shows to what extent narrative can function as a literary-musickal intermedium. Blurring medial lines, this novel is both music(k) and literature at the same time. And that is precisely its power. Much like Cage and Young’s worded compositions, *The Prague Sonata* works as a texted score and invite the reader to participate in musicking – by showing how to listen, how to respond to music, by teaching the reader how to compose and to imagine. Using *The Prague Sonata* as a texted score, musickal ekphrasis aids the reader to “perform” the sonata through their imagination and engage in musicking. Like the conceptual artists, *The Prague Sonata* blurs lines – between performer and audience. Much like Cage and Young’s artworks where the ‘real’ performer resides in both the musician and the audience, the reader also functions as creator and recipient simultaneously. A literary audience is actively involved, within certain frameworks indicated by acousmatization, in curating their own affective experience in *The Prague Sonata*. It is perhaps this affective experience that is the crux of the matter. The mode of representation of music or music(k)’s medium is in some ways inconsequential. Nor is the distinction between ‘real’ and ‘imagined’ music of import. Rather, what a particular musickal medium, or mode of musickal representation can *do* for its audience is significant.

The question then arises, what can literary musick do then? Do words not get ‘in the way’ of musick? Small certainly thinks so, arguing that language is undesirable in musicking because it impedes the affective experience (200). For Small, words afford interference and distraction from proper musicking. However, although music and engagement around musickal performances certainly have a place within musicking, a novel can enhance that musickal experience. Novels can aid the reader in untangling emotional responses to music(k) as it gives a voice to a reader’s affective

response. Further, novels can help explore and illustrate how one musick is a reflection of the self and of the other and their relationship to another. Novels give access into different modes of musicking that a reader may not otherwise have access to. That is, they can imagine and articulate different scenarios of musicking and invite the reader to reflect, provoking them to an embodied mode of thinking about how they themselves – and others – musick.

The extent to which a reader has an embodied or affective musickal experience is dependent on the reader's background. This research has explored the affordances of musickal novels and on that basis has made conjectures how readers may respond to the work. How open a reader is to the idea that literature can be musickal, for example, will have an influence on the depth of the musickal experience. Preliminary evidence suggests that expert musicians are less likely to appreciate what literature can do with musick and more likely to struggle with inaccuracies in the text (Delazari 12). However, any specific reader-responses assessments are at this point in time only hypotheses and further research should be done in empirically exploring reader responses to musicko-literary texts.

Besides empirical research into reader-response, there are two other areas for further research both of which relate to the case studies. The first is that all of the selected case studies are Eurocentric and thus an examination as to whether and how non-Western musick may exist in literature, and how non-Western literature deals with musicking would be expedient. Investigating how non-Western musick and literature interact will provide insight into different ways of articulating relationships – that is, new ways of musicking. A second point of interest is to examine what musicking looks like when the protagonist is *not* an expert in their field: Frank in *The Music Shop* has an uncanny ability to find the right kind of music for his customers, the cellist in *The Cellist of Sarajevo* is a professional musician, and Meta in *The Prague Sonata* was a prodigy pianist and rising the musicological ranks. None of these characters are amateur music(k)ians. Despite functioning as accessible musick for informed and uninformed readers alike, these novels continue to imply that musicking is done by experts. However, the concept of musicking suggests that *all* manners of engagement in musick is able to give voice to political matters. Therefore, amateur or inexpert musick-making also has something to say about (political) relationships.

Reframing Literature

The case studies in this thesis have shown that music is not a tangible object but a variety of activities and behaviours that together constitute an embodied performance. In other words, the process of musick-engagement is what makes music(k) what it is. The process-oriented perspective can be extended to literature too. Rather than thinking about literature as novels (or other literary

forms), perhaps one can think about literaturing – that is, the process in which literature comes to be. If the concept of musicking is applied to literature, it follows that literaturing is able to give voice to the way in which relationships work and be political in much the same way in which musicking can. The process of writing a novel, discussing what has been read in classes, researching different theories, vacuum cleaning a lecture hall, are all different kinds of literary actions. In talking about literaturing, various literary angles can be brought together e.g. performance theory, reception theory, (new) historicism, contextualisation, as well as close and distant reading. In bringing these aspects together, interpersonal and political relationships can be given a voice and brought to light.

Reframing Representation

It has been seen that musick and literature speak to and about interpersonal and political relationships. In the light of musicking, representation as a concept can do the same. As a verb, musicking is constituted by various activities. Activities are actions that occur across time and thus musicking is not a static concept. This thesis has observed how musicko-literary novels have a range of techniques at hand to represent musicking and musickal relationships. It thus seems that representation can capture not only a still image, but also behaviour and activity. Seen in this light, representation cannot be only be defined as the picture of a static object but can function as a moving, embodied image. In stretching what representation can capture, one also expands what representation can *do*. Representation becomes an integral part of inviting an audience to an embodied experience. In other words, it becomes part of creating affective experiences.

Another important point regarding representation is that it does not require a tangible or “original” object that exists outside of the mind to carry out its function. This function can be to create a musickal experience or arouse affect. The musicko-literary novels in this thesis have testified to the power of mental representation and to the imagination’s ability to sustain affect. The novels offer an experiential expression of Mitchell’s argument that mental representations are in fact tangible: what one imaginatively sees or hears can be transferred so that another person can also see and hear the image. What one person sees or hears is unlikely to be an exact replica of the other person’s representation but it is exactly in these differences where meaning can be found. It is in the gaps between these representations that relationships – musical, political or otherwise – can be identified and given a voice. Artistic representation thus has a significant role in articulating power relationships and therefore one should be encouraged to engage in musicking and literaturing.

A Closing Word

In a word play, the title of this research project – *Worded Wordlessness: Music(k)al Ekphrasis and Novel Musicking* – refers to finding musick in new places. On the one hand, the novel has been reframed to be musick and a form of musicking. On the other hand, musicking has been seen in a new – novel – light. In turn, this leads to a new – a novel – way of understanding both musickal and literary practices. The music(k) I have been looking at has mostly been instrumental music – that is, wordless. Novel musicking is crafted through music(k)al ekphrasis, which gives a non-verbal medium a voice. Instrumental musick has been allowed to speak through a musickal ekphrasis that goes beyond making only music come to the foreground, but that also makes the context of the musicking become present. Musicking is thus politicized; musicko-literary texts have that same potential and thus have much to offer the reader. Here then, an invitation to take up musicko-literature’s invitation to have an affective experience – in whichever mode or medium that fits.

Bibliography

- Abbate, Carolyn. "Music - Drastic of Gnostic?" *Critical Inquiry* 30 (2004): 505-536.
- Adorno, Theodore. *Essays on Music*. Ed. Richard Leppert. Trans. Susan H. Gillespie. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.
- . *Philosophy of Modern Music*. Trans. W. Blomster. New York: Seabury, 1973.
- Agawu, V Kofi. *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classical Music*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991.
- Ahmed, Sara. *Happy Objects*. Duke University Press, 2010.
- Albers, Josef. *Interaction of Color*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1963.
- Alperson, Philip. *What is Music? An Introduction to the Philosophy of Music*. Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1986.
- Alphen, Ernst van. "Affective Operations of Art and Literature." *Anthropology and Aesthetics* 53/54 (2008): 20-30.
- Altieri, Charles. *The Particulars of Rapture: An Aesthetic of the Affects*. Cornell: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Andreas, Peter. *Blue Helmets and Black Markets : The Business of Survival in the Siege of Sarajevo*. Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press, 2008.
- Armstrong, Rachel. *The Radical Aesthetic*. New Jersey: Wiley, 2000.
- Auer, Leopold. *Violin Playing as I Teach It*. Massachusetts: Courier Corporation, 1980.
- Auslander, Philip. "Musical Personae." *The Drama Review* 50.1 (2006): 100-119.
- . "Performance analysis and popular music: A manifesto." *Contemporary Theatre Review* 14.1 (2004): 1.
- Austin, J. L. *How to Do Things with Words?* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1962.
- Baerentsen, K. B. and J. Trettvik. "An activity theory approach to affordance." *Proceedings of NordiCHI 2002* (2002): 51-60.
- Barrow, Terrence. *Music of the Maori: Traditional and modern music of the Maori*. Wellington: Seven Seas Publishing Pty Ltd, 1965.
- Baudrillard, Jean. *Simulacra and Simulation*. Trans. Sheila Faria Glaser. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994.
- Beethoven, Ludwig van. "Violin Sonata No. 9, Op. 47 'Kreutzer Sonata'." 1803.
- Bharucha, Jamshed, Meagan Curtis and Kaivon Paroo. "Varieties of Musical Experience." *Cognition* 100.1 (2006): 131-172.
- Blacking, John. *How Musical is Man*. Washington: University of Washington, 1974.
- Bowen, Zack. "Music as Comedy in Ulysses." *Picking up Airs: Hearing the Music in Joyce's Text*. Ed. Ruth H. Bauerle. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993. 31-52.

- Bowie, Andrew. *Aesthetics and Subjectivity: From Kant to Nietzsche*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003.
- Boyce-Tillman, June. "The Transformative Qualities of a Liminal Space Created by Musicking." *Philosophy of Music* 17.2 (2009): 184-202.
- Breder, Hans. "Intermedia: Enacting the Liminal." *Performing Arts Journal* 17.2/3 (1995): 112-120.
— . *Intermedia: Enacting the Liminal*. Norderstedt: Books on Demand, 2005.
- Brillenbug-Wurth, Kiene. *Musically Sublime: Indeterminacy, Infinity, Irresolvability*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2009.
- Brinkema, Eugenie. *The Forms of the Affects*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Brown, Calvin S. *Music and Literature: A Comparison of the Arts*. Hanover: University Press of New England, 1987.
- Bruhn, Siglind. "A Concert of Paintings: "Musical Ekphrasis" in the Twentieth Century." *Poetics Today* 22.3 (2001): 551-605.
- Burgess, Anthony. *Napoleon Symphony*. London: W.W. Norton & Company, 1974.
- Burholder, J. Peter, Donald Jay Grout and Claude V. Palisca. *A History of Western Music*. Eighth. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2010.
- Burkholder, J. Peter, Donald Jay Grout and Claude V. Palisca. *A History of Western Music*. 8th. London: W. W. Norton, 2010.
- Cage, John. "4'33"." 1952.
— . *Silence: Lectures and Writings by John Cage*. Hanover: Wesleyan University Press, 1961.
- Cambridge Dictionary. "music." Cambridge University Press, n.d. 01 June 2022.
<<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/music>>.
- Cappelen, Birgitta and Anders-Petter Andersson. "Musicking Tangibles for Empowerment." July, 2012.
- Clubbe, John. *Beethoven: The Relentless Revolutionary*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2019.
- Cobussen, Marcel and Nanette Nielsen. *Music and Ethics*. Taylor & Francis Group, 2012.
- Cochrane, Tom, Bernardino Fantini and Klaus R. Scherer, *The Emotional Power of Music: Multidisciplinary perspectives on musical arousal, expression, and social control*. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online, 2013.
- Collins Online Dictionary. "music." Collins Online Dictionary, n.d. 01 June 2022.
<<https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/music>>.
- Cook, Nicholas. "Music as Performance." *The Cultural Study of Music - A Critical Introduction*. Ed. Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert and Richard Middleton. New York & London: Routledge, 2003. 204-219.
- Cunningham, Valentine. "Why Ekphrasis." *Classical Philology* 102 (2001): 57-71.

- Dauhlhaus, Carl. *Foundations of Music History*. Trans. J. B. Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Davies, Stephen. *Musical Meaning and Expression*. New York: Cornell University Press, 1994.
- Dayan, Peter. "Intermediality and the Refusal of Interdisciplinarity In Stravinsky's Music." *Intermedial Arts: Disrupting, Remembering and Transforming Media*. Ed. Leena Eilittä, Liliane Louvel and Sabine Kim. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012. 159-171.
- Deats, Richard. "Adagio in Sarajevo: An Urgent Call to Faith and Action." *Fellowship* 59.3 (1993): 31.
- Delazari, Ivan. *Musical Stimulacra*. New York: Routledge, 2021.
- Deleuze, Gilles. *Proust and Signs*. Trans. Richard Howard. New York: Braziller, 1964.
- DeNora, Tia. *Music in Everyday Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Donia, Robert J. *Sarajevo: A Biography*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2006.
- Edgecombe, Rodney Stenning. "Melophrasis: Defining a Distinctive Genre of Literature/Musical Dialogue." *Mosaic* 26.4 (1993): 1-20.
- Fialho, Oliva. "What is literature for? The Role of Transformative Reading." *Cogent Arts & Humanities* 6.1 (2019): 1-16.
- Fisk, Charles. "What Schubert's Last Sonata Might Hold." *Music and Meaning*. Ed. Jenefer Robinson. London: Cornell University Press, 1997. 179-200.
- Forbes, Elliot, ed. *Thayer's Life of Beethoven*. Vol. I. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992.
- Foster, E. M. *Howard's End*. London: Penguin Group, 2000.
- Galloway, Steven. *The Cellist of Sarajevo*. London: Atlantic Books, 2008.
- Gant, Andrew. *What is Music*. London: Profile Books Ltd, 2017.
- Gaver, William. "Technology affordances." *Proceedings of CHI* 91 (1991): 79-84.
- Genette, Gérard. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. Trans. Jane E. Lewin. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Gianturco, Carolyn. "Giazotto, Remo." *Grove Music Online* (2001): n.p., 15 May 2022.
<<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000011086>>.
- Gibson, James. *The Ecological Approach to Visual Perception*. Oxfordshire: Taylor & Francis Ltd., 2014.
- Goehr, Lydia. "How to Do More with Words. Two Views of (Musical) Ekphrasis." *British Journal of Aesthetics* 50.4 (2010): 389-410.
- Goldhill, Simon. "What is Ekphrasis For?" *Classical Philology* (2007): 1-19.
- Hadžiosmanović, Jelena. "How is Culture used as a Tool for Dissuasion of Conflict and Consensus: A Case of Sarajevo (1992-1995)." *Epiphany* 7.1 (2014): 22-46.
- Hailstone, Julia C., et al. "It's not what you play, it's how you play it: Timbre affects perception of emotion in music." *Psychology Press* 62.11 (2009): 2141-2155.

- Hamer, Petra. "Modes of transgression in besieged Sarajevo from 1992 to 1995." *Darüber hinaus... Populäre Musik und Überschreitung(en)*. Oldenburg: der Carl von Ossietzky Universität Press, 2018. 62-74.
- Hanslick, Eduard. *On the Musically Beautiful*. Trans. Geoffrey Payzant. Indianapolis: Hackett, 1986.
- . *The Beautiful in Music*. Trans. Gustav Cohen. Indianapolis, 1957.
- Harling-Lee, Katie. "Listening to Survive: Classical music and conflict in the musico-literary novel." *Violence* (2020): 371-388.
- Havas, Kato. *The Twelve lesson Course in a New Approach to Violin Playing*. Leipzig: Bosworth, 1989.
- Hepokoski, James and Warren Darcy. *Elements of Sonata Theory: Norms, Types, and Deformations in the Late-Eighteenth-Century Sonata*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Herzog, Grégoire. "Do Animals Have Music." *BAMS* 5 (1941): 3-4.
- Hess, Juliet J. "Musicking Marginalization: Periphractic Practices in Music Education." *The Palgrave Handbook of Race and the Arts in Education*. Ed. Kraehe, A., Gaztambide-Fernández, R. and Carpenter II, B. . Palgrave Macmillan, 2018. 325-346.
- Higgins, Dick. "Intermedia." *Leonardo* 34.1 (2001): 49-54.
- Hogan, Patrick Colm. "Affect Studies." *Oxford Research Encyclopedias Literature* (2016): 1-29.
- J. A. Tenreiro machado, António C. Costa, Miguel F. M. Lima. "Dynamical analysis of compositions." *Springer Verlag* 65.4 (2010): 399-412.
- James, Timothy. *Beethoven: The 'Moonlight' and other Sonatas, Op. 27 and Op. 31*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Jankélévitch, Vladimir. *Music and the Ineffable*. Trans. Carolyn Abbate. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Jones, Timothy. *Beethoven: The 'Moonlight' and Other Sonatas, Op. 27 and Op. 31*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Joyce, James. *Ulysses*. San Fernando de Henares: Oxford University Press España, 2008.
- Joyce, Rachel. *The Music Shop*. London: Transworld Publishers, 2017.
- Judah, Tim. *The Serbs: History, Myth and the Destruction of Yugoslavia*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1007.
- Juntunen, Marja-Leena, et al. "Envisioning imaginary spaces for musicking: equipping students for leaping into the unexplored." *Music Education Research* 16.3 (2014): 251-266.
- Juslin, Patrick N. and Petri Laukka. "Communication of emotions in vocal expression and music performance: Different channels, same code?" *Psychological Bulletin* 129.5 (2003): 770-814.
- Kalinak, Kathryn Marie. *Film Music: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Karl, Gregory and Jenefer Robinson. "Shostakovich's Tenth Symphony and the Musical Expression of Cognitively Complex Emotions." *Music & Meaning*. Ed. Jenefer Robinson. London: Cornell University Press, 1977. 154-178.

- Kauffman, Rebecca. "Top 10 musical novels." *The Guardian*, 23 January 2019. 13 August 2022.
<<https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/jan/23/top-10-musical-novels>>.
- Kerman, Joseph. *Contemplating Music: Challenges to Musicology*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1985.
- Kinderman, William. "Contrast and Continuity in Beethoven's Creative Process." *Beethoven and His World*. Ed. Scott Burnham and Michael P. Steinberg. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2020. 193-224.
- . *The Creative Process in Music From Mozart to Kurtag*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2012.
- King, Curtis S. "The Siege of Sarajevo, 1992-1995." *Block by Block: The Challenges of Urban Operations*. Ed. William Glenn Robertson and Lawrence A. Yates. Fort Leavenworth: U.S. Army Command and General Institute Press, 2003. 235-290.
- Kivy, Peter. *Music Alone*. New York: Cornell University Press, 1990.
- Klee, Paul. "Cooling in the Garden of the Torrid Zone." 1924.
- . "In the Style of Bach." 1919.
- Kramer, Lawrence. "Dangerous Liaisons: The Literary Text in Musical Criticism." Kramer, Lawrence. *Critical Musicology and the Responsibility of Response: Selected Essays*. Hampshire: Ashgrave, 1989. 35-44.
- . "Introduction." Kramer, Lawrence. *Critical Musicology and the Responsibility of Response: Selected Essays*. Hampshire: Ashgate, 2006. ix-xvi.
- . "Narrative Nostalgia: Modern Art Music off the Rails." *Music and Narrative since 1900*. Ed. Michael L. Klein and Nicholas Reyland. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2013. 163-188.
- Krieger, Murray. *Ekphrasis: The Illusion of the Natural Sign*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1992.
- Langer, Susanne. *Philosophy in a New Key*. 3rd. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1956.
- Leppart, Richard. *The Sight of Sound*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993.
- Lerdahl, Fred and Ray Jackendoff. *A Generative Theory of Tonal Music*. Massachusetts: MIT Press, 1983.
- Levine, Caroline. *Forms: Whole, Rhythm, Hierarchy, Network*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2015.
- Levinson, Jerrold. *The Pleasures of Aesthetics*. New York: Cornell University Press, 1996.
- Lewney, Mark and Bernard E. Richardson. "Investigating the effect of different strutting arrangements on the modes of a guitar soundboard." *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America* 105 (1999): 1125.
- Leys, Ruth. "The Turn to Affect: A Critique." *Critical Inquiry* 37 (2011): 434-472.
- Lidov, David. *Elements of Semiotics*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1999.

- Lissa, Zofia. "Aesthetic Functions of Silence and Rests in Music." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 22.4 (1964): 443-454.
- Liszt, Franz. "Héroïde funèbre." 1850.
- Maček, Ivana. "Transmission and Transformation: Memories of the Siege of Sarajevo." *Civillians Under Siege from Sarajevo to Troy*. Ed. Alex Dowdall and John Horne. New York: Springer, 2017. 15-36.
- Mahler, Gustav. "Symphony No. 2." 1888.
- Marrow, Bradford. *The Prague Sonata*. London: Grove Press UK, 2017.
- Martineau, Jason. *The Elements of Music*. Somerset: Wooden Books Ltd., 2008.
- Marx, Adolf Bernhard. *Musical Form in the Age of Beethoven : Selected Writings on Theory and Method*. Trans. Scott Burnham. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Massumi, Brian. *Politics of Affect*. Cambridge: Polity, 2015.
- McAuley, Tomás, et al. *The Oxford Handbook of Western Music and Philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020.
- McClary, Susan. *Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, and Sexuality*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991.
- McGrenere, J. and W. Ho. "Affordances: Clarifying and evolving a concept." *Proceedings of CHI 2000* (2000): 179-186.
- Merriam, Alan P. "Characteristics of African Music." *Journal of the International Folk Music Council* 11 (1959): 13-19.
- Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary. "Music." Merriam-Webster, n.d. 01 June 2022.
<<https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/music>>.
- Mitchell, W. J. T. "Ekphrasis and the Other." Mitchell, W.J. T. *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1994. 151-182.
- . "What is an Image?" *New Literary History* 15.3 (1984): 503-537.
- Monelle, Raymond. *Linguistics and Semiotics in Music*. Oxfordshire: Routledge, 1992.
- Mussorgsky, Modest. "Pictures at an Exhibition." 1874.
- Naythons, Matthew. *Sarajevo: A Portrait of the Siege*. New York: Grand Central Publishing, 1994.
- Nelles, William. *Frameworks: Narrative Levels and Embedded Narrative*. New York: Peter Lang, 1997.
- Nettl, Bruno. "Music." *Grove Music Online* (2001): n.p.
- Neubauer, John. *The Emancipation of Music from Language: Departure from Mimesis in Eighteenth-Century Aesthetics*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988.
- Newcomb, Anthony. "Action and Agency in Mahler's Ninth Symphony, Second Movement." *Music and Meaning*. Ed. Jenefer Robinson. London: Cornell University Press, 1997. 131-153.
- Norman, Donald. *The Design of Everyday Things*. Milton Keynes: Ingram Publisher Services, 1988.

- Norwich, John Julius, ed. *Oxford Illustrated Encyclopedia of the Arts*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990.
- Novák, Radomil. "Sound in Literary Texts." *Neophilologus* 104.2 (2020): 151.
- Odendaal, Albi, et al. "What's with the K? Exploring the implications of Christopher Small's 'musicking' for general music education." *Music Education Research* 16.2 (2014): 162-175.
- Pater, Walter. "The School of Giorgione." *Walter Pater the Renaissance Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text*. Ed. Donald L. Hill. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1893. 102-122.
- Pauer, Ernst. *The Elements of the Beautiful in Music*. Classic Reprint. London: Forgotten Books, 201.
- Penderecki, Krzysztof. "Threnody for the Victims of Hiroshima." 1994.
- Pereira, Margarida Esteves. "More than Words: the Elusive Language of A.S. Byatt's Visual Fiction." *Writing and Seeing : Essays on Word and Image*. Ed. Rui Carvalho Homen and Maria de Fátima Lambert. New York: Rodopi, 2006. 211-222.
- Pritchett, James. "What Silence Taught John Cage: The Story of 4'33'." *John Cage and Experimental Art: The Anarchy of Silence*. Museu d'Art Contemporani de Barcelona, 2009.
- Pritchford, Nicola, C.P. Biggam and C.J. Kay, *Progress in Colour Studies*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2006.
- Probyn, Elspeth. "Writing Shame." *The Affect Theory Reader*. Ed. Melissa Gregg and Gregory J. Seigworth. Durham: Duke University Press, 2010. 71-92.
- Rimsky-Korsakov, Nikolai. "Scheherazade." 1888.
- Rink, John. "Translating Musical Meaning: The Nineteenth-Century Performer as Narrator." *Rethinking Music*. Ed. Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010. 217-238.
- Rippl, Gabriele, ed. *Handbook of Intermediality*. Boston, 2015.
- Rosen, Charles. *Sonata Forms*. New York: Norton, 1988.
- Rush, Mark. *Playing the Violin: An Illustrated Guide*. New York: Routledge, 2006.
- Sadie, Stanley and Alison Latham, *The Cambridge Guide to Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Saintsbury, George. *A History of Criticism and Literary Taste in Europe from the Earliest Texts to the Present Day*. Charleston: BiblioBazaar, 2009.
- Sandberg, Larry. *The Acoustic Guitar Guide*. Chicago: A Cappella Books, 2000.
- Schafer, R. Murray. "Music and the Soundscape." *The Book of Music and Nature: An Anthology of Sounds, Words, Thoughts*. Ed. David Rothenberg and Marta Ulvaeus. Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 2009. 58-68.
- Scheer, Monique. "Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (and Is That What Makes Them Have a History)?" *History and Theory* 51 (2012): 193-220.
- Scher, Steven Paul. "Literature and Music (1982)." Scher, Steven Paul. *Essays on Literature and Music (1967-2004)*. Ed. Walter Bernhart and Werner Wolf. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2004. 173-202.

- . "Notes Toward a Theory of Verbal Music." *Comparative Literature* 22 (1970): 147-156.
- . *Verbal Music in German Literature*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968.
- Scherer, Klaus R. and Marcel R. Zentner. "Emotional Effects of Music: Production Rules." *Music and Emotion: Theory and Research*. Ed. Patrick N. Juslin and John A. Sloboda. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. 361-392.
- Schille, Richard. "Engineering a Better Guitar." *Mechanical Engineering* 133.02 (2011): 38-41.
- Schmidt-Beste, Thomas. *The Sonata*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.
- Searle, John R. "The Logical Status of Fictional Discourse." *New Literary History* 6.2 (1975): 319-332.
- Shouse, Eric. "Feeling, Emotion, Affect." *M/C Journal* 8.6 (2005): NP. <<http://journal.media-culture.org.au/0512/03-shouse.php>>.
- Sibelius, Jean. "The Swan of Tuonela." 1895.
- Sloane, Irving. *Classical Guitar Construction*. New York: Stirling Publishing Co., 1984.
- Small, Christopher. *Musicking*. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1998.
- Smith, Hazel. *The Contemporary Literature-Music Relationship: Intermedia, Voice, Technology, Cross-Cultural Exchange*. New York: Routledge, 2016.
- Spaeth, Sigmund. *The Art of Enjoying Music*. New York: Permabooks, 1949.
- Strauss, Richard. "Don Quixote, Op. 35." 1897.
- Swafford, Jan. *Beethoven: Anguish and Triumph*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2014.
- Talbot, Michael. "Albinoni, Tomaso Giovanni." (2001).
- . "Albinoni: The Professional Dilettante." *The Musical Times* 112.1540 (1971): 538-541.
- Tarasti, Eero. *A Theory of Musical Semiotics*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994.
- Taruskin, Richard. *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Taylor, Nancy. *Teaching Healthy Musicianship: The Music Educator's Guide to Injury Prevention and Wellness*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Thompson, Randal Joy and Edin Ibrahimfendic. "Sarajevo: Courage and Defiance through Music as Inspirations for Social Change." *Grassroots Leadership and the Arts for Social Change*. Ed. Susan J. Erenrich and Jon F. Wergin. West Yorkshire: Emerald Group Publishing, 2017. 3-28.
- Thompson, William Forde, E. Glenn Schellenberg and Gabriela Husain. "Arousal, Mood and the Mozart Effect." *American Psychological Society* 12.3 (2001): 248-251.
- Thrift, Nigel. "Intensities of Feelings: Towards a Spatial Politics of Affect." *Geografiska Annaler* 86 B.1 (2004): 57-78.
- Tolstoy, Leo. *The Kreutzer Sonata*. Trans. Benjamin R. Tucker. Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 1889.
- Tuijl, Louise van. Personal Correspondence, 16 May 2022.

- Tunbridge, Laura. *Beethoven: A Life in Nine Pieces*. London: Penguin UK, 2020.
- Vukceвич, Mai. "The University of Chicago." 2002. *Representation*. 19 May 2022.
<<https://csmt.uchicago.edu/glossary2004/representation.htm>>.
- Walker, Jonathan. "Formalism." *The Oxford Companion to Music*. Ed. Alison Latham. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Wimsatt, W. K. *The Verbal Icon*. Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1954.
- Winn, James. *Unsuspected Eloquence: A History of the Relations Between Poetry and Music*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984.
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1922.
- Wolf, Werner. *The Musicalization of Fiction*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1999.
- Woolf, Virginia. *Mrs Dalloway*. Boston: Mariner Books, 1990.
- Young, James. *Critique of Pure Music*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Young, La Monte. "Compositions 1960." 1963. 06 July 2022.
<<https://www.fondazionebonotto.org/it/collection/fluxus/younglamonte/2121.html>>.
- Zangwill, Nick. "Music, Metaphor and Emotion." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 65 (2007): 391-400.
- Zintel, Harold Albert. *A System Model of the Guitar*. Philadelphia: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1990.