## The Importance of Intersectionality:

Experiences of Women of Color of Ethnic Profiling in the Netherlands



Sharon Chamman 5509459 Utrecht University August 2020

A Thesis submitted to the Board of Examiners in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Arts in Conflict Studies & Human Rights

**Supervisor:** Dr. Mario Fumerton

**Date of submission:** August 3, 2020

**Program trajectory:** Research and Thesis Writing Only (30 ECTS)

Word count: 22557

The picture on the front page is taken at the Black Lives Matter protest on June  $5^{th}$ , 2020, in Utrecht, the Netherlands by Jan Kees Helms<sup>1</sup>.

 $<sup>^{1}\,\</sup>underline{\text{https://www.doorbraak.eu/foto-reportage-van-het-massale-blacklives matter-protest-gisteren-in-utrecht/}$ 

#### Abstract<sup>2</sup>

Ethnic profiling is one of the manifestations of institutionalized racism in the Netherlands. It is defined as the practice of being arrested or stopped by security officials based on ethnicity. Moreover, within this practice, it is believed that people from certain ethnic groups are more likely to commit crimes. Public and academic debates regarding ethnic profiling have been focused on the experiences of men. However, if we want to understand the practice of ethnic profiling in a holistic way, we need to incorporate the experiences of women of color.

This thesis aims to capture the experiences of women of color in the Netherlands with ethnic profiling. The aim is not to add to the list of women's experiences but rather to understand how ethnic profiling looks like while acknowledging how gender and ethnicity, among other identity categories, intersect. To do this, I used intersectionality as my analytical frame. Intersectionality is not only about different identity categories that intersect, but especially about the outcomes of this interaction in power relations, creating inequality.

By doing semi-structured interviews, I have collected a diverse range of experiences with ethnic profiling. This range of experiences shows how women of color are marginalized in the context of ethnic profiling. The women felt that these experiences were influenced by the intersectional stereotypical ideas of black womanhood, the womanhood of Middle Eastern women, and Asian womanhood. So, these experiences did not only feel influenced by the fact that these women are *of color*, but, moreover, because they are *women of color*. The experiences of these women cannot be generalized since different ethnicities and other identity categories influence the experiences of women of color differently.

In short, the understanding of ethnic profiling will only be more inclusive and allencompassing if an intersectional way of thinking about these women's experiences is included.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A Dutch abstract of this thesis can be found in Appendix 1. I have also included a more elaborate summary of this research in Appendix 4. In Appendix 5, I included a Dutch translation of this summary.

#### **Acknowledgments**

First and foremost, I want to thank all the women that have participated in this research. Thank you for trusting me with your personal experiences, which are important and valuable. I could not use every experience that we have discussed. However, that does not mean that those experiences were less interesting or not worthy; it just means that it did not fit in the scope of this thesis. Thank you for all your time and your involvement throughout the whole process. I hope to have done justice to your experiences in this thesis. I cannot express in words how grateful I am.

Furthermore, I want to thank Mirthe and Ali, my classmates. Thank you for all the time you put into reading my thesis and giving critical feedback. Also, I want to thank my family and friends, especially Bo, Anne, and Lisa, who commented on my thesis and motivated me to get the best out of it.

Last but not least, I would like to express my gratitude towards dr. Mario Fumerton, the supervisor of this thesis. Thank you for your support, your enthusiasm, and always very elaborate and constructive feedback.

### Content

Abstract	2
Acknowledgments	3
Introduction	6
Chapter 1. Institutional racism, ethnic profiling, and the experiences of women	13
1.1. Institutionalized racism and ethnic minorities	13
1.2. Ethnic profiling	16
1.3. Women's experiences	18
1.4. Summary and concluding remarks	20
Chapter 2. Intersectionality and the experiences of women of color	22
2.1. Researching women of color	22
2.2. Conceptualizing intersectionality	24
2.3. Critiques of intersectionality as an analytical frame	25
2.4. Intersectional identity categories	27
2.5. Summary and concluding remarks	29
Chapter 3. Methodology	30
3.1. Research design	30
3.1.1. Ontology and epistemology	30
3.1.2. Where, when, who, and what	31
3.2. Research method	32
3.2.1. Research questions	32
3.2.2. Phases	33
3.2.3. Semi-structured interviews	34
3.3. Ethical considerations, research limitations and opportunities, and position	ı <b>ality</b> . 35
3.3.1. Ethical considerations	35
3.3.2. Research limitations and opportunities	36
3.3.3. Positionality	37
3.4. Summary and concluding remarks	37
Chapter 4. Meet the women: identities and everyday experiences	39
4.1. Intersectional identity categories	39
4.1.1. Ethnicity	39
4.1.2. Gender	41
4.1.3. Other social identities	42
4.2. Experiences of everyday racism	43
4.3. Summary and concluding remarks	45
Chanter 5. Reing ethnically profiled	47

5.1. Being a black woman	48
5.1.1. Driving while being a black woman	48
5.1.2. Flying while being a black woman	49
5.1.3. Partying while being a black woman	51
5.1.4. Being a black mother	52
5.2. Being a Muslim or Middle Eastern woman	56
5.2.1. Flying while being a black Muslim woman	56
5.2.2. Flying while being an Iranian woman	57
5.3. Being an Asian woman	59
5.3.1. Working while being a Chinese woman	60
5.4. Summary and concluding remarks	60
Conclusion	62
References	66
Appendixes	70
Appendix 1 - Abstract in Dutch/Samenvatting	70
Appendix 2 – Interview guide	71
Appendix 3 - Original quotes	74
Appendix 4 – Summary in English	79
Appendix 5 – Summary in Dutch	83
Appendix 6 - Plagiarism Declaration	87

#### Introduction

In 2016, Dutch media were tied up with the case of Typhoon, a black Surinamese Dutch rapper. A police officer stopped him when he was driving his new and expensive car, which, according to the police officer, did not match his 'profile.' The police officer said that he thought the car was bought with drug money. Later, a spokesman stated Typhoon was stopped because of his young age and the new and expensive car, but that his skin color also had a role in this (NOS 2016). This incident led to more public attention to ethnic profiling in the Netherlands.

This example illustrates the overall idea people have when talking about ethnic profiling: men of color being stopped by the police because they are driving a 'too' expensive car. However, this is not the only way in which ethnic profiling is happening.

On January 9, 2020, a Dutch Iranian woman posted on Instagram that the American Customs and Border Protection refused her to board her flight from the Netherlands to the United States. Her post went viral because many people reposted it. She never got an explanation from the American Customs and Border Protection officials why she was not allowed to board her flight. However, she argues that it is because of her Iranian appearance and last name<sup>3</sup>. Interestingly, even though this case did receive much public attention, no news articles on this matter referred explicitly to 'ethnic profiling,' while in the case of Typhoon, many did. Why is that?

#### **Ethnic profiling**

Ethnic profiling is, as I will explain later in this thesis, a manifestation of institutionalized racism, which Özdil (2014, 56) defines as "systemic racist practices in society." In turn, the general understanding of ethnic profiling is "the practice of singling out people based on their race or ethnicity for police or other security stops in the belief that members of a certain race or ethnic group are more likely to commit a particular crime" (Sharma 2003, 276). In other words, existing literature stresses that ethnic profiling is done by security officials, like the police. These security officials single people out from certain ethnic groups, consciously or subconsciously, before knowing if they have committed a crime. This practice seems to be influenced by stereotypical ideas relating to these ethnic groups. In this general understanding, ethnic profiling specifically targets young males of color (Sharma 2003, 275-76).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Interview with Yasmin [Dutch Iranian girl], on 04-05-2020.

In the Netherlands, the context of this research, there is no absolute restriction or taboo on ethnic profiling (Eijkman 2010, 2). Eijkman (2010, 1) argues that "within the Dutch political arena and in public speech," ethnic profiling is often framed as a solution to the problem of, for example, terrorism, radicalization, and violent crime. Besides, Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 448) argue that the Netherlands knows a culture of control, in which the Dutch government puts individual rights second in the name of collective security. There is public and political support for preventive searches in the Netherlands (Eijkman 2010, 16), which legitimizes ethnic profiling for the sake of security.

Ethnic profiling has a significant impact on individuals from certain ethnic groups. As Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 445) argue, ethnic profiling can lead to feelings of polarization and stigmatization. Besides, ethnic profiling contributes to adverse political and public discourses targeted at minorities (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 451). Because the Dutch government merges migration policy and crime control, as Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 445) argue, ethnic minorities are addressed as "dangerous others" within these adverse political and public discourses. Furthermore, El-Tayeb (2003, xx) discusses the narrative of Europe as homogeneously white, which has been at the center of public and policy debates in Europe. This narrative results in ethnic minorities being perceived as "European others" (El-Tayeb 2011). Moreover, because of these negative discourses and narratives, ethnic minorities are more likely to be targeted by ethnic profiling (Welch 2007, 286). These political and public discourses and debates will be elaborated on in Chapter 14.

These "dangerous" or "European others" are often perceived to be men. As Welch (2007, 278) argues, because of the "racialization of crime," black men are inherently linked to criminality. He argues: "When the public sees such a large portion of those convicted and sentenced by criminal courts are Black, the message conveyed is that Blackness and criminality are inextricably related" (Welch 2007, 280). However, black men are not the only ones who are criminalized.

Newsome (2003, 34) discusses stereotypes of black women, them being perceived as "masculine, crafty, promiscuous, sexually inviolable, pathological, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Note that I am discussing narratives and discourses. I do not aim to claim that everyone in the Netherlands agrees with these narratives and discourses. However, these narratives and discourses do show how some ideas are embedded in Dutch society, as I will show with some example throughout this thesis.

criminally inclined." These images are reinforced by the media. As Newsome (2003, 390) argues: "In Hollywood films, black women are portrayed as more violent, in need of more physical restraint, and as more sexualized than white women." Furthermore, Newsome (2003, 34) argues that these stereotypical ideas of black women in the media lead to the ethnic profiling of these women (Newsome 2003, 40). However, not much attention has been given to the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling in public and academic discourses.

Research on women of color and their experiences with ethnic profiling is limited. As I have stated at the beginning of this introduction, the general understanding of ethnic profiling is men being stopped in their cars by the police. Almost all academic and non-academic works on ethnic profiling are about these male experiences (Amnesty International and Open Society Justice Initiative 2013; Batton and Kadleck 2004; Eijkman 2010; Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011; Welch 2007). However, the attention for police violence and the experiences of women is growing. For example, Ritchie (2017) has written the book: *Invisible No More: Police Violence Against Black Women and Women of Color,* discussing a variety of experiences of women of color with police violence in the United States. Nevertheless, I could not find any research done on women's experiences with ethnic profiling in the Netherlands.

To conclude, I am interested in the empirical complication of the lack of interest in women's experiences with ethnic profiling in the Netherlands. I aim to fill this gap by researching women's experiences. By doing this, I do not aim to make a list of women's experiences but rather to consider how ethnic profiling plays out in the intersection of ethnicity and gender. In order to do this, I will use intersectionality as my analytical frame.

#### **Intersectionality**

To research and uncover the experiences of women of color, I believe intersectionality is necessary as an analytical frame. Davis (2008, 68) defines intersectionality as "the interaction between gender, race, and other categories of difference in individual lives, social practices, institutional arrangements, and cultural ideologies and the outcomes of these interactions in terms of power." In other words, different axes of power shape people's identities and experiences, and this influences how they construct their social world. Important here is the connection between identity and power. Crenshaw (1991, 1241) further explains this connection: "Race, gender, and other identity categories are

most often treated in mainstream liberal discourses as vestiges of bias or domination – that is, as intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize those who are different." So, people's identities and the experiences related to these identities, are influenced by the power relations these identities entail. The stereotypes of black women I have discussed shortly in the previous section are an example of how identities can entail power relations.

The reason why intersectionality is especially useful when researching the experiences of women of color is stressed by Crenshaw (1989). She argues that antiracist politics and feminist theory both overlook the experiences and struggles of black women, since most antiracist discourse focuses on men of color, and feminist discourse focuses on white women. Moreover, Crenshaw (1991) argues that we have to take into account the different intersections of people's identities because these different intersections influence a situation and the experiences of these situations differently. To illustrate, women of color experience multiple subordination because they are 'women' as well as 'of color.' Therefore, they have different experiences than 'white women' or 'men of color.' Since intersectionality takes into account different intersections, it is especially useful to uncover the experiences of women of color. For this thesis, I will focus on the identity categories of ethnicity and gender, which I will elaborate on in Chapters 2 and 3. However, I will incorporate other identities, as well.

To conclude, I will use intersectionality to acknowledge multiple axes of identity to limit the blind spots of researching the experiences of ethnic profiling of women of color.

#### Research question and relevance

Now that I have discussed my empirical starting point and the analytical frame I will use, I here present my research puzzle:

How do intersectional identity categories shape the specific experiences of different Dutch women of color of ethnic profiling by security officials in the Netherlands in the period from 2010 to 2020?

Even though I will elaborate on this research puzzle in Chapter 3, I want to clarify here what I mean with 'women of color.' In this research, 'women of color' are women who are or are perceived as non-white. So, black women, Middle Eastern women, and Asian women all fall within this category of 'women of color.' In this research

specifically, I have interviewed women who identified as 'double-blooded<sup>5</sup>', Chinese, Turkish, Moroccan, Molucca, Somali, Ethiopian, Djiboutian, Iranian, Surinamese, Aruban, Curaçaoan, and as black. However, in much of the academic literature I have read, which is mostly about the context of the United States, 'black women' is more commonly used. So, in this thesis, when quoting or paraphrasing other academics, it might seem that I am using 'black women' and 'women of color' interchangeably. However, I stress that 'black women' fall within the broader category of 'women of color.'

To come back to the above-stated research puzzle, I have divided it into four subquestions:

- 1. What kind of social identities become relevant in the context of ethnic profiling of Dutch women of color, and how?
- 2. How do the ethnic and gender identities of Dutch women of color influence the context of ethnic profiling of these women?
- 3. How do different identity categories intersect in the specific experiences of Dutch women of color in the context of ethnic profiling?
- 4. How do the previously mentioned identity categories become "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize those who are different" (Crenshaw 1991, 1242) in the context of ethnic profiling?

The relevance of these questions is threefold. First, this research puzzle has theoretical relevance. Since research on ethnic profiling is almost solely done on men, the theoretical understanding of ethnic profiling is one-sided. As Sharma (2003, 276) elaborates: "The focus on racial profiling as a male-state relationship is problematic because it simplifies the practice of profiling, the individuals whom it affects, and how it occurs." So, this research contributes to a more inclusive understanding of ethnic profiling by incorporating the experiences of women and thereby rethinking ethnic profiling.

Second, the societal relevance relates to the theoretical relevance. Because of a lack of interest in women's experiences of ethnic profiling, women are not taken into account in, for example, policies to counter ethnic profiling. So, if we take into account

10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In Dutch: *Dubbelbloed* (Voorn 2017). This term is used to counter the more often used word of 'half-breed' (in Dutch: *halfbloed*).

the experiences of women, we can have more thought about how to counter ethnic profiling for women of color, as well. Furthermore, this research will give more insights into how institutionalized racism looks like for women of color in the Netherlands.

Third, this research has a methodological relevance. Operationalizing intersectionality is a challenge since it tries to grasp a complex reality. This research will contribute to an understanding of how to use intersectionality as an analytical frame.

#### Structure of the thesis

To answer my research puzzle, I organized the thesis as follows. In Chapter 1, I will discuss ethnic profiling. I will elaborate on the institutionalization and normalization of racism in the Netherlands and stress the need for it to be researched. Furthermore, I will discuss academic literature on ethnic profiling, arguing that the general understanding of ethnic profiling is not all-encompassing since it does not acknowledge the experiences of women. In order to acknowledge these experiences, intersectionality is needed as an analytical frame.

In Chapter 2, I will elaborate on this analytical framework. Moreover, I will stress that intersectional identity categories and the intersectional subordination of women or color are essential to understand their experiences. In addition, I will elaborate on the two main intersectional identity categories that I will use in this thesis: ethnicity and gender.

In Chapter 3, I will discuss my research design and methodology and further explain my research questions. In addition, I will discuss the opportunities and limitations of this research. Last, I will reflect on my own biases as a researcher and woman of color, stressing that objectivity is not the aim but rather to create a situated knowledge.

Chapters 4 and 5 contain the empirical findings of this research. In Chapter 4, I will discuss the different intersectional identity categories of the women I have interviewed. Furthermore, I will discuss the experiences of everyday racism to show the sometimes hostile socialized attitudes and behaviors in Dutch society towards these women of color. Overall, this chapter will answer what intersectional identity categories are important for the women that I have interviewed, in order to be able to zoom in on how these identity categories influence the experiences of ethnic profiling.

In Chapter 5, I will discuss the experiences of ethnic profiling. Furthermore, by illustrating these experiences, I will answer how being a black woman, being a Muslim

woman, being a Middle Eastern woman, or being an Asian woman, results in the intersectional marginalization of these women in the context of ethnic profiling. Moreover, I will analyze intersectional stereotypes to add to this argument.

Lastly, in the Conclusion, I will conclude that all different identity categories are essential in order to grasp the complexity of ethnic profiling. The intersectional identity categories of women of color lead to them being ethnically profiled in both racialized and gendered ways. Furthermore, I will elaborate on how intersectionality helps us to see multiple identity categories, how these categories intersect, and how these intersections come with power relations. In the end, I will make valuable suggestions for further research.

## Chapter 1. Institutional racism, ethnic profiling, and the experiences of women

In this chapter, I will contextualize the empirical case of women's experiences of ethnic profiling. First, I will elaborate on institutional racism in the Netherlands, discussing adverse discourses and narratives regarding ethnic minorities. This is necessary because there are currently a lot of political and societal debates going on regarding ethnic minorities. These debates influence the practice of ethnic profiling, which I will define in the second section of this chapter. Here, I will elaborate on the discussion about, on the one hand, the legitimacy and effectiveness of ethnic profiling, and on the other hand, the experiences of people who are targeted by ethnic profiling. I will do this to show why I focus on the experiences and not on the 'objective reality.' Lastly, I will elaborate on these experiences, arguing there is a lack of attention towards women's experiences and discuss what is already known about the experiences of women.

#### 1.1. Institutionalized racism and ethnic minorities

On May 25, 2020, George Floyd, a 46-year-old black male, was arrested in Minneapolis, the United States, by three police officers. They arrested him because they accused him of buying cigarettes with fake money. After handcuffing him, George Floyd showing no signs of resistance, one police officer sat on his neck with his knee. As the New York Times (2020) reports: "Seventeen minutes after the first squad car arrived at the scene, Mr. Floyd was unconscious and pinned beneath three police officers, showing no signs of life." The video of the police officer sitting on Floyd's neck went viral on social media. The death of George Floyd has sparked many protests all over the world, including in the Netherlands.

On June 1, 2020, a demonstration of approximately 5000 people took place in Amsterdam, followed by many demonstrations throughout the country. However, people were not only demonstrating against police brutality in the United States but also against police brutality in the Netherlands.

Institutional violence and institutionalized racism are not exclusively American, as multiple events in the Netherlands have shown throughout the years. For example, Mitch Henriquez, a Dutch Aruban man, had died of excessive police violence five years ago (OneWorld 2020). In March 2020, Tomy Holten, a Dutch black man, died in police custody after being pressed to the ground by two police officers and three civilians. He

did nothing punishable or posed a threat to anyone (Controle Alt Delete 2020). Besides, in 2020, it came forward that tax authorities in the Netherlands (*de Belastingdienst*) have ethnically profiled people with a double-passport, accusing them of committing fraud (Het Parool 2020). So, institutionalized racism is also a problem in the Netherlands. Özdil (2014, 56) defines institutionalized racism as "systemic racist practices in society."

Institutionalized racism is apparent in many aspects of the lives of ethnic minorities in the Netherlands. As Weiner (2014, 735) explains, talking about the Netherlands: "Minorities experience institutionalized racism in the educational and occupational domains and frequent interpersonal discrimination in public places from the general public, business owners, and the police." However, institutionalized racism in the Netherlands does not get much public attention (Özdil 2014; Weiner 2014). Özdil (2014, 50) argues that the Netherlands shows "Dutch exceptionalism," which is the perception of the Netherlands as colorblind and a non-racist country. According to Özdil (2014, 50), this narrative is "rooted throughout Dutch academic and intellectual culture, and therein also Dutch institutions and public debate with regards to matters of race and racism."

An example of this is illustrated in an article written by a right-wing politician, Rob Roos. He writes, translated from Dutch to English: "Somewhere in the Netherlands, there will be discrimination. However, we live in a free country with hospitable people who are not racists<sup>6</sup>" (Forum van Democratie 2020). Rob Roos emphasizes here that Dutch people are not racists, and is, therefore, showing "Dutch exceptionalism" (Özdil 2014, 50).

Nevertheless, the racist systems that are set in place nowadays come from Dutch history, characterized by exploitation, slavery, and genocide (Weiner 2014, 736). Weiner (2014, 737) also describes "Dutch exceptionalism" but calls it "the institutionalized practice of social forgetting," which is not acknowledging the history of Dutch exploitation in the Dutch national narrative. This, in turn, contributes to the belief that the Netherlands is a tolerant and racism-free society. Because of this national narrative, institutionalized racism remains hidden from the public gaze and is normalized.

14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> In Dutch: "Er zal zeker ergens in Nederland sprake zijn van discriminatie. Maar door de bank genomen leven wij in een vrij land met gastvrije mensen die zeker niet racistisch zijn."

An example of this normalization is the tradition of Black Pete<sup>7</sup> (*Zwarte Piet* in Dutch). As Özdil (2014, 55) argues, conservative or right-wing commentators and academics, as well as so-called progressive left-wing public figures<sup>8</sup>, deny that this tradition is blackface and racist. Because of this perception of Dutch society being non-racist and the fact that institutionalized racism is normalized, it is still an underresearched topic in the Netherlands (Özdil 2014, 60).

As a result of "Dutch exceptionalism," Dutch identity, and European identity in general, is perceived as a homogeneous white entity in public and policy debates (El-Tayeb 2003, xx; Weiner 2014, 33). As El-Tayeb (2011, xxi) argues, critical literature on these matters points out that there is the belief that "there are only migrants, no minorities in Europe." As a result, ethnic minorities are frozen in the state of migration (El-Tayeb 2011, xx). So, within this narrative, ethnic minorities are not seen as legitimate citizens of European countries. An example of how the Dutch state draws on this narrative is how it ascribes the membership of ethnic minorities based on descent, making them 'a Dutch person with a migration background' (*Nederlander met een migratieachtergrond* in Dutch, before this, the term *allochtoon* was used) (De Zwart 2012, 303). So, 'othering' ethnic minorities start already with the Dutch state ascribing identity.

This idea of Europe's whiteness has consequences for how minorities are perceived. As El-Tayeb (2011, xxv) argues, the presence of minorities is often framed as a sign of crisis within European contexts. As Weiner (2017, 734) explains, in the Netherlands, there is the stereotypical idea that Turkish and Moroccan Dutch persons are engaged in criminality, and unable to assimilate into Dutch society. The same goes for Antilleans, Surinamese, and African Dutch, as they are stereotypically perceived as lazy and uncivilized. Moreover, within adverse political and public discourses, minority groups are addressed as "dangerous others," being compared to criminals (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 451). For example, the *Partij Voor de Vrijheid* (PVV), a Dutch

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Black Pete is part of the Sinterklaas tradition in the Netherlands. Black Pete is the helper of Sinterklaas and his face is depicted as black with red lips, frizzy hair and golden earrings – "all analogous to the colonial stereotypes of Black slaves" (Hilhorst and Hermes 2015, 3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> An example of these public figures is Erik van Muiswinkel, who played "head pete" on Dutch television and said, as Özdil (2014, 55) quotes: "I don't think Black Pete is blackface. But this is very hard to explain, because I paint my face black."

right-wing political party, relates immigration to unsafety in their election program<sup>9</sup> (Partij Voor de Vrijheid 2017). Overall, this leads to a hostile view relating to ethnic minorities.

However, my aim is not to say that every Dutch person agrees with the narratives and discourses mentioned in this thesis. Instead, I aim to show that these narratives and discourses are existent in Dutch society, which can have real consequences for ethnic minorities.

To conclude this section, institutionalized racism is an under-researched topic, even though it seems that there are adverse political and public discourses relating to ethnic minorities in the Netherlands. Therefore, I will research one manifestation of institutionalized racism: ethnic profiling.

#### 1.2. Ethnic profiling

As stated in the introduction, the general understanding of ethnic profiling is "the practice of singling out people based on their race or ethnicity for police or other security stops in the belief that members of a certain race or ethnic group are more likely to commit a particular crime" (Sharma 2003, 276). In other words, "race becomes a proxy for risk of criminal behavior" (Batton and Kadleck 2004, 34). Within this general understanding of ethnic profiling, three different aspects can be discovered. First, ethnic profiling is used to prevent criminality (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 448). Second, ethnic profiling is understood as a practice that targets ethnic minorities, men specifically (Sharma 2003, 275-76). Third, ethnic profiling refers most of the time to the context of traffic stops (Batton and Kadleck 2004), or as Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 448) call it, 'phishing actions,' done by security officials. This is often referred to as "Driving While Black" (Sharma 2003, 279; Weitzer and Tuch 2002, 436). Important to note here is that profiling by the police or other security actors is distinct from profiling by other actors, like civilians, because of the power disparity (Batton and Kadleck 2004, 39-40). However, as I will come back to later, this general understanding of ethnic profiling is not inclusive of women's experiences.

As Eijkman (2010, 4) argues, there is no official restriction of ethnic profiling in the Netherlands. Furthermore, as Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 448) argue,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> In the election program of the PVV it says, translated from Dutch to English: "Enough of mass-immigration and asylum, terror, violence, and unsafety" (Partij voor de Vrijheid 2017). In Dutch: "Genoeg van massa-immigratie en asiel, terreur, geweld en onveiligheid."

the Dutch government introduced stop and search powers in 2002 and 2006, in the context of counterterrorism. The local government can label areas as 'security risk zones,' in which the police can search everyone for 12 hours with no reason of suspicion (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 449). Even though there is no official prohibition of ethnic profiling in the Netherlands, Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 45) do argue that ethnic profiling is a form of discrimination. Therefore, ethnic profiling is forbidden according to the first article of the Dutch Constitution<sup>10</sup>.

Talking about the Netherlands, Van der Leun and Van der Woude (2011, 448) argue that we live in a "culture of control," "in which collective security and shielding society from possible security risks are seen as the most important goals." As a result, the Dutch government devalues individual rights for the sake of security in the context of ethnic profiling (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 451). Furthermore, Eijkman (2010, 1) takes it a step further by stating that ethnic profiling is perceived within Dutch political and public debate as the solution to multiple problems: "terrorism, radicalization, integration, violent crime, serious public nuisance or public safety." As Çankaya (2012, 11) illustrates with a quote from an inspector working for the Dutch police, translated from Dutch to English: "If of hundred offenses, 90 can be traced to Martians, then we will check all Martians<sup>11</sup>".

This perception of ethnic profiling as a solution can be placed in the context of post 9/11 counterterrorism. Moreover, statistically, minorities seem to be more involved in crime than white people (Batton and Kadleck 2004, 33). For this reason, the targeting of ethnic minorities is sometimes seen as necessary for security reasons and legitimized. Nevertheless, as Batton and Kadleck (2004, 33) argue, these statistics "have been criticized by academics for not accurately reflecting the nature and extent of crime or characteristics of criminals." So, these statistics do not go uncontested and should not legitimize ethnic profiling.

Now we have looked at ethnic profiling from a security perspective; there is the other side of this discussion: the perspectives of the ones who are targeted by ethnic profiling. As Batton and Kadleck (2004, 35) argue, people who are ethnically profiled by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Article 1 of Dutch Constitution: "All persons in the Netherlands shall be treated equally in equal circumstances. Discrimination on the grounds of religion, belief, political opinion, race or sex or any other grounds whatsoever shall not be permitted." (Government of the Netherlands 2008, 5).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> In Dutch: "Als van de honderd delicten er negentig getraceerd kunnen worden naar marsmannetjes, dan gaan we toch alle marsmannetjes controleren." (Çankaya 2012, 11)

the police will know a lifetime of getting stopped. This can be very humiliating. Furthermore, this can lead to feelings of polarization and stigmatization (Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011, 445). This can, in turn, lead to an increasing divide between the police and minorities, which results in minorities having little or no trust in police officers. Another risk is a self-fulfilling prophecy. As Batton and Kadleck (2004, 35) explain, young males can internalize the messages about their criminal propensity.

To find out how ethnic profiling plays out, we should focus on the experiences of the people who are targeted by ethnic profiling. I agree with Weitzer and Tuch (2002, 436), who argue that "citizen's perceptions of police stops may be considered just as important as the objective reality of such stops." Let me stress here, I do not seek the objective reality, for I do not believe there is one objective reality. Instead, I am interested in the experiences because they show how people construct their reality.

To conclude this section, I have argued that ethnic profiling is the practice of security actors stopping or arresting someone, based on their appearances. Besides, I argued why it is essential to look at the experiences of people who are targeted by ethnic profiling. As I have said, I do not believe in an objective reality, questioning whether or not ethnic profiling is legitimate. Rather, I try to make sense of how people are constructing their social worlds through their experiences. Furthermore, I have mentioned that the general understanding of ethnic profiling is too limited. I will elaborate on this in the next section, discussing the experiences of women of color who are ethnically profiled by security actors.

#### 1.3. Women's experiences

The general understanding of ethnic profiling corresponds with the example of Typhoon I illustrated in the Introduction. Ethnic profiling is generally understood as the practice of stopping men of color in their cars, referred to as "Driving While Black" (Sharma 2003, 279; Weitzer and Tuch 2002, 436). However, as I will argue here, this general understanding of ethnic profiling is too limited, as Sharma (2003, 280) argues, "Driving While Black" suggests that ethnic profiling is only about race or ethnicity. However, other identity categories also influence ethnic profiling, like gender.

Much research is done on how men are ethnically profiled by security officials and what their experiences are (Amnesty International and Open Society Justice Initiative 2013; Batton and Kadleck 2004; Eijkman 2010; Van der Leun and Van der Woude 2011; Welch 2007). In the report of Amnesty International and Open Society

Initiative (2013), for example, eight different Dutch men of color were asked about their experiences with ethnic profiling. Also, public attention focuses on men being ethnically profiled, like the case of Typhoon but also the cases of "black men like Michael Stewart, Edmund Perry, and Mark Davidson" (Ritchie 2017, 19), which are all black men killed by policemen in the United States. Since recently, the case of George Floyd has gained much public attention. His video is all over the news and social media. However, the case of Breonna Taylor, a black woman who was shot eight times in her own house by the police in March 2020, in Louisville, gained much less attention (The New York Times 2020a). Why does her case remain disconnected from the broader narrative?

Because of this focus on the experiences of men, it might seem like they are the only targets of ethnic profiling and other forms of police brutality (Ritchie 2017, 233). In turn, because of this focus, the experiences of men of color have shaped our understanding of police brutality (Chatelain and Asoka 2015, 54). However, women have been targeted by police brutality in the same ways as men, next to that they experience distinctly gendered ways of police violence, like sexual violence and violence inside homes and other private spaces, away from the public eye (Chatelain and Asoka 2015, 54-56). However, these cases "have failed to mold our analysis of the broader picture of police violence; nor have they drawn equal public attention or outrage" (Chatelain and Asoka 2015, 54). Women's voices are still missing in the discussion about police brutality in general, and ethnic profiling specifically.

Despite this, some research on women's experiences of ethnic profiling in the United States has been done (Newsome 2003; Ritchie 2017; Sharma 2003). Ritchie (2017) wrote a book on the experiences of women of color with police violence in the United States: *Invisible No More: Police Violence Against Black Women and Women of Color.* She gives many examples of women experiencing police violence, some with deadly consequences:

"Women like Rosann Miller, placed in a chokehold in 2014 by a New York City police officer when she was seven months pregnant, just weeks after police choked Eric Garner to death on camera using one" (Ritchie 2017, 27).

"Women like Mya Hall, a Black trans woman who was shot dead by police after making a wrong turn onto National Security Agency property outside of Baltimore, just weeks before Freddie Gay's case rocked the city and the nation" (Ritchie 2017, 27).

From these examples, you can see that police violence is as real for women of color as for men of color, but these cases do not enjoy the same amount of public and academic attention. Therefore, I stress the need to incorporate the experiences of women into our theorization of police violence and ethnic profiling. As Ritchie (2017, 41) argues: "Expanding our understanding of the forms and contexts of police violence experienced by women and gender-nonconforming people of color enables us to better understand the full shape and reach of state violence in ways essential to countering it." Since I could not find any research on the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling or other forms of police violence, based in the Netherlands, this thesis will focus on the experiences of women of color in the Netherlands.

#### 1.4. Summary and concluding remarks

In this chapter, I discussed the empirical complication of this research: the lack of attention to the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling in the Netherlands.

First, I discussed how institutionalized racism is normalized and under-researched in the Netherlands (Özdil 2014 60). Furthermore, there is a need to research institutionalized racism since adverse political and public discourses about ethnic minorities are embedded in Dutch society (El-Tayeb 2011; Weiner 2017, 734). Accordingly, I am interested in one of the manifestations of institutionalized racism in the Netherlands: ethnic profiling.

Second, I have defined ethnic profiling as the practice of being arrested or stopped based on the idea that people from certain ethnic groups "are more likely to commit a particular crime" (Sharma 2003, 276). I stressed here that it is crucial to look at the experiences of people who are ethnically profiled by security officials, instead of trying to find an objective reality. Specifically, how do women of color construct their social realities through their experiences with ethnic profiling?

Third and last, I discussed that within academic and public discourses regarding police violence and ethnic profiling, there is a focus on the experiences of men. This focus on men's experiences results in the conceptualization of ethnic profiling solely based on these experiences. What can we understand better or differently if we research the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling?

To answer this question, I believe intersectionality is needed as an analytical frame, which I will discuss in the next chapter.

#### Chapter 2. Intersectionality and the experiences of women of color

In the previous chapter, I have elaborated on the empirical complication of this research: the experiences of women of color of ethnic profiling in the Netherlands. I have shown that much of the conceptualization of ethnic profiling is based on the experiences of men. Women's voices remain excluded from the discussion, even though writers like Ritchie (2017) and Sharma (2003) stress the importance of incorporating the experiences of women to the debate for it to become holistic and balanced.

To incorporate women's voices into the ethnic profiling debate, I believe the idea of intersectionality provides a suitable analytical frame. Intersectionality acknowledges different identity categories, like ethnicity and gender, and the intersections of these categories and the outcomes in power dynamics. In this chapter, I will first discuss intersectionality theory, explaining why it is appropriate for researching the experiences of women of color. In the second section, I will define intersectionality. Third, I will discuss the pitfalls of using intersectionality as an analytical frame. In response, I will elaborate on what choices I have made for this research to overcome these pitfalls. Last, I will focus on the specific aspects of intersectionality that I will use in this thesis.

#### 2.1. Researching women of color

In this section, I will stress the suitability of intersectionality for researching the experiences of women of color. To do this, I will draw on Crenshaw (1989), who coined the concept.

Kimberlé Crenshaw (1989) is seen as the scholar who put intersectionality on the map of feminist theory. In her first work, *Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics,* she discusses how antiracist politics and feminist theory both overlook the experiences and struggles of black women. She argues that this is because antiracist discourse focuses on black men, and feminist discourse focuses on white women. Both neglect the interaction of race and gender.

In 1991, Crenshaw (1991) wrote another article named *Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color,* in which she takes an intersectional approach in analyzing violence against black women. Moreover, Crenshaw (1991) argues that scholars have to take into account the different intersections of people's identities because these different intersections influence a

situation and the experiences of these situations differently. To illustrate, women of color are 'women' as well as 'of color.' Therefore, they have different experiences of the same situations as 'white women' or 'men of color.' In other words, intersectionality theory has its origins in researching black women, challenging the universal gendered experiences, and universal racialized experiences (Edna e.a. 2012, 2100). Seeing how race is 'gendered' and gender is 'racialized' (Davis 2008, 71). Furthermore, intersectionality is used by scholars to acknowledge the multiple axes of identity to limit blind spots when researching all kinds of phenomena.

Even though everyone has intersectional identity categories, it is most noticeable within subordinated groups. As Crenshaw (1989, 15) argues: "the *privileging* of whiteness or maleness is implicit, it is generally not perceived at all." So even though white males do have intersectional identity categories, these remain implicit<sup>12</sup>. The intersectional identity categories of women of color are explicit, them being subordinated in multiple ways: being a woman and of color.

Multiple subordination or intersectional subordination is explained by Crenshaw (1991, 1249) as: "[...] frequently the consequence of the imposition of one burden that interacts with preexisting vulnerabilities to create yet another dimension of disempowerment." To illustrate, in the case of women of color, they are already disadvantaged because they are 'of color,' which comes with, as I have already explained, adverse political and public discourses. In addition, they are not only 'of color' but also 'women.' So next to that racism disadvantages these women, sexism adds another disadvantage.

To be able to capture the experiences of the multiple subordinated, intersectionality is needed. As Crenshaw (1989, 140) argues: "Because the intersectional experience is greater than the sum of racism and sexism, any analysis that does not take intersectionality into account cannot sufficiently address the particular manner in which Black women are subordinated." In short, intersectionality helps us to understand the intersectional identity categories of women of color and the intersectional subordination that comes with it.

23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> As Crenshaw (1989, 151) argues: "Race and sex, moreover, become significant only when they operate to explicitly *disadvantage* the victims [...]". So, being white and being male remains implicit because, generally, no disadvantages or inequalities relate to these identity categories.

#### 2.2. Conceptualizing intersectionality

Now that I have discussed the origins of intersectionality and the importance of intersectionality to research the experiences of women of color, I will now define and further explain the concept of intersectionality.

Even though Crenshaw (1989) has coined the concept, I think the definition of intersectionality of Nash (2008, 2) makes it more understandable: "the notion that subjectivity is constituted by mutually reinforcing vectors of race, gender, class, and sexuality." In other words, different identity categories shape people's identities and experiences, and this influences how they construct their social world. This definition focuses simply on the intersections of people's identities. However, an important aspect is missing here – namely, the role of power (Davis 2008, 68).

Intersectional identity categories create complexity and difference, along with overlapping disadvantages (Corus and Saatcioglu 2015, 418). So, intersectionality is not just about how intersectional identity categories influence each other but mainly about its outcomes in inequalities (Collins 2015, 2). In other words, intersectionality is useful to understand the reproduction of power (Cho e.a. 2013, 807). Power is defined by Gourevitch (1998, 48) as "the ability to make others inhabit your story of their reality [...]". This ability is often achieved through the creation of dominant discourses and stereotypes, which I will elaborate on later. Furthermore, intersectionality is not only about power relations, but intersectionality itself is produced in the power relations it aims to study (Collins 2015, 2).

This brings me to the two main dominant approaches of intersectionality: structural intersectionality and political intersectionality. Structural intersectionality describes the "multilayered and routinized forms of dominations" (Crenshaw 1991, 1245). Political intersectionality offers an applied dimension of structural intersectionality, "by offering a framework for contesting power and thereby linking theory to existent and emergent social and political struggles" (Cho e.a. 2013, 800). However, I do not think these two main approaches should be seen as separate. I believe that the incorporation of structural intersectionality into your research comes with a political aim. As Collins (2015, 16) argues, since intersectionality is embedded in power relations, working with it as an analytical frame is highly political. In this thesis, the aim is to raise awareness for the experiences of women of color concerning ethnic profiling.

#### 2.3. Critiques of intersectionality as an analytical frame

Now that I have defined intersectionality, I will go into the critiques of intersectionality as an analytical frame. Since intersectionality is perceived as a political practice and tries to capture complex power dynamics, there are some pitfalls using intersectionality as an analytical frame.

Intersectionality is often praised because, as Carastathis (2014, 307-398) argues, of its simultaneity and complexity. Simultaneity refers to the ability to read different categories, like gender and ethnicity, simultaneously instead of separately. Complexity refers to how intersectionality tries to capture complex social structures and subjective experiences. However, both of these 'qualities' are contested by the critique that intersectionality is too vague to work with.

Davis (2008, 68) argues that intersectionality is too vague when she questions if intersectionality is either a theory, a concept, or a heuristic device. She further argues: "it is not at all clear whether intersectionality should be limited to understanding individual experiences, to theorizing identity, or whether it should be taken as a property of social structures and cultural discourse." Nash (2008, 10) expands this statement by arguing that it is unclear whether intersectionality can only be used for the multiple subordinated, or if it can be used as a general theory of identity. Since everyone has intersectional identities, it is arguable that intersectionality can be used to research any social group. However, as I have argued before, intersectionality's political aim is more focused on the multiple subordinated, like women of color. So, even though the simultaneity of intersectionality is useful, it raises the question of who and what you can research with it.

Even though Carastathis (2014) argues that one strength of intersectionality is to grasp complexity, she is also aware of the critiques regarding this complexity. Namely, intersectionality stresses the importance of acknowledging different identities, like race and gender, but the number of different identities or categories seem endless (Carastathis 2014, 309). Where do we stop? What identities should we acknowledge, and what identities recede more into the background? However, this open-endedness and vagueness can be useful, for, as Davis (2008, 75-78) argues, this can lead to intersectionality being applicable in almost any context and is useful for critical feminist theory.

Next to simultaneity and complexity, Carastathis (2014, 308) names two other

qualities of intersectionality: irreducibility and inclusivity. Irreducibility refers to the ability to see how multiple categories are at play at once, without reducing an experience to only one identity category. Inclusivity refers to including groups of people into research, that are most often not included, like women of color in this research. Because of this inclusivity, research becomes more holistic and balanced. However, again, these two qualities do not go uncontested.

Nash (2008, 6), for example, argues that intersectionality can be countereffective: "[...] intersectional projects often replicate precisely the approaches that they critique." She illustrates this by critiquing the fact that intersectionality theory is almost always about black women. The problem here is that intersectionality treats black women as a unitary and monolithic entity (Nash 2008, 8). Moreover, the literature on intersectionality mainly focuses on gender and race or ethnicity, which neglects other categories of difference, like class, nationality, language, and sexuality (Nash 2008, 9). By stating this, Nash (2008, 9) critiques Crenshaw (1991) for not recognizing these other categories of difference, and therefore she is not capturing the diversity of the experiences of women of color. Overall, there is the risk of actually reducing intersectional identity categories and excluding groups of people that fall into other categories of difference, for example, queer black women or non-gender conforming black people. Relating to this, there is the risk that intersectionality splits people that were perceived to be in the 'same' group before (Carastathis 2013, 942).

Relating to these critiques of intersectionality, I have made some choices for this research. To come back to the simultaneity and complexity, I have chosen to research women of color. Even though I think any social group can be researched with intersectionality as an analytical frame, I support its political aim. I feel like women of color have been neglected in the research topic of ethnic profiling and many other research topics.

Besides, to overcome the endlessness of categories of differences, I will use ethnicity and gender as the main intersectional identity categories. Besides, I have chosen ethnicity and gender since these seem to be the most relevant in the context of ethnic profiling. On the one hand, ethnicity is important because this seems to be the "proxy for risk of criminal behavior" (Batton and Kadleck 2004, 34). On the other hand, since women are neglected in the ethnic profiling debate, I want to focus on gender as well. More importantly, I will stress the importance of the *intersections* of these identity

categories.

However, I do not want to contribute to the counter-effectiveness of intersectionality by reducing specific identity categories and portraying women of color as a monolithic and unitary entity. So, I do take into account other categories of difference, like sexuality and class, which will become evident in the empirical chapters.

#### 2.4. Intersectional identity categories

Now that I have elaborated on the need for intersectionality to research the experiences of women of color and its conceptualization and critiques, I will zoom in on what intersectional identity categories I will analyze in this thesis. Besides, I want to elaborate on the power-aspect of intersectionality by introducing stereotypes that are influential in shaping people's experiences. Before I am going into the intersectional identity categories that I will use, I want to stress that these identity categories are socially constructed.

As I have discussed before, I will use ethnicity and gender as the main intersectional identity categories. First, ethnicity is defined as "an aspect of social relationship between persons who consider themselves as essentially distinctive from members of other groups of whom they are aware and with whom they enter into relationships" (Eriksen 2010, 16-17).

The question might arise why I am using ethnicity rather than race in this thesis. I use 'ethnicity' because, in Dutch academic literature and public discourse, ethnic profiling (etnisch profileren in Dutch) is more often used than racial profiling. Since my research is based in the Netherlands, I will use 'ethnic profiling' and 'ethnicity.' Nevertheless, in quoting other academics, 'racial profiling' and 'race' might still appear in this thesis.

Furthermore, there is an academic difference between 'race' and 'ethnicity.' The concept of 'race' is often abandoned by academics since it falsely divides human populations into subspecies. Since there is no biological proof 'race' exists, 'ethnicity' is used to refer to social relationships, as shown in the definition by Eriksen (2010, 17). However, there is also the modern concept of race. As Bhopal (2003, 442) argues: "In this perspective, race provides a way of defining, for social purposes, populations that look different and have different ancestral roots." In this prospect, 'race' is similar to the definition of 'ethnicity' of Eriksen (2010, 17). Nevertheless, because the concept of 'race' is still contested and 'ethnicity' is more often used in the Dutch context, I will stick with

'ethnicity.'

In this research, I have interviewed women of different ethnicities, which I will elaborate on in the empirical chapters. However, as we have already discussed, power plays a role within ethnic identity. As Eriksen (2010, 17) argues: "Ethnicity refers both to aspects of gain and loss in interaction, and to aspects of meaning in the creation of identity. In this way, it has a political, organizational aspect as well as a symbolic, meaningful one." How this role of power plays out in the identities of the women I have interviewed will be discussed in the empirical chapters.

Next to ethnicity, I will use 'gender' as another main identity category. Parent e.a. (2013, 641) define gender as "a set of socially constructed standard of community, identity, and covert and overt behaviors, ascribed to persons by virtue of their apparent biological sex." Again, also within gender identity, power relations are involved. Gender is seen as something "by which societal structures of power, privilege, and oppression are shaped" (Parent e.a. 2013, 641). I will go into more detail about these outcomes of power in the empirical chapters.

As I have argued, I will not only draw on these two identity categories. I will also discuss, among other things, religion, class, sexuality, and motherhood. So, even though I categorize these women as 'women of color' in this thesis, they are not one homogeneous group of people, they all have different experiences with ethnic profiling relating to all these aspects of their identities.

Here, you can see how power relations are embedded in intersectionality theory. Every identity category has its own power relations that I will elaborate on in the empirical chapters. Furthermore, identity categories are, as Crenshaw (1990, 1242) argues: "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize those who are different."

However, I do not analyze these power relations separately since they are intersectional and simultaneous. A way to see these intersectional power relations is within stereotypes. Moreover, stereotypes are "controlling images," invented by groups of people who have the power to define "to make racism, sexism, and poverty appear to be natural, normal, and an inevitable part of everyday life" (Collins 1990, 67-68 as cited in Newsome 2003, 34). In other words, these "controlling images" have "the ability to make others inhabit your story of their reality" (Gourevitch 1998, 48).

As I will discuss in the empirical chapters, stereotypes of women of color

influence how the world perceives them and how other people react to them, which, in turn, influences the experiences of these women. So, to research the experiences of women of color, I will analyze stereotypes since they show how power relations are embedded in the intersectional identity categories constructed about these women. I will go into more detail about the specific stereotypes of different women of color in the empirical chapters.

#### 2.5. Summary and concluding remarks

In this chapter, I have discussed the analytical framework of this research: intersectionality. I discussed that intersectionality has its origins in researching black women, drawing on their experiences as both 'racialized' and 'gendered' (Davis 2008, 71). Intersectionality helps us to understand intersecting identity categories and the subordination that comes with it (Crenshaw 1989, 40), creating inequalities (Collins 2015, 2). How then, can we understand the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling as both 'racialized' and 'gendered'? In turn, how can we understand the intersectional subordination of women of color in the context of ethnic profiling?

In addition, I discussed the critiques of intersectionality and the choices I have made for this research. To overcome the question of what I can research with intersectionality, I chose to focus on the experiences of women of color. I want to overcome the complexity of identity categories by choosing two main categories: ethnicity and gender. Besides, these identity categories are the most relevant ones in this research: researching *women* who are *of color*. However, to prevent the risk of illustrating women of color as one homogeneous entity, I do incorporate other identity categories, which I will discuss in the empirical chapters.

Last, I illustrated that ethnicity and gender itself deal with power relations (Eriksen 2010, 17; Parent e.a. 2013, 641). For this research, I will use stereotypes relating to the intersectional identity categories of the women of color, together with their experiences. This way, I will be able to analyze how intersectional subordination plays out and influences the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling. This brings us to the question of: What can intersectionality help us to see when looking at the experiences of women of color in the context of ethnic profiling?

In the next chapter, I will further elaborate on the methodology of this research.

### **Chapter 3. Methodology**

In this chapter, I will discuss the methodology of this research. First, I will discuss the research design, elaborating on the ontological and epistemological stances this research takes. Besides, I will discuss the choices made in this research relating to these stances. In the second section, I will present the research method by discussing the research questions and the different phases of this research. Last, I will reflect on ethical considerations, research limitations and opportunities, reflecting on my position as a researcher and woman of color.

#### 3.1. Research design

In this section, I will discuss the research design. I will first discuss the ontological and epistemological nature of this research. This is important to understand the choices I have made for this research. Furthermore, I will discuss the choices I have made in this research by answering the questions of 'where,' 'when,' 'who,' and 'what.'

#### 3.1.1. Ontology and epistemology

The ontological nature of this research is social constructivist. Intersectionality, as I have discussed in the previous chapter, is an analytical frame to look at how different axes of power shape people's identities and experiences. Besides, these axes of power are in itself socially constructed. So, I believe the nature of social reality, the ontology of this research, is something "that people are in the process of fashioning" (Boeije 2010, 6).

For this research, I am interested in the specific experiences of ethnic profiling of women of color. Therefore, my epistemological stance is, on the one hand, phenomenological. I believe that "the world, consciousness, perception and lived experiences are inseparable, there is not an objective world that exists separately from our perception of it" (Mason 2018, 8). On the other hand, my epistemological stance is interpretivist, I will interpret the experiences, meanings, and interpretations of the women I have interviewed (Mason 2018, 8). In short, I believe that social phenomena can be known through the experiences of people.

The ontological and epistemological stances discussed here, make this research an experiential puzzle because it seeks "to explore how the world and experience are interconnected" (Mason 2018, 12). For this experiential puzzle, a qualitative research method is necessary since this type of research often starts with the assumption that individuals actively construct social reality (Boeije 2010, 6). So, since both my

ontological and epistemological stances are embedded in social constructivism, I believe a qualitative research method will help me answer the research puzzle.

#### 3.1.2. Where, when, who, and what |

Now that I have discussed the ontological and epistemological stances of this research, this brings us to the choices made for this research, which I will discuss through the questions of 'where,' 'when,' 'who,' and 'what.'

To begin with the question of 'where,' the location of this research is the Netherlands. I chose to do research in the Netherlands because I live there myself. As a brown woman, I experience structural and everyday racism in the Netherlands. Besides, the "Dutch exceptionalism" (Özdil 2014) that I have discussed in Chapter 1 leads to a unique form of racism in the Netherlands that needs to be researched. In other words, the topic of structural racism in the Netherlands interests me on a professional as well as a personal level.

Moreover, I did not focus on one single area within the Netherlands. Since the experiences of women of color are so under-researched, it would be hard to find enough participants for this research if I focused on one particular area. Besides, I do not aim to make generalizations about the experiences of women of color in the Netherlands, but I am interested in *specific* experiences.

To answer the question of 'when,' I conducted interviews from March to May 2020. I had approximately ten weeks to complete fieldwork. However, I have been working on this research since the end of 2019, until August 3, 2020, preparing and analyzing this research, and writing this thesis. Furthermore, in this research, I have focused on the period from 2010 to 2020. This is the time frame in which the different experiences of the women I have interviewed have taken place.

The questions of 'who' and 'what' have been answered throughout the first two chapters already. I have interviewed women of color about their experiences with ethnic profiling. I chose to focus on women of color since they have been neglected in the ethnic profiling-debate and because their multiple subordination adds to the theorization of ethnic profiling.

To reach these women, I made use of purposive sampling. I do not aim to have a statistically representative sample; instead, I aim to capture "a wide range of perspectives and experiences, rather than to replicate their frequency in the wider population" (Boeije 2010, 36). For this research, this means that I looked for women of

color, living in the Netherlands, who had experiences with ethnic profiling. However, to say that my sample does not have to be statistically representative is not to say that I would have been satisfied with any number of interviews. As Boeije (2010, 36) argues, in qualitative research, you want "to represent a wide range of perspectives and experiences." Furthermore, I used snowball sampling (Boeije 2010, 40), which means that I asked participants if they knew other women of color with similar experiences, who I subsequently approached.

To capture as much of the diversity of the experiences of women of color, in the limited timeframe I had, I have interviewed 14 women in total. In the next section, I will discuss how I have approached these women.

The last question that remains unanswered is the 'how' question. I will discuss this elaborately in the next section, discussing the research method.

#### 3.2. Research method

In this section, I will answer the question of 'how' I have conducted this research. I will do this by discussing the research puzzle and sub-questions, followed by the different phases I have gone through to answer these questions. Also, I will elaborate on what data collection technique I used.

#### 3.2.1. Research questions

Drawing on the previous chapters, the research puzzle I aim to answer is:

How do intersectional identity categories shape the specific experiences of different Dutch women of color of ethnic profiling by security officials in the Netherlands in the period from 2010 to 2020?

To answer this research puzzle, I have divided it into four sub-questions. The first one is: What kind of social identities become relevant in the context of ethnic profiling of Dutch women of color, and how? I ask this question to see what social identities are important to the women I have interviewed. As I have discussed in the previous chapter, I focus on ethnicity and gender. However, I do not want to neglect the fact that the women I have interviewed might see their own identity as something else or see other factors as evenly important.

The second sub-question I aim to answer is: *How do ethnic and gender identities* of *Dutch women of color influence the context of ethnic profiling of these women?* After

incorporating other identity categories that may seem relevant to the women I have interviewed, I do want to focus on ethnicity and gender, since this is the intersection that is often overlooked.

The third sub-question is: *How do different identity categories intersect in the specific experiences of Dutch women of color in the context of ethnic profiling?* To overcome the danger that I will look at gender and ethnicity only as separate identity categories, with this sub-question, I want to focus on the *intersections* of all identity categories that proved valuable. Furthermore, I want to know how the intersections lead to specific experiences of ethnic profiling.

The fourth and last sub-question is: *How do the previously mentioned identity* categories play out as "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize those who are different" (Crenshaw 1991, 1242) in the context of ethnic profiling? To include the power aspects of my analytical frame, intersectionality, I do not want to look only at the intersections but also to the negative effects these intersections have for women of color in the context of ethnic profiling.

Answering these sub-questions will help me to answer the research puzzle.

#### 3.2.2. Phases of research method

In order to answer the research puzzle and sub-questions, I have gone through five different phases in this research. I want to stress that these phases overlapped in the research period.

In the first phase of this research, the aim was to capture the overall context of the research topic. I used this phase to get in touch with different women of color. I did this through my social media channels, posting the question of whether there were women with experiences with ethnic profiling that wanted to participate in this research. Besides, I took this time to read into the context of structural racism in the Netherlands.

In the second phase, I interviewed the first couple of women that responded to my social media posts. I did seven interviews in this phase, asking specifically about the experiences of these women with ethnic profiling. More subtly, we also discussed the social identities these women identified as. I did not ask explicitly about identity in this phase since I was thinking of doing multiple interviews with the same women. However, even though I did not ask specifically about identity categories, ethnicity and gender came up anyhow. Being a woman of color seemed to be something inescapable, so in

every interview, these topics came to the foreground.

In the third phase, I took some time to analyze and reflect on the second phase. I coded and analyzed the data so far, to see what I was missing. What struck me in this phase was that many women had different perceptions of what ethnic profiling was. Multiple women talked about them being ethnically profiled in the healthcare system, the educational system, and in private spheres. So, I decided to make a new social media post, explaining through some examples of what I meant with ethnic profiling, stressing that I was focusing on ethnic profiling by *security officials*. Again, women responded to this post. In this phase, I decided to let go of the idea of multiple interviews with the same women. I decided that I wanted to incorporate more women into the research to have a more diverse range of experiences.

In the fourth phase, I interviewed another seven women, with some alterations in the interview-questions. In this phase, I explicitly asked about how these women identified as. Next to that, I asked about their experiences with ethnic profiling.

In the fifth and final phase, I focused on analysis. Throughout all phases, I transcribed interviews and coded them for the first time. I used 'open coding,' "breaking down, examining, comparing, conceptualizing and categorizing data" (Boeije 2019, 96). In this fifth phase, I re-coded my data. I went over all existing codes, doing 'axial coding,' deciding what data is more important than other data, reducing and reorganizing the codes that I had already made (Boeije 2010, 109). After axial coding, I did 'selective coding,' making the codes fit to answer my research questions in connecting them to theoretical concepts (Boeije 2010, 119). I coded the data with NVivo.

To conclude, I believe I have gathered enough data throughout these five phases to answer my research puzzle.

#### 3.2.3. Semi-structured interviews

Throughout the different phases, I have used one primary data collection technique: interviewing. As Boeije (2010, 62) argues: "Interviews provide an opportunity for researchers to learn about social life through the perspective, experience and language of those living it." So, I chose to do semi-structured interviews to capture the experiences of women of color. The interview guide I have worked with during the interviews can be found in Appendix 2.

However, I did plan to do focus groups as well. Focus groups can give extra insights into how women of color make sense of their experiences of ethnic profiling.

However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic, I was not able to organize these focus groups in person. Besides, the stories women told me were very emotional and personal. So, it seemed unethical to ask these women to discuss their experiences with others, let alone talking about it to strangers online and not even in person.

# 3.3. Ethical considerations, research limitations and opportunities, and positionality

Since I believe it is crucial to reflect on my own position as a researcher, I will now discuss ethical considerations, research limitations and opportunities, and my position as a woman of color as well as a researcher.

#### 3.3.1. Ethical considerations

Concerning ethical considerations, I want to discuss 'informed consent' and the 'do no harm' principles. To start with informed consent, Boeije (2010, 45) defines it as: "the obligation to outline fully the nature of the data collection and the purpose for which the data will be used to the people or community being studied in a style and language that they can understand." To fulfill this obligation, I explained at the beginning of every interview that I am doing this research as part of my master's program, that I am personally engaged with the subject, and find it important to incorporate women's experiences into the ethnic profiling debate. However, as Mason (2018, 96) argues, full informed consent is, most of the time, impossible to achieve. There are always some things that the interviewees might not understand, understand differently, or that I did not think of. This puts me, as a researcher, in a powerful position that needs reflection, which I will come back to later.

Next to 'informed consent,' the 'do no harm' principle is also important to reflect on. Ethnic profiling is a sensitive and personal topic; ethnic profiling can have serious emotional consequences. So, talking about experiences with ethnic profiling can rake up emotions and cause psychological harm (Boeije 2010, 49). To try to overcome this, I did stress in every interview that interviewees can stop the interview at any time, that they are not obligated to answer my questions if they do not feel comfortable, and that I would send them this thesis so they can give me feedback on how they want their stories to be represented. Besides, some of the interviewees stressed that they found it important to participate in this research. As Yasmin stressed:

"I am totally in favor of your research; I really wanted to participate in this research myself. Not just for you, it is, of course, to do you a favor as well, but I really support this research"  $^{13}$ .

So, by being in a dialectic relationship with the women I have interviewed during data generation, data analysis, and thesis writing, I hope to have incorporated the 'informed consent' and 'do no harm' principles, as much as it is possible.

## 3.3.2. Research limitations and opportunities

Now that I have elaborated on the ethical considerations of this research, I will now go into the research limitations and opportunities. First, regarding scope and time, I want to discuss the impact the COVID-19 pandemic has had on this research.

In the first couple of weeks, there was no 'intelligent lockdown' yet in the Netherlands, which meant that I was able to travel throughout the Netherlands and meet the interviewees in person. In total, I have done two interviews in person. After these first weeks, on March 16, the Netherlands went into an 'intelligent lockdown,' which meant that everyone was advised to stay home as much as possible. Because of this, I was not able to meet the interviewees in person but had to do the interviews through WhatsApp video call or Zoom. This has had both positive as well as negative effects.

On the positive side, meeting interviewees online meant that the interviewees and I were more flexible to meet. Also, because the interviewees were most of the time at home, they might have felt more open and comfortable to talk about their experiences than they would have when we would have met in public. However, on the negative side, because of this sensitive topic, I would have preferred the interviewees to meet me in person. Since I was asking very personal questions, it felt strange to be on the other side of the screen. However, overall, I think the COVID-19 pandemic was not of significant negative influence on the data I have gathered eventually.

Now that I have discussed the influence of the COVID-19 pandemic, I want to reflect on what I see as the most significant limitation of this research. Because this research focuses on the experiences of women, and I have interviewed generally cisgender women, this research is not inclusive of gender non-conforming people, trans women, and women who do not identify as feminine in this research. I am aware this is a

36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Interview with Yasmin, Dutch Iranian woman, on 04-05-2020. In Dutch: "Ja, ik ben helemaal voorstander van je onderzoek. Ik wilde hier ook echt zelf aan meewerken, niet alleen om maar om jou, ja het is natuurlijk ook om jou een gunst te doen, maar ik sluit me helemaal aan bij jouw onderzoek."

significant limitation of this research, and I want to stress that, therefore, I am not wholly inclusive in this research. Therefore, the re-thinking of ethnic profiling will also not be entirely inclusive.

#### 3.3.3. Positionality

The third and last thing I will reflect on is my position as a researcher and as a woman of color. As a woman of color, born in the Netherlands, I have myself been ethnically profiled in private settings. Besides, I am personally engaged in activism relating to racism and other forms of inequality. For these reasons, I am interested in this research topic. The question might arise whether I am not too biased regarding this topic. However, I do not think of this bias as a limitation of this research but rather as an opportunity. For example, some women have stressed that they trust me more because I am a woman of color myself. As Aisha stresses:

"I often have the idea that, if it is a white person, they will never fully understand. So, that is why I really like it that this type of research is done by people who may experience it themselves or, at least, that they belong to the same group. Then people just feel more comfortable" <sup>14</sup>.

So, because I am a woman of color, I can better understand the world of the interviewees because I belong more or less to the same societal group. That being said, I do not claim I can totally relate to all women I have interviewed. I do recognize that I am privileged because of my light brown skin color and my sleek hair (in contrast to afro's), being a 'double-blooded' Dutch Surinamese woman.

Furthermore, as I have already elaborated on discussing the epistemological and ontological stances, I do not believe an objective reality exists. Every 'knowledge' is 'situated,' as Haraway (1988) argues. To summarize, I believe that my position as a researcher, as well as a woman of color, is fruitful for generating a situated knowledge of the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling.

#### 3.4. Summary and concluding remarks

In this chapter, I have discussed the methodology of this research. Important here is that

<sup>14</sup> Interview Aisha, a Dutch Moroccan girl, on 24-04-20. In Dutch: "Ik heb vaak wel een beetje het idee dat, als het een wit persoon is, dan denk ik van ja, ze begrijpen het wel, maar ze zullen het nooit op die manier helemaal begrijpen. Dus daarom vind ik het ook wel echt fijn als dit soort onderzoek ook zelf worden gedaan door mensen die het misschien zelf ervaren hebben, of in ieder geval, tot de doelgroep behoren of zo. Dan voelen mensen zich ook gewoon prettiger."

both the ontological and epistemological stances of this research fall into social constructivism. Besides, I stressed that objectivity is not the aim but rather to create a situated knowledge (Haraway 1988). Therefore, I made use of purposive and snowball sampling, trying to capture a wide variety of experiences of ethnic profiling of Dutch women of color through semi-structured interviewing.

Now that I have discussed the empirical topic of ethnic profiling, the analytical frame of intersectionality, and the methodology of this research, I will present my empirical findings in the next chapters.

# Chapter 4. Meet the women: identities and everyday experiences

The empirical findings are structured into two chapters. In Chapter 4, will discuss how the women I have interviewed identify as and how these identities play out in their social realities. Chapter 5 will be about the experiences of ethnic profiling of these women and the power that is embedded in their intersectional identity categories.

Before I go into the first chapter, I want to note that all interviews were done in Dutch. In this thesis, I present some quotes throughout that are translated into English. I will present the original Dutch quotes in footnotes and the more extended quotes in Appendix 3. In addition, it is important to know that the names of the women have been anonymized. I use pseudonyms.

In this chapter, it will become evident how the women I have interviewed perceive themselves, how they are perceived by society, their ascribed identities, and what that means for their everyday experiences.

#### 4.1. Intersectional identity categories

In this section, I will first discuss the ethnic identities of the women I have interviewed. Second, I will do the same for gender identity. Third, I will shortly discuss other social identity categories.

#### **4.1.1. Ethnicity**

As I have stated in Chapter 2, ethnicity is defined as "an aspect of social relationship between persons who consider themselves as essentially distinctive from members of other groups of whom they are aware and with whom they enter into relationships" (Eriksen 2010, 17). Furthermore, ethnicity has both a political and symbolic meaning (Eriksen 2010, 17).

In this thesis, I have interviewed women of different ethnicities. For example, Etchica<sup>15</sup> identifies as a 'double-blooded', her dad coming from Surinam, and her mother being a white Dutch woman. Fatima identifies as *Surinaams Hindoestaans*, which could be translated as coming from Surinam with Indian descent. Kyana's parents are from Djibouti and Ethiopia. Amina was born in Somalia. Catharina is from Aruba. Sylvana

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Etchica is not a pseudonym. She preferred that I use her own name in this thesis. She is also the writer of the book *Dubbelbloed*.

stresses that she is a Dutch Curaçaoan woman from African-European descent. Furthermore, Ashley, Sylvana, Catharina, and Ava have referred to themselves as 'black women.' Besides, I have interviewed a Molucca woman, Paula, a Chinese woman, Sam, a Turkish woman, Esma, a Moroccan woman, Aisha, and an Iranian woman, Yasmin. These ethnicities were symbolically important parts of some of these women's identities. For example, Yasmin said:

"I have a very good relationship with my mom, and my mom is Iranian. She has the culture, and I have lived there for six years. So, I definitely feel Iranian<sup>16</sup>".

Yasmin tells me she does not have an Iranian passport, but she does have a Dutch one, which makes her a Dutch citizen. Furthermore, multiple women emphasized that they strongly identify as Dutch or partly Dutch. Aisha connects her Moroccan descent to her Dutch identity in our interview:

"I have to say, I am just Dutch, but I do have my Moroccan background. That is how I see it $^{17}$ ".

Moreover, Kyana and Amina argued that they feel more Dutch than anything else. As Kyana argues: "I am born and raised here<sup>18</sup>." Amina also stated that she feels most at home in the Netherlands, living here since she was a one-year-old.

However, drawing on the political aspect of ethnicity, both of these women stress the complications that come with being Dutch while being non-white. As Kyana argues:

"You want to be accepted as Dutch since you feel Dutch. However, other people will not acknowledge you as Dutch<sup>19</sup>".

Amina stresses a similar thing by arguing that she will be perceived as a foreigner because of the way she looks. Furthermore, when I ask Kyana how she identifies as, she first mentions her societal position as a foreigner (*allochtoon* in Dutch). So, symbolically,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Interview with Yasmin [Dutch Iranian woman], on 05-05-2020. In Dutch: "Ik heb een hele goede band met mijn moeder en mijn moeder is Iraans, die heeft de cultuur, ik heb daar ook 6 jaar gewoond. Dus, ik voel me zeker wel Iraans."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Interview with Aisha [Dutch Moroccan woman], on 24-04-2020. In Dutch: "Ja, ik moet zeggen, ik ben gewoon Nederlands, maar ik heb gewoon mijn Marokkaanse achtergrond. Zo zie ik dat echt."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Interview with Kyana [Dutch Ethiopian/Djiboutian woman], on 10-04-2020. In Dutch: "Ik ben hier geboren en getogen."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Interview with Kyana [Dutch Ethiopian/Djiboutian woman], on 10-04-2020. In Dutch: "Je wilt geaccepteerd worden als gewoon een Nederlander, omdat je je ook echt zo voelt. Maar, het is voor jou nog dat anderen dat niet zo kunnen erkennen."

these women identify as partly Dutch, next to another ethnic identity, but politically, they are perceived as foreigners.

In the context of ethnic profiling, Dutch identity also recedes more into the background. As Ava stresses when I ask her to define ethnic profiling: "It is about you being non-white.<sup>20</sup>" Ashley stresses the same. She states that security officials do not look further than her skin color.

However, Kelly stresses the concept of colorism by arguing that light-skinned women of color do have an advantage over darker-skinned women. Colorism is defined by Hunter (2007, 237) as "the process of discrimination that privileges light-skinned people of color over their dark-skinned counterparts." So, saying that ethnic profiling is about being non-white is not enough. The darkness of your skin tone also influences the practice of ethnic profiling, among other practices of racism.

#### **4.1.2.** Gender

The second main identity category that I focused on is gender identity. Gender is defined by Parent e.a. (2013, 641) as "a set of socially constructed standard of community, identity, and covert and over behaviors, ascribed to persons by virtue of their apparent biological sex." Gender identity, however, was not as explicitly discussed in the interviews as ethnic identity. Therefore, I believe that the women I have interviewed identify as cisgender. This is more implicit because it is seen as the 'standard' in Dutch society and many other societies. However, by stating this, I do not say that this 'standard' is the only 'true' gender identity or should be perceived as the standard at all. More gender diversity exists and should be acknowledged. However, in this thesis, I have failed to include this gender diversity, which I have reflected on in Chapter 3.

One woman who was aware and explicitly talked about her gender identity is Aisha:

"I am really a cisgender woman. So, I identify with the gender identity that belongs to how I was born<sup>21</sup>".

Even though the rest of the women did not explicitly discuss their own gender identity, some of them, like Catharina, Ashley, and Ava, did talk about the standard of community

<sup>21</sup> Interview with Aisha [Dutch Moroccan woman], on 24-04-2020. In Dutch: "Wel echt als cis gender vrouw. Dus ik ben wel echt gewoon een, ja, mijn genderidentiteit die ik heb gekregen of, zeg maar hoe ik ben geboren, daar identificeer ik mij gewoon volledig mee."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Interview with Ava [Dutch black woman], on 17-03-2020. In Dutch: "Het gaat om je niet-wit zijn."

of how a woman should behave. These women argued that women are perceived as less of a threat than men. As Ashley argues:

"In this case, as a woman, you are in an advantage. Then the tables are turned, for once<sup>22</sup>".

Therefore, being a woman can be an advantage to these women in the context of ethnic profiling.

However, as I have argued in Chapter 2, gender also comes with power relations in which women of color are oppressed. Gender is seen as something "by which societal structures of power, privilege, and oppression are shaped" (Parent e.a. 2013, 641). As Newsome (2003, 35) argues, black womanhood is perceived as contrary to white womanhood, perceiving black women as more masculine than feminine. As Ritchie (2017, 62) argues, by masculinizing black women and women of color, it removes them from being worthy of protection. As Ritchie (2017, 215) states: "Black women, Indigenous women, and other women of color are defined as inherently existing outside the bounds of womanhood – rendering the status of "good victim" unattainable." This is illustrated by Catharina in our interview when she argued that as a black woman, you will be turned into a perpetrator, even though you are the victim of the situation.

Furthermore, in the United States specifically, some stereotypes regarding black women contribute to these women being perceived as "subhuman, animalistic, to be violated, feared, and punished" (Ritchie 2017, 62-63). As you can conclude from here, the womanhood of women of color is embedded in societal structures of oppression and power that results in them being perceived as a threat and as less deserving of protection. How this works out in the context of ethnic profiling will be discussed in the next chapter.

#### 4.1.3. Other social identities

The women of color I have interviewed also talked about other social identity categories. Aisha, Amina, Fatima, Catharina, and Kyana, for example, identify as Muslim. Visually, Amina is the only one who wears a hijab, making her visibly recognizable as Muslim. Furthermore, Ashley was the only woman who talked about her sexuality. She identifies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Interview with Ashley [Dutch black woman], on 13-03-2020. In Dutch: "Dan heb je als vrouw eens een voordeel, dan zijn de rollen voor een keer omgedraaid."

as, I quote: "gay, or queer, whatever you want to call it, non-straight at least<sup>23</sup>." Fatima stresses that her chronic illness is part of her identity, Catharina identifies as an older woman, and Sylvana stresses that the neighborhood you live in is also an important identity category, especially in the context of ethnic profiling:

"There is a different law in certain streets and for certain people<sup>24</sup>."

Next to this, the Islamic last name of Catharina and the Iranian last name of Yasmin seemed to be an important factor in their experiences of ethnic profiling. This will become clear in the next chapter.

All the before-mentioned identity categories lead to the specific experiences of women of color. In the next section, I will discuss some of these experiences.

#### 4.2. Experiences of everyday racism

Now that I have discussed the identity categories that seem important for the women of color I have interviewed, I aim to connect these identities to the social realities of these women. Here, I will draw on some everyday experiences. I find it important to discuss these experiences since it teaches about dominant discourses in the Netherlands about these women of color. This, in turn, influences the practice of ethnic profiling.

As I have discussed in Chapter 1, Dutch society knows "Dutch exceptionalism" (Özdil 2014, 5), which means that the Netherlands is often perceived as a colorblind and non-racist country. However, drawing on the everyday experiences of the women of color I have interviewed, this perception seems untrue. All women I have interviewed gave examples of how they experience everyday racism. Everyday racism is defined by Philomena Essed (1991, 3):

"The concept of everyday racism counters the view, prevalent in particular in the Netherlands, that racism is an individual problem, a question of "to be or not to be a racist." The crucial criterion distinguishing racism from everyday racism is that the latter involves only systematic, recurrent, familiar practices. The fact that it concerns repetitive practices indicates that every racism consists of practices that

<sup>24</sup> Interview with Sylvana [Dutch black woman], on 02-04-2020. In Dutch: "Er heerst een andere wet in bepaalde straten en voor bepaalde mensen."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Interview with Ashley [Dutch black woman], on 13-03-2020. In Dutch: "Ik ben gay, of queer, of hoe je dat wil noemen, ik ben in ieder geval non-straight."

can be generalized. Because everyday racism is infused into familiar practices, it involves socialized attitudes and behavior."

So, looking at the experiences of everyday racism of women of color teaches us something about what the socialized attitudes and behaviors are towards them in Dutch society. For example, Aisha discussed the familiar practice of women of color always being asked 'where you are from.' When you say you are from a city in the Netherlands, this will not be accepted as the 'right' answer. People often expect you to answer with a non-Dutch ethnic identity. Another 'familiar practice' is that it is assumed that women of color cannot talk Dutch properly. As Kyana said:

"I have been in multiple situations in which people find it clever that I can speak Dutch so well<sup>25</sup>."

Aisha, Amina, and Esma receive similar comments on their ability to speak Dutch.

The women I interviewed discussed everyday racism at work. Kelly talked about colleagues making racist jokes and not taking her opinion seriously. Catharina also discussed being discriminated at work. As a teacher, she was the only black woman working at the school. When she asked why there is so little diversity, a colleague answered: "One is enough<sup>26</sup>." Furthermore, Esma stresses that she is discriminated against while trying to find a job, never being invited for a job interview. Last but not least, Amina talks about her experiences as a nurse, patients refusing to be helped by her because of the way she looks.

Practices of everyday racism also take place in public spaces. Etchica talks about racist jokes being made towards her, about a story on how someone called her "pretty beautiful for a negro woman<sup>27</sup>," and her being told to go back to her own country by a bus driver. Also, Kelly was told by a boy that if she were lighter-skinned, she would have been perfect. Besides, in the interview with Sam, a Chinese Dutch woman, she talked about racist comments made to her and her family relating to the COVID-19 pandemic. Furthermore, Ashley tells me a story about a man yelling "Heil Hitler<sup>28</sup>" to her. So, these

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Interview with Kyana [Dutch Ethiopian/Djiboutian woman], on 10-04-2020. In Dutch: "Ik ben in meerdere situaties gekomen dat mensen het heel knap vonden dat ik zo goed Nederlands kan spreken."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Interview with Catharina [Dutch Aruban woman], on 03-04-2020. In Dutch: "Eén is genoeg."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Interview with Etchica [Dutch Surinamese woman], on 06-04-2020. In Dutch: "Voor een negerin ben je wel heel mooi."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Interview with Ashley [Dutch black woman], on 13-03-2020.

women experience everyday racism in many different ways.

On a more general note, Aisha discussed that the Netherlands is not the tolerant society that it believes it is. Also, because of "Dutch exceptionalism" (Özdil 2014, 5), it is hard to talk about these experiences in the Netherlands. As Aisha argues:

"White people, they get angry when you say you find something racist. Then they think you think they are racists<sup>29</sup>".

Ashley argues the same, saying that racism does not exist in the eyes of white Dutch people. Relating, many women stressed that the Netherlands is a white society in which they are not perceived as part of this society. As is, again, also stressed by El-Tayeb (2011) in her book on "European Others."

To conclude, what I aim to show with this section is how identity categories can be ascribed to women of color. All the before-mentioned identity categories lead to the specific experiences of women of color in contexts of racism. Even though some identity categories become more relevant in these contexts than others, it is still about the intersections of all identity categories. These different intersections influence a situation and the experiences of these situations differently. So, these women are not only 'women' and 'of color,' but some of them are also 'being perceived as a foreigner,' 'Muslim,' 'coming from a certain neighborhood,' 'having a darker skin tone,' 'having a certain last name,' and so on.

#### 4.3. Summary and concluding remarks

In this chapter, I have answered the questions of what the intersectional identity categories of women of color are and how these identity categories play out in the daily lives of these women in power dynamics, creating inequalities.

Women I interviewed identified as 'double-blooded', Surinamese, Djiboutian and Ethiopian, Somalian, Aruban, Chinese, Turkish, Moroccan, Iranian, and black. In addition, almost all women identified as Dutch or as part Dutch. These ethnic identities seemed to be symbolically important. However, looking at the political aspects of these women's identities, some of them argued, like Kyana and Aisha, that they are not perceived as Dutch by others. Furthermore, in the context of ethnic profiling and other forms of racism, the non-white identity and the darkness of skin tone becomes relevant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Interview with Aisha [Dutch Moroccan woman], on 24-04-2020. In Dutch: "Witte mensen worden boos als je zegt van, dat is racistisch. Dan koppelen ze dat meteen van oh, jij vindt mij helemaal racistisch."

Besides, generally speaking, these women identify as cisgender, meaning they identify with the sex they were born with. Some women argued that being a woman comes with perceptions of being less of a threat. However, in academic literature, it is argued that the womanhood of women of color is masculinized through stereotypical ideas (Newsome 2003, 35), which makes women of color perceived as less worthy of protection (Ritchie 2017, 62).

Furthermore, other social identities relating to, for example, religion, sexuality, class, and a last name, also seemed important for these women's identities.

Relating to these identities, I discussed the experiences of everyday racism of these women. Examples of these experiences are being complimented on the ability to speak Dutch, having to accept racist jokes, being discriminated against when applying for jobs, and the difficulty of discussing racism with white Dutch people. Looking at these experiences, it shows the socialized attitudes and behaviors towards these women of color.

In the next chapter, I will further elaborate on these attitudes and behaviors, answering the question of: How can we understand the intersecting identity categories of women of color as negative frameworks in which women of color are marginalized and excluded in the context of ethnic profiling?

# **Chapter 5. Being ethnically profiled**

"That is a good question. Why do I laugh? Because it is almost natural to be ethnically profiled as a black woman<sup>30</sup>".

This quote is by one of the women I have interviewed, Catharina, and shows that ethnic profiling is an important topic within the lives of women of color. Now that I have discussed the intersectional identity categories and the experiences of everyday racism that relate to these categories, I will discuss the experiences of ethnic profiling by security officials.

Moreover, I will connect these experiences to certain stereotypes that relate to the identity categories these women have. As Slakoff (2019, 1) argues: "Stereotypes are mental shortcuts that people use to place others into categories, and people base stereotypes on preconceived notions about the group's members." Moreover, Collins (1990, 67-68 as cited in Newsome 2003, 34) argues that groups with the power to define use stereotypes as "controlling images," which makes racism and sexism perceived to be part of everyday life. Because of this, I believe that using stereotypes in my analysis will illustrate the negative frameworks in which women of color are excluded, as I have argued before.

I do want to stress here that I do not believe these stereotypes are 'the only truth,' and I do not want to reduce the experiences of these women to these stereotypes.

Nonetheless, stereotypes do teach us something about the socialized attitudes towards women of color. I structured this chapter according to what seemed to be the most important identity categories relating to the specific experiences.

First, I will discuss the experiences of women who identified as and are identified as black women. Second, I will do the same for women who identify as and are perceived as Middle-Eastern and/or Islamic women. Finally, I will discuss the experience of a Chinese Dutch woman. Nevertheless, by structuring this chapter alongside these identity categories does not mean that these women are only part of these identity categories. Instead, the experiences relate most to these specific identities. In addition, more identity categories will be taken into account within these sub-sections.

47

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Interview with Catharina [Dutch Aruban woman], on 03-04-2020. In Dutch: "Dat is een mooie vraag. Waarom lach ik? Omdat het echt bijna vanzelfsprekend is geworden om etnisch geprofileerd te worden als zwarte vrouw."

#### 5.1. Being a black woman

"Controlling images" of black women are discussed by Sharma (2003) and Newsome (2003). Newsome (2003, 24) discusses the stereotypes of women of color being perceived as, among other things, masculine and criminally inclined. In addition, black womanhood is seen as the antithesis of white womanhood, which makes black women be perceived as a threat and not worthy of protection (Newsome 2003, 35). Sharma (2003, 286) argues that there are two main intersectional stereotypes of black women. The first one is the black woman as a drug addict, and the other one is the black woman as sexualized and impure.

Here, I will discuss the experiences of black women, who felt these kinds of stereotypical ideas influenced these experiences. Within this section, I will have subsections dividing the experiences of black women to the different contexts in which they are profiled: while driving, while flying, while partying, and while being a mother.

## 5.1.1. Driving while being a black woman

As I have argued before, ethnic profiling is generally understood as men of color being stopped while driving by the police, referred to as "Driving While Black" (Sharma 2003, 279; Weitzer and Tuch 2002, 436). In this research, it appeared that this also happens to women. Ava told me about the many times she was stopped by the police while driving. She shares with me:

"Driving in The Hague is a real challenge. Because all kinds of streets are closed off, and there are a lot of one direction streets. It also changes every month. So, I was taking a shortcut, and I had noticed there was an alcohol check done by the police further down the road.

So, I just turned into the street before the check. They probably thought: 'that person saw us standing here and is turning now because he or she does not want to be tested.'

Anyways, I do not drink alcohol. Of course, they do not know that. I also do not know if they could see that I am black or not when I turned. However, he came after me, a cop on a motorcycle. He came riding next to me. He said: 'follow me.' However, he went into the first street, which is a super-narrow street. So, I did not go down that street, I took the next one, so I could get behind him again. He probably thought I wanted to run, even though this was not possible at all since

you could not go any other way by car.

So, after that, he was not happy that I took the next street. I drove behind him to the alcohol test. The motorcycle cop was super rude; he yelled at me: 'I told you to drive behind me!' He was furious. So I said, 'you know, that street is super narrow, you can go through it with your motorcycle.' From that moment on, he was no longer reasonable. I was also very annoyed.

Another police officer did the alcohol test on me, and of course, nothing came out, because I hardly ever drink. However, they still wanted to fine me with something. So, they took a book with what offenses can be fined. I got fined 150 euros because I did not follow the orders of the police officer"<sup>31</sup>.

As you can derive from this example, Ava felt treated by the police like she had done something wrong. Even though she had passed the alcohol test, they still fined Ava for not following the orders from a police officer. She felt criminalized.

Another experience of a black woman while driving is that of Amina. She starts by telling me that she is never stopped by the police when she is by herself. However, when she is with her brother, they are stopped regularly. As discussed in the previous chapter, some women thought women themselves are seen as less of a threat by security officials. Amina believed this influenced this case; the police were perceiving her brother more as a threat than herself.

## 5.1.2. Flying while being a black woman

Next to 'Driving While Black,' ethnic profiling also happens in airports, which Sharma (2003) refers to as "Flying While Brown." Sharma (2003, 283) argues that this is the most prominent place where women of color are ethnically profiled.

"Flying While Brown" comes with certain stereotypes. In the 1980s, the War on Drugs arose after the blowup of the crack market in the United States (Sharma 2003, 287). It was meant to decrease the drug trade. Not to mention, women of color have especially been targeted by this war on drugs (Ritchie 2017, 73). As Sharma (2003, 287) argues: "Black women have come to embody the typical addict or drug courier." Here, I will discuss the experiences of black women who felt ethnically profiled by Customs officials.

Kyana points out that she was the only one drawn out of the queue when she

 $<sup>^{31}</sup>$  Interview with Ava [Dutch black woman], on 17-03-2020. For the original Dutch quote, see Appendix 3.

traveled to Curacao. She was taken to a separate room; they questioned her about the reason she was traveling and checked her stuff. Nonetheless, she does acknowledge that it is hard to prove that she was drawn out of this queue because of her skin color. However, she does feel like this has contributed to the situation.

Furthermore, three black women have had experiences that can, more or less, be related to the War on Drugs and the stereotype of black women being drug couriers (Sharma 2003, 287). Ashley, Catharina, and Ava elaborated on experiences with Customs officials checking their hair for drugs. Ashley explains:

"This also happened one time at Schiphol. The metal detector gates went off, and the woman on the other side, she wanted to check my afro. They think you are smuggling drugs or something<sup>32</sup>".

Ava tells a similar story. The difference is that she had dreadlocks at the time it happened. Since then, she is more aware of how she can 'properly' wear her hair when traveling. Catharina was also pretty surprised when Customs officials wanted to check her hair:

"Is this hair all yours, she asked. Or is it a wig? I said, no, it is my own hair. Then, they fell down to my scalp. I asked, 'what are you looking for, clips?'. She said: 'no, drugs'<sup>33</sup>".

In this case, the Customs official explicitly stated that she was searching for drugs. Catharina, in the same interview, asks herself why people with straight hair are not searched for drugs since they can also braid drugs into their hairs. Why are black women searched into their hairs, down to their scalps?

Next to the experience of Ashley's hair being searched, Ashley talks about another experience at the airport in which she felt profiled based on her skin color. When she arrived in the Netherlands from a holiday with her white girlfriend, now ex-girlfriend, her girlfriend could pass right through Military Police. However, when Ashley showed her ID, the man behind the desk began asking her questions about her holiday and kept

<sup>33</sup> Interview with Catharina [Dutch Aruban woman], on 03-04-2020. In Dutch: "Is dit haar allemaal van uzelf, of is het een pruik? Ik zeg nee, het is mijn eigen haar. En toen hebben ze zitten voelen tot op mijn hoofdhuid. Ik zeg, wat is er dan? Wat zoekt u? Spelden? Ze zei: nee, drugs."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Interview with Ashley [Dutch black woman], on 13-03-2020. In Dutch: "Dit gebeurde trouwens ook een keer op Schiphol. De metaaldetectorpoortjes gingen af en de vrouw die daar stond wilde in mijn afro kijken. Ze denken dan dat je drugs mee smokkelt of zo."

looking at her ID. Ashley got annoyed and said: "I am Dutch. I do not know what you are looking for<sup>34</sup>." Ashley felt that she was put outside of the Dutch identity, which can be related to the concept of "European others" (El-Tayeb 2011).

#### 5.1.3. Partying while being a black woman

Next to "Driving While Black" and "Flying While Brown," 'Partying While Black' also seems to be relevant in the experiences of the women I interviewed. These experiences involved being ethnically profiled by private security guards at clubs and festivals.

Multiple women have discussed that they were denied at clubs regularly, like Etchica, Catharina, and Kyana. Kyana explains she was denied at a club and was treated violently by the security guard at that club:

"I once went to a café where I had been coming for years, but there was a different bouncer than usual. I noticed that he was super friendly to everyone entering the club, but when I arrived, his mood changed. He said: 'are you allowed to go in?'. So I said, 'yes?'. 'Can I see your ID.' 'Sure.' At that time, I already had a strange feeling.

After a while being in this club, I lost my debit card. I had been here for four hours or so, so the bouncer had seen me passing by several times. So I said to him, 'can I run up and down to get cash because I lost my debit card inside.' He did not really respond to that, but I know that you can go in until 3 AM. When I came back precisely one past 3, he said: 'you cannot go in.' I said: 'That is strange because I just said that I would go up and down quickly. It is one past 3; I am just a few seconds late'. 'No, you are not going in.' So I was annoyed, but I thought: leave it, it is only for one hour.

Then, two or three ladies walked by, blonde hair, blue eyes. He was super sweet to these girls, and they were allowed to go inside. Then I said to him: 'You are a douchebag.' Suddenly, I was held in a headlock against the wall, and the bouncer called the police. He said that I had insulted him, punched him, and called him names. The police came and told me to leave the city center<sup>35</sup>".

In this example, Kyana is treated violently by the security guard while she was not violent towards him. He lies about her punching him while Kyana is the one who felt

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Interview with Ashley [Dutch black woman], on 13-03-2020. In Dutch: "Ik ben gewoon Nederlands dus ik weet niet waar je op zoek naar bent."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Interview with Kyana [Dutch Ethiopian/Djiboutian woman], on 10-04-2020. For the original Dutch quote, see Appendix 3.

discriminated against since he did let the white blonde girls in and not her. Furthermore, Kyana felt criminalized (Newsome 2003, 34) and less worthy of protection (Ritchie 2017, 215), being put in a headlock against the wall while she did not pose any threat.

Another example of feeling discriminated against by a security guard is that of Ashley. She went to a festival in Amsterdam with a couple of friends. Ashley was the only non-white person in the group. All of her friends could walk right past security. However, when Ashley wanted to pass, she was stopped by the security guard. The bottoms of her trousers were unfolded and checked, her purse was checked, as well as her body, and, again, her afro was checked.

This experience raises the question of why Ashley's white friends were not checked, and Ashley was checked so extensively. What was the security guard looking for? Would the perceptions of the security guard be influenced by the stereotype of black women as addicts and drug couriers (Sharma 2003, 287)? In addition, it seemed that the security guard did not respect the privacy of Ashley's body in the same way she respected the privacy of Ashley's white friends. As Sharma (2003, 293) argues, "black women's bodies have historically been sexualized and thereby cheapened, and the myths about their sexuality that emerged during the days of slavery continue to influence law's treatment of these women today." Regardless of the answers to the question mentioned above, Ashley felt ethnically profiled by the security guard.

## 5.1.4. Being a black mother

Now that I have discussed some experiences relating to being black and female, I want to add another identity category to this section: being a black mother. As I have argued, black womanhood is seen as the opposite of white womanhood. White womanhood is seen as the standard of how women should behave. As Ritchie (2017, 48-49) argues: "Only white women could access "true womanhood," characterized by "piousness, purity, submissiveness, and domesticity." Conversely, women of color were denied access to the same perceptions and privileges". In other words, black womanhood is seen as the opposite of white womanhood, masculinizing black women.

This can be further translated into perceptions of white and black motherhood. Newsome (2003, 37-38) discusses the stereotype of black women as 'welfare queens,' being lazy, irresponsible, and wanting to live off government social services. Moreover, the welfare queen is perceived as a "neglectful, incompetent mother" (Newsome 2003,

37-38). Ritchie (2017, 77-78) further argues that the War on Drugs also led to the policing of pregnant black women and black motherhood. Low-income mothers especially seem to be targeted by this (Ritchie 2017, 199).

Sylvana's experiences as a black mother seemed to be influenced by these stereotypical ideas. I did not record the interview with Sylvana, given its sensitivity, but I did write a vignette after this interview. The excerpts presented here are parts of this vignette.

"Sylvana tells me about her experiences with the police, which have been involved multiple times in the conflict between Sylvana and her downstairs neighbor. The downstairs neighbor was always complaining about noise disturbance, which was caused by the bad condition of the floor of Sylvana's apartment. The housing cooperation should have fixed this lousy condition of the floor.

One day, Sylvana got a message from the housing cooperation that she had to remove the floor from her apartment. Being pregnant and working with 2,5-year-old twins around, this was a very exhausting time to be in. As she was told, she removed the floor and did not yet buy a new one since noise measurements should have been done first.

Not much later, the police were at her door. Sylvana explains to me that the floor was out and that there were some household chores left undone. The police officer thought it was a mess. The police officer said: 'I would not let my children live here. I would go somewhere else'. Sylvana got annoyed and said: 'I would not.' She explains to me that the household chores simply had to be done.

The police officer left and said she would send the community police officer to check if everything was going alright. No more than two hours later, the doorbell rang. It was not the community police officer, as Sylvana expected, but it was the crisis department of youth services (*Crisisdienst Jeugdzorg* in Dutch). They said: "The children have to go.' Sylvana was forced to call someone to bring the kids to<sup>36</sup>".

In the experience discussed here, the police officer came into Sylvana's house for a reason that had nothing to do with the motherhood of Sylvana. However, this police

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Interview with Sylvana [Dutch black woman], on 02-04-2020. For the original Dutch excerpt from vignette, see Appendix 3.

officer had still called the crisis department of youth services. So, she made a judgment on the motherhood of Sylvana, which Sylvana believed to be influenced by stereotypical ideas of black women being bad mothers in combination with the state the apartment was in. Besides, Sylvana stresses that she lived in a particular neighborhood, which influenced this situation as well, according to her.

Furthermore, a year later, the police were at her door again. This time, the bed of Sylvana and her partner broke, so they temporarily slept on a mattress in the living room. When the police came, they were not happy to see the 'mess' in Sylvana's house. The police officers called youth services again. From here on, Sylvana was forced to have caretakers in her house three times a week. She says:

"I became a paranoia mom, I was super stressed, and therefore there was unsafety in my home<sup>37</sup>."

She also explains that having a newborn baby, she had to adjust her life to having three children. In the interview, Sylvana asks herself whether youth services would also have been called if she was a white mom living in another neighborhood. Was the situation really that unsafe? Later, it became clear that the caretakers did not even know why they were in Sylvana's home. They asked questions like: 'Are the children from the same dad?', and 'Was there a weapon in the house?'. None of these things were true but were instead informed by racist stereotypes. As Sylvana explains:

"The problem was the mattress on the floor. It should have been put up against the wall if we did not sleep on it. Otherwise, there was a fall hazard with the baby. This was the reason why I was forced to have caretakers in my own home<sup>38</sup>".

Reflecting on this, Sylvana asks herself if these caretakers had to be forced into her home, 'correcting' her motherhood?

Meanwhile, the caretakers had written positive reports on the motherhood of Sylvana, stating that Sylvana was no threat to her children and a good mother.

Nonetheless, the conflict with the downstairs neighbor still made Sylvana feel unsafe in her own house. Besides, Sylvana was still living in fear of losing her children. Eventually,

38 Interview with Sylvana [Dutch black woman], on 02-04-2020. In Dutch: "Het probleem was dat er een matras in de woonkamer op de grond lag, die tegen de muur gezet moest worden als er niet op geslapen werd, omdat er een valgevaar was met de baby. Dat was de reden waarom ik hulpverleners in huis kreeg."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Interview with Sylvana [Dutch black woman], on 02-04-2020. In Dutch: "Ik werd een paranoia moeder, het was super stressvol en daardoor kwam er alleen maar meer onveiligheid in mijn huis."

this fear became a reality. Sylvana's newborn suffocated in her baby carrier. She thought she had protected the baby by dressing her extra-warm and having a plastic hood around her and her baby to protect the baby from the rain.

Just a day after the death of the baby, Sylvana and her partner had an appointment at child protection (*Kinderbescherming* in Dutch). The case manager of Sylvana requested this. However, it turned out that this case manager did not even read the reports of the caretakers she had forced into the home of Sylvana. Why did she not read these reports? Sylvana believes that this case manager made certain assumptions on Sylvana's motherhood for her to take it to child protection. Nonetheless, Sylvana told her story, including the death of her baby, and the appointment at child protection did not have any negative consequences for her.

However, the story is still not over yet. As I quote from the vignette I wrote:

"Because the death of the baby was not natural, an autopsy was done, and a detective had to look into it. There was even video footage on the death of the baby since it happened while bringing her twins to daycare. At the daycare, Sylvana found out that her baby was not breathing, which was recorded by the security cameras. The detective permitted Sylvana to cremate her baby and closed the case. The detective concluded that it was an accident, as the doctors in the hospital also stressed.

However, a new community police officer, whom Sylvana trusted, came to bring the news that a new detective wanted to have the baby carrier in which the baby died. She also had to give permission to this detective to research her case. One day, Sylvana receives a document which states that she is called up for questioning, "in association with the serious abuse of [name baby]." In 2019, Sylvana was questioned. However, she had heard nothing since. It seems that the police still have not reported the questioning to the Public Prosecution Service (*Het Openbaar Ministerie* in Dutch) <sup>39</sup>".

In this case, the first detective and doctors that took care of the baby of Sylvana had concluded that the death of the baby was a tragic accident. So, why did this new detective reopen the case? Were the detective and the police officers, consciously or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Interview with Sylvana [Dutch black woman], on 02-04-2020. For the original Dutch excerpt from vignette, see Appendix 3.

unconsciously drawing on the stereotypes of black motherhood, and therefore seeing Sylvana as a "neglectful, incompetent mother" (Newsome 2003, 27-38)? Would a white mother have been treated the same? Sylvana asked similar questions in our interview.

#### 5.2. Being a Muslim or Middle Eastern woman

As can be concluded from the previous section, there are stereotypical ideas about black women. These controlling narratives influence the experiences of these women. The same goes for women who identify as and are identified as Muslim or Middle Eastern. However, for these women, these stereotypical ideas look different.

Flying as a Muslim and/or Middle Eastern woman comes with stereotypes relating to the War on Terror. The War on Terror began in 2011, after the 9/11 attacks. The goal was to reduce terrorism, which has resulted in the ethnic profiling of "Arab, Middle Eastern, Muslim, and South Asian men" (Ritchie 2017, 71-72). Moreover, as Ritchie (2017, 91-92) argues, women of the same communities are ethnically profiled: "Beyond targeting in terror investigations, women who wear the hijab or otherwise appear to be Muslim were routinely subject to discriminatory and abusive policing practices after 9/11, from verbal abuse and discriminatory arrests to airport profiling and unwarranted searches violating religious precepts" (Ritchie 2017 91-92). The stereotypical idea relating to this is "Middle Eastern females as jihadists who have taken up extremism with their male counterparts" (Slakoff 2019, 5). Furthermore, Sharma (2003, 300) argues that Arab and South Asian women are, like black women, perceived as 'threats.' Catharina and Yasmin felt that stereotypes like these had influenced their experience of ethnic profiling at the airport.

#### 5.2.1. Flying while being a black Muslim woman

In this section, I will elaborate on the experience of Catharina, who identifies as a black Muslim woman. I have already referred to one of her experiences in the previous chapter. However, because this experience at the airport relates more to her identity as a Muslim, I feel it is appropriate to discuss this experience here.

"I was taken out of the queue at Customs, which I found strange. At the airport, you can check in independently. I looked around me to see who was in line, and I was the only black woman. My husband is a white man, and he could check in independently without any issues.

Then, it was my turn. Somehow, I was unable to check-in. I got a little annoyed

and nervous since the people behind me wanted to catch their flights as well. So I asked: 'What is going on?' Someone came from behind the counter: 'Madam, would you come here for a minute?' I was taken out of the queue in front of everyone.

They took my passport and looked at it. I said: 'I am not a criminal. You can check everything.' And then they said: 'No madam, everything is fine.' So I said: 'Wait a minute, why did you get me out of the line?' A very young man answered: 'Madam, your last name is Bashara, that name is already a risk.'40"

In this case, Catharina seemed to be profiled based on her Islamic-sounding last name. Why would this man at Customs state that having the last name of 'Bashara' is already a risk?

Catharina believes he was influenced by the stereotypical idea of Muslim women being involved with terrorism. In addition, the appearance of Catharina as a black woman has most likely also influenced this situation. As I have argued, black women are perceived as fearsome (Ritchie 2017, 62-63), did this contribute to the decision of the Customs officer to take Catharina out of the line? For Catharina, it did.

## 5.2.2. Flying while being an Iranian woman

Another example of a woman who was profiled at the airport is Yasmin, a Dutch Iranian woman. She was denied to board her flight to the United States by the American Customs and Border Protection:

"A week later, there was the attack. Well, you probably heard of it, the attack of the United States in Iran which killed a general of Iran. We were flying the next day, or two days after. So from that incident on, I was jokingly questioning if this was going to get me in trouble.

So, with my good behavior, I checked what documents I needed to have to be able to travel to the United States. I went to Schiphol with my ESTA and passport, just like my two friends I was supposed to travel with. We went through Customs, and we passed the Security and Passport Control. I was relieved and said to my friends: 'well, now we have passed.'

When our flight was boarding, it was our turn. My friends were ahead, and they walked past the boarding check. While my passport was checked, I wanted to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Interview with Catharina [Dutch Aruban woman], on 03-04-2020. For the original Dutch quote, see Appendix 3.

walk further. However, the flight attendant said: 'no, no, no, she has to go back.' She explained to me that the United States Customs and Border Protection had several additional questions for me and that I had to wait for them.

Well, more than fifteen minutes later, three American men came, and one of them came to me. He asked: 'passport?', while he grabbed my passport out of my hands, and he immediately took a photo of it. On the spot, with everyone present and people still boarding, he asked me all kinds of questions. 'Who are you?'. 'Where are you from?' The same questions were asked when I got interviewed for a visa application. However, now I was questioned in front of everyone and intimidatingly.

After everyone was boarded, they were still asking questions. A flight attendant came over to us: 'We are done boarding, do I have to take her suitcase out?' So, the American man said to her: 'Yes, she is not allowed to board.' At that moment, I realized what was really happening.<sup>41</sup>"

Yasmin explains after describing this experience that she felt treated like a terrorist, which brings us back to the idea of Muslim and/or Middle Eastern women being involved in terrorist practices (Ritchie 2017, 91-92). In this case, the Iranian background of Yasmin was perceived by her as very influential in her being profiled. The airstrike of the United States in the Islamic Republic of Iran, on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of January 2020, killed Qasem Soleimani, a top Iranian general (BBC 2020). Moreover, the relationship between the United States and Iran has been hostile for years. Nevertheless, this relationship has become more hostile in the past year. For example, people with an Iranian passport or people who have been in Iran after the 1<sup>st</sup> of March last year are not allowed to travel to the United States. So, Yasmin felt that this had influenced this experience.

In line with this, Yasmin explains that she does not have an Iranian passport, only a Dutch one. So, the American Customs and Border Protection officials could not have profiled her based on a passport. Instead, she argues, she is profiled because of her parents' heritage and because of her Iranian last name:

"In my Dutch passport, it does not say I am Iranian. Moreover, I also do not have Iranian nationality since I do not have an Iranian passport. So, I must be profiled based on my appearance combined with my last name, which Is super Iranian. At

\_

 $<sup>^{41}</sup>$  Interview with Yasmin [Dutch Iranian woman], on 05-05-2020. For the original Dutch quote, see Appendix 3.

the American Consulate, they immediately asked: 'Your parents are Persian, right?'

So, in this case, Yasmin felt profiled based on her appearance and her last name, resulting in not being allowed to go to the United States with her friends. Still, Yasmin did not get a definite answer to her question of why she was not allowed to travel to the United States. Yasmin asks herself why she was the one who was not allowed to board the flight and not her white Dutch friends she was traveling with?

#### 5.3. Being an Asian woman

In this research project, I have interviewed one Chinese Dutch woman. Racism towards Asian people has been neglected for a long time. In the article of Slakoff (2019, 6), in which she discusses media representations of women of color, including Asian females, she states that there are no studies done on the representations of Asian female victims and only two studies on the depiction of Asian females as offenders.

However, there are more general stereotypes relating to Asian women. For example, Asian women are often exoticized and fetishized. As Mukkamala and Suyemoto (2018, 42) argue, having researched the experiences of stereotypes of Asian women in the United States: "Similar numbers of participants reported experiences of direct sexualization through name calling, touching, or comments related to their appearance and body as more indirect sexualization, such as being called "China Doll". This might also explain why Sam discusses the stereotype of Asian women being involved in human trafficking, which Sam stresses to be about sex trafficking specifically.

As Sam herself argues, talking about criminalized stereotypes of Asian women herself, Chinese people are often stereotyped as being involved in human trafficking and working illegally. Relating to this stereotypical idea, Sam says that Chinese women are often targeted by identity checks, "even though we are Dutch citizens<sup>43</sup>." So, from this, it could be argued that Chinese women are perceived as non-Dutch or immigrants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Interview with Yasmin [Dutch Iranian woman], on 05-05-2020. In Dutch: "Ja, want in mijn Nederlands paspoort staat niet dat ik Iraans ben, ik heb ook geen Iraanse nationaliteit omdat ik ook geen Iraans paspoort heb. Dan is het wel van mijn uiterlijk in combinatie met mijn achternaam wat super Iraans is. Op de Amerikaanse ambassade zeiden ze ook gelijk van: 'Your parents are Persian right?'."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Interview with Sam [Chinese Dutch woman], on 14-03-2020. In Dutch: "Ook al zijn we gewoon Nederlandse burgers."

Moreover, as Ritchie (2017, 89) argues, immigrant women are often perceived as the violation of the nation-state, and therefore they are constructed as the public enemy.

#### 5.3.1. Working while being a Chinese woman

Sam works at her family's restaurant, which is regularly checked by security officials like the police and the General Intelligence and Security Service. As she explains:

"Working in the catering industry, I am always asked to show my ID card to see if I am working legally. Also, the General Intelligence and Security Service (*AIVD* in Dutch) has been involved in checking my family's restaurant to see if we were involved in human trafficking.

First, the police come by themselves. They are pretty nice at first, doing ID checks. What you see after, however, is how many police officers they have brought, surrounding the whole restaurant. It is like you have a drug trading business; that many police officers are involved.<sup>44</sup>"

Besides ID-checks at work, Sam also discusses in the interview that she always double checks if she has her passport with her. Because, as a Chinese Dutch woman, you are often asked to show your ID. As she explains:

"If I go out, I always think 'shit, do I have my passport?'. I do not want to get in trouble. From generation to generation, we are taught to bring our passports everywhere<sup>45</sup>".

Even though little research is done on the criminalized stereotypes of Asian women, it is arguable that these experiences are influenced by, as Sam explains herself, the stereotypes of Chinese women being involved in human trafficking, sex trafficking specifically.

#### 5.4. Summary and concluding remarks

In this chapter, I have discussed the specific experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling. These experiences are influenced by different identity categories and show how certain perceptions and stereotypes of these identity categories are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Interview with Sam [Chinese Dutch woman], on 14-03-2020. For the original Dutch quote, see Appendix 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Interview with Sam [Chinese Dutch woman], on 14-03-2020. In Dutch: "Kijk, als ik nu de deur uit stap dan denk ik altijd 'shit, heb ik mijn paspoort wel bij?' Ik wil ook niet in de problemen raken. En dat is van generatie op generatie een soort van overgeplaatst van, je moet je altijd kunnen legitimeren."

embedded in society.

First, the experiences of the black women show how they felt perceived as criminally inclined (Newsome 2003, 34), as drug addicts (Sharma 2003, 287), and as neglectful, incompetent mothers (Newsome 2003, 37-38). This influenced their experiences of being stopped by police officers, checked in their afros and dreads by Customs officials, and accused of abuse by a detective.

Second, the experiences of women who are Muslim or Middle Eastern felt influenced by the stereotype of them having terrorist affiliations (Slakoff 2019, 5), in the context of the War on Terror (Ritchie 2017, 91-92). This influenced how these women were treated at the airport, drawn out the queue, and denied to board the flight.

Third, A Dutch Chinese woman felt her experiences were influenced by the stereotype of Asian women being involved in human trafficking, sex trafficking specifically. Because of this, she feels she is regularly checked for her ID by the police.

As you can conclude from this chapter, the identity categories in which women of color are subordinated work as "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize" (Crenshaw 1991, 1241) these women in the context of ethnic profiling. I have tried to show this by connecting stereotypes of the intersectional identity categories to these experiences. Important here is that these stereotypes do not only draw on 'ethnicity' but also on 'gender,' discussing stereotypical ideas about black womanhood, the womanhood of Middle Eastern and Muslim women, and Asian womanhood.

Next is the Conclusion of this thesis, in which I will elaborate on the answer to my research puzzle. Furthermore, I will elaborate on what intersectionality helps us to see and what this thesis is a case of.

# **Conclusion**

Throughout this thesis, I have argued that the widespread understanding of ethnic profiling, conceptualized as "Driving While Black" (Sharma 2003, 279; Weitzer and Tuch 2002, 436), lacks the experiences of women of color. So, in this thesis, I have focused on the experiences of ethnic profiling of women of color in the Netherlands to contribute to this gap of knowledge.

In order to incorporate the experiences of women of color, I stressed that intersectionality is needed as an analytical frame. Intersectional identity categories and the intersectional subordination of women of color are important to understand their experiences fully (Crenshaw 1989, 140). These women are both 'women' and 'of color.' Next to that, they have all kinds of identities relating to, for example, their sexuality or religion.

In this thesis, I have generated many different experiences of 14 different women of color with ethnic profiling. However, I did not discuss all the experiences of all women, given the scope of this thesis. I have interviewed women from many different ethnicities, identifying as, for example, black, Chinese, Surinamese, and Iranian. In addition, all these women identified as Dutch or partly Dutch. Relating to gender identity, all women from this research identified as cisgender. The women also discussed other identity categories that were meaningful to them, like being a mother, living in a particular neighborhood, and having a specific last name. All these identity categories, especially the stereotypical ideas relating to these identity categories, felt to have influenced the experiences of these women of color in the context of ethnic profiling.

Before I conclude on these experiences and my analysis, I will first repeat the research puzzle:

How do intersectional identity categories shape the specific experiences of different Dutch women of color of ethnic profiling by security officials in the Netherlands in the period from 2010 to 2020?

To answer this research puzzle, it is important to note, again, that intersectional identity categories work as "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize" (Crenshaw 1991, 1241) these women of color in the context of ethnic profiling. Overall, the intersectional identity categories of women of

color lead them to being subordinated in multiple ways. This multiple subordination is "the imposition of one burden that interacts with preexisting vulnerabilities to create vet another dimension of disempowerment" (Crenshaw 1991, 1249).

As we have seen throughout this thesis, the women felt discriminated against by different security actors. The intersectional identity categories of women of color lead them to being ethnically profiled in both racialized and gendered ways. So, what can we understand better or differently if we analyze the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling? Furthermore, what can intersectionality help us to see?

First of all, intersectionality helps us to see that people have multiple identity categories. In this research, it helps us to see that women of color are not only 'women' but also 'of color,' next to that they are, for example, 'Muslim,' 'mother,' 'from a particular neighborhood,' and 'perceived as a foreigner.'

Second, it helps us to see that these identity categories do not stand alone but intersect. So, all identity categories influence each other and cannot be analyzed separately. For example, when Sylvana was accused of abusing her baby, she felt not only her motherhood mattered but, moreover, her *black* motherhood. Another example is that of Sam, feeling being checked not only because she is Chinese, but because she is a Chinese *woman*. Moreover, the intersectional stereotypes of black women, Middle Eastern and/or Islamic women, and Asian women influence how these women are perceived and how security officials react to them.

Moreover, intersectionality helps us to see that different ethnic identities also influence the experiences of women of color differently, as Slakoff (2019, 2) stresses: "Importantly, the lives of minority women are not all the same. Black and Middle Eastern women may both face harmful stereotypes and racism, but their lived experiences are different." So, the experiences of all women of color cannot be generalized, as can be concluded by the variety of experiences I have analyzed in this research.

Third, it shows that these intersections come with power relations, creating inequalities. In the case of this research, these inequalities are, on the one hand, the experiences of ethnic profiling themselves, and on the other hand, the neglecting of these women's experiences in public and academic debate. So, what if we did not incorporate the experiences of women of color with the analytical frame of intersectionality?

When only recognizing the 'of color'-identity of these women, you will miss the

intersectional stereotypical ideas of these women, and therefore, their intersectional experiences. For example, you will not be aware of the experiences of Kyana, feeling discriminated against because of her black womanhood, being perceived as a threat by a bouncer, and therefore treated violently by him. You will not be able to see that Yasmin is feeling rejected to board her flight because of the stereotype of Middle Eastern women being involved in terrorism.

Not recognizing this, makes it harder to overcome these cases of ethnic profiling. It is important to have a comprehensive and holistic understanding of ethnic profiling in order to counter it. As Ritchie (2017, 254) argues: "If we fail to take women's experiences into account, we cannot confront the full measure of police violence, or articulate visions of justice that fully reflect the needs and experiences of all members of our communities." So, if we want a more just society, we should incorporate the experiences of women to theorize ethnic profiling and other forms of institutional violence.

This thesis is a case of how to overcome the neglect of experiences of women of color. Women are not only neglected in public and academic debates surrounding ethnic profiling. Debates about other forms of police violence should also acknowledge the experiences of women of color, next to all kinds of debates relating to racism and sexism. As I have mentioned in Chapter 3, the women I have interviewed also experienced profiling in the healthcare and educational system, and in private spheres. It is important to do further research on this.

However, to say that intersectionality is only useful in topics relating explicitly to racism and sexism is not enough. In all kinds of topics, from healthcare to business-related topics, incorporating minorities' experiences, or experiences of people who are often neglected, will lead to a better understanding of a particular phenomenon. If you are not incorporating these experiences, you will not see the full picture, and there is the possibility that you cannot see certain problems. I hope that other researchers and academics can draw from this research on how to be inclusive in academic research.

Besides, as I have reflected on as a limitation of this research, we need to acknowledge the experiences of non-gender-conforming people, trans women, and women who do not identify as feminine. We need to be continually learning about neglected minorities. This is not only important to fully understand the phenomena we

aim to research, but also to create equal and inclusive academic and public spheres.

# References

Amnesty International and Open Society Justice Initiative. (2013). "Equality Under Pressure: The Impact of Ethnic Profiling." *CITO REPRO, Amsterdam.* 

Batton, Candice and Colleen Kadleck. (2004). "Theoretical and Methodological Issues in Racial Profiling Research." *Police Quarterly* 7(1):30-64.

BBC. (2020). "Qasem Soleimani: US kills top Iranian general in Baghdad air strike." <a href="https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-50979463">https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-50979463</a> Accessed on: 27-06-2020.

Bhopal, R. (2004). "Glossary of terms relating to ethnicity and race: for reflection and debate." *J Epidemiol Community Health* 58:441-445.

Boeije, Hennie. (2010). Analysis in Qualitative Research. Sage Publications Ltd.

Çankaya, Sinan. (2012). *De controle van marsmannetjes en ander schorriemorrie.* Boom Lemma Uitgevers, Den Haag.

Carastathis, Anna. (2014). "The Concept of Intersectionality in Feminist Theory." *Philosophy Compass* 9(5): 304-314.

Chatelain, Marcia and Kaavya Asoka. (2015). "Women and Black Lives Matter. An Interview with Marcia Chatelain". *Dissent* 63(3): 54-61.

Cho, Sumi, Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw, and Leslie McCall. (2013). "Toward a Field of Intersectionality Studies: Theory, Applications, and Praxis." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 38(4): 785-810.

Collins, Patricia Hill. (2015). "Intersectionality's Definitional Dilemmas." *Annual Review Sociology* 41:1-20.

Controle Alt Delete. (2020). "Is Tomy Holten onze George Floyd? Overleden na politiegeweld in Zwolle (video)". Link: <a href="https://controlealtdelete.nl/blog/is-tomy-holten-onze-george-floyd">https://controlealtdelete.nl/blog/is-tomy-holten-onze-george-floyd</a>. Accessed on: 7 June 2020.

Corus, Canan, and Bige Siaatcioglu. (2015). "An intersectionality framework for transformative service research." *The Service Industries Journal* 35(7-8):415-429.

Crenshaw, Kimberle. (1989). "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics." *University of Chicago Legal Forms* 1(8):139-167.

Crenshaw, Kimberle. (1991). "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color." *Stan. L. Rev.* 1241.

De Zwart. (2012). "Pitfalls of top-down identity designation: Ethno-statistics in the Netherlands." *Comparative European Politics* 10:301-318.

Davis, Kathy. (2008). "Intersectionality as buzzword. A sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory successful". *Feminist Theory* 9(1):67-85.

Edna, A. Viruell-Fuentes, Patricia Y. Miranda, and Sawsan Abdulrahim. (2012). "More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health." *Social Science & Medicine* 75:2099-2106.

Eijkman, Quirine. (2010). "Has the Genie Been Let Out of the Bottle? Ethnic Profiling in the Netherlands". *The Journal of Law and Social Justice* 5(2):1-21.

El-Tayeb, Fatima. (2011). "Introduction. Theorizing Urban Minority Communities in Postnational Europe". In: *European Others, Queering Ethnicity in Postnational Europe*. University of Minnesota Press.

Eriksen, Thomas Hylland. (2010). *Ethnicity and Nationalism. Third Edition. Anthropological Perspectives.* Pluto Press.

Essed, Philomena. (1991). *Understanding Everyday Racism: An Interdisciplinary Theory.* SAGE Publications, Inc.

Forum van Democratie. (2020). "Nieuws. Rob Roos: We staan op het punt de cultuuroorlog te verliezen". Link:

https://www.fvd.nl/we staan op het punt de cultuuroorlog te verliezen Accessed on: 23 July 2020.

Gourevitch, Philip. (1999). We Wish to Inform You That Tomorrow We Will be Killed With Our Families: Stories from Rwanda. Picador, New York.

Government of the Netherlands. (2008). *The Constitution of the Kingdom of the Netherlands 2008*. Published by the Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations,

Constitutional Affairs and Legislation Division in collaboration with the Translation Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Het Parool. (2020). "Belasting dienst erkent: toch sprake van etnisch profileren". Link: <a href="https://www.parool.nl/nederland/belastingdienst-erkent-toch-sprake-van-etnisch-profileren">https://www.parool.nl/nederland/belastingdienst-erkent-toch-sprake-van-etnisch-profileren</a> Accessed on: 7 June 2020.

Hilhorst, Sacha, and Joke Hermes. (2015). "We have given up so much': Passion and denial in the Dutch Zwarte Piet (Black Pete) controversy." *European Journal of Cultural Studies:* 1-16.

Hunter, Margaret. (2007). "The Persistent Problem of Colorism: Skin Tone, Status, and Inequality." *Sociology Compass* 1(1):237-254.

Mason, Jennifer. (2018). Qualitative Researching. Sage Publications Ltd.

Mukkamala, Shruti, and Karen L. Suyemoto. (2018). "Racialized Sexism/Sexualized Racism: A Multimethod Study of Intersectional Experiences of Discrimination for Asian American Women." *Asian American Journal of Psychology* 9(1):32-46.

Nash, Jennifer. C. (2008). "Re-thinking Intersectionality." Feminist Review 89:1-15.

Newsome, Yvonne D. (2003). "Border patrol: The U.S. Customs Service and the Racial Profiling of African American Women." *Journal of African American Studies* 7(3):31-75.

New York Times. (2020). "How George Floyd Was Killed in Police Custody." Link: <a href="https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/31/us/george-floyd-investigation.html">https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/31/us/george-floyd-investigation.html</a>. Accessed on: 7 June 2020.

New York Times. (2020a). "Why Aren't We All Talking About Breonna Taylor?". Link: <a href="https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/04/us/breonna-taylor-black-lives-matter-women.html">https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/04/us/breonna-taylor-black-lives-matter-women.html</a> Accessed on 7 June 2020.

NOS. (2016). "Typhoon legt uit waarom hij 'blij' is dat hij staande werd gehouden". Link: <a href="https://nos.nl/op3/collectie/10852/artikel/2150689-typhoon-legt-je-uit-waarom-hij-blij-is-dat-hij-staande-werd-gehouden">https://nos.nl/op3/collectie/10852/artikel/2150689-typhoon-legt-je-uit-waarom-hij-blij-is-dat-hij-staande-werd-gehouden</a> Accessed on: 22 January 2020.

OneWorld. (2020). "Welke George Floyds kent Nederland?" Link: <a href="https://www.oneworld.nl/lezen/discriminatie/racisme/welke-george-floyds-kent-nederland/">https://www.oneworld.nl/lezen/discriminatie/racisme/welke-george-floyds-kent-nederland/</a> Accessed on: 7 June 2020.

Özdil, Zihni. (2014). " "Racism is an American Problem": Dutch Exceptionalism and its Politics of Denial." *Frame* 27(2):49-64.

Parent, Mike C., Cirleen DeBlaere, and Bonnie Moradi. (2013). "Approaches to Research on Intersectionality: Perspectives on Gender, LGBT, and Racial/Ethnic Identities." *Sex Roles* 68:639-645.

Partij voor de Vrijheid. (2017). "Concept verkiezingsprogramma 2017-2021". Link: <a href="https://www.pvv.nl/visie.html">https://www.pvv.nl/visie.html</a> Accessed on: 23 July 2020.

Ritchie, Andrea J. (2017). "Invisible No More: Police Violence Against Black Women and Women of Color." *Beacon Press.* 

Sharma, Sherri. (2003). "Beyond Driving While Black and Flying While Brown: Using Intersectionality to Uncover the Gendered Aspects of Racial Profiling." *Journal of Gender and Law* 12(2):275-309.

Slakoff, Danielle. C. (2019). "The representation of women and girls of color in United States crime news." *Sociology Compass.* 14: 1-13.

Van der Leun, Joanne P. and Maartje A.H. van der Woude. (2011). "Ethnic profiling in the Netherlands? A reflection on expanding preventive powers, ethnic profiling and a changing social and political context". *Policing & Society* 21(4): 444-455.

Voorn, Etchica. (2017). *Dubbelbloed*. Uitgeverij in de Knipscheer.

Weiner, Melissa F. (2014). "The Ideologically Colonized Metropole: Dutch Racism and Racist Denial." *Sociology Compass* 8/6:731-744.

Weitzer, Ronald, and Steven A. Tuch. (2002). "Perceptions of Racial Profiling: Race, Class, And Personal Experience." *Criminology* 40(2):435-456.

Welch, Kelly. (2007). "Black Criminal Stereotypes and Racial Profiling." *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice* 23(3):276-288.

# **Appendixes**

## Appendix 1 - Abstract in Dutch/Samenvatting

Since this research is done in the Netherlands and in Dutch, I will include the abstract translated in Dutch here.

Etnisch profileren is één van de vormen van geïnstitutionaliseerd racisme in Nederland. Het wordt gedefinieerd als het aangehouden of gearresteerd worden door veiligheidsactoren, zoals de politie, douane en private beveiligers, op basis van etniciteit. Publieke en academische debatten over etnisch profileren worden gedomineerd door de ervaringen van mannen. Echter, als we etnisch profileren volledig willen begrijpen, moeten ook de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur opgenomen worden in het debat.

Het doel van deze thesis is om de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur in Nederland te verzamelen en te analyseren. Het is niet mijn doel om simpelweg een lijst te maken met deze ervaringen, maar om te begrijpen hoe etnisch profileren eruit ziet door te erkennen hoe gender en etniciteit, zowel als andere identiteitscategorieën, elkaar kruisen. Om dit te doen, heb ik 'intersectionaliteit' als analytisch kader gebruikt. Het gaat hierbij niet alleen om hoe verschillende identiteitscategorieën elkaar kruisen en beïnvloeden, maar vooral om de uitkomst van deze interactie in machtsverhoudingen.

Door het doen van semigestructureerde interviews, heb ik een breed scala aan ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur met etnisch profileren verzameld. Deze ervaringen laten zien hoe vrouwen van kleur worden gemarginaliseerd in de context van etnisch profileren. Deze ervaringen worden beïnvloed door de intersectionele stereotype ideeën van de vrouwelijkheid van zwarte vrouwen, de vrouwelijkheid van Midden Oosterse vrouwen en de vrouwelijkheid van Aziatische vrouwen. Dus, deze ervaringen voelden niet alleen beïnvloed door het *van kleur* zijn, maar vooral door het zijn van *vrouw van kleur*. De ervaringen van deze vrouwen kunnen niet worden gegeneraliseerd omdat verschillende etnische groepen en andere identiteitscategorieën de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur verschillend beïnvloeden.

Kortom, het debat rondom etnisch profileren is alleen inclusief en allesomvattend als een intersectionele manier van denken over de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur wordt meegenomen.

## Appendix 2 - Interview guide

Here, I will present the interview guide I have worked with. I both present the questions in English and Dutch. All interviews were done in Dutch.

This interview guide has evolved during the research. Not every interview followed this line of questions, but it does give an idea of how I have approached the interviews.

# **Introducing questions**

 Tell something about myself and this interview. Stress that if they do not feel comfortable, they can refuse to answer a question and stop the interview at any time.

Vertel wat over mijzelf en over het verloop van het interview. Benadruk dat als ze zich niet comfortabel voelen, ze geen antwoord hoeven te geven op de vraag en het interview elk moment kunnen stopzetten.

- Ask for permission to record the interview.
   Vraag om toestemming voor het opnemen van het interview.
- Ask them to tell something about themselves.
   Wilt u wat over uzelf vertellen?
- Ask if they have any questions about me or the research. *Voordat ik u vragen ga stellen, heeft u nog vragen voor mij?*

## Questions about ethnic profiling

- How would you define ethnic profiling?
   Wat verstaat u onder etnisch profileren?
- Give your definition. *Geef mijn definitie.*
- If you think about ethnic profiling, could you give an example of a situation you have been in?
  - Als u denkt aan etnisch profileren, kunt u dan een voorbeeld geven van een situatie?
- How did you feel in these situations?
   Hoe voelde u zich daarbij?

## Questions about social identities

- How would you identify as?Hoe zou u uzelf identificeren?
- How would others identify you?Hoe zouden andere u identificeren?
- Is there a difference in how others would perceive you and how you see yourself?
   What is the difference?
  - Is er een verschil in hoe anderen u zien en hoe u uzelf ziet? Wat is het verschil?
- What is the reason, according to you, that others would identify you differently than you would yourself?
  - Wat is de reden, denkt u, dat anderen u anders zouden identificeren dan u uzelf zou identificeren?

## Questions about both social identities and ethnic profiling

- If we look back at the cases in which you felt ethnically profiled, how do these identities come to the foreground?
  - Als we terug kijken naar de gevallen waarin u etnisch bent geprofileerd, hoe komen uw identiteiten naar voren in dat geval?
- What identities did the security actors emphasize on?
   Welke identiteiten werden benadrukt door de veiligheidsactoren in uw geval?
- Are these identities important to you?
   Zijn deze identiteiten belangrijk voor u?
- What identities become less important in the context of ethnic profiling?
   Welke identiteiten worden minder belangrijk in de context van etnisch profileren?

#### **Concluding questions**

- Are there any other things you would like to discuss?
   Zijn er nog andere dingen die u wilt bespreken?
- How did you feel answering these questions?
   Hoe voelde u zich bij het beantwoorden van deze vragen?
- Do you have any questions for me?Heeft u nog vragen voor mij?
- Do you know any other women who would like to participate in this research?

Kent u nog vrouwen die graag zouden willen meewerken aan dit onderzoek?

# **Appendix 3 - Original quotes**

I find it important to present the original Dutch quotes I have translated into English in this thesis. In translation, some meaning gets lost. These translations are a product of my own, while the 'raw quotes' could give more or other insights into what the women of color themselves meant. For the short quotes, I have put the translations into footnotes. For the bigger quotes, I put the translations in this Appendix.

# Footnote 31 - quote Ava

"In Den Haag rijden, dat is echt een kriem. Want er zijn allerlei straatjes die zijn afgesloten, één richting en weet ik het. Het veranderd ook nog eens elke maand. Dus, ik ging daar zo een beetje binnendoor, toen had ik al gezien dat er verderop een controle stond, met de politie met een blaastest.

Ik sloeg net af, waarschijnlijk dachten ze van "oh, die persoon, die heeft gezien dat wij hier staan en die gaat nu afslaan", weet je wel. Want die wil niet blazen. Gok ik hé, dat ze dat zo gedacht hadden.

Maar ja, ik ben iemand, ik drink eigenlijk geen alcohol. Maar oké, dat weten zij natuurlijk niet. Ik weet ook niet of ze op dat moment al konden zien dat ik zwart was of niet. Maar in ieder geval, ze kwamen dus achter me aan, een motoragent. En die kwam naast mij rijden en eh, die zei van "volg mij." Maar hij ging dus het eerste en het beste straatje in, maar dat straatje was mega smal. Dus ik ging dat straatje niet in, ik nam de volgende, om weer achter hem terecht te kunnen komen zeg maar. Maar hij dacht, ik weet niet, waarschijnlijk dacht hij dat ik wilde vluchten of weet ik veel wat. Maar dat kon helemaal niet, omdat, je kon geen andere kant op, met de auto in ieder geval niet.

Dus, daarna was hij niet blij. En toen ben ik achter hem aan gereden naar dat blaas gebeuren, en nou en toen was de motoagent super onbeschoft. En hij zei: "Ja en ik zei nog tegen je dat je achter mij aan moest rijden." Hij ging helemaal te keer, dus toen heb ik hem gezegd van ja, dat straatje is super smal, jij kan daar met je motor doorheen. Vanaf dat moment was hij gewoon niet meer voor reden vatbaar. En ja, ik werd toen ook geïrriteerd.

En zijn collega ging toen die blaastest doen. En natuurlijk kwam er niets uit, want ik drink eigenlijk nooit. Maar ze vonden dat ze mij ergens op moesten pakken, dus hebben ze er toen echt zo'n boekje bij gepakt en daar werd in gezocht van welke overtreding ze mij zouden kunnen bekeuren. Toen hebben ze een overtreding gevonden, van dat ik zijn order niet heb opgevolgd. En toen kreeg ik een boete van 150 euro."

#### Footnote 35 – quote Kyana

"Ik heb ooit een keer meegemaakt dat ik in een café kwam, waar ik echt al jaren over de vloer kwam, maar er was toen een andere uitsmijter dan normaal. En ik zag al dat hij bij binnenkomst tegen iedereen supervriendelijk deed, maar toen ik aankwam, dat was tijdens carnaval, deed hij meteen al best wel naar. Hij zei: "ja eh, mag je wel naar binnen?". Dus ik zeg "ja?", "Mag ik je ID zien?" "Ja, dat kan." Ik had toen eigenlijk al best een raar gevoel.

Maar toen was ik mijn bankpasje kwijtgeraakt in het café, waar ik echt al vier uur lang was of zo, en de uitsmijter had mij al meerdere keren voorbij zien komen. Dus ik zei van: "goh, ik ren even snel op en neer naar huis om contant geld te halen want ik ben mijn bankpasje binnen kwijtgeraakt." Daar reageerde hij niet echt op, maar je mag daar naar binnen tot 3 uur.

Toen kwam ik terug, precies één over 3, en toen zei hij: "ja, je mag niet naar binnen." Ik zeg "huh, dat is raar, want ik zei net nog dat ik even snel op en neer ga. Het is één over 3, ik ben gewoon een paar seconde te laat." "Nee, nee, gaat hem niet worden, je gaat echt niet naar binnen." Dus ik was best wel geïrriteerd, maar ik dacht, ik laat het zitten, het is nog maar een uur.

Toen kwamen er twee, drie dames voorbij lopen, blonde haren, blauwe ogen, waar hij super lief tegen deed en die mochten toen wel naar binnen. En toen zei ik: "Ik vind jou echt een klootzak." Toen werd ik in een houdgreep gehouden tegen de muur aan en hij belde de politie. Hij had een melding gemaakt dat ik hem had beledigd, heb geslagen en hem heb uitgescholden. En van de politie moest ik het centrum verlaten."

#### Footnote 36 - excerpt from vignette Sylvana

"Sylvana vertelt mij over haar ervaringen met de politie. Zij zijn meerdere malen betrokken geweest bij conflicten tussen Sylvana en haar onderbuurvrouw. De onderbuurvrouw was altijd aan het klagen vanwege de geluidsoverlast die werd veroorzaakt door de vloer van Sylvana's appartement. De woningbouw was verantwoordelijk voor de vloer.

Toen kreeg ze een bericht van de woningbouw, dat ze de vloer eruit moest halen, omdat de vloer niet goed was. Maar er moesten geluidsmetingen plaatsvinden dus mocht ze ook nog geen nieuwe vloer kopen. Dit was op het moment dat ze een werkende moeder van een tweeling was, maar ze was ook zwanger van haar derde kindje terwijl ze dat niet wist. Kortom, een uitputtende en heftige situatie om in te zitten.

Op het moment dat Sylvana de vloer uit de woonkamer heeft gehaald, komt de politie weer aan de deur en komt deze keer ook binnen. Het was een politieagente die al een keer eerder aan de deur heeft gestaan, maar toen niet binnen is gekomen. Nu komt ze wel binnen, Sylvana legt uit dat op dat moment de vloer eruit lach en ze ook achterstallig huishoudwerk had. Ze was namelijk een werkende moeder van een tweeling en had simpelweg nog geen tijd gehad om iets in het huishouden te doen. De politieagente vond het een rotzooi. Ze zei: "Ik zou hier niet met mijn kinderen wonen, ik zou ergens anders naar toe gaan." Sylvana raakte een beetje geïrriteerd en zegt: "ik niet."

De politieagente gaat weg en zegt dat de wijkagent nog wel langs zal sturen om te kijken of alles nog goed gaat. Geen twee uur later ging de deurbel weer, deze keer stond Crisisdienst Jeugdzorg voor de deur en niet de wijkagent zoals de politieagente had gezegd. Jeugdzorg zegt: "De kinderen moeten hier weg." Sylvana werd gedwongen om iemand te bellen waar de kinderen naar toe konden."

## Footnote 39 - excerpt from vignette Sylvana

"Omdat het geen natuurlijk dood was van de baby, moest er een autopsie gedaan worden en mag je niet zomaar begraven of cremeren. De eerste rechercheur heeft het gelaten voor wat het is en Sylvana kreeg toestemming om de baby te cremeren. Op de camerabeelden van de kinderopvang waar het is gebeurd, was te zien hoe Sylvana erachter kwam dat haar baby niet meer ademde. De dokters in het ziekenhuis hebben benadrukt dat wel meer ouders ongelukken krijgen met hun kinderen.

Toen kwam er een nieuwe wijkagent, die Sylvana vertrouwt, het nieuws brengen dat een nieuwe rechercheur de draagzak wilde hebben waarin de baby is overleden. Ook moest Sylvana iets ondertekenen om toestemming te geven dat ze werd onderzocht. Op een dag komt de wijkagent weer, hij brengt haar een nieuw document waarin staat dat ze wordt opgeroepen voor verhoor, "in verband met de zware mishandeling van [naam baby]". In 2019 is Sylvana verhoord, maar dit loopt nog steeds. Het blijkt dat de zaak niet eens uitgetypt bij het openbaar ministerie is aangekomen, terwijl het verhoor al een jaar geleden was."

#### Footnote 40 - quote Catharina

"Bij de douane ben ik zeker een keer uit de rij gehaald, dat vond ik zo vreemd. Want je gaat inchecken, en dan kan je ook zelfstandig inchecken. En ik keek zo om mij heen, van wie staan er allemaal in de rij, en ik was inderdaad de enige zwarte. En vrouw. Mijn man

is een witte man, dus die ging voor mij en alles ging goed.

En toen was het mijn beurt. Het lukte me niet om in te checken. En ik werd een beetje geïrriteerd en zenuwachtig, want die andere mensen moesten ook hun vliegtuig halen. Dus ik stond daar, en ik zeg: "Wat is er aan de hand?". Toen kwam er eentje van achter de balie naar mij toe en zei: "Mevrouw, wilt u even hierheen komen?". En toen werd ik in het bijzijn van iedereen uit de rij gehaald.

Ze hebben mijn paspoort genomen, alles bekeken. En toen zei ik: "Ik ben geen crimineel hoor. Je mag alles na gaan, jullie kunnen alles na gaan." En toen zeiden ze: "Nee mevrouw, alles is goed." Dus ik zeg: "Maar wacht eens even, waarom halen jullie mij uit de rij?". En toen zei een jongeman, een hele jonge vent, hij zegt tegen mij: "Mevrouw, uw achternaam is Bashara. En Bashara, die naam is al een risico."

## Footnote 41 - quote Yasmin

"Een week later, was er de aanval. Nou ja dat heb je waarschijnlijk meegekregen, tussen Iran en Amerika. Waardoor een generaal van Iran is vermoord. En wij zouden, de dag erna of twee dagen erna, gaan vliegen. Dus toen kreeg ik al een beetje vraagtekens van nou, zal ik misschien problemen krijgen hierdoor? Maar het was meer op een grappende wijze.

Dus, ik met mijn goede gedrag, alle research gedaan, naar de airport met mijn visum, nou ja, ESTA. Net zoals mijn twee vriendinnen, en een paspoort. We zijn langs de douane geweest, dus paspoortcontrole gehad. Ik zeg nog tegen mijn vriendinnen: "Hé, nou, nu zijn we er langs."

Komen we bij de boarding, zijn wij aan de beurt. Mijn vriendinnen waren voor dus die lopen er langs. En mijn paspoort wordt gecontroleerd, ik loop er langs, maar één van de stewardessen zei: "Nee, nee, nee. Zij moet terug." Ze zegt dat de United States Customs and Border Protection nog een aantal aanvullende vragen voor mij heeft. Ik moest wachten.

Ruim een kwartier later, kwamen er drie Amerikaanse mannen naar mij toe. En ter plekke, waar iedereen bij was, ging één van hen mij allemaal vragen stellen. Hij zei: "paspoort?" En hij pakt mijn paspoort uit mijn handen en maakte gelijk al een foto. Terwijl iedereen aan het boarden was, ging hij gewoon vragen stellen. Hardop, waar iedereen bij stond. Zo van, "wie ben je, waar kom je vandaan", eigenlijk een soort van interview die ik al had gehad voor de visum aanvraag, maar dan ter plekke daar. En best wel op een intimiderende toon.

Maar toen kwam er een stewardess naar ons toe van: "We zijn klaar met boarden, moet ik haar koffer eruit halen?" En op dat moment dacht ik echt van: "Wacht, wat?" Dus zij kijken elkaar aan, en hij zegt: "Yes, she is not allowed to board." Zo van, haal haar spullen eruit. En op dat moment viel het kwartje."

## Footnote 44 - quote Sam

"Ja, sowieso als personeel van een horecaonderneming wordt er per direct gevraagd naar je legitimatie. En dan is het zo dat ze er naar kijken of je legaal werkt of niet. Achteraf, is het zeg maar ook dat de AIVD betrokken wordt om te kijken of er sprake is van mensenhandel.

Dan komen ze eerst gewoon met politie en dan komen ze binnen. Dan is het in het begin best wel netjes, ze kloppen aan en vragen naar legitimatie. Maar wat je dan ziet is de hoeveelheid mensen die ze hebben meegenomen, dat je denkt 'jezus, ik ben hier geen drugshandel aan het ondernemen of zo'."

# **Appendix 4 - Summary in English**

This summary of the thesis is a more elaborate one than the abstract and consists of a combination of all chapter summaries. I decided to make this summary since I wanted to include a Dutch summary for the women I have interviewed next to other native Dutch speakers that are interested in this research. See Appendix 5 for the Dutch translation.

# Research topic and puzzle

In the Netherlands, institutionalized racism is normalized and under-researched (Özdil 2014, 60). Nevertheless, it does prove to be a big part of the lives of ethnic minorities living in the Netherlands (El-Tayeb 2011; Weiner 2017, 734). Accordingly, I am interested in one of the manifestations of institutionalized racism in the Netherlands: ethnic profiling.

Ethnic profiling is the practice of being arrested or stopped based on the idea that people from certain ethnic groups "are more likely to commit a particular crime" (Sharma 2003, 276). In this research, I have analyzed the experiences of women who are ethnically profiled by security officials. I did not aim to find an objective reality.

Within academic and public discourses relating to police violence and ethnic profiling, there is a focus on the experiences of men. This focus results in the conceptualization solely based on these experiences. With this research, I have aimed to incorporate the experiences of women of color with ethnic profiling to get a better and more inclusive understanding of the phenomenon.

To effectively incorporate women's experiences in the understanding of ethnic profiling, I used intersectionality as my analytical frame. Intersectionality has its origins in researching black women, drawing on their experiences as both 'racialized' and 'gendered' (Davis 2008, 71). In short, intersectionality helps us to understand intersecting identity categories and the subordination that comes with it (Crenshaw 1989, 40), creating inequalities (Collins 2015, 2). In this research, I focus on ethnic and gender identity, but I did incorporate other identity categories. This brings us to the research puzzle of this thesis:

How do intersectional identity categories shape the specific experiences of different Dutch women of color of ethnic profiling by security officials in the Netherlands in the period from 2010 to 2020?

#### **Empirical findings**

In order to incorporate the experiences of women of color, I have done 14 interviews with women of color. I have made use of semi-structured interviewing to capture a wide variety of experiences of ethnic profiling.

In this thesis, I have divided the empirical findings into two main themes: identity categories and the experiences of everyday racism and experiences of ethnic profiling.

#### Identity categories and experiences of everyday racism

Women I have interviewed identify as 'double-blooded', Surinamese, Djiboutian and Ethiopian, Somalian, Aruban, Chinese, Turkish, Moroccan, Iranian, and black. Besides, almost all women identified as Dutch or part Dutch. These ethnic identities seem to be symbolically important. However, looking at the political aspects of these women's identities, some of them argued that they are not perceived as Dutch buy others. Furthermore, the women argued that in the context of ethnic profiling and other forms of racism, the non-white identity and the complexion of skin tone becomes relevant.

Besides, generally speaking, these women identify as cisgender, meaning they identify with the sex they were born with. Some women argued that being a woman comes with perceptions of being less of a threat. However, in academic literature, it is argued that the womanhood of women of color is masculinized through stereotypical ideas (Newsome 2003, 35), which makes women of color perceived as less worthy of protection (Ritchie 2017, 62).

Furthermore, other social identities relating to, for example, religion, sexuality, class, and last names, also seemed important in these women's identities.

Relating to these identities, I discussed the experiences of everyday racism of these women. Examples of these experiences are being complimented on the ability to speak Dutch, having to accept racist jokes, being discriminated against when applying for jobs, and the difficulty of discussing racism with white Dutch people. Looking at these experiences, it shows the socialized attitudes and behaviors towards these women of color.

#### Experiences of ethnic profiling

Moreover, I have analyzed the experiences of these women of color with ethnic profiling. To analyze these experiences, I have made use of stereotypes. I want to stress here that I do not believe these stereotypes are the 'truth.' However, stereotypes do show us how

women of color can be perceived by others, for example, by security actors.

First, the experiences of black women I interviewed, show how they felt perceived as criminally inclined (Newsome 2003, 34) when Ava was fined, even though she passed the alcohol test. Ava, Ashley, and Catharina talked about how they felt perceived as drug addicts (Sharma 2003, 287) when Customs officials checked their afros and dreads for drugs. Furthermore, Sylvana felt portrayed as a neglectful, incompetent mother (Newsome 2003, 37-38), when she was accused of abusing her child by a detective.

Second, the experiences of women who are Muslim or Middle Eastern felt influenced by the stereotype of them having terrorist affiliations (Slakoff 2019, 5), in the context of the War on Terror (Ritchie 2017, 91-92). Catharina and Yasmin felt this influenced how they were treated at the airports. Catharina was drawn out of the queue, and Yasmin was denied to board her flight.

Third, a Dutch Chinese woman, Sam, felt her experiences were influenced by the stereotype of Asian women being involved in human trafficking, sex trafficking specifically. Because of this, she feels she is regularly checked for her ID by the police.

#### Conclusion

As you can conclude, the identity categories in which women of color are subordinated work as "intrinsically negative frameworks in which social power works to exclude or marginalize" (Crenshaw 1991, 1241) these women in the context of ethnic profiling.

I have shown this by connecting stereotypes of intersectional identity categories to these experiences. Important here is that these stereotypes do not only draw on 'ethnicity' but also on 'gender.' For example, when Sylvana was accused of abusing her baby, she felt not only her motherhood mattered but, moreover, her *black* motherhood. Another example is that of Sam, feeling being checked not only because she is Chinese, but because she is a Chinese *woman*. Moreover, the intersectional stereotypes of black women, Middle Eastern and/or Islamic women, and Asian women influence how these women are perceived and how security officials react to them. Furthermore, the experiences of women of color cannot be generalized because many different intersectional identity categories are at play, as can be concluded by the variety of experiences I have analyzed in this research.

To conclude, I want to stress that we need to continually learn about neglected

minorities. This is not only important to fully understand the phenomena we aim to research, but also to create equal and inclusive academic spheres.

# **Appendix 5 - Summary in Dutch**

In deze bijlage heb ik een samenvatting toegevoegd van de thesis in het Nederlands. Ik vond dit belangrijk, zodat de vrouwen die ik heb geïnterviewd het onderzoek goed kunnen begrijpen in de taal die ze het beste spreken. Daarnaast is deze samenvatting ook voor andere Nederlandssprekenden die geïnteresseerd zijn in dit onderzoek.

## Onderzoeksonderwerp en vraag

Zoals Özdil (2014, 60) beargumenteerd, is in Nederland racisme geïnstitutionaliseerd en hiermee genormaliseerd, waardoor er onvoldoende onderzoek naar wordt gedaan. Desalniettemin blijkt racisme een groot onderdeel uit te maken van het leven van etnische minderheden in Nederland (El-Tayeb 2011; Weiner 2017, 734). Ik ben dan ook geïnteresseerd in één van de vormen van geïnstitutionaliseerd racisme in Nederland: etnisch profileren.

Etnisch profileren wordt gedefinieerd als het staande gehouden worden op basis van etniciteit. Hierbij bestaat het idee dat bepaalde etnische groepen meer geneigd zijn om misdaden te plegen (Sharma 2003, 276). Binnen academische en publieke debatten over politiegeweld en etnisch profileren, is er vaak alleen aandacht voor de ervaringen van mannen. Deze focus resulteert in de conceptualisering van etnisch profileren, uitsluitend gebaseerd op deze ervaringen. Met dit onderzoek is mijn doel om de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur te integreren in het debat over etnisch profileren om zo een beter en meer inclusief begrip te krijgen van dit fenomeen.

Om de ervaringen van vrouwen effectief te integreren in het begrijpen van etnisch profileren, gebruik ik intersectionaliteit als mijn analytisch kader. Intersectionaliteit vindt zijn oorsprong in het onderzoeken van zwarte vrouwen. Hierbij benadrukt wordt dat hun ervaringen beiden 'geracialiseerd' en 'gendered' zijn (Davis 2008, 71). Kortom, intersectionaliteit helpt ons om te begrijpen hoe identiteitscategorieën, zoals etniciteit en gender, met elkaar kruisen, om de daarmee samenhangende ondergeschiktheid te begrijpen (Crenshaw 1989, 40). Door deze samenhangende ondergeschiktheid ontstaan ongelijkheden (Collins 2015, 2).

In dit onderzoek richt ik mij op etnische en genderidentiteit. Daarnaast heb ik ook rekening gehouden met andere identiteitscategorieën, wat later duidelijker wordt. Dit brengt ons tot de onderzoeksvraag van deze scriptie:

Hoe geven intersectionele identiteitscategorieën vorm aan de specifieke ervaringen van verschillende Nederlandse vrouwen van kleur met etnisch profileren door veiligheidsactoren in Nederland, in de periode van 2010 tot 2020?

## **Empirische bevindingen**

Tijdens het onderzoek heb ik 14 interviews gedaan met vrouwen van kleur. Ik heb gebruik gemaakt van semigestructureerde interviews om een breed scala aan ervaringen met etnisch profileren te verzamelen.

In de thesis heb ik de empirische bevindingen onderverdeeld in twee hoofdthema's: identiteitscategorieën en de ervaringen van alledaagse racisme, en ervaringen met etnisch profileren.

#### Identiteitscategorieën en alledaags racisme

Vrouwen die ik heb geïnterviewd, identificeren zich als dubbelbloed, Surinaams, Djiboutiaans en Ethiopisch, Somalisch, Arubaans, Chinees, Turks, Marokkaans, Iraans en zwart. Daarnaast identificeren alle vrouwen zich als Nederlands of gedeeltelijk Nederlands. Deze etnische identiteiten zijn van symbolische waarde voor deze vrouwen. Maar, kijkend naar de politieke aspecten van de etnische identiteiten van deze vrouwen, beweerden sommige van deze vrouwen dat ze niet als Nederlanders worden gezien door anderen. Bovendien beargumenteerden de vrouwen dat, in de context van etnisch profileren en andere vormen van racisme, de niet-witte identiteit en de donkerheid van je huidskleur als relevant bevonden worden.

Kijkend naar de genderidentiteit, identificeren de vrouwen zich over het algemeen as cis-gender. Dit betekent dat ze zich identificeren met het geslacht waarmee ze zijn geboren. Een aantal vrouwen beargumenteerde dat het vrouw-zijn komt met het idee dat ze minder bedreigend zijn. In de academische literatuur over de vrouwelijkheid van vrouwen van kleur wordt echter beweerd dat deze vrouwelijkheid wordt beïnvloed door stereotiepe ideeën van vrouwen van kleur als mannelijk (Newsome 2003, 35), waardoor vrouwen van kleur als minder waardig voor bescherming worden beschouwd (Ritchie 2017, 62).

Andere sociale identiteiten, zoals religie, seksualiteit, klasse en achternaam, bleken ook belangrijk voor de identiteit van deze vrouwen en voor de ervaringen die zij mij later vertelden.

Met betrekking tot deze identiteiten, besprak ik de ervaringen van deze vrouwen

met alledaags racisme. Voorbeelden van deze ervaringen zijn het gecomplimenteerd worden op het spreken van goed Nederlands, racistische grappen te moeten accepteren, gediscrimineerd worden bij het solliciteren en de moeilijkheid om racisme te bespreken met witte Nederlanders.

Kijkend naar deze ervaringen, zien we de gesocialiseerde houdingen en gedragingen tegenover deze vrouwen van kleur.

#### Ervaringen met etnisch profileren

Naast de ervaringen met alledaags racisme, heb ik natuurlijk ook de ervaringen met etnisch profileren<sup>46</sup> besproken met de vrouwen. Om deze ervaringen te kunnen analyseren met de ondergeschiktheid die bij de intersectionele identiteitscategorieën van deze vrouwen behoren, heb ik gebruik gemaakt van stereotype beelden. Ik wil hier echter benadrukken dat ik niet geloof dat deze stereotype beelden 'de waarheid' presenteren, maar deze beelden laten wel zien hoe vrouwen van kleur waargenomen kunnen worden door anderen, waaronder veiligheidsactoren.

Ten eerste laten de ervaringen van zwarte vrouwen zien hoe zij zich als crimineel-gemaakt voelen (Newsome 2003, 34), wanneer Ava staande wordt gehouden en een boete krijgt terwijl de blaastest, waar het in eerste instantie om ging, negatief was. Ava, Ashley en Catharina hebben het over hoe ze zich als drugsverslaafden voelden neergezet (Sharma 2003, 287), toen hun afros en dreads werden gecontroleerd door de douane. Ten slotte vond Sylvana dat ze werd geportretteerd als nalatige, incompetente moeder (Newsome 2003, 37-38) toen ze werd beschuldigd van misbruik van haar eigen kind door een rechercheur.

Ten tweede lieten de ervaringen van moslim- of Midden-Oosterse vrouwen zien dat zij beïnvloed werden door het stereotype dat zij terroristische banden zouden hebben (Slakoff 2019, 5). Catharina en Yasmin waren van mening dat dit van invloed was op de manier waarop zij op de luchthavens werden behandeld, waarbij Catharina uit de rij werd gehaald en Yasmin tot haar vlucht werd geweigerd.

Ten derde voelde een Nederlandse Chinese vrouw, Sam, dat haar ervaringen werden beïnvloed door het stereotype van Aziatische vrouwen dat zij betrokken zijn bij mensenhandel, in het bijzonder sekshandel. Hierdoor voelt Sam dat er naar dit

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> De uitgewerkte ervaringen zijn in mijn thesis te vinden. De Nederlandse quotes van deze ervaringen worden in de voetnoten en in Appendix 3 gepresenteerd.

stereotype wordt gehandeld, wanneer zij voor de zoveelste keer een identiteitscheck krijgt door de politie.

#### Conclusie

Zoals we hieruit kunnen concluderen, werken de identiteitscategorieën waarin vrouwen van kleur ondergeschikt worden als intrinsieke negatieve kaders waarin sociale macht werkt om deze vrouwen uit te sluiten of te marginaliseren (Crenshaw 1991, 1241) in het kader van etnisch profileren.

Ik heb dit aangetoond door stereotypen van intersectionele identiteitscategorieën aan de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur te koppelen. Belangrijk hierbij is dat deze stereotypen niet alleen gebaseerd zijn op 'etniciteit', maar ook op 'gender'. Toen Sylvana bijvoorbeeld werd beschuldigd van misbruik van haar baby, voelde ze niet alleen dat haar moederschap er toe deed, maar vooral haar *zwarte* moederschap. Een ander voorbeeld is dat van Sam, die zich niet alleen gecontroleerd voelt omdat ze Chinees is, maar omdat ze een Chinese *vrouw* is. Zo voelde het voor elke vrouw in dit onderzoek dat deze intersectionele stereotypen over de vrouwelijkheid van zwarte vrouwen, de vrouwelijkheid van vrouwen uit het Midden Oosten en Islamitische vrouwen en de vrouwelijkheid van Aziatische vrouwen, hun ervaringen hebben beïnvloed.

Daarnaast kunnen de ervaringen van vrouwen van kleur niet worden gegeneraliseerd, vanwege de verschillende identiteitscategorieën en de daarbij horende verscheidenheid aan ervaringen die ik in dit onderzoek heb geanalyseerd.

Tot slot wil ik benadrukken dat we voortdurend moeten leren over minderheden die niet gehoord worden. Dit is niet alleen belangrijk om de fenomenen die we willen onderzoeken volledig te begrijpen, maar ook om gelijke en inclusieve academische en publieke sferen te creëren.

# **Appendix 6 - Plagiarism Declaration**

# Declaration of Originality/Plagiarism Declaration MA Thesis in Conflict Studies & Human Rights Utrecht University

(course module GKMV 16028)

# I hereby declare:

- that the content of this submission is entirely my own work, except for quotations from published and unpublished sources. These are clearly indicated and acknowledged as such, with a reference to their sources provided in the thesis text, and a full reference provided in the bibliography;
- that the sources of all paraphrased texts, pictures, maps, or other illustrations not resulting from my own experimentation, observation, or data collection have been correctly referenced in the thesis, and in the bibliography;
- that this Master of Arts thesis in Conflict Studies & Human Rights does not contain material from unreferenced external sources (including the work of other students, academic personnel, or professional agencies);
- that this thesis, in whole or in part, has never been submitted elsewhere for academic credit;
- that I have read and understood Utrecht University's definition of plagiarism, as stated on the University's information website on "Fraud and Plagiarism":

"Plagiarism is the appropriation of another author's works, thoughts, or ideas and the representation of such as one's own work." (Emphasis added.)<sup>47</sup>

Similarly, the University of Cambridge defines "plagiarism" as " ... submitting as one's own work, irrespective of intent to deceive, that which derives in part or in its entirety from the work of others without due acknowledgement. It is both poor scholarship and a breach of academic integrity." (Emphasis added.)<sup>48</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> https://students.uu.nl/en/practical-information/policies-and-procedures/fraud-and-plagiarism

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> http://www.plagiarism.admin.cam.ac.uk/what-plagiarism/universitys-definition-plagiarism

- that I am aware of the sanction applied by the Examination Committee when instances of plagiarism have been detected;
- that I am aware that every effort will be made to detect plagiarism in my thesis, including the standard use of plagiarism detection software such as Turnitin.

Name and Surname of Student:

#### **Sharon Chamman**

Title of MA thesis in Conflict Studies & Human Rights:

The Importance of Intersectionality: Experiences of Women of Color of Ethnic Profiling in the Netherlands

Signature	Date of Submission
	3 August 2020
Echammas.	