

**Nationalism and National Culture
in Indonesian Art Music and Performances (1900-2018):
Reflections from Postcolonial Perspectives**

Aniarani Andita
5837456

MA Thesis Musicology
Utrecht University

First Reader/Supervisor: Dr. Floris Schuiling
Second Reader: Dr. Barbara Titus

2018

ABSTRACT

Partha Chatterjee (1997) affirms that the attitude to modernity in formerly-colonized societies is always deeply ambiguous, because the modernity that the colonizers used as justification for colonialism also taught the colonized societies of its values. Indonesia is not an exception; having been colonized for centuries by a European nation, Indonesian nationalism arose from the desire for freedom from the colonizer. However, this nationalism, and the subsequent attempts for the creation of national culture has have always been replete with ambivalencies—with negotiations between the need to create a distinct national identity and the values of European cultures as imposed in the colonial time. This thesis looks at the discourses of nationalism, national culture, and national music in Indonesia since the beginning of the twentieth century to the present day, and examine its manifestations in the field of Indonesian art music and its performances by Indonesian symphony orchestras. I argue that these discourses and actions have always been embedded with a legacy of colonialism in the form of xenocentrism in its broad sense: the tendency among Indonesians to continue to concern about the Western others as they try to define their own identity and culture. Moreover, through case studies such as the compositions *Varia Ibukota* by Mochtar Embut and *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* by Arya Pugala Kitti, and the practices of contemporary symphony orchestras Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic, I employ postcolonial theories to view those works as reflections of the entanglement between colonial history and Indonesia-specific visions, as well as as endeavours to decolonize the knowledge of European classical music and performance form.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am forever grateful for my parents, whose love and support know no bounds. My endless gratitude also goes to the Bodegraven family (Anin, Elmer, Thaisa, and Senja), whose generosity in sharing their life and home with me is incredibly kind.

I thank my supervisor Dr. Floris Schuiling for his support, constructive feedbacks, and willingness to hear my thoughts, and Dr. Barbara Titus for being the second reader of this thesis.

I thank all the teaching staffs, especially Prof. Karl Kügle and Dr. Rebekah Ahrendt for their kind encouragement, and Dr. Olga Panteleeva, whose teaching has helped me greatly in knowing what I want to do in my research.

I am indebted to all the people I met during my research internship in Indonesia in 2017. Especially Erie Setiawan, Airin Efferin, and Addie MS, who showed me that there are many more things yet to be explored.

I am glad I could share the two years of the Master program with my classmates: Laura, Joeri, Joris. I very much value our friendships.

CONTENTS

Abstract
Acknowledgments
Contents

Introduction 1

Indonesia 1
Thesis Background 2
Thesis Objective and Research Questions 4
Approach and Theoretical Framework 5
Thesis Outline 6
Methods 8

Chapter 1 Under the Dutch and Japanese Rules (1900-1945): Early Conceptualization of Nationalism, National Culture, and National Music 9

The Rise of Indonesian Nationalism 10
National Culture and Art as Consequences of Anti-Imperial Nationalism 12
The Beginning of the Search for National Music 14
 European Classical Music Presence in the Dutch East Indies 15
 Ki Hadjar Dewantara's *Kinanthie Sandoong* and Music Education in *Taman Siswa* 20
 Indonesia Raya 21
 One Representation of Regional Music as the Basis for National Music 24
 European Classical Music as the Basis for National Music 26
Conclusion 27

Chapter 2 Under the Indonesian Regimes: The Old Order and the New Order (1945-1998) 29

National Culture Under the Regimes 30
 According to Sukarno and the Old Order 30
 According to the New Order 32
Continuation of European Classical Music as the Basis for National Music 34
 Orchestration of *Indonesia Raya* 34
 Lagu Seriosa 35
 Pasaribu, Dunga, and Manik 35
 Varia Ibukota by Mochtar Embut 36
The Emergence of Indonesian Contemporary Music (*Musik Kontemporer*) 39
Classical and Orchestral Music Performances 40
Conclusion 41

Chapter 3 Indonesia in the Reformation Era (1998-2018) 42

National Culture 43

Suvenir dari Minangkabau by Arya Pugala Kitti 45

Performances of Indonesian Symphony Orchestras: The Case Studies of Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic 47

Gita Bahana Nusantara 48

Jakarta City Philharmonic 54

The Complex Interrelationship Between Ethnicity and Participation in Indonesian Symphony Orchestras 56

The History of Tension and Discrimination Towards the Chinese Indonesians 56

The Implication to General Education and Music Education 59

The Implication to Participation in Indonesian Symphony Orchestras 61

Conclusion 61

Conclusion 63

Indonesian National Music: A Loosely-Defined and An Ongoing Venture 63

'Doing it Ourselves': Decolonizing European Classical Music? 64

Epistemic Disobedience in 'Domestic' Matters 67

Positioning My Contribution 68

Bibliography

List of Figures

INTRODUCTION

My argument is that because of the way in which the history of our modernity has been intertwined with the history of colonialism, we have never quite been able to believe that there exists a universal domain of free discourse, unfettered by differences of race or nationality. Somehow, from the very beginning, we have made a shrewd guess that (...) we would forever remain consumers of universal modernity; never would we be taken seriously as its producers. It is for this reason that we have tried, for over a hundred years, to take our eyes away from this chimera of universal modernity and clear a space where we might become the creators of our own modernity.

Partha Chatterjee, *Our Modernity*¹

Ours is the modernity of the once-colonized. The same historical process that has taught us the value of modernity has also made us the victims of modernity. Our attitude to modernity, therefore, cannot but be deeply ambiguous.

Partha Chatterjee, *Our Modernity*²

Indonesia is a large country with a long history of colonialism and myriads of political and cultural turmoils after the independence. Examining its history and its contemporary situation is difficult work. In this thesis, I look at a small partial of this highly-complex Indonesia. I focus on the history of the discourses of nationalism and national culture in Indonesia since the beginning of the twentieth century to the present day, and examine its manifestations in the field of Indonesian art music and its performances by Indonesian symphony orchestras. I am fully aware that in analyzing these discourses, I analyze the thoughts, ideas, and actions of only a small group of people in the urban centers of Indonesia. These people are the privileged: the intellectuals, the educated, the wealthy, the powerful, some of them came from noble families. Nevertheless, among the people within this group was also the people who ran the first lap of the nationalist movement, who formulated the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, who led a suppressive regime in the country for more than 30 years, and who, in the setting of post-colonial Indonesia, negotiate the legacy of colonialism and their nationalistic ideas through their works in Indonesian musical scene. Without disregarding the thoughts, ideas, and actions of Indonesians outside this small group, I contend that trying to understand Indonesia and its post-colonial society through this small aspect of Indonesia (music and music performance) and a small group in urban Indonesia is important. The quotations above by political philosopher Partha Chatterjee refer to post-colonial India, but they are perfectly apt to describe post-colonial Indonesia as illustrated in this thesis. This thesis shows that among those discourses of nationalism, national culture and national music in Indonesia, there are always ambiguities. As our nationalism sprang from the desire to liberate ourselves from the colonizer and their versions of modernity, until the present day, we continuously try to define our own modernity without forgetting our roots, but also without neglecting the modernity values that the colonizer had taught us.

Indonesia

Indonesia is a vast archipelago; it comprises of more than 13.000 islands. Its land and sea area is the sixteenth largest in the world, and its population is around 260 million people—the fourth largest in the

1 Partha Chatterjee, *Our Modernity* (Rotterdam/Dakar: South-South Exchange Programme for Research on the History of Development (SEPHIS) and the Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA), 1997), 14.

2 Chatterjee, *Our Modernity*, 20.

world. Of the 260 million people, more than half of them live in urban areas, which are concentrated on the islands of Java, Bali, and Sumatra. The people of Indonesia and the language they speak are highly diverse—there are more than 300 ethnic and language groups. However, around forty percent of the population are from the Javanese ethnic group, and more than 80 percent of the population are Muslims. Nonetheless, all of the Indonesians speak the official national language, Bahasa Indonesia. From around the eighth century to the sixteenth, the archipelago was the home of many ancient kingdoms, such as the kingdoms of Majapahit and Sriwijaya. These kingdoms traded with Chinese dynasties and Indian kingdoms, hence the people of the archipelago had been in contact with and absorbed various cultures, religions, and political models from outside the archipelago. In the seventeenth century, the Dutch East Indies trading company (*Verenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie/VOC*) was established in some trading posts in the archipelago. When VOC dissolved in the 1800s, the Dutch started to set up a colonial government which covered all across the archipelago, which was then called the Dutch East Indies. The Japanese occupied the archipelago briefly during the turmoil at the end of the Second World War. In 1945, Indonesia declared its independence as the Republic of Indonesia, although it was not until 1949 that the Dutch government acknowledged the independence. Since the independence, Indonesia has been led by 7 presidents, with Suharto (the second president) as the president with the longest time in office (31 years). Because of the country's extraordinary diversity, the official slogan of the Republic of Indonesia is *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, which means 'unity in diversity,' expresses the nation's desire to unite albeit its ethnic, religious, and cultural differences.

Thesis Background

I am an Indonesian. In many ways, I am a privileged Indonesian, and a part of the small group that I previously mentioned. I am well-educated and trained as a classical pianist; I finished my first university degree in Indonesia and continued to obtain another degree in music studies in Australia, and a master's degree in musicology in the Netherlands (which was completed by this thesis). My ethnicity is Javanese, hence I am a part of the ethnic majority in Indonesia. I grew up in Bandung and I lived and worked in Jakarta—two of the biggest cities in Java, the most developed island in the country. With regards of the history of colonialism in Indonesia, I certainly had always been aware of it, but I, as many other Indonesians, had never critically looked at the effects of that history to my everyday life, my knowledge, and my experience, including (and especially) my love for European classical music and musicology. It was not until my encounter with postcolonial theory at the start of my master study, that I started to question my love for classical music and musicology; of whether there was a coloniality of the idea of the supremacy of all things European embedded in that love. As Walter Mignolo puts it:

Coloniality of knowledge does not mean that knowledge was colonialized, but that hegemonic ways of knowing and disciplinary world-making, since the European renaissance, were instruments of colonialization and as a consequence, of colonialization of non-European knowledge.³

Indeed, among postcolonial studies' main critiques to European colonialism is in the problematic notion of progress and modernity (as the main legacy of the Enlightenment) embedded in it; in the coloniality of the notion that European's concept of modernity is the only and the universal concept.⁴ Within this

³ Walter Mignolo, "The Darker Side of the Enlightenment: A Decolonial Reading of Kant's *Geography*," in *Reading Kant's Geography*, eds. Stuart Elden and Eduardo Mendieta (New York: SUNY Press, 2011), 326.

⁴ See Mignolo, "The Darker Side of the Enlightenment," 329.

coloniality, the Europeans were the *humanitas*—the ones who control knowledge and therefore, superior, while the non-Europeans were seen as the *anthropos*/'uncivilized'/'backward', or the ones "who were not quite to the level of the *humanitas*."⁵ As a consequence, colonialism was given the mission to 'civilize'; the European colonizer imposed the superior status of European ideas, values, institutions, and culture to the colonized territories. One of these imposed 'civilized' cultures in the Dutch East Indies was European classical music. European classical music has been seen as the kind of music that could help achieve the Enlightenment's goal to discover the Self.⁶ Of the many genres of European classical music, the one that is deemed as the most important genre is the symphony. Stephen Cottrell writes of the symphony orchestra as "one of the great cultural achievements of European civilization."⁷ In non-Western countries, including Indonesia, European-modelled orchestras had been formed since the nineteenth century.⁸

The personal questioning, supported by those postcolonial critiques, drove me to think back to what I knew, from my own experience as an Indonesian, about European classical music in Indonesia. I had observed that European classical music is still being regarded as the 'higher' or more superior form of music in Indonesia, long after colonialism in Indonesia had ended. Indeed, as Nelson Maldonado-Torres posits, coloniality, still can be very much on-going even if colonization has ended.⁹ In the case of the symphony orchestra, I had noticed that Twilite Orchestra, an Indonesian professional symphony orchestra based in Jakarta, often held performances of Indonesian folk songs and national songs that were rearranged for a symphony orchestra. I assumed that there was a degree of xenocentrism in this (as one of the legacies of colonialism), in the way that they intended to 'elevate' the songs to the level of symphonic music as the more 'exclusive' and sophisticated form of music. At the time, I took xenocentrism in its narrow sense—as a belief that other's cultures, particularly European/Western cultures, are better than all others, including one's own.¹⁰ I then carried out a research internship with Twilite Orchestra and Bandung Philharmonic in July to November 2017 to investigate the matter further, and to explore the intercultural interactions between European and local cultures and knowledge occurring in the orchestras.

Among the most important findings of the internship are:

- (i) Xenocentrism was not palpable. All of the respondents were aware of the fact that symphony orchestra and classical music are European cultural heritage, but they stated that they do not regard it as superior to other kinds of music, including and especially Indonesian music. They also do not think that the mixing of Indonesian music and symphony orchestra as signifying that Indonesian music is not good enough, or needs to be 'elevated' to a European music form. The mixing is seen as an inevitable impact of globalization. Therefore, they think it is also no longer relevant to look at a form of culture based on its geographic origin.

5 Mignolo, "The Darker Side of the Enlightenment," 326.

6 Lawrence Kramer, *Why Classical Music Still Matters* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 20-21.

7 Stephen Cottrell, "The Future of the Orchestra," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra*, ed. Colin Lawson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 251.

8 Tim Carter and Erik Levi, "The History of the Orchestra," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra*, ed. Colin Lawson (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2003), 18.

9 See Nelson Maldonado-Torres, "Outline of Ten Theses on Coloniality and Decoloniality," 10.

<http://frantzfanonfoundation-fondationfrantzfanon.com/article2360.html>.

10 Jeremy Wallach, "Exploring Class, Nation, and Xenocentrism in Indonesian Cassette Retail Outlets," *Indonesia* 74 (2002): 82. doi: <https://doi.org/10.2307/3351527>.

- (ii) Nationalism was still strongly shown by many of the respondents. They were determined to contribute to the country through their involvement in the Indonesian music scene.
- (iii) The orchestras are *loci* of intercultural encounters and postcolonial negotiations. This is particularly demonstrated through the orchestras' practices of using the orchestra as a vehicle to actualize their Indonesian-specific goals. Twilite Orchestra's 2017 Independence Day concert (in which they performed arrangements of folk and national songs), for example, was held partly to show support for Basuki Tjahja Purnama (the former governor of DKI Jakarta, who is a Chinese and non-Muslim Indonesian, and who was then incarcerated for blasphemy) and for pluralistic, harmonious Indonesia. Bandung Philharmonic also felt the need to respond to the current political and social situation in Indonesia by publishing a video that propagates their support for *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* and *Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia/NKRI* (The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia).¹¹

Thesis Objective and Research Questions

This thesis expands on aspects of those findings. First of all, although xenocentrism in its narrow sense (i.e. believing that Western culture is superior to Indonesian) was not palpable, I would like to look more critically into this by expanding on the meaning of xenocentrism. Xenocentrism consists of two words, "xeno" and "centrism," which can be understood literally as "oriented towards the foreign." Therefore, in this thesis, I consider xenocentrism as not only to denote a belief that European culture is *superior* to Indonesian, but also to denote the tendency among Indonesians to continue to *concern* about the Western¹² others and compare ourselves to the Western others as we try to define our own identity and culture. In the words of Walter Mignolo, it is a concern to "claim(...) *recognition by or inclusion in the humanitas*."¹³

All of the internship's findings show that the discourses of nationalism and national cultural identity are still relevant up to this day, 72 years after the independence. Therefore in this thesis, within the thinking framework of xenocentrism in its broad sense, I investigate the history of Indonesian ideas about nationalism, national culture, and national music since the rise of the nationalist movement in the early 1900s to the present day, and look at the connection between these ideas and the history of colonialism in Indonesia (including the history of the presence of European classical music in the colonial setting of the Dutch East Indies). I then look at the manifestations of these ideas and history in several case studies of Indonesian art music compositions and arrangements.

Finding (iii) shows the negotiations made by the orchestras in using the form of a symphony orchestra for their own—often nationalistic—agenda. In the thesis, I further explore this kind of negotiation made by postcolonial Indonesians by looking at the practices by other orchestras in Indonesia, namely

- 11 Some Indonesians feel the need to reinstate their support for NKRI because one of the main advocations of the conservative Indonesian Muslims is to change the form and ideology of the country to an Islamic state.
- 12 The term 'foreign' certainly can refer to all nations outside Indonesia, but in this thesis I focus on examining the European/Western foreign. In the years before the independence in 1945, the term 'Western' almost always referred to European. After the independence, the term 'Western', especially in relation to popular cultures, sometimes also refers to north American.
- 13 Walter Mignolo, "Epistemic Disobedience, Independent Thought and Decolonial Freedom," *Theory, Culture and Society* 26 no. 7-8 (2009): 3. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276409349275>.

Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic, which are both sponsored by the government, and both frequently perform Indonesian national songs and folk songs in their performances.

Finding (iii) also highlights the contemporary social and political situation in Jakarta in relation to the tension between native/indigenous Indonesians (*pribumi*¹⁴) and Chinese Indonesians. This tension is not without precedent; in the colonial time the population was placed into a hierarchy of ethnic groups: the Europeans were at the top, the Foreign Orientals (mainly Chinese) were in the middle and the natives were at the bottom.¹⁵ This differentiation between the natives and the Chinese Indonesians was maintained up until long after the independence, particularly during the reign of the New Order regime (1966-1998) with their discriminatory policies toward the Chinese. This ethnicity issue is also related to the issue of class and music education. Chinese Indonesians are generally wealthier than *pribumi*, and Chinese Indonesians children are generally enrolled in better schools than *pribumi* children.¹⁶ In music education, based on my personal observation from my participation in classical music education both as a student and as a teacher, there were more Chinese Indonesian students than *pribumi* students. However, this was not the case in both Twilite Orchestra and Bandung Philharmonic; most of the musicians were non-Chinese Indonesians. I explore this connection between ethnicity, class, and participation in music more thoroughly in this thesis.

Therefore, the thesis asks the following questions:

- What are the ideas of nationalism, national culture, and national music in Indonesia since the beginning of the twentieth century to the present, and how do these relate to the history of colonialism?
- How are these ideas actualized in Indonesian art music compositions and arrangements?
- How do the orchestras negotiate the form of a European symphony orchestra with their own nationalistic agenda?
- How does ethnicity relate to the discourse of Indonesian nationalism and national culture, and how do ethnicity and class affect participation in Indonesian symphony orchestras?

Approach and Theoretical Framework

My approach derives from three main bodies of thought: the cultural study of music (Clayton et al. 2011), relational musicology (Born 2010, Cook 2012), and postcolonial theory. Referring to the cultural study of music, this thesis looks at Indonesian compositions/arrangements and classical music performances as reflectors and generators of social and cultural meanings. Drawing from relational musicology, I also look at the complex interrelation, imbrication, and appropriation of the ideals, idioms, and perceptions about European classical music in Indonesian art music compositions/arrangements and performances.¹⁷

Furthermore, I follow the thoughts of postcolonial theorists, mainly of Partha Chatterjee, Dipesh Chakrabarty, Nikita Dhawan, Homi K. Bhabha, Walter Dignolo, and Nelson Maldonado-Torres. As I

14 The terms *pribumi* and *non-pribumi* had been banned since 1998 due to their racist bias (I discuss this in more detail in Chapter 3).

15 Chang-Yau Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian Schools in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Class and Religion," *Asia Pacific Education Review* 12 no. 3 (2011): 404. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-010-9144-7>.

16 See Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian Schools in Indonesia," 403-411.

17 Georgina Born, "For a Relational Musicology: Music and Interdisciplinarity, Beyond the Practice Turn," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 135 no. 2 (2010): 209. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/02690403.2010.506265>.

mentioned at the beginning of this Introduction, in examining the history of Indonesia and its contemporary situation, one cannot but encountering many ambiguities and contradictions. Partha Chatterjee provides clarity for this, in the way that he argues that ambiguity indeed lies at the heart of post-colonial societies of formerly-colonized countries. The modernity that colonialism introduced was what caused Indonesians to endure colonialism at the first place, but it also what taught the Indonesians about its values, including and especially the desire for freedom and progress. Hence, in this thesis I do not intend to find the 'grand' thread among the ambiguities, but to lay out and entangle those ambiguities. If I do find a common idea among the ambiguities, it does not intended to and should not diminish other ideas within the discourses. As historian Adrian Vickers notes, a country as huge and heterogenous as Indonesia cannot possibly have just one single narrative.¹⁸

In the writing of this thesis, my position as an Indonesian is difficult to navigate at times, as I scrutinize the legacy of colonialism in Indonesia and the ideas and actions of fellow Indonesians in response to that legacy. I think my subjectivity and predispositions as an Indonesian cannot be but influential in my analysis. But I believe what is important is to acknowledge those predispositions and constantly taking a look at them critically. In order to be not blindly critical in analyzing the legacies of colonialism in Indonesia, I follow Dipesh Chakrabarty's idea that the way to examine the legacy of colonialism in postcolonial Indonesia is not to reject that legacy (especially the European hegemonic line of thought of modernity and progress embedded in our way of viewing matters), but rather to acknowledge it as at once both indispensable and inadequate in analyzing the experiences of modernity in Indonesia, and to renew it from and for the margins.

As I do not want to be obtusely critical towards the legacy of colonialism, I also do not want to be unreasonably critical or uncritical about the Indonesians' ventures in coping with those legacies. For this I follow Nikita Dhawan's example to analyze the ideas and actions of Indonesians in this thesis as an exploration of the entanglements of Western and non-Western knowledge productions.¹⁹ I also try to view these negotiations done by Indonesians, and my effort in this thesis to understand post-colonial Indonesia as potential decolonial actions: an "affirmative sabotage," according to Dhawan, or enunciation of the third space, as theorized by Homi Bhabha, or an "epistemic disobedience," according to Mignolo. These are all quests for a change of attitude; a resignation from modernity/coloniality, a critical questioning of coloniality, and a transformation of the self-hating subject to a decolonizing agent.²⁰

Thesis Outline

I divide the thesis into 3 chapters which are arranged in chronological order. Chapter 1 covers the period from the beginning of the twentieth century (which marked the rise of the nationalist movement in Indonesia) to the independence in 1945. During this period, Indonesia was still colonized by the Dutch and subsequently, briefly occupied by the Japanese (1942-1945). Chapter 2 covers the era of post-independence Indonesia, from the start of the leadership of Sukarno (the Old Order) in 1945 to the end of the governance of Suharto (the New Order) in 1998. Chapter 3 covers Indonesia in the Reformation era, from the fall of Suharto in 1998 to the present day. This period is marked by a

¹⁸ Adrian Vickers, *A History of Modern Indonesia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 3.

¹⁹ Nikita Dhawan, "Affirmative Sabotage of the Master's Tools: The Paradox of Postcolonial Enlightenment," in *Decolonizing Enlightenment: Transnational Justice, Human Rights and Democracy in a Postcolonial World*, ed. Nikita Dhawan (Leverkusen: Barbara Budrich Publishers, 2012), 70.

²⁰ Maldonado-Torres, "Outline of Ten Theses on Coloniality and Decoloniality," 22-24.

significant improvement in the quality of democracy within the nation. Each chapter addresses the discourses of nationalism, national culture, and national music and its manifestations in music and performances which occurred during the period. With regards to Indonesian national music, I do not intend to discuss all of Indonesian art music compositions/arrangements that were created between 1900 to 2018.²¹ Rather, I focus on some 'snapshots' or case studies from each period which I regard as suitable in supporting or contradicting the ideas of nationalism, national culture, and national music as conceptualized in the respective period.

In Chapter 1, I firstly draw upon some general conceptions about nation and nationalism by political scientists Liah Greenfeld and Benedict Anderson. Specifically for Indonesia, I refer to Anthony Reid's analysis of nationalism in Southeast Asia, in which he analyzes nationalism in Indonesia as 'anti-imperial nationalism.' Reid argues that the term 'nationalism' is often automatically assumed to refer to anti-imperial nationalism, but it is important to recognize the difference between nationalism in European countries, for example, and nationalism in Southeast Asian countries, with their history of colonialism and the dynamics of East-West interrelationship. The subsequent formulation of an Indonesian national culture as one of the results of the anti-imperial nationalism, therefore, is also embedded with the complex interrelationships between the colonizer/European/West and the colonized/Indonesian/East, and the diversity of cultures across Indonesian archipelago. Within this framework, I discuss the ideas regarding the creation of a national culture during this period, which were mostly voiced by Indonesian intellectuals and nationalists such as Ki Hadjar Dewantara, Sutan Takdir Alisjahbana, and Sanusi Pané. I also examine some conceptions of Indonesian national music as expressed by intellectuals Boediardjo and Armijn Pané. I then look at the manifestation of these ideas through case studies of Indonesian music compositions from this period, namely the national anthem *Indonesia Raya* by Wage Rudolf Supratman and *Kinanthie Sandoong* by Ki Hadjar Dewantara. Because many of these ventures in creating Indonesian national music incorporated the ideals and idioms of European classical music, I also look at the history of appearance of European classical music the Dutch East Indies and analyze how this history affected Indonesians perception about European classical music.

In Chapter 2, I discuss the ideas regarding national culture as perceived by the Old Order and the New Order regimes. These ideas were incorporated both in the official state policies and in the stances expressed by the leaders of the regimes (Sukarno and Suharto). Regarding the discourse in national music, I look at some conceptions about national music as voiced during this period by composer-music critic Amir Pasaribu and J.A. Dunga and L. Manik (both music critics). In light of these conceptions, I then analyze case studies of the orchestration of *Indonesia Raya* by the Dutch composer-conductor Jozef Cleber, and *Varia Ibukota*, a composition/arrangement of Betawi folk songs by Mochtar Embut. With regards to performances, I show that although performances of European music in this period were less frequent than the previous period, some symphony orchestras that were formed during this period continue to display the prestigious image of European classical music.

In Chapter 3, I analyze national culture as perceived by the governments in the Reformation era. As a case study of national music, I examine the composition *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* by Arya Pugala Kitti. I also discuss the practices of Indonesian contemporary symphony orchestras through case studies Gita Bahana Nusantara (GBN) and Jakarta City Philharmonic (JCP). Both orchestras are funded/sponsored by the government, which makes them very interesting case studies, particularly on

²¹ Franki Notosudirdjo and Christopher Miller's dissertations are notable studies that provide historiographical accounts of Indonesian art music compositions from the beginning of the twentieth century to the present.

how they adhere to or reshaping the perception of European classical music for their own nationalistic agenda. In analyzing the practices of GBN and JCP, I frequently reflect back on my experience with Bandung Philharmonic and Twilite Orchestra during my research internship. The final section of the chapter looks at the interrelationship between ethnicity, class, and participation in Indonesian symphony orchestras. I start by examining the positioning of Chinese Indonesians in the imagining of the nation and national culture of Indonesia, from the start of the nationalist movement in the early twentieth century until the present day. I discuss how the gap and tension between native Indonesians and Chinese Indonesians manifest in the classical music scene in Indonesia, particularly on participation in classical music education and in symphony orchestras.

Methods

In gathering information about Indonesian ideas of nationalism, national culture, and national music, I refer to Indonesian official policies and relevant academic writings (i.e. Anderson 1991, Reid 2009, Tsuchiya 1987, Jones 2005, Yampolsky 1995). The dissertations by Franki Notosudirdjo (2001) and Christopher Miller (2014) are the main sources to which I refer in relation to Indonesian art music compositions. In examining the history of European classical music presence in Indonesia, I refer to both Notosudirdjo and Miller's dissertations, Matthew Isaac Cohen's account on Indonesian performing arts (2016), and the archives available at the Netherlands Institute for Sound and Vision. In exploring the connection between ethnicity, class, and participation in music, I gather information from academic writings related to ethnicity, class, and education in Indonesia (i.e. Hoon 2006, Kipp 1993, Bertrand 2004), my research internship, and my experience as a music student and teacher in Indonesia.

I analyze *Indonesia Raya*, the orchestration of *Indonesia Raya*, *Varia Ibukota* and *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* using traditional musical analysis method, focusing mainly on their harmonies, instrumentations, and melodic and rhythmic features. For *Varia Ibukota* and *Suvenir dari Minangkabau*, I compare the features in the compositions with musical features of traditional music of Betawi and Minangkabau—to which each arrangement refers, respectively. I also refer to my interview with Arya Pugala Kitti that I conducted during my research internship.

In analyzing the practices of Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic, I consult their performances' recordings, relevant news articles, and my own observations during the research internship.

CHAPTER 1

**UNDER THE DUTCH AND JAPANESE RULES (1900-1945):
EARLY CONCEPTUALIZATION OF NATIONALISM, NATIONAL CULTURE, AND
NATIONAL MUSIC**

Nationalism is a form of social consciousness which emerged firstly in early sixteenth century England.²² It then spread to parts of Europe, the Americas, and much of Asia (including Indonesia), especially in the last two centuries. At the core of nationalism is the concept of a nation. Both nationalism and nation have been continuously redefined by many scholars, such as Liah Greenfeld, who divides nationalism into three types: the individualistic-civic type, the collectivistic-civic type, and the collectivistic-ethnic type.²³ In his influential book *Imagined Communities* (1991), Benedict Anderson defines nation as an imagined political community. It is imagined because “the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear them, yet in the minds of each lives this image of their communion.”²⁴ Regarding nationalism, Anderson contends that it is “not the awakening of nations to self-consciousness; it invents nation where they do not exist.”²⁵ According to historian Anthony Reid, what is significant about Anderson's thesis is that it “fatally punctured some common-sense ideas about its (i.e. nationalism') perennial naturalness.”²⁶ Indeed, Anderson, at a public lecture in Indonesia, states that nationalism “is not something inherited from the ancient past, but is rather a “common project” for the present and the future.”²⁷

Anthony Reid identifies a typology of nationalism in Southeast Asia, for he argues that nationalism in Southeast Asia cannot always be fittedly categorized into the typologies such as defined by Greenfeld. According to Reid, nationalism in Indonesia is anti-imperial nationalism²⁸; in the way that the drive to invent a nation sprang from the desire to liberalize one's self from the foreign colonizer. Some features idiomatic to anti-imperial nationalism²⁹ are applicable to Indonesia, including support for the development of a national culture as one of the keys to creating prosperity for the new national identity. As the nation of Indonesia started to be imagined and invented in the early 1900s, the drive to create a national culture emerged immediately. In this chapter I discuss the rise of Indonesian nationalism in the early twentieth century that led to the conceptualization of Indonesian national culture and national music until the independence in 1945. Among the main actors involved in these discourses was Ki

22 Liah Greenfeld, *Spirit of Capitalism: Nationalism and Economic Growth* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2003), 2.

23 Individualistic-civic type is the original type of nationalism, in which "the idea of society as an association of individuals is combined with the civic concept of nationality." The civic nationality is equated with citizenship; "membership in the nation in this case ultimately depends on one's will to be a member." Collectivistic nationalism "envision(s) the nation as a collective individual, possessed of its own will, needs, and interests, which take precedence over the wills, needs, and interests of the human individuals who compose it and are not to be gauged from those of the majority." Hence, collectivist-ethnic type "combines the unitary definition of the nation with the ethnic concept of membership," while collectivist-civic type combines "the unitary definition of the nation with civic criteria of nationality." See Greenfeld, *Spirit of Capitalism*, 2-3.

24 Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities* (New York: Verso, 1991), 6.

25 Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, 6.

26 Anthony Reid, *Imperial Alchemy: Nationalism and Political Identity in Southeast Asia* (Leiden: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 3.

27 Benedict Anderson, "Indonesian Nationalism Today and in the Future," *Indonesia* 67 (1999): 2.

28 Reid, *Imperial Alchemy*, 8-10.

29 Reid, *Imperial Alchemy*, 9.

Hadjar Dewantara, an educator, composer, and a nationalist. Dewantara actively participated in the nationalist movement since its rise. He also founded the school *Taman Siswa* and its education method, and pronounced his many ideas of Indonesian national culture. Dewantara's conception of national culture as a synthesis of Indonesian and foreign cultures is particularly prominent and has been echoed by many other Indonesian nationalists and intellectuals. His composition, *Kinanthie Sandoong*, served as an example of a manifestation of his ideas of national culture. Another significant music composition from this period is the national anthem *Indonesia Raya*, which was composed in 1928. *Indonesia Raya* with its Western music character serves as a *locus* of the complex interweaving of Indonesian nationalism, the diversity of Indonesian cultures, and the irresistible influence from European music tradition. There were also conceptions about national music expressed by some writers, which echoed the aspects discussed in the debates of the creation of Indonesian national culture. To put these ventures in a broader context, I discuss the appearance of European classical music through performances in the Dutch East Indies, and traces how these performances contributed in shaping the perception of Indonesians about European classical music, and consequently, in their efforts to create Indonesian national music.

The Rise of Indonesian Nationalism

Nationalism in Indonesia is unanimously considered to begin to flourish in the beginning of the twentieth century. It was marked by the establishment *Boedi Oetomo* (Noble Endeavour) in 1908. Although *Boedi Oetomo* was not a political organization, it aimed to progress the economic and education condition of Javanese Indonesians. As such, the organization is regarded to be the first organization that advocated liberation from the colonizer. At the time of *Boedi Oetomo*, the entity of Indonesia as we know it today did not yet exist. The vast archipelago as is now covered within the borders of Indonesia was the Netherlands East Indies—colonies of the Dutch. After *Boedi Oetomo*, several other similar organizations were founded; all strove to manifest the East Indies into an imagined independent nation of Indonesia. One of these organizations was the *Indische Partij*, founded in 1912 by the intellectuals Ki Hadjar Dewantara, Douwes Dekker, and Tjipto Mangunkusumo. Dewantara was also the first person who used the name ‘Indonesia’ in a political sense to denote the dreamed nation in his writings from the 1910s.³⁰

Ki Hadjar Dewantara was a very influential figure in Indonesia from the beginning of the nationalist movement until after the independence. During the 1930s, he was known, together with Sukarno, Muhammad Hatta (later became Sukarno's vice president), and the Muslim leader Kyai Haji Mansur, as one of the leaders of the Indonesian people.³¹ After the independence, he served as the first Minister of Education of the Republic of Indonesia, and for later governments he continued to function as a chief adviser for educational matters. Dewantara was born from the Javanese noble family Paku Alaman, and named as Raden Mas Soewardi Soerjaningrat. He took the name Ki Hadjar Dewantara³² when he was 39 years old (in 1928). At the time, he already had established *Taman Siswa* (literally meant “Garden of Pupils”) in 1922, a private school in Yogyakarta. Dewantara founded *Taman Siswa* based on his belief that colonialism could not be fought only with political actions; but also by instilling the will for

30 R. Franki S. Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia” (Ph.D., University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2001), 134.

31 Kenji Tsuchiya, *Democracy and Leadership: The Rise of the Taman Siswa Movement in Indonesia* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1987), xi.

32 “Ki” or “Kyai” is a name usually attached to a person who is widely respected as highly-knowledgeable/a teacher.

freedom within Indonesians through education.³³ By the early 1930s, branches of *Taman Siswa* school had been established in various parts of Java and other islands.³⁴ True to Dewantara's anti-colonial stance, *Taman Siswa* resisted all kinds of interventions from the colonial government, and was eventually regarded by the colonial ruler as an adversary.

Before *Taman Siswa*, since he was enrolled in STOVIA (a medical school in Batavia), Dewantara had been developing his nationalistic ideology and actively pronouncing his ideas about Indonesian nationalism.³⁵ In 1912, he founded the political party *Indische Partij* along with Dr. Tjipto Mangunkusumo and Douwes Dekker, both intellectuals and nationalists. *Indische Partij* aimed mainly to “establish a nation consisting of all ethnic groups in the Indies.”³⁶ He then came into wide attention when he wrote and published an article titled “Als ik eens een Nederlander was”/“If I was a Dutchman” in 1913, which was a response to the Dutch colonial government's plan to hold a major festivity in the East Indies to celebrate the independence of the Netherlands from the reign of Napoleon Bonaparte.³⁷ Dewantara certainly saw the irony in the situation and expressed his critique to the colonial government through the article. At the time, Dewantara was the first Indonesian who publicly criticized the colonial government. The use of the Dutch language in the article—which placed Dewantara, a native Indonesian, at an equal footing with the colonizer—added insult to the colonial government. As a result, he was sent to prison and eventually exiled to the Netherlands for six years.

There were also other major organizations such as *Sarekat Islam*, which was founded in 1912. *Sarekat Islam* was a nationalist organization that used Islam as a unifying characteristic of the nation of Indonesia.³⁸ Communism was adapted by the Communist Party of Indonesia/*Partai Komunis Indonesia* (PKI), established in 1920, to promote revolution in the East Indies.³⁹ The Nationalist Party of Indonesia/*Partai Nasional Indonesia* (PNI) was formed in 1927 and aimed for the independence of Indonesia and the establishment of democratic political institutions.⁴⁰ Sukarno, who later became the first president of Indonesia, was the leader of this party. In the early 1930s, Sukarno was imprisoned and exiled, Dutch resistance to the nationalist movement strengthened, and later in the early 1940s the Japanese occupied the East Indies.⁴¹ During this time, other nationalists such as Muhammad Hatta and Sutan Sjahrir (later became the first prime minister of Indonesia) also came into prominence.⁴² The nationalist movement regained its strength at the end of the Second World War (and the end of Japanese occupation). In June 1945, Sukarno outlined *Pancasila*, the five philosophical principles of the independent Indonesia: nationalism, internationalism or humanitarianism, representative government, social justice, and belief in God.⁴³ Sukarno and Muhammad Hatta then proclaimed the independence of

33 Quoted by Prof. Dr. Sardjito, the dean of the University of Gadjah Mada in Yogyakarta, in his speech at the awarding ceremony of Doctor Honoris Causa from the university for Ki Hadjar Dewantara in 19 December 1956. See “Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa” (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Taman Siswa, 1957), 21.

34 Tsuchiya, *Democracy and Leadership*, x.

35 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 133.

36 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 134.

37 Prof. Dr. Sardjito's speech at the awarding ceremony of Doctor Honoris Causa from the University of Gadjah Mada for Ki Hadjar Dewantara in 19 December 1956, “Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa,” 19.

38 Jacques Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 30.

39 Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 30.

40 Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 30-31.

41 Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 31.

42 Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 31.

43 Pancasila still serves as the 'sacred' basis of the country up to this day. The five principles now ordered as: 1) belief in one God, 2) humanitarianism, 3) unity of the nation, 4) representative government and democracy, and 5) social justice.

Indonesia in 17 August 1945.

National Culture and Art as Consequences of Anti-Imperial Nationalism

For Indonesia to be realized as a nation, Ki Hadjar Dewantara argued that the creation of a national culture is essential. According to Dewantara, the basis for the Indonesian national culture is the 'peaks' and 'essences' of regional cultures from all across the archipelago, which then can be developed further, including through blending with European cultures.⁴⁴ Dewantara explained his views on Indonesian national culture as follows:

We are now in the era of acculturation, or cultural exchange with the Western world. The basic character of all cultures is its universality; it is a God's gift to humankind to enhance our lives. (Various) form(s) of cultures came into being like how nature came into being; filled with many different forms and appearances (...) Cultural exchange with foreign countries needs to be done according to three principles: continuity with our own culture, convergence with other (foreign) cultures which eventually will lead us to a universal realm, in which we can create a world unity and a concentric humankind. Concentric (the third principle) means that there is a world culture as the center, but each country still retain their own 'circle/orbit'. This is one manifestation of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*.⁴⁵

He continued:

We should never think that we have to reject all cultural influences from the outside world, particularly from the West! (...) but we also must not incorporate (Western) culture that is not necessary for us.⁴⁶

From those statements, it can be seen clearly that despite being a devout anti-colonial and nationalist, Dewantara never rejected foreign cultures, including that of the colonizer's. For Dewantara, cultures are natural matters and therefore acculturation between cultures is also natural. Dewantara's open attitude perhaps was strongly influenced by his upbringing in the Paku Alaman family, that was known to be open to Western education. During 1878-1900, many members of the family went to study in the Netherlands.⁴⁷

Dewantara's idea of 'synthesis' between traditional cultures and (selective) foreign cultures became prominent in the subsequent and continuous debates about Indonesian national culture. Musicologist Christopher Miller aptly describes this as the outlook of 'cosmopolitan nativist'.⁴⁸ Miller identifies the cultural elites who engaged in the debates of Indonesian culture as cosmopolitan nativists: "intellectuals educated in the West and invested to a significant extent in Western ideas of modernity, but who were

44 Ki Hadjar Dewantara's speech at the awarding ceremony of Doctor Honoris Causa from the University of Gadjah Mada for himself in 19 December 1956, "Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa," 46.

45 "Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa," 32.

46 "Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa," 38.

47 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 130.

48 Christopher J. Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist, Eclectic: Cultural Dynamics in Indonesian *Musik Kontemporer*" (Ph.D., Wesleyan University, 2014), 39.

committed, often deeply, to indigenous traditions, especially in the arts."⁴⁹ Miller further argues that for the cosmopolitan nativists, "*gamelan* and other forms (of traditional arts) did not represent a retreat into local tradition, but were instead integrated into an engagement with modern ideas that were circulating internationally."⁵⁰

Cosmopolitanism is indeed a trait found in many formerly-colonized countries, and it is not mutually exclusive with nationalism. In culture, especially in arts, cosmopolitanism often resulted in hybridity of forms. However, I would argue that the hybridity and interweaving of cultures in formerly-colonized countries such as Indonesia cannot be seen solely as an inevitable mix of cultures and as a result of cosmopolitanism (in which the cultures within it are considered as equal). This is because the cosmopolitanism often embodies xenocentrism, or the 'anxiety' and concern in positioning Indonesian cultures vis-à-vis foreign cultures, especially European cultures. This 'anxiety' is one of the most conspicuous forms of evidence of colonialism's impacts in Indonesia. Anti-imperial nationalism elicits the need to create a national identity as a distinct, and possibly a better, identity, to that of the colonizer's—something that Indonesians can claim ownership to and can be proud of. As Dewantara stated in the speech:

In this matter (i.e. acculturation with foreign cultures), we must show to the world, that we are free enough (...) to choose for ourselves what we need (from foreign cultures). Indonesia is not the Netherlands, not the United Kingdom, not the United States (...) We have to be bold and able to create our own culture—as expected from any nation that enters the international world—but as a nation with our own character.⁵¹

The gist of Dewantara's idea was continuously reworked in the subsequent debates about national culture, including in the widely discussed *polemik kebudayaan* (the polemic of culture) which occurred in the 1930s (Dewantara's vision of national culture was eventually used as a part of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia). The debate was started by Sutan Takdir Alisjahbana, a prominent writer and novelist, who published an article entitled "Towards a New Society and Culture" in *Poedjangga Baroe* (a literary journal established in early 1930s) in 1935. In the article, Alisjahbana addressed a statement made by Dr. Soetomo (a doctor, politician, and the founder of Boedi Oetomo) in the National Education Congress in 1935. The Congress argued that Indonesians should always be referring to the Eastern value system which is based on collectivism, spiritualism, and anti-materialism.⁵² Responding to this, Alisjahbana opined that the Congress had failed in recognizing some inherent flaws in the Indonesian multiethnic cultural tradition, and that remaining loyal to this tradition was meant pushing the country back to the past. Alisjahbana argued that Indonesia should look to the 'dynamic' culture of the West as a model and opposed attempts to remain loyal to the local tradition since it was meant pushing the country back to the past.⁵³ He also strongly stated that the pre-Indonesia period has completely ended.⁵⁴ As a response to Alisjahbana, Sanusi Pané (a writer,

49 Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 39.

50 Miller, "Cosmopolitan Nativist," 91.

51 "Masalah Kebudayaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa," 38-39.

52 Taufik Abdullah, "Dari Hasrat 'Kemajuan' ke Pembentukan Bangsa," in *Indonesia dalam Arus Sejarah: Masa Pergerakan Kebangsaan* eds. Taufik Abdullah and A.B. Lopian (Jakarta: PT. Ichtiar Baru van Hoeve, 2012), 89.

53 Tod Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy, 1950-2003: Culture, Institutions, Government" (Ph.D., Curtin University of Technology, 2005), 68.

54 Taufik Abdullah, "Dari Hasrat 'Kemajuan' ke Pembentukan Bangsa," 90.

journalist, and historian) published an article entitled ‘Indonesian Unity’ (‘Persatuan Indonesia’) in the newspaper *Suara Umum* in the same year. Pané opined, similarly to Dewantara, that “today is a continuation of yesterday...the perfect way is to combine Faust and Arjuna, and to merge materialism, intellectualism, and individualism (Western values) with spiritualism, emotions, and collectivism (Eastern values).”⁵⁵ In a similar vein, R. Ng. Poerbatjaraka (a philologist) states that “in short, do not be too infatuated with traditional culture, but do not also be too infatuated with Western culture; know that we can use both for our benefits.”^{56 57}

This concern in positioning Indonesia’s own culture relative to European cultures was further deepened during the Japanese occupation in 1942 to 1945. The Japanese invaded Indonesia in 10 January 1942, and the Dutch surrendered two months after. The Japanese brought along with them their ideology of the superiority of the Japanese culture relative to the Western imperialist’s. They regarded themselves as a prime example of an Asian culture that managed to resist Western cultural hegemony. They also saw themselves as the leader of a great pan-Asian cultural model, and included Indonesia in this scheme as they started their occupation. To achieve this cultural model in Indonesia, the Japanese formed the Cultural Center (*Keimin Bunka Shidoso*) in 1943, whose tasks were to promote traditional Indonesian arts, to introduce and disseminate Japanese culture, and to educate and train Indonesian artists.⁵⁸ The Japanese’s end goal of their cultural policy was evidently not to help the Indonesians to ‘modernize’ themselves but rather to mobilize Indonesians to help achieve the Japanese’s own agenda. Nonetheless, their policy, especially the Cultural Center’s, helped nurture and further drove the Indonesian cultural nationalists’ venture to develop the Indonesian national culture, and to think about how they view this culture relative to Western cultures. For example, in the field of Indonesian fine arts, a review of Indonesian paintings at the time was compelled to address the similarities between the styles of the paintings with the paintings of Western Europe and American artists. Jim Supangkat, a renowned art curator, remarked that Indonesian paintings is a modern art that is “quite different from that of traditional Indonesian art” and that the “various popular styles in the development of modern art in Western Europe and the United States also appear in Indonesian modern art development.”⁵⁹

The Beginning of the Search for National Music

As I show through the following analysis of the discourse national music and Indonesian compositions from the period of 1900-1945, the ideals and idioms of European classical music were often incorporated. As such, it is important to firstly look at the history of European classical music presence in Indonesia.

55 “Polemik Kebudayaan,” Government of DKI Jakarta official website, <http://www.jakarta.go.id/web/encyclopedia/detail/2403/Polemik-Kebudayaan>.

56 “Polemik Kebudayaan,” Government of DKI Jakarta official website, <http://www.jakarta.go.id/web/encyclopedia/detail/2403/Polemik-Kebudayaan>.

57 It is important to address which “West” they referred to. I would argue that considering the time of the debate, which was in the early 1930s, when flow of communication from the other sides of the world was limited, the people of the East Indies was not accustomed to the ‘West’ other than Europe. The Javanese intellectuals who had the opportunity to study abroad in the early twentieth century mostly went to European countries such as the Netherlands and Germany. Moreover, and perhaps most importantly, the colonizer was the Dutch—a nation in Europe.

58 Jones, “Indonesian Cultural Policy,” 80.

59 Jones, “Indonesian Cultural Policy,” 84.

European classical music presence in the Dutch East Indies

The nineteenth century saw the height of Dutch imperialism in the East Indies, as the Dutch started to stamp out independent trading outfits and control the hereditary rulers of the islands as bureaucratic elites who collected taxes for the colonial state.⁶⁰ It was also in the nineteenth century that a 'metropolitan superculture'⁶¹ began to form, as the Dutch and the Europeans began to develop their cultural life in the urban centers of the archipelago such as Batavia (Jakarta), Surabaya, and Semarang. As a part of this culture was performances of European music, which almost always took place in venues that were considered prestigious, such as the Schouwburg, the Harmonie clubhouse, the Concordia club building, and Hotel des Indes in Batavia, Hotel Savoy Homan and Preanger in Bandung, and Restaurant Grimm in Surabaya. In the Concordia during the 1850s, for example, the garden of the building became the venue of Saturday evening concerts which performed works by popular European composers such as Strauss, Offenbach, Verdi, and Donizetti.⁶² In this kind of performances, the attendance of non-European was very small, if any.⁶³ As Matthew Cohen notes, these performances were not intended to address the native masses; they were intended for the Europeans to promote their European identity in the East Indies.⁶⁴ The 'civilized' arts they participated in, including music performances, were crucial to distinguish themselves from the natives and the Indos (mixed blood of Indonesian and European). The theater and opera performances at the Bachelor's Theater/Military Theater in Batavia (later became the Schouwburg), for example, were exclusively for Europeans, and a strict European sartorial regulation (shoes and stockings) was enforced.⁶⁵ In 1837, the Schouwburg saw an opera performance by a France opera troupe for the occasion of an official visit by Prince Hendrik of the Netherlands⁶⁶—an unmistakable symbol of prestige and authority. Another example of such occasion is the celebration of the birth of Princess Irene of the Netherlands in 1939, held by the Royal Netherlands Navy in Surabaya.⁶⁷ In the film recording of this occasion, a Dutch admiral was seen arrived at the venue and welcomed by Indonesian porters who saluted and opened the door for the admiral (see Figures 1.1 and 1.2). Inside, the festivity was attended by all Dutch/Europeans and was accompanied by an all Dutch/European orchestra players (violin, double bass, piano, saxophones, trumpet) which performed dance music such as swings and polkas (see Figure 1.3 and 1.4). Matthew Cohen argues that this prestige (and superiority) accorded to all things European resulted in the mixing of certain European arts with traditional arts, as the Indonesians attempted to 'modernize' the traditional.⁶⁸

60 Matthew Isaac Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts: Modernity and Tradition in Colonial Indonesia* (Honolulu: Hawaii University Press, 2016), 6.

61 Hildred Geertz, "Indonesian Cultures and Communities," in *Indonesia*, ed. Ruth McVey (New Haven: HRAF Press, 1963), 35.

62 Scott Merrillees, *Batavia in Nineteenth Century Photographs* (Surrey: Curzon Press, 2000), 200.

63 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 2.

64 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 8.

65 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 16.

66 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 55.

67 "'T Sal Waerachtig Wel Gaen" (1939), accessed from the archives of the Netherlands Institute for Sound and Vision.

68 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 8.



Figure 1.1 A young Indonesian porter greeted the guests⁶⁹



Figure 1.2. A young Indonesian porter saluted the Dutch admiral

⁶⁹ Figures 1.1 to 1.4 are stills from the film/video "T Sal Waerchtig Wel Gaen" (1939), accessed from the archives of the Netherlands Institute for Sound and Vision.



Figure 1.3 The orchestra/big band performed at the occasion



Figure 1.4. The Dutch/European attendees

One of the most fertile grounds of this mixing of European and traditional arts was the Javanese royal courts. The indigenous nobles and hereditary rules were transformed by the Dutch into civil servants of the colonial government and were given a seemingly superior status, as a means to keep the nobles under control. As a result, these nobles began to adjust their customary performing arts with European forms as displayed by the colonizer. In the nineteenth century, instead of using a *gamelan* ensemble, the major courts in Central Java began to have their own military bands to provide background music for formal receptions.⁷⁰ In such bands the conductors were Dutch, but the musicians were Javanese and they were given a loftier status as court servants.⁷¹ Other occasions such as tea dances were often accompanied by a dance orchestra or string band which played waltzes, polkas, and mazurkas. These occasions were attended by the indigenous nobles and the Europeans, and commoners were allowed to see from a distance.⁷² As such, for the commoners, the image of European music and the orchestra, particularly the Western string instruments, began to be attached to both the European whites and the indigenous nobles—both are signifiers of the exclusive and the respectable.

In the early 1920s, Walter Spies, a German musician, was invited by the Yogyakarta Royal Palace (*Kraton*) to train *Kraton*'s musicians on diatonic and orchestral music.⁷³ The orchestra of *Kraton* Yogyakarta was made up of 9 musicians and was active until 1950. Furthermore, the Javanese elite women in Surakarta in 1893 were reported to be taking lessons in violin, guitar, and piano so that they could perform together with Dutch women. Around the same time, Belgian composer and violinist Charles May led a musical society in Surabaya that offered violin lessons.⁷⁴ The performances of slave orchestras for European audiences also contributed to this superior and exclusive image of European classical music.⁷⁵ A rich Dutch landlord Augustijn Michiels was reported in 1854 to own 2 slave orchestras, one was to play Western classical music, and the other was to play military marches.⁷⁶ The Governor Generals of Batavia (1777-1780, 1800-1811) and the Governor General of Surabaya (1794-98) were also reported to own orchestras of slave musicians in their houses.⁷⁷ The orchestra played classical music (e.g. marches, rondos, military tunes)⁷⁸ with Western musical instruments (e.g. flute, clarinet, trumpet, violin, double bass, timpani) to entertain their masters and the guests. The great power imbalance in such setting deepened the association of the music and the orchestra as owned by the Europeans, hence strengthened the image of the music and the orchestra as the more respectable and 'higher' kind of music. On the other hand, for the former slaves, European music and their ability to play the instruments, despite their association with their ex-masters, inevitably became a part of their identity.

Christopher Miller argues that the presence of European classical music in the East Indies, although not small, was very limited in the way that the repertoires performed and consumed were mostly of 'periclassical' and 'paraclassical' character. 'Periclassical' denotes classical music "that were too overtly functional, too commercial, insufficiently substantial, or too firmly embedded in social life in ways that

70 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 11.

71 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 12.

72 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 12.

73 Y. Edhi Susilo, "Aktivitas dan Perkembangan Orkes Simfoni Jakarta" (Ph.D., Universitas Gajah Mada, 2014), 88-93.

74 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 90.

75 Slavery in the East Indies was later abolished in the third quarter of the nineteenth century, Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 35.

76 Suka Hardjana, "Catatan Musik Indonesia: Fragmentasi Seni Modern yang Terasing," *Kalam* 5 (1995): 6.

77 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 34-35.

78 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 41.

undermined their potential as Art,” hence “became peripheral.”⁷⁹ Examples of these 'periclassical' music include waltzes, overtures, and opera arias. However, there was some exception, such as the orchestra of the Concordia, which under the lead of the Dutch conductor/musician Nico J. Gerharz in the early 1900s started to perform 'serious' works such as Tchaikovsky's Symphony Pathétique and Dvorak's New World Symphony.⁸⁰ 'Paraclassical', on the other hand, denotes the kind of music which “partook of the urbane sophistication signified by the sound of the symphony orchestra, without fully submitting to an aesthetic hierarchy that would impel them toward the repertoire of the classical canon and its particular variety of formal complexity.”⁸¹ This would include the military bands and the dance orchestra performed at the balls.⁸²

However, it is important to note that the difference between these repertoires in the East Indies and the 'serious' classical music repertoires (e.g. symphonies of Mozart and Beethoven) performed in Europe might matter for us now, but it was most likely not noticeable for the indigenous Indonesians at the time. These music and its performance form were what they saw as attached to the Europeans; it was what the Europeans consumed, enjoyed, and performed. Later, it was also what the noble/elite Indonesians performed and consumed. It is useful here to refer to the concept of 'social markedness.' Social markedness refers to “the ways social actors actively perceive one side of while ignoring the other side as epistemologically unproblematic.”⁸³ A good illustration for this concept is in the words ‘man’ and ‘woman’ in the English language. The unmarked term ‘man’ can represent humankind generically or indicate the opposite of woman. The marked term ‘woman,’ however, never be used to refer to humankind in general, and is more specified and heavily articulated than the unmarked ‘man.’⁸⁴ The marked also represents extremes that are either ‘above’ or ‘below’ the norm.⁸⁵ In the case of races as identities in the East Indies/Indonesia, the marked/unmarked identities took a more complicated form. For as long as Indonesia was colonized, indigenous Indonesians were placed at the bottom of the social hierarchy, with the Europeans at the top and the non-European foreigners in the middle. Through this arrangement—disregarding the non-European foreigners for the time being—the natives were set as a contrast to the Europeans, with Europeans (albeit being a minority) as the norm because they were the ruler. The Europeans in the East Indies were the unmarked not just because they were the norm, but also because they were what they regarded as ‘full’ human beings. The natives Indonesian were the marked, because they were ‘below’ the norm, and because their identity limited which places they could go to and what things they could do. However, markedness varies from one context to the next.⁸⁶ The Europeans within the context of the East Indies as a colony ruled by the Dutch were unmarked. But in the eyes of the natives, the Dutch and other white people, were certainly marked. This was due to the Europeans’ position on the power and social structure, and therefore for the status attached to them: the better, the more powerful, the more modern people. Hence, European classical music that was 'owned' by the Europeans also became associated with the loftier status.

For the Indonesian elites in the nineteenth century and early twentieth century, European classical music also served as the opposite of the 'vulgar' form of Western entertainment such as jazz couple

79 Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 43.

80 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity,” 91.

81 Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 43.

82 Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 42-43.

83 Wayne Brekhus, “A Sociology of the Unmarked: Redirecting Our Focus,” in *Sociological Theory* 16 no. 1 (1998): 35. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/0735-2751.00041>.

84 Brekhus, “A Sociology of the Unmarked,” 35.

85 Brekhus, “A Sociology of the Unmarked,” 35.

86 Brekhus, “A Sociology of the Unmarked,” 37.

dance that was being seen as bad influence.⁸⁷ Traditionalists were distraught by the practice of this social dance in which men danced cheek to cheek with women wearing flimsy clothes, which could generate unhealthy sexual thoughts. As I discuss in the next chapters, this attitude of opposing Western popular music but tolerating classical music was continually perpetuated by Indonesians until many years after the independence.

During the Japanese occupation in 1942-1945, although they imposed an anti-Western ideology and the establishment of a great pan-Asian culture, European classical music was nonetheless tolerated. In the first months of Japanese occupation, some European classical musicians were still allowed to actively performing. For instance, the Hungarian-born pianist Lili Kraus, who was living in Bandung, was initially allowed to live outside of the camps where Europeans were imprisoned. In exchange, Kraus gave solo recitals in prison camps around Java (performing Beethoven, Mozart, Bartók, Debussy, and Schubert) and performed concertos with the Jakarta radio orchestra under the baton of the Japanese conductor and composer Iida Nobuo.⁸⁸ This way, European classical music was once again attached to the ruler, hence maintained its respectable and exclusive image.

Ki Hadjar Dewantara's Kinanthie Sandoong and music education in Taman Siswa

As I discussed previously, Ki Hadjar Dewantara envisioned the national culture as the synthesis of 'peaks' of regional cultures. He was, however, also opened to the influences of foreign cultures. As Franki Notosudirdjo argues, Dewantara manifested this vision in his composition *Kinanthie Sandoong* (1916), which was created during his exile in Holland.⁸⁹ *Kinanthie Sandoong* is based on a *gendhing* (traditional Javanese *gamelan* composition) with the same name. The piece was composed for soprano and piano, an instrumentation closely associated to Western classical chamber music pieces and unknown to *gamelan* music tradition. The harmony employed in the piece is Western music tonal harmony—also unknown in *gamelan* music. However, the piano part was written based on the *gender* part of the original *gendhing*. *Gender* is a metallophone instrument in a *gamelan* ensemble that is customarily played in a quasiimprovisatory manner. Additionally, Notosudirdjo argues that the piece demands the singer to sing according to *cengkok-wilet* style, which is a traditional pattern of improvisation and melodic embellishment in traditional Javanese singing.⁹⁰ Hence, according to Notosudirdjo, *Kinanthie Sandoong* “perfectly blends Western and indigenous (music) cultures, an ideal of harmony.”⁹¹

Furthermore, due to Dewantara's strong concern in national culture and national music, he included lessons in Javanese music as a part of the curriculum of *Taman Siswa*. Dewantara wrote a book called *Sari Swara*, which purpose was to introduce *gamelan* to the students using concepts borrowed from European classical music.⁹² Showing his cosmopolitan nativist outlook, Dewantara strove to transform *gamelan* into a 'universal' musical language by applying the Western theory of tonal music.⁹³ Dewantara did so because—encouraged by theosophical⁹⁴ thinking—he saw the potential in *gamelan*

87 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 122.

88 Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 182.

89 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 118.

90 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 118.

91 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 118.

92 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 154-155.

93 Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia,” 155.

94 The Theosophical Society was founded in New York in 1875. The goals of the society are to “form a nucleus of the universal brotherhood of humanity, without distinction of race, creed, sex, caste, or colour; to encourage the study of

(and Javanese culture in general) to overcome the crisis faced by Indonesians in the modern age, and that adhering to Javanese culture would place themselves in the “vanguard of the age.”⁹⁵ Indonesian culture scholar Jennifer Lindsay argues that the education program in *Taman Siswa* highlights Dewantara Java-centrist tendency in his nationalism.⁹⁶ Given Dewantara's stances and actions, and the fact that Dewantara quit *Boedi Oetomo* because he felt that it was too Java-centrist⁹⁷, I would argue that the focus on Javanese culture and *gamelan* in *Taman Siswa* was due to a simple reason: because *Taman Siswa* was firstly located in Yogyakarta, a Javanese city. The education on Javanese culture in *Taman Siswa* was a manifestation of his idea of national cultures as the synthesis of 'peaks' of regional cultures, and Dewantara took *gamelan* as the representation of the regional culture in Yogyakarta.

One of Dewantara's colleagues in *Taman Siswa* was R.M. Soerjo Poetro, who was also a member of the Paku Alaman family. Like Dewantara, Poetro had a keen interest in music and pursued to develop an Indonesian national music. Not only composing music pieces that blend Western and Indonesian music idioms, Poetro also attempted to conduct musicological research on Javanese music (e.g. melodic formation, modes) and to create a notation system suitable for the new national music.⁹⁸ The practice of music education in *Taman Siswa* inspired other nationalist schools to do the same. The *Budi Setia* national school in East Sumatera, for instance, composed and used their original diatonic songs in Indonesian rather than using the Dutch song book which was used widely in schools during colonial time.⁹⁹ Notosudirdjo argues that it was this practice that later served as the basis for *lagu perjuangan* (patriotic songs)¹⁰⁰ written by composers such as Ismail Marzuki and Gesang Martohartono.

Indonesia Raya

Around the same time, in 1928, Wage Rudolf Supratman composed the Indonesian national anthem *Indonesia Raya* (Indonesia the Great). Supratman was a journalist, violinist, composer, and a nationalist. Supratman was motivated to compose *Indonesia Raya* after he read an article in the magazine *Timboel* which called for Indonesians to compose a national anthem.¹⁰¹ *Indonesia Raya* was composed as a single melodic line with text and premiered at the closing ceremony of the Second Youth Congress in 1928. Supratman performed it himself on his violin. In the occasion of this premiere, the anthem was intentionally not sung to avoid suspicions from Dutch officers that were assigned to monitor the congress.¹⁰² In 1930, the Dutch ruler banned *Indonesia Raya* to be sung in public.

comparative religion, philosophy, and science; and to investigate unexplained laws of Nature and the power latent in human beings.” See “Theosophy,” *Encyclopedia Britannica Online*, <https://britannica.com/topic/theosophy>. A branch of the society was established in Amsterdam in 1887, and in the Dutch East Indies in 1901. Kenji Tsuchiya posits that the Society was significant in increasing the self-confidence of Javanese intellectuals to lead the revival of Javanese culture. See Tsuchiya, *Democracy and Leadership*, 42-45.

95 Tsuchiya, *Democracy and Leadership*, 44.

96 Jennifer Mary Lindsay, *Klasik, Kitsch, Kontemporer: Sebuah Studi Tentang Seni Pertunjukan Jawa* (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press, 1991), quoted in Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 146.

97 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 133-134.

98 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 151-152.

99 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 155.

100 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 155.

101 Dirdho Adithyo and I Gusti Agung Anom Astika, *Bunyi Merdeka: Sejarah Sosial dan Tinjauan Musikologi Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya* (Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia, 2017), 22.

102 Adithyo and Astika, *Bunyi Merdeka*, 25.

In his discussion of European nationalism in music, ethnomusicologist Philip V. Bohlman defines national music as a reflection of “the image of the nation so that those living in the nation recognize themselves in basic but crucial ways. It (...) represent(s) something quintessential about the nation.”¹⁰³ Nationalist music, on the other hand, is different from national music in the way that it serves a nation-state in its competition with other nation-states.¹⁰⁴ Bohlman's conception of national and nationalist music perhaps should not be interpreted as to include national anthems, because regardless of how the anthem sounds or composed, it represents the nation's identity and serves the nation-state as an image of the nation presented to other nation-states. Even so, what do we make of the national anthem of Indonesia, which was created during the years of struggle for independence and served as a symbol of anti-imperial nationalism, but was instead composed in European classical music manner?

The melody of *Indonesia Raya* is simple, which was likely intentional, because Supratman would want it to be easily followed by all Indonesians. It is set in the key of G major and there is no modulation within the piece (there is not even an accidental). The distinct character of *Indonesia Raya* is mostly provided by its rhythm. The rhythmic figuration is dominated by the rhythm of a dotted quaver followed by a semiquaver. This rhythm provides a sense of haste and vigour to the song, which is apt for an anthem of a country that was trying to achieve its independence. It is also, as Jozef Cleber rightly observed (Cleber was a Dutch composer/conductor who later orchestrated *Indonesia Raya*), similar to the rhythm in *La Marseillaise*, the French national anthem (it is also set in the key of G major). Whether or not Supratman was inspired by *La Marseillaise* is unclear, but it does make sense if he was, for *La Marseillaise* was also a revolutionary song and an anthem for freedom.

Recently in 2017, the Ministry of Education and Culture commissioned and published a book entitled "The Sound of Independence: Social History and Musicological Analysis of *Indonesia Raya*." The authors, Dirdho Adithyo and I Gusti Agung Anom Astika, argue that Supratman was a composer who was very adept at "modern Romantic musical idioms,"¹⁰⁵ as can be seen in his composition *Indonesia Raya*. According to the authors, in *Indonesia Raya* we can find many musical idioms that can also be found in compositions by the great composers such as Richard Wagner, Anton Bruckner, and Gustav Mahler.¹⁰⁶ Hence, "whoever thinks that *Indonesia Raya* is not a serious music and not equal to the works of Beethoven is seriously wrong."¹⁰⁷ The authors further argue that even though *Indonesia Raya* is a populist composition and not an absolute music composition, it nonetheless had achieved an effect as strong as a programme music, because it stirred fear among the Dutch colonial government when they heard it sung by Indonesians before the independence.

There are some very interesting conceptions within the line of those statements. The sentiment of the authors to 'defend' *Indonesia Raya* as a worthy piece of music so that Indonesians can appreciate it more fully is understandable. The book was commissioned by the national government as a part of their project to 'revive' the full 3-stanzas version of *Indonesia Raya*, so this nationalistic agenda is to be expected. However, it is curious that the 'defense' needs to be done by comparing it to the 'great' works of Bruckner, Beethoven, and other European classical music composers. In this, again palpable the concern in positioning Indonesian culture vis-à-vis European cultures (in this case, especially European

103Philip V. Bohlman, *The Music of European Nationalism: Cultural Identity and Modern History* (Santa Barbara, California: ABC-CLIO, 2004), 82-83.

104Bohlman, *The Music of European Nationalism*, 119.

105Adithyo and Astika, *Bunyi Merdeka*, 69.

106Adithyo and Astika, *Bunyi Merdeka*, 70.

107Adithyo and Astika, *Bunyi Merdeka*, 70.

classical music). The argumentation of the authors implies that for Indonesians to be able to appreciate the anthem more fully, they need to be shown that *Indonesia Raya* is equal/just as good as the 'great' music of the 'great' classical music composers. This argument perpetuates the perception of European classical music as prestigious and of high quality that had been shaped in Indonesia since the nineteenth century. In my opinion, considering *Indonesia Raya* within the context of the time during its composition and the messages contain in the lyrics should be enough reason for Indonesians to appreciate it.

This is not to assert that *Indonesia Raya* is not a good piece of music, or that Supratman was not truly a nationalist. Rather, I would argue that the Western music idioms were simply the only idioms that Supratman was exposed to at the time, as an Indonesian living in a Dutch colony. Supratman was not a member of the Javanese aristocrat families, so it was unlikely that he immersed himself in Javanese *gamelan* music.¹⁰⁸ Instead, Supratman briefly attended the *Europeesche Lagere School* (the Dutch primary school), and then continued to the Dutch teacher's college (*kweekschool*), which taught diatonic and European music to their students.¹⁰⁹ He also started to play violin after he was given a violin by his Dutch brother-in-law. Supratman later became a member of a jazz band called Black and White. Therefore, Supratman in *Indonesia Raya* “belong(s) to a phase of the national struggle, when “the native intellectual” educated in colonial modes of thinking “decides to remember what he is,” but has only a “borrowed aestheticism” available.”¹¹⁰

Moreover, it is also probable that Supratman used Western music idiom in *Indonesia Raya* not because he thought it was a better music tradition, but for the sake of its neutrality.¹¹¹ The Second Youth Congress was attended by young people from various youth organizations from all across the archipelago¹¹², who gathered to unite themselves as people of one nation. Therefore, it would not be wise to present a national anthem that was composed based on a certain regional culture, as it would lean towards just one region instead of the nation. European classical music is not originated from Indonesia and therefore neutral and can be appreciated by all Indonesians with many different ethnic backgrounds. In this, of course, also implies the coloniality of the idea of the 'universality' of European classical music.

Curiously, the "Western-ness" in *Indonesia Raya* was later used as a justification for the establishment of the Western-modelled music high school *Sekolah Musik Indonesia* (SMIND) in 1951 in Yogyakarta. The Ministry of Education and Culture, showing clearly the anxiety in positioning Western culture in post-colonial Indonesia, “did not agree with the idea of founding a Western music conservatory in Indonesia.”¹¹³ The cultural bureaucrat Soemaryo L.E. later received permission to found SMIND by arguing that “*Indonesia Raya*, the Indonesian national anthem, was modelled upon Western national anthems.” On the other hand, the establishment of the conservatory for traditional music *Konservatori Karawitan* (KOKAR) went with the full support of the government.

108 Wisnu Mintargo, *Musik Revolusi Indonesia* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Ombak, 2008), 23-24.

109 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 112.

110 Frantz Fanon, "On National Culture" (1961), 40-41, quoted in Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 163.

111 Mintargo, *Musik Revolusi Indonesia*, 3.

112 This included youth organizations such as *Jong Java*, *Paguyuban Pasundan* (Sundanese youth), *Jong Sumatranen Bond*, *Jong Minahasa*, *Jong Ambon*, and *Jong Timorsh Verbond*.

113 Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 243-244.

One representation of regional music as the basis for national music

In the early 1940s, a debate similar to the polemic of culture touched on the issue of Indonesian music. Some arguments made to select one representation from all music presently available in Indonesia as the basis for national music. In 1941, after watching a *kroncong* concert at the Schouwburg in Batavia that was held by the Association of Eastern Radio Groups (*Perserikatan Perkompoelan Radio Ketimoeran/PPRK*), Ali Boediardjo, a writer, expressed a critique about it in *Poedjangga Baroe*.¹¹⁴ According to Boediardjo, the programming of *kroncong* for the first PPRK concert (which at the time was an influential colonial government cultural institution) was unacceptable because it was as if PPRK was suggesting that *kroncong* is a general Indonesian music (i.e. national music).¹¹⁵ *Kroncong* itself is a popular music genre in Indonesia which was very popular in the first half of the twentieth century.¹¹⁶ It is a hybrid European-Indonesian genre; characterized by European instrumentation (trio, violin, two small plucked lutes, flute, guitar and cello) and basic tonal harmony, Euro-American popular song form, and distinctly Indonesian texture (i.e. Figuration of instrumental parts resemble traditional Javanese and Sundanese music).¹¹⁷ Due to its popularity as an entertainment music for lowerclass people in the early 1900s, *kroncong* was then characterized as a lowbrow music.¹¹⁸ This lowbrow stigma attached to *kroncong* was likely the reason of Boediardjo's dissatisfaction of the concert. The dissatisfaction led Boediardjo to think about what music is 'worthy' to be the basis for Indonesian national music. He argued that because Indonesians had chose their national language, now Indonesians needed to choose their national music. Boediardjo then suggested *gamelan* as the basis of the national music, because it is the music of the majority of the people and because it us also the music of quality.¹¹⁹ His claim that *gamelan* (and hence Java) is representing of the majority of the people was clearly Java-centrist, because it did not acknowledge the people of Indonesia outside Java. Java-centrism within the national discourse in Indonesia was indeed evident since the beginning of the nationalist movement in early 1900s up until the end of the New Order era. Boediardjo's proposition was supported by the G. J. Resink, a Dutch historian, who likened the quality of *gamelan* to that of the European classical music, and hence suitable for "the unitary music of Indonesians."¹²⁰

114Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 175.

115Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 175.

116Philip Yampolsky, "Kroncong Revisited: New Evidence From Old Sources," *Archipel* 79 no. 1 (2010): 7. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3406/arch.2010.4159>.

117Yampolsky, "Kroncong Revisited," 9-10.

118However, during the 1930s, *kroncong* gained considerable prestige due to its incorporation into *lagu perjuangan* (patriotic songs) by composers like Ismail Marzuki and Gesang Martohartono. See Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 100.

119Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 100.

120Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 100.

INDONESIA RAYA
IRINGAN PIANO
DARI PERATURAN PEMERINTAH NO.44 TH 1958

Festoso con bravura

MM: 88 - 96

WR. Supratman (1928)

Arr: Jos Cleber (1949)

Rev: R.A.J. Soedjasmin (1952)

2

Vocal

Stansa I In do ne sia ta nah a ir ku ta nah
Stansa II In do ne sia ta nah yang mu lia ta nah
Stansa III In do ne sia ta nah yang su ci ta nah

5
tum pah da rah ku Di sa na lah a ku ber di ri ja di pan du i bu
ki ta yang ka ya Di sa na lah a ku ber di ri un tuk sla ma la ma
10 ki ta yang sak ti di sa na lah a ku ber di ri nja ga i bu se ja

14
ku In do ne sia ke bang sa an ku Bang sa dan ta nah a
nya In do ne sia ta nah pu sa ka pusa ka ki ta se mu
ti In do ne sia ta nah ber se ri ta nah yang a ku sa

18
ir ku ma ri lah ki ta ber se ru In do ne sia ber sa
a nya ma ri lah ki ta men do a In do ne sia ba ha
ya ngi ma ri lah ki ta ber jan ji In do ne sia A ba

22
tu Hi dup lah ta nah ku hi dup lah ne gri ku bang sa ku rak yat ku se mu
gia su bur lah ta nah nya su bur lah ji wa nya bang sa nya rak yat nya se mu
di sla mat lah rak yat nya sla mat lah pu tra nya pu lau nya la ut nya se mu

26
a nya ba ngun lah ji wa nya ba ngun lah ba dan nya un tuk IN DO NE SIA RA
a nya sa dar lah ha ti nya sa dar lah bu di nya un tuk IN DO NE SIA RA
ma ju lah ne gri nya ma ju lah pan du nya un tuk IN DO NE SIA RA

31
YA In do ne sia Ra ya Mer de ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta In do
YA In do ne sia Ra ya Mer de ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta In do
YA In do ne sia Ra ya Mer de ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta In do

36
ne sia Ra ya mer de ka mer de ka hi dup lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do nesia Ra ya mer de
ne sia Ra ya mer de ka mer de ka hi dup lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do nesia Ra ya mer de
ne sia Ra ya mer de ka mer de ka hi dup lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do nesia Ra ya Mer de

41
ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta In do ne sia Ra ya mer de ka mer de ka hi dup
ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta In do ne sia Ra ya mer de ka mer de ka hi dup
1..2. ka mer de ka ta nah ku ne gri ku yang ku cin ta 3.
lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do lah In do ne sia Ra ya
lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do lah In do ne sia Ra ya
lah In do ne sia Ra ya In do lah In do ne sia Ra ya
rit

Figure 1.5. Melody and lyrics of *Indonesia Raya*¹²¹

¹²¹From the official website of the *Indonesia Raya* project, <http://laguindonesiaraya.id/download/partitur>.

This opinion of Boediardjo triggered a strong response from Armijn Pané. Armijn Pané was, like his older brother Sanusi Pané, a staunch nationalist and a writer. Armijn believed that Indonesian national music needed to be based on indigenous music, but it need not be a certain ethnic music.¹²² Instead, the national music needed to be based on an indigenous music that had appeal to all Indonesians from various ethnic backgrounds. According to Armijn, this can be found in the genre of *kroncong*. Indonesia and Southeast Asia scholar William H. Frederick summarized Armijn's argument as follows:

The music was modern and forward-looking because it clearly assimilated many styles, unified them into a seamless whole, and was still capable of accommodating new influences. The people, the musicians as well as audience, were also progressive, for they represented a blending of many different groups, and their voice was that of ordinary people, not a handful of aesthetes or aristocrats. This, he said, was much more satisfactory as a potential base for a new Indonesian culture than *gamelan*, which was after all a court art of the Javanese, rooted in a regional ruling elite and its traditions, and, he thought, unaccustomed to change and synthesis.¹²³

Armijn Pané's argument is similar to his brother's—in the ways that this national music needs to be a synthesis of various cultures, and that it needs to be open to new influences, including foreign influences. What Armijn also highlighted, however, was that this music needs to be humble and grounded; as belong to the common people, and not just to the aristocrats (like *gamelan*).

European classical music as the basis for national music

Despite Boediardjo and Pané's propositions, the bulk of music composed by Indonesian composers during the period of 1900-1945—most of them composed during the Japanese occupation—was in the form of European music-modelled art songs. In the opening of the Cultural Center, Iida Nobuo stated that the Cultural Center needed to filter Indonesian musical sphere from unhealthy elements.¹²⁴ What Nobuo meant by unhealthy elements were music from the United States and Britain (i.e. Japan's enemies in the war), as well as *kroncong*. On the other hand, classical music was tolerated, but needed to be adjusted to Indonesia's own flesh and blood.¹²⁵ To implement this stance, Nobuo encouraged compositions of patriotic art songs by Indonesian composers. Among art song composers who rose into prominence during this time was Cornel Simanjuntak. Simanjuntak was a Batak (an ethnic group in North Sumatera) musician who went to Java to study at the Dutch teacher's college (*kweekschool*) at the end of the 1930s. At the time, the people of Batak, including Simanjuntak, would already be familiar with European music idiom because European church music had been introduced by the Rheinische Missionary in Batak land for about a hundred years.¹²⁶ In Java, Simanjuntak's close affinity to European music was further strengthened during his study in St. Xavarius College in Muntilan, Central Java, which was known for its intense education and training in European classical music. In the college, classical music and musical instruments were regarded as the staple of music and taught to the students (included music history, theory, harmony, and basic composition), while other genres such

¹²²Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 175.

¹²³William Frederick, "Dreams of Freedom, Moments of Despair: Armijn Pané and the Imagining of Modern Indonesian Culture" (1997), quoted in Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 100.

¹²⁴Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 201.

¹²⁵Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 201.

¹²⁶Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 189.

as jazz and *kroncong* were prohibited.¹²⁷ After Simanjuntak graduated from the college, the Japanese invaded Indonesia and subsequently closed St. Xavarius. Work opportunity for musicians was scarce, and after taught for some time as a teacher in Magelang, Central Java, Simanjuntak moved to Jakarta and worked for the Cultural Center.

The Japanese also formed the Language Council (*Komisi Bahasa*), which aimed to replace the Dutch language with Indonesian.¹²⁸ Encouraged by this development, Simanjuntak started to compose art songs with text from Indonesian poems. He attempted to translate the rhythm and flow of the poems into the melodic and rhythmic structure of the songs.¹²⁹ Notosudirdjo argues that in the song *Kemuning* (based on a poem by Sanusi Pané), Simanjuntak was successful in creating a composition with a distinct national sound yet modern. This is due to—in addition to the use of an Indonesian poem—use of the *pelog* scale for the melody line in such a way that listeners would not perceive it immediately as a pentatonic melody. Hence, it has both nationalistic appeal and a nod to the modern.¹³⁰ Notosudirdjo further argues that this genre of art song was which was then developed into the genre of *lagu seriosa*, which became very popular in the 1950s.¹³¹ Simanjuntak remarked, when asked about why he composed songs for Japanese propaganda, that he intended to bring the feeling of 'modern' music to the common Indonesians, because they were only accustomed to five-tone songs.¹³² Through these propaganda songs, which were composed based on a diatonic scale, the people would then get familiarized with the seven-tone songs. This, according to Simanjuntak, is the first step towards appreciation for 'heavier' music such as symphonies and other classical music.

Conclusion

The rise of anti-imperial nationalism in Indonesia in the early 1900s triggered an immediate need to create a distinct national culture, including national music. The most dominant concept for the creation of Indonesian national culture expressed during this time was a synthesis of Indonesian and foreign (especially European) cultures. I argue that in this cosmopolitan stance is evident one of the most conspicuous form of colonialism's impacts: the underlying concern or 'anxiety' of Indonesians in positing themselves in comparison to the European other. Some of the ideas about national culture and national music were actualized into concrete forms, such as Dewantara's vision which was then incorporated into the 1945 Constitution and into his own composition *Kinanthie Sandoong*, and Simanjuntak's stance on classical music as the basis of national music which he manifested in his compositions of art songs. Some other opinions, such as the proposition by Ali Boediardjo for *gamelan* to serve as the basis of national music, or *kroncong* as suggested by Armijn Pané, did not come into fruition. Nevertheless, these opinions give insights on the myriad of ideas and ambivalencies present in these early formation years of the Republic of Indonesia. During these years, Indonesians started to think about their identity after more than 300 years of colonization and the imposition of European cultures. The imposed culture included European classical music, which was consumed, performed and enjoyed in the Dutch East Indies mainly by the European rulers and the indigenous nobles. This practice created an association between European classical music and prestige and quality.

127Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 191.

128Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 207.

129Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 208.

130Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 211.

131Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 213.

132Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 216.

Indonesia Raya provides a good illustration of the ambivalence present during this period. *Indonesia Raya* is undoubtedly nationalistic both in intent and in content, yet it was composed fully in European classical music manner. I argue that this does not suggest that Wage Rudolf Supratman was not truly a nationalist, but European classical music idioms was the only music idiom he was familiar with as someone who lived in a European colony and studied in Dutch schools. Furthermore, the history of this period between 1900-1945 as I discussed in this chapter hints that implementation of ideas of national culture and music was most successful if it was backed by political power, as shown, among others, in the output of Indonesian compositions during the Japanese occupation era. The Japanese Cultural Center encouraged compositions of Western-modelled art songs, and hence Indonesian compositions of art songs flourished during this era.

CHAPTER 2

UNDER THE INDONESIAN REGIMES: THE OLD ORDER AND THE NEW ORDER (1945-1998)

Indonesia proclaimed independence in 1945, which marked the accomplishment of the main goal of anti-imperial nationalism: freedom from the colonizer. However, it was not until 1949 that this independence was recognized by the Dutch government. Between 1945 and 1949, the area of Indonesia was divided into the republic's areas and the Dutch's areas. During this period, Indonesia had to manage urgent matters such as setting up state institutions, developing a system of democracy, and establishing economic stability, and also faced armed struggles against the Dutch army. Sukarno, a charismatic political leader that rose into prominence during the Revolution for independence in the 1930s to 1945, became the first President of the Republic of Indonesia. His government was later termed as the Old Order. The rank of leadership in this newly-found state of the Republic of Indonesia was dominated by the new class (instead of the aristocrats who were the indigenous-in-charge during the Dutch occupation): nationalists who received Western education, were involved in the nationalist movement, and had a common desire to be modern (this includes Sukarno, Ki Hadjar Dewantara, and Muhammad Hatta).¹³³ In 1957, fearing that his power was under threats from party leaders and from the outbreak of regional rebellions, Sukarno put an end to the Western model of democracy and announced the system of 'Guided Democracy.'¹³⁴ As a part of this system, Sukarno reinstated the 1945 Constitution and sacralized it into something unchallengeable, just like the five principles of the nation (*Pancasila*). Under this system, the status of the prime minister was reduced and Sukarno became the centre of power.

This decision was proven to be harmful for Sukarno, as it triggered a series of events that led to the fall of his government in 1965. On 30 September 1965, six military generals were killed by a group of air force officers and officers from Sukarno's praetorian guard, Cakrabirawa.¹³⁵ This was an action intended by the group as a movement to defend Sukarno's governance. To this day, what really happened and who were behind the action remain unclear. What clearly happened was that Major General Suharto, a high-rank military officer, then took control of the capital and denounced the 30 September event as a coup. The military under Suharto set a narrative in which the Communist Party (*Partai Komunis Indonesia*/PKI) was denounced as the perpetrator of the coup. This narrative was successful in convincing the Indonesian people that a coup had indeed occurred and that Suharto took the appropriate measures to 'defend' the country. Consequently, during the next few years Communist Party members and alleged members and sympathizers were hunted down, imprisoned, and murdered. Suharto became president in 1968, and Indonesia came under the New Order. Under the New Order, the new class that occupied the rank of leadership during Sukarno's era was replaced by military officers. 1945 Constitution and *Pancasila* continued to be sacralized; as the ultimate justifications for any action taken by the government. Corruption and collusion were rampant and international debt was mounting, but what the majority of people felt was that the economy stabilized and wealth increased. Suppression of the oppositions against the government was carried out and sufficiently masked for a long time. Suharto was in reign until 1998, when a series of mass protests finally pushed him to resign as president.

¹³³Vickers, *A History of Modern Indonesia*, 118-119.

¹³⁴Vickers, *A History of Modern Indonesia*, 143-144.

¹³⁵Vickers, *A History of Modern Indonesia*, 160.

Within these turmoils of succession of governments, nationalism, national culture and national music continued to be reconceptualized and actualized in various ways. As the two successive governments were essentially authoritarian, the official cultural policies of the state under these regimes were influential in shaping the cultural scene in Indonesia. Through this chapter I show that, as reflected by the policies, being independent from the colonizer did not immediately eliminate the concern among Indonesians in positioning one's self to the others (especially the European/Western others) when searching for our cultural identity. As for the venture for the creation of national music, this period was marked the continuation of the idea of European classical music as the basis for national music, as illustrated by the orchestration of *Indonesia Raya* by the Dutch composer/conductor Jozef Cleber, by the stances expressed by Amir Pasaribu (a composer-music critic) and J.A. Dungga and L. Manik (both music critics/writers), and a case study of *Varia Ibukota* by Mochtar Embut. In the late 1970s, however, a new genre of Indonesian art music emerged, which was dominated by traditionally-based compositions. Compared to the period before the independence, performances of European classical music during this period was less frequent. However, some professional and student symphony orchestras were formed. In the performances of these orchestras, the association between European classical music and prestige was preserved.

National Culture Under the Regimes

According to Sukarno and the Old Order

The Department of Education, Training and Culture (*Departemen Pendidikan, Pengamatan dan Kebudayaan/Departemen PPK*) was one of the first state ministries that were created after the independence, with Ki Hadjar Dewantara as its first minister. Between 1948 and 1954, the ministry held several cultural congresses, with an addition of a 'Cultural Conference' in 1950. These meetings became an elite forum attended by political and cultural elites, and the opinions expressed in these meetings provide insights into the early formulation of the official cultural policies in Indonesia.¹³⁶

In the 1948 Cultural Congress, the issue of East culture vis-à-vis West culture as has been discussed since the cultural polemic was still very much present. A majority of the participants in the Congress again agreed on the abstract concept of 'synthesis' between Western and Eastern cultures to create an Indonesian culture.¹³⁷ However, when Mohamad Zain, a participant of the Congress, raised a question about how to place the different cultures in Indonesia within this synthesis, the chair of the Congress dismissed the question by saying that the focus of the congress is on Indonesian culture and therefore he should not differentiate cultures in Indonesia.¹³⁸ This tendency of downplaying the diversity of cultures in Indonesia was later perpetuated by the New Order government.

In 1949, as a part of the Dutch government recognition of the Indonesian independence, a Cultural Accord was agreed between the Indonesian and the Dutch governments. This Accord ensured that the movement of people and materials related to culture and the arts between the two countries remained free.¹³⁹ Consequently, the Cultural Conference in 1950 was held specifically to address the implications of this Accord.¹⁴⁰ The substances of this Conference, however, were not very different

¹³⁶Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 97.

¹³⁷Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 98.

¹³⁸Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 98-99.

¹³⁹Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 102.

¹⁴⁰Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 102.

from the first Cultural Congress or from the previous debate in the polemic of culture. Ki Hadjar Dewantara restated his perspective on national culture, and also rejected the Cultural Accord. Consistent to his cosmopolitan outlook, Dewantara argued that Indonesia should be able to freely see and influenced by the cultures of many different countries in order to equip itself to develop a national culture.¹⁴¹ Sutan Takdir Alisjahbana, also consistent to his opinion during the *polemik kebudayaan*, stated that “it is already proper that we open our nation as wide as possible to the riches of all the culture of the new era.”¹⁴²

However, as I discussed in Chapter 1, although the cultural nationalists were mostly open to the foreign cultures, they maintained that Indonesians need to be selective in incorporating foreign cultures into the national culture. Likewise, the regional cultures that can be incorporated into the national culture also need to be carefully selected. This stance was evident as well in the policies of Sukarno. Under the Guided Democracy, Sukarno emphasized concepts that he brought forward as uniquely Indonesian. These were concepts such as *gotong royong* which means working together hand in hand to achieve something, and *musyawarah mufakat*, which denotes a process of discussion that leads to a resolution which is agreed by all participants of the discussion. Sukarno also revived the 1945 Constitution which bore Ki Hadjar Dewantara’s vision of national culture.¹⁴³ Clause 32 in 1945 Constitution stated that “The government shall advance the national culture of Indonesia.” The Explanation section of this clause further defined the national culture:

The nation’s culture is a culture that arose as a result of the works and wisdoms of all Indonesians. The old and authentic culture as can be found in the peaks of regional cultures from all regions in Indonesia is the national culture. The effort to create a new culture has to be directed towards the progress of culture and the unity of Indonesia, without rejecting new materials from foreign cultures which can enhance and enrich the national culture, as well as elevate the degree of humanity of Indonesians.¹⁴⁴

In the second sentence of the Explanation, it can be seen that the regional cultures that were deemed to be worthy to be a part of the national culture is narrowed down to the ‘old and authentic’ forms only. As with the terms ‘peaks’ and ‘essences’ in the Dewantara’s idea of national culture, the meaning of ‘old and authentic’ is indeed unclear, and it caused a politics of inclusion and exclusion—of what kinds of arts regarded as acceptable and unacceptable according to the authority (in this case, Sukarno). There was then a categorization of which regional arts were deemed to be the ‘peaks,’ ‘old’ and ‘authentic’. During the time of Guided Democracy, it seemed like the preferred arts were those that were regarded as of high quality and moral character,¹⁴⁵ which criteria, again, remained unclear. Regardless, the government of the Guided Democracy was eager to develop (selected) regional arts and at the same time also attempted to instantly create a national art. A case in point for an instant national art is the

141 Jones, “Indonesian Cultural Policy,” 102.

142 Jones, “Indonesian Cultural Policy,” 103.

143 During 1950-1959, the Constitution used was the 1950 Temporary Constitution (*Undang-Undang Dasar Sementara* 1950).

144 “Kebudayaan bangsa ialah kebudayaan yang timbul sebagai buah usaha budinya rakyat Indonesia seluruhnya. Kebudayaan lama dan asli terdapat sebagai puncak-puncak kebudayaan di daerah-daerah di seluruh Indonesia, terhitung sebagai kebudayaan bangsa. Usaha kebudayaan baru harus menuju ke arah kemajuan adab, budaya dan persatuan, dengan tidak menolak bahan-bahan baru dari kebudayaan asing yang dapat memperkembangkan dan memperkaya kebudayaan bangsa sendiri, serta mempertinggi derajat kemanusiaan bangsa Indonesia.”

145 Jones, “Indonesian Cultural Policy,” 124.

dance *serampang duabelas*, which was boasted in the late 1950s as the national dance, which was expected to replace the Western couple dancing as a social activity for the young people.¹⁴⁶ A program to develop regional arts was *hiburan daerah*, which was held by the Radio of the Republic of Indonesia/*Radio Republik Indonesia* (RRI), who commissioned numerous recordings of songs in regional languages which were then adapted to Western tuning and idioms.¹⁴⁷

It is important to note the stances taken by Sukarno with regards to arts. Sukarno was a socialist, and therefore he oriented towards the policies of the Soviet Union and generally took an anti-West stance. In relation to performing arts, Sukarno took the Soviet model in rejecting “Western music, Western dancing, and the hula hoop” since he regarded it as degrading and as symbolic weapons of Western’s imperialism.¹⁴⁸ This stance was shared by the Institute of People's Culture (Lembaga Kebudayaan Rakyat/LEKRA) which was established in 1950. LEKRA strove to search for an alternative to Western modernity. For instance, LEKRA advocated the banning of the 'decadent' Western cultures such as Hollywood films.¹⁴⁹ Nonetheless, Sukarno did not seem to reject all genres of Western music. Sukarno famously banned Western rock-n-roll music in the late 1950s;¹⁵⁰ however, he did not mind European classical music, or what he perceived as European classical music. As I discussed in the previous chapter, the presense of European classical music in the Dutch East Indies was mostly of 'periclassical' or 'paraclassical' character. However, orchestration, which is the most visible and audible feature of a symphony (the staple of European classical music) and was the feature of both the 'periclassical' and 'paraclassical' music, serve as the main signifier of the superiority of European classical music for the Indonesians.¹⁵¹ This was due to the association between classical music and the the people in power (Europeans, noble indigenious, and the Japanese) which was shaped through the the performances of European classical music in the East Indies. The most obvious evidence of Sukarno's leniency towards classical music is in his approval to the orchestration of the national anthem *Indonesia Raya* by the Dutch musician and conductor Jozef Cleber (I discuss this in the next section).

According to the New Order

This focus on ‘respectability’ of arts was carried into the New Order era.¹⁵² One of the doctrines imposed by the New Order was *wawasan kebangsaan*, which was a doctrine about awareness about the nation as one economic, social, cultural, political, and military unity. Philip Yampolsky argues that it was only in the New Order era that the regional cultures were recognized as the basis for the national culture, as can be seen from this sentence from the the Guidelines of the State Policy/*Garis-garis Besar Haluan Negara* (GBHN) 1973:

146Philip Yampolsky, “Forces for Change in the Regional Performing Arts of Indonesia,” in *Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia* 151 no. 4 (1995): 706. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-90003035>.

147Yampolsky, “Forces for Change,” 706.

148Donald Hindley, *The Communist Party of Indonesia, 1951-1963* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1964), 186, quoted in Andrew N. Weintraub, “The “Crisis of the Sinden”: Gender, Politics, and Memory in the Performing Arts of West Java, 1959-1964,” in *Indonesia* 77 (2004): 59.

149Vickers, *A History of Modern Indonesia*, 134.

150Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 311.

151Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 78.

152Yampolsky, “Forces for Change,” 711.

The nation's culture is in fact one, and the existing varieties of culture [that is, regional culture] demonstrate the richness of the national culture. This rich variety is the capital and basis for the development of the entire national culture, the results of which can be enjoyed by the nation.¹⁵³

However, contrary to Yampolsky's reading, I would argue that this formulation was not different from that of the 1945 Constitution. The difference lies in the way the two regimes framed their policies and how they acted on the policies. The New Order's main ideology was *pembangunan* (development), which essentially is similar to the ideologies of civilization and modernization as imposed by the colonizer. In order to advance the *pembangunan*, the government was justified to intervene on—or in their terms, to guide (*membimbing*) and nurture (*membina*)—all matters in the life of the Indonesian people, including on arts. Consequently, the regional arts were guided and nurtured in order to reach the degree of respectability as expected by the government. These programs of guidance and nurturing were, as Yampolsky argues, far more structured and consistent from that of the previous regime.¹⁵⁴ This is very understandable, considering that during the regime of Sukarno, the nation was still facing more urgent matters as a young nation, such as the establishment of principal governmental bodies and political stability. Nonetheless, both the Old Order and the New Order applied some standard of respectability which defined which arts were acceptable and unacceptable. In general, the operating principle of the Department of Education and Culture/*Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan* (Depdikbud)—that was responsible for the development of the arts during the New Order—was that 'urban' is more respectable than 'rural,' and therefore performances that depict attractive and impressive 'urban' standards (such as fancy costumes and Western instruments) are more respectable than those that do not.¹⁵⁵ The acceptable arts were also should not be vulgar and disorderly (e.g. performers wearing sandals or dancers move rather erotically); they had to be orderly and inoffensive. The efforts to 'develop' the regional arts into a more respectable form were often resulted in the adjustments of the features of the arts to be more in line with the trends from Western performing arts (i.e. to be better suited to the modern times).

In the 1990s, however, the New Order became very concerned about the bad impacts of 'Western lifestyle' and consumerism. Similarly to Sukarno, the New Order regime was anxious in redressing the flow of Western popular culture into Indonesia.¹⁵⁶ As Matthew Isaac Cohen recalled from his time in Indonesia in the 1990s, the government was talking about the threats of foreign cultural influences in the era of globalization and about the need to maintain traditional art as a moral compass.¹⁵⁷ This was done through, among others, events such as the "Arts Summit Indonesia" in 1995, which was organized by the Directorate General of Culture.¹⁵⁸ This festival showcased Indonesian contemporary performing arts, including contemporary music (I discuss this music further in the next section). However, this concern on the preservation of traditional cultures needs to be considered within a broader context of Indonesian society at the time. In the late New Order era (late 1980s-1997), the regime's grip on society became increasingly less forceful.¹⁵⁹ This was due to various factors, but one of the most significant was that the society had changed. Indonesians in the 1990s were much more educated, healthier, and more

¹⁵³Yampolsky, "Forces for Change," 707.

¹⁵⁴Yampolsky, "Forces for Change," 707.

¹⁵⁵Yampolsky, "Forces for Change," 712.

¹⁵⁶Jones, "Indonesian Cultural Policy," 180.

¹⁵⁷ Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, xiii.

¹⁵⁸Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 364.

¹⁵⁹David Bourchier and Vedi R. Hadiz, "Introduction," in *Indonesian Politics and Society: A Reader* eds. David Bourchier and Vedi R. Hadiz (New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003), 16.

prosperous than they were in the 1960s. Consequently, more people read newspapers, watched television, and became more aware about what was happening in the country and the world (e.g. human rights, corruption). The regime then responded to the change by establishing the National Commission on Human Rights in 1993. However, it maintained that 'Western' standards were not applicable in Indonesia.¹⁶⁰ In order to justify rejection of liberal notions such as human rights and the separation of power, the regime insisted that Indonesia could only be guided by indigenous Indonesian values of harmony and cooperation. Wherefore, in the realm of culture, the government was also concerned about the stream of Western popular culture such as popular music. The genre of European classical music, although was not given a particular attention and very rarely financially supported, was nonetheless tolerated and never banned by the government.

Continuation of European Classical Music as the Basis for National Music

Orchestration of Indonesia Raya

In 1950, by request of M. Jusuf Ronodipuro (the then head of the Radio of the Republic of Indonesia/RRI)¹⁶¹, the national anthem *Indonesia Raya* was rearranged to a symphonic form by Jozef (Jos) Cleber, a Dutch musician, conductor, and composer/arranger.¹⁶² Cleber stated that he sensed the nuance of *La Marseillaise* in *Indonesia Raya*. Cleber rearranged *Indonesia Raya* and recorded it at RRI Studio Jakarta in early 1951, which involved 140 musicians from RRI orchestras. Ronodipuro and Cleber then presented this recording to Sukarno, who did not approve this first version and asked for some revisions. The recording of final and approved version of the arrangement was sent to the Netherlands for the master to be made. This recording of *Indonesia Raya* was the only version that was used all over Indonesia for 47 years until Addie MS made a new recording in 1997.

In his arrangement of *Indonesia Raya*, Cleber did not alter the melody at all. Expectedly, Cleber added harmony to the melody, spread between the woodwind, brass, and string sections. Most of the parts play the same rhythmic pattern almost all the time. This is also to be expected, for Cleber was likely wanted to retain the distinct rhythm figuration of the original composition. Another feature Cleber added is the change of dynamics (Supratman did not give any dynamic markings). The text of *Indonesia Raya* consists of 3 stanzas, each consists of 3 couplets and a refrain. In the arrangement, Cleber set the first 2 couplets in *forte*, likely because these couplets declare the greatness of the land and the pride of Indonesians. Cleber arranged the third couplet in *mezzo forte* and largely muted the percussion section, giving it an immediate and obvious change of tone in contrast to the previous couplets and to the subsequent refrain. This is most probably to highlight the change of tone in text, because in contrast to the first two couplets, the third couplet depicts the Indonesians' good wishes/prayers for their homeland. For the refrain, Cleber set it back to *forte*, and doubling the voices in most of the brass parts, hence creating a peak moment within the composition. This is a logical arrangement choice, because the refrain—other than being repeated in each of the stanza—depicts the most patriotic sentiment of the whole text: declaring Indonesia as an independent nation (it contains the word "merdeka," which literally means free, and was the word most closely associated with the

¹⁶⁰Bourchier and Hadiz, "Introduction," 17.

¹⁶¹Yayasan untuk Indonesia, *Ensiklopedi Jakarta, Buku II: Budaya dan Warisan Sejarah* (Jakarta: Dinas Kebudayaan dan Permuseuman Provinsi DKI Jakarta, 2005), 61-62.

¹⁶²Jozef Cleber was firstly trained as a classical violinist and pianist, but later shifted his interest to jazz music and pops orchestra and learned to play the trombone. He first came to Batavia/Jakarta in 1949, invited by RRI to teach Indonesian musicians in orchestration and composition. In Jakarta, Cleber led the Cosmopolitan Orchestra, which consisted of musicians from various nationalities. The orchestra focused on performing orchestral arrangements of popular music.

freedom fighters). From this brief analysis, Cleber seemed to try to pay appropriate respect for the national anthem, although, and perhaps especially because, his position at the time must have been difficult to navigate (i.e. being a Dutchman and asked to arrange the national anthem of a nation that used to be colonized by his government).

As for the decision by Ronodipuro to give the task to Cleber, I suggest what drove him to ask Cleber was because he felt that the national anthem needs to be able to be played in a 'grander' way (i.e. by more instruments in a symphony orchestra). In present day Indonesia, orchestras such as Twilite Orchestra and Gita Bahana Nusantara also performed patriotic songs in a symphonic orchestra form due to this reason—that symphonic form 'enhances' the songs and create a more evocative effect for the listeners (I discuss Gita Bahana Nusantara in the next chapter). Additionally, Ronodipuro was probably also driven by the the perceived unavailability at the time of an Indonesian who was adept in rearranging a composition to an orchestral form. As with Sukarno, his approval of this orchestration highlights his stance towards European classical music and orchestral music—that to him this was an acceptable/high-standard form of art.

Lagu seriosa

The genre of European music-modelled art songs which flourished under the policy of the Japanese Cultural Center was then termed as *lagu seriosa* (*seriosa* songs). The term *seriosa* came into use as the name of one of three categories of RRI's annual singing contest *Bintang Radio* (Radio Star), which was started in 1951 (the other 2 categories being pop and *kroncong*).¹⁶³ The category *seriosa* denotes the more serious singing style ("classical style"), in contrast to entertainment songs such as *kroncong*.¹⁶⁴ Suka Hardjana, a prominent Indonesian musicologist, observes that *lagu seriosa* composers such as Cornel Simanjuntak and Mochtar Embut took as their model songs by Schubert, Mendelssohn, Schumann, Brahms, Wolf and short arias by Puccini, Gounod, Mascagni, Bizet, and Strauss.¹⁶⁵ Miller notes that composers wrote *lagu seriosa* or utilized orchestral accompaniment when "an aura of greater prestige and seriousness was called for."¹⁶⁶ Orchestra (especially the string sections) and *seriosa* style (medium tempi, subdued dynamics) hence serve as markers of seriousness and prestige.¹⁶⁷ The birth of this genre gave a new alternative for the Indonesian national music.¹⁶⁸ As I discussed in the previous chapter, *kroncong* was rejected largely because of its popular/entertainment nature and *gamelan* was rejected because it was too Java-centrist. *Lagu seriosa*, on the other hand, was serious music (as opposed to popular music genres such as *kroncong*), it was universal (without leaning towards a certain traditional music), it was modern (because it was modelled on European art songs), and it had been successfully composed by Indonesians.

Pasaribu, Dunga, and Manik

Also in the 1950s, the composer-music critic Amir Pasaribu came to the fore by bringing a vision similar to Simanjuntak's—to introduce and instill love and taste for 'high' quality of music (i.e. Indonesian art music on a par with European classical music) among Indonesians.¹⁶⁹ However, he was

¹⁶³Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 3.

¹⁶⁴Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 140.

¹⁶⁵Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 139.

¹⁶⁶Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 146.

¹⁶⁷Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 146.

¹⁶⁸Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity," 213.

¹⁶⁹Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 223.

also critical about Simanjuntak's art songs, which he deemed as primitive in the use of harmony.¹⁷⁰ According to Pasaribu, Indonesians at the time were too entrenched in popular music, hence they did not have "(...) sense of history, sense of excellence, sense of business. All they want to do is (fun) singing."¹⁷¹ In 1953, Pasaribu was appointed as the head of the newly-founded Western-model music conservatory *Sekolah Musik Indonesia* (SMIND) in Yogyakarta.¹⁷² Through this tenure, Pasaribu's stance found a ground of implementation. Pasaribu introduced a composition course and invited European classical musicians to teach at the conservatory. In his venture as a composer, despite his leaning towards European classical music, Pasaribu still could not turn away from music from the Indonesian tradition. In his composition *Variasi Sriwijaya*, for example, Pasaribu used a *pelog* pentatonic melodic material from an Indonesian folksong *Gendhing Sriwijaya*.¹⁷³ Pasaribu remarked that this exploration of traditional sounds is a manifestation of his nationalism—of learning from these indigenous sounds and create music as a contribution to the nation's musical development.¹⁷⁴

J.A. Dungga and Liberty Manik (both music critics) echoed Pasaribu's stance, by asserting that European classical music was already commonly called universal-international, and that it is the music that satisfies the modern spirit.¹⁷⁵ Dungga and Manik suggested that merely rearranging Indonesian songs into a symphony orchestral format does not mean that the Indonesian music has already risen to the field of instrumental music.¹⁷⁶ To Dungga and Manik, creating a high form of Indonesian music—one that resembles the quality of European classical music—is the way to develop music with a national character. Hence, for Cornel Simanjuntak, Amir Pasaribu, Dungga, and Manik, it is necessary for Indonesian national music to make use of traditional musics, but it needs to be framed within European classical music idiom.¹⁷⁷ Accordingly, Miller classified both Simanjuntak and Pasaribu as precursors of Western-oriented stream in Indonesian art music composition.

At first glance, this stance shared by Simanjuntak, Pasaribu, Dungga, and Manik may appear as xenocentrist (in its narrow sense); that they believed European culture (in this case, the music) was better than Indonesian. However, they also were undoubtedly nationalist, for their ideas were all intended for the good of their nation. This ambivalence demonstrates that the concern among Indonesians to look to the European other in the search of our identity remained evincing until this period of 1945 to 1998. The image of prestige and quality attached to European classical music (as I discussed in Chapter 1) perhaps already too deeply perceived by the Indonesians. It is important to remember that the idea of superiority of classical music was, after all, one of the legacies of European Enlightenment, which in turn served as the foundation/justification for the civilizing mission of colonization.

Varia Ibukota by Mochtar Embut

In their historiography of Indonesian art music compositions, both Franki Notosudirdjo and Christopher Miller did not consider arrangements of traditional songs/music as art music, and therefore did not discuss such arrangement in their works. Whereas arrangement of several traditional songs into

¹⁷⁰Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 138.

¹⁷¹Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 223.

¹⁷²Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 226.

¹⁷³Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 227.

¹⁷⁴Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 229.

¹⁷⁵Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 122-123.

¹⁷⁶Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 135.

¹⁷⁷Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 230.

And these are the 4 variations of the melody:



Figure 2.2. Variation 1 of the melody



Figure 2.3. Variation 2 of the melody



Figure 2.4. Variation 3 of the melody



Figure 2.5. Variation 4 of the melody

Interestingly, because Embut did not use the most-known melody of *Jali-jali*, upon first hearing, perhaps most Indonesians would not recognize it immediately as *Jali-jali*. The distinct Indonesian sound that I immediately perceived upon hearing *Varia Ibukota* the first time was due to the constant (like an *ostinato*) and distinctly audible *kroncong* rhythm. Embut mostly set this rhythm in the lower string instruments (viola, violincello, and double bass). A good example of this can be found in the beginning of the fourth variation of *Jali-jali*:

The image shows a musical score for the Kroncong rhythm in *Varia Ibukota*. The score is arranged for five instruments: Violin I (Vln. I), Violin II (Vln. II), Viola (Vla.), Violoncello (Vc.), and Double Bass (Cb.). The tempo is marked 'poco accel.' and 'Allegro'. The key signature is one sharp (F#). The score is divided into two systems. The first system shows the beginning of the piece with a 'poco accel.' marking. The second system shows the 'Allegro' section, which begins with a 'pizz.' (pizzicato) marking and a 'mf' (mezzo-forte) dynamic. The Kroncong rhythm is characterized by a steady, repetitive pattern of eighth notes in the lower strings (Viola, Vc., and Cb.), while the violins play a more melodic line. The score includes various musical notations such as slurs, accents, and dynamic markings.

Figure 2.6. *Kroncong* rhythm in *Varia Ibukota* played by the violas, cellos, and double basses

In sum, although *Varia Ibukota* (and other arrangements) were not discussed by Notosudirdjo and Miller in the canon of Indonesian art music, this arrangement/composition seems to adhere to some of the conceptions of national music as I discussed so far. It is composed largely in a European classical music manner (i.e. harmony, symphonic form, variations on a theme) hence 'respectable', yet it also incorporated traditional music (Betawi folk songs) with the distinct *kroncong* rhythm and sound that was retained successfully. In other words, it is a good illustration of the synthesis between European and Indonesian musics.

The Emergence of Indonesian Contemporary Music (*Musik Kontemporer*)

Indonesian art music in the 1900s to the 1950s, of which some I discussed in Chapter 1 and above, were dominated by compositions and arrangements that took European classical music idiom as its basis, although they also often incorporated Indonesian traditional music elements and Indonesian poems. Notosudirdjo argues that this European classical music-based style of composition became the predominant aesthetic of Indonesian national (art) music.¹⁷⁹ However, Miller argues that many of the Indonesian *musik kontemporer* (contemporary music) compositions, which emerged in the late 1970s, are essentially traditionally-based. While compositions in the 1900s-1950s were mostly of European music idiom and harmonically conventional, *musik kontemporer* often show similar end results to the experimental works of the avant-garde European and American composers. But Miller argues but the means to produce these results were different and thoroughly 'Indological.' According to Miller, 'Indological' means that these compositions embody the logic and features of traditional Indonesian music, such as rote learning, collaboration, and highly idiomatic improvisation.¹⁸⁰ These compositions often did not involve the production of detailed scores which were then realized by the performers, and the composers develop the pieces over the course of an extensive rehearsal process in collaboration with the performers.¹⁸¹ In some of these compositions, Ali Boediardjo's idea of *gamelan* as the basis for national music seems to come into fruition. An example can be found in Frans Haryadi's composition *Kenangan Masa Lampau*, which was composed for a *gamelan* orchestra.¹⁸² However, the *gamelan* orchestra in this piece is an entirely new one because Haryadi combined Betawi, Sundanese, Javanese, and Balinese *gamelan* instruments together. The score of this music piece is in the form of the overarching structure/framework of the piece. To realize this score, Haryadi then gave directions to the

¹⁷⁹Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," i.

¹⁸⁰Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 10-11.

¹⁸¹Miller, "Cosmopolitan, Nativist," 227-228.

¹⁸²Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 344-345.

gamelan musicians on how to work within the structure based on traditional practices.

Classical and Orchestral Music Performances

During 1945 to 1949, before the Indonesian independence was recognized by the Dutch government, Dutch colonial government still governed particular areas in Indonesia, including forming a symphony orchestra. In 1948, 65 Dutch musicians were brought to Indonesia to form the Radio Philharmonic Orchestra, led by Dutch conductor/musician Yvon Baarspul.¹⁸³ The performances of this orchestra were targeted exclusively for Dutch people and other foreigners in Jakarta.¹⁸⁴ As a part of the celebration of Queen Wilhelmina's birthday in 1948, for example, the orchestra performed for Dutch audience and distinguished indigenous Indonesians who were invited to the occasion.

As for Indonesian professional symphony orchestras, there were not many that established after the Dutch-established Radio Philharmonic Orchestra. However, in the orchestras that were established, the association between European music and orchestra with prestige remains palpable. The Radio of the Republic of Indonesia (RRI) had two orchestras, Orkes Radio Jakarta and Orkes Studio Jakarta, and continued to be the host of these two orchestras until 1966. Orkes Radio Jakarta consisted mainly of the remaining Dutch musicians and focused on playing mostly classical music repertoires, while Orkes Studio Jakarta, led by the Indonesian musician Syaiful Bahri, exclusively played Indonesian music. Christopher Miller notes that the relationship between these two orchestras (e.g. broadcast time, the prestige of each in the eyes of the audiences) is unclear, but a comment by Amir Pasaribu provides an indication of how the relationship might be.¹⁸⁵ Pasaribu remarked that the Indonesian musicians did not care about the “the 'white skin' orchestras” and regarded themselves as inferior to “the ‘white skinned.’”¹⁸⁶ In 1966, Orkes Simfoni Jakarta was founded by the initiation of the then Governor of DKI Jakarta Ali Sadikin. This orchestra was a merging of Orkes Radio Jakarta and Orkes Studio Jakarta; which Edhi Susilo deems as also a merging of East and West.¹⁸⁷ Ali Sadikin perceived the orchestra as a way to introduce Indonesia to foreigners in Jakarta. Hence, a Western-style orchestra was seen as the suitable way of presenting Indonesia in the eyes of foreigners. The orchestra's repertoires were always a mix between Western music and Indonesian music (although more Western pieces). In the late 1990s, some more orchestras were founded: Twilite Orchestra was founded in 1999 and Nusantara Symphony Orchestra in 1998. Twilite Orchestra is developed more into a pops orchestra, while Nusantara Symphony Orchestra is European classical music-oriented.

In 1964, *Sekolah Musik Indonesia* (SMIND), that was once headed by Amir Pasaribu, was expanded into a music-specialized high school and a university-level classical music academy (Indonesian Music Academy/*Akademi Musik Indonesia* (AMI), later merged with other art colleges and renamed as Indonesian Institute of Arts/*Institut Seni Indonesia* (ISI)). Especially during its initial years, the teaching staff at AMI was dominated by musicians from the *Kraton* orchestra and European musicians such as Rene Baumgartner (Germany), Leo Fuch (Germany), and Nicolay Varvolomeyef (Russia). As AMI was the first Western-modelled music academy in post-independence Indonesia, this arrangement continued the association between European classical music and the upper classes of the society (*Kraton* musicians

183Notosudirdjo, “Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity,” 90.

184Susilo, “Aktivitas dan Perkembangan Orkes Simfoni Jakarta,” 84-86.

185Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 77.

186Amir Pasaribu, *Musik dan Selingkar Wilajahnja* (Jakarta: Perpustakaan Perguruan Kementerian P. P. dan K, 1955), quoted in Miller, “Cosmopolitan, Nativist,” 77-78.

187Susilo, “Aktivitas dan Perkembangan Orkes Simfoni Jakarta,” 1.

and European whites). AMI (and later ISI) had its own student orchestra, which held performances both within the university and outside. The written record of the performances of this orchestra is limited, but from the available record, the repertoires of the orchestra comprised standard European classical music works by composers such as Milhaud and Vivaldi and arrangements of Indonesian folk songs.¹⁸⁸ My late grandfather Dailamy Hasan served some time as the director of SMIND and later as the first director of AMI. Based on my mother's account, during his tenure in AMI he produced performances of standard opera works such as Puccini's *Madame Butterfly* and *La Boheme*. Performances of chamber music and solo recital were also held regularly.

Conclusion

This chapter has shown that in the quest for national culture during the period of 1945 to 1998, the concern in positioning the relationship between the Indonesian culture and Western cultures remained palpable. The focus of the development of national culture in the field of arts was in the selection of domestic and foreign arts that were deemed to be worthy to be incorporated in the national culture. As a general rule, the preferred arts were the ones that were regarded as of high quality, good moral character, and respectable (i.e. not vulgar). In terms of music, as shown by both the Old Order and the New Order and as expressed by Amir Pasaribu, J.A. Dungga, and L. Manik, European classical music and orchestral form were viewed as the most respectable, and hence appropriate to be incorporated in the national music. This was most conspicuous in the orchestration of the national anthem *Indonesia Raya* by Joz Cleber, and in the rise of the genre *lagu seriosa*, which is a 'serious' art song modelled on the European art songs of Schubert and Mendelssohn. The case study of the arrangement/composition *Varia Ibukota* by Mochtar Embut, albeit being an arrangement and therefore was commonly not considered as a part of Indonesian art music compositions, serves as a good example of the manifestation of those ideas of national culture and national music (i.e. European music-based, in orchestral form, but also incorporated Indonesian music tradition). This dominance of Western-based compositions in the 1940s to the 1950s was then balanced by the emergence of *musik kontemporer* in the late 1970s. Many of these *musik kontemporer* compositions are, as argued by Christopher Miller, thoroughly based on the logic and idioms of Indonesian traditional music. However, in the context of art music performance, performances of European classical music and orchestral arrangements of pop and folk songs as practiced in the nineteenth and twentieth century East Indies continued to be dominant. These performances were now practiced by Indonesian symphony orchestras, such as Orkes Radio Jakarta, Orkes Simfoni Jakarta, Twilite Orchestra, Nusantara Symphony Orchestra, and the orchestra of ISI.

¹⁸⁸Susilo, "Aktivitas dan Perkembangan Orkes Simfoni Jakarta," 108-111.

CHAPTER 3

INDONESIA IN THE REFORMATION ERA (1998-2018)

Suharto and the New Order regime fell in 1998, and the post-1998 era is called the Reformation era. Having learned from 53 years of authoritarian regimes, Indonesia was determined to improve the quality of democracy in the nation. This has been manifested, among others, through a direct election for the president of the Republic of Indonesia. From 1998 to 2004, the presidents (i.e. B.J. Habibie, Abdurrahman Wahid, and Megawati Soekarnoputri) were still elected by the members of the Upper House, but starting in 2004, the presidents (i.e. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono (2004-2014) and Joko Widodo (2014-present)) had been elected directly by the people. Another significant change in the Reformation era is the decentralization of governance, which is manifested in the system of *otonomi daerah* (regional autonomy). With *otonomi daerah*, the regional governments are given autonomy and authority to manage their own regions. According to Law No. 23 of 2014 about Regional Government, there are some areas that are strictly still have be managed by the central government, such as international politics, national defense and security, national monetary and fiscal, and religions. The regional governments, in turn, are responsible in managing other areas of government in their own region, including education, health, public works, public housing and social welfare, labour, the environment, and culture. One of the consequences of this policy is the change in the system of development planning. Before Reformation, the national government formulated the development plans and implemented them in all regions in Indonesia in a top-down manner (i.e. without consultation with the regional governments). After 2004, the national development programs have to always be consulted with the government of all 34 provinces in Indonesia. The regional governments—in the levels of province and cities/regencies—have the liberty to formulate their own development programs, in consultation with the national government.

In this chapter I look at the policies related to national culture within this changed political and governmental environment. To explore the venture for the creation of national music during this period, I turn to a case study of *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* by Arya Pugala Kittu, which was composed recently in 2017. In terms of performances, I discuss the practices of contemporary symphony orchestras Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic. Some musicological studies have been done to analyze the politics of practices of such contemporary symphony orchestras around the world; especially to look at how the form of symphony orchestra is continuously reshaped according to the orchestras' idiomatic agendas. A study by Tina K. Ramnarine, for instance, analyzes the Baltic Youth Philharmonic Orchestra as a site of bidirectional political projects: on the one hand it fosters collaboration between the Baltic states within the context of pan-European integration, and on the other hand it also preserves the national identities of the states.¹⁸⁹ The dialectic between these two orientations is reflected in the choices of repertoire of the orchestra, which often include folk-inspired music. Another notable study is Rachel Beckels Willson's analysis of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra—the orchestra that was founded by Edward Said and Daniel Barenboim with the intention to promote peace and solidarity between Israel and Palestine (and between Arabs and Jewish in general).¹⁹⁰ In the study, Willson critically examines the

¹⁸⁹Tina K. Ramnarine, "Musical Performance as Storytelling: Memory, European Integration, and the Baltic Youth Philharmonic Orchestra," *Muzikologija* 16 (2014): 83-103. doi: <https://doi.org/10.2298/muz1416083r>.

¹⁹⁰Rachel Beckels Willson, "The Parallax Worlds of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 134 no. 2 (2009): 319-347. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/02690400903109109>.

parallax¹⁹¹ in the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra. Willson argues that in contrast to the orchestra's explicit goal as countering violence, the internal sociality of the orchestra contains disconcerting unharmonious relationships. My analysis at this chapter looks at Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic as case studies of such negotiations in the context of Indonesia. Both of the orchestras serve as an illustration of how the perception about European classical music is being perpetuated and reshaped, as European classical music and performance form are negotiated with nationalistic ideas in post-colonial Indonesia. Because Gita Bahana Nusantara is a youth orchestra, I also refer to Margaret Kartomi's characterization of youth orchestras around the world.

At the end of this chapter, I discuss the complex interrelationship between ethnicity and participation in Indonesian symphony orchestras in the present day, which requires a look back to the history of ethnic tension in Indonesia. Since the Dutch colonial time, there has been a gap and a tension between 'native' Indonesians (*pribumi*) and the Chinese Indonesians. The colonial government segregated the people in the East Indies into 3 categories of social status: the first was the European whites, the second was the Chinese, and the last was the *pribumi*. This segregation led to differentiation in the facilities and privileges each of the category could access, and caused separation in social life between the races. As a result, since the rise of the nationalist movement driven by the *pribumi* nationalists to resist the colonial (the European whites) power, Chinese Indonesians were largely excluded. After the independence, during Suharto's New Order era, ethnic differences were ignored and Chinese Indonesians identity was suppressed. This long and complex history of the tension between *pribumi* and Chinese Indonesians affected, among many others, Chinese Indonesians' choices in education, including in classical music performance education. Supported by my observation from my research internship with Twilite Orchestra and Bandung Philharmonic, I argue that this has resulted in the minimum participation of Chinese Indonesian musicians in Indonesian symphony orchestras in the present day.

National Culture in the Reformation Era

As a consequence of regional autonomy, cultural development programs in regional level are also determined by the regional governments. This means that the regional arts supported by the government are more widespread, because the development program is decentralized, and therefore more regional arts can be supported by their respective regional governments. From my knowledge as a citizen of Indonesia, and from my work experience in the National Development Planning Agency from 2008 to 2013, I can confirm that the decentralized governance and planning system was indeed implemented. Perhaps that is partly why during that time, I did not hear substantial debates in the national level about creating a specific, fixed kind of a national culture. However, this does not mean that the national government is no longer giving general directions on various matters, including on cultural development. In 2017, the national government issued Law No. 5 about Cultural Advancement. The Law states that:

The Indonesian national culture is the whole process and result of intercultural interaction that occur and develop in Indonesia. This development is dynamic in nature; marked by intercultural interaction within cultures in Indonesia as well as with foreign cultures, within the context of the dynamic global change.¹⁹²

¹⁹¹Willson draws the definition of parallax from Zysek's *The Parallel View*, in which it is described as "a perspective on processes that are connected to one another in the deepest sense, but that nonetheless never merge."

¹⁹²"Kebudayaan Nasional Indonesia adalah keseluruhan proses dan hasil interaksi antar-kebudayaan yang hidup dan

The sentence still has the same idea of a national culture as an aggregate of cultures from all across Indonesia, but it does not imply the need to create a national culture from a synthesis of those cultures. It also still addresses the connection between cultures in Indonesia and cultures from other countries, but it gives the impression of this connection being acknowledged as a natural part of the current condition of a globalized world. At least in the level of idea, this conception feels less 'anxious' about the positioning of Indonesian culture than in the conception of Dewantara and other cultural nationalists in the early twentieth century.

However, in the break-down of national policies as set in the Medium-Term National Development Plan 2015-2019 (*Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional/RPJMN*), the focus seems to be on the strengthening of local identities and cultures. One of the main targets for cultural development as stated in the RPJMN is the "strengthening of national character and identity."¹⁹³ This policy backgrounded by a list of problems which includes: "the decrease in the trust and love among Indonesians of domestic products," and the "low awareness among Indonesians about Indonesian cultural diversity, historical values, and local wisdoms."¹⁹⁴ The plan also stated that the challenge that the nation expects to face in the realization of this target is to "increase society's ability in adopting global cultures that are positive and productive."¹⁹⁵ This statement is somewhat similar to the stance showed during the period of 1945 to 1998, in which the Old Order and the New Order regimes rejected the 'decadent' foreign cultures, and the need to only select the positive and 'respectable' ones.

I found that the conception of national identity and culture as stated in the Law 5/2017 was also articulated by some of my respondents during my research internship with Indonesian symphony orchestras (Bandung Philharmonic and Twilite Orchestra) in 2017. The respondents regarded the cross-cultural mix between Western musical form and Indonesian music as a natural and inevitable impact of globalization, just like how it happens everywhere else in the world. They also did not think of the mixing as signifying that Indonesian music is not good enough, or needs to be 'elevated' to a Western form.

I do not see it as something wrong (...) to me it provides an opportunity (...) how the orchestral setting that allows complex harmony opens up opportunities of new sensations, of new harmony (if mixed with traditional Indonesian music).¹⁹⁶

(In the Independence Day concert) we performed patriotic songs in a symphonic orchestra form; it moved the audience, brought them to tears. (The symphonic form) creates new meaning, transforms the songs positively.¹⁹⁷

berkembang di Indonesia. Perkembangan tersebut bersifat dinamis, yang ditandai oleh adanya interaksi antar-kebudayaan baik di dalam negeri maupun dengan budaya lain dari luar Indonesia dalam proses dinamika perubahan dunia."

193Buku II Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2015-2019, 2-60.

194Buku II Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2015-2019, 2-61.

195Buku II Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2015-2019, 2-61.

196Interview with Bambang Sugiharto (Professor of Philosophy at the Catholic University of Parahyangan, Bandung and a board member of Bandung Philharmonic), 15 September 2017.

197Interview with Addie MS (conductor of Twilite Orchestra), 18 August 2017.

It is fine; it makes the music more appealing to young people.¹⁹⁸

However, similarly to the policy in RPJMN 2015-2019, some also made the point that this mixing still needs to be done selectively and fairly so that it does not reduce the value of the Indonesian cultures:

As long as it (the mixing) does not change the message of the Indonesian songs, I think it is perfectly fine to do it.¹⁹⁹

In the globalization of culture, the people love the mixed stuff, as long as it is proportional.²⁰⁰

It is OK, as long as the Indonesian culture is also developed/amplified, not just the orchestra.²⁰¹

***Suvenir dari Minangkabau* by Arya Pugala Kitti**

During my research internship with Bandung Philharmonic, I had the chance to observe their preparation for their September 2017 concert. One of the pieces they performed in the concert was *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* by Arya Pugala Kitti. This piece was the winner of the 2017 Young Composer's Competition (which was held by the orchestra). Upon hearing it for the first time during the rehearsal, I was struck by the similarities of sound between *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* and *Varia Ibukota*. *Suvenir* was also distinctively Indonesian, but also sounded like classical symphony at times. *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* ("Souvenir from Minangkabau") is an original composition by Kitti. As the title clearly shows, the composition takes inspiration from the music of Minangkabau, which denotes both an ethnic group and the highlands in West Sumatera to which the ethnic group indigenous. Similarly to *Varia Ibukota*, to my ears, the primary factor which contributes to the distinct Indonesian sound was the constant and clearly audible rhythmic pattern, which immediately reminded me of the music of *tari piring* (one of Minangkabau traditional dances). This was confirmed by my interview with Kitti, in which he remarked that although he did not draw upon *tari piring* specifically, but he indeed drew inspirations from Minangkabau traditional dances.

Also similarly to *Varia Ibukota*, Kitti set the rhythmic pattern mostly in the lower string instruments and lower brass instruments (french horn, trombone and tuba). Additionally, Kitti's originally-composed melodies were also derived from melodies of traditional Minangkabau music, hence added the distinct Indonesian sound of the piece. In terms of instrumentation, Kitti set for a tambourine as one of the percussion instruments, because it imitates the sound of a *rebana* (traditional Malay percussive instrument, which is often used in the performances of Minangkabau music).

198Interview with musician, 14 August 2017.

199Interview with Rama Widi (harpist), 16 August 2017.

200Interview with Nandya Abror (cellist), 15 August 2017.

201Interview with musician, 14 August 2017.

The image shows a musical score for three lower string instruments: Viola, Cello, and Contrabass. The music is in 4/4 time and features a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes. The Viola part has a melody of eighth notes starting on G4. The Cello and Contrabass parts play a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes starting on G2. Dynamics include forte (f) and pizzicato (pizz).

Figure 3.1. Rhythmic pattern in *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* played by the lower string instruments (bars 1-2)

Apart from those features, *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* was largely written in European classical music idioms. It is set for a full symphony orchestra and is harmonically tonal. Its overall form resembles a simpler version of a sonata form. Kitti remarked that he drew inspiration from the structure of Astor Piazzolla's works. This single-movement piece is structured into: (short introduction)-fast section-slow section-fast section-(short and contrasting ending). The fast-slow-fast sections are all based on the same subject/theme.

In sum, *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* combines the melodic and rhythmic style of Minangkabau traditional music with European classical music idioms (i.e. orchestral instrumentation, harmony, form). In other words, the piece, like *Varia Ibukota*, manifests the idea of national culture as a 'synthesis' of Indonesian and European cultures, and the concept of European music-based national music as expressed by Pasaribu and Simanjuntak. Moreover, Kitti himself remarks that his intention in composing is almost always nationalistic—to create a contemporary Indonesian musical identity. Below is an excerpt from my interview with Kitti²⁰²:

Aniarani. What is your end goal in composing?

Arya Kitti. Perhaps to create an identity of Indonesian composition. I am certain that Indonesia is very rich of musical materials that can be brought into orchestral form (the composition competition was for symphonic composition) (...) What I did mostly with *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* was to bring out the character of Minangkabau music. (...) From the Minangkabau music that I have been listening, the most stand-out characters for me are joy and hyperactivity. So the first thing I try to do was to bring out those characters. Deliberation on the palette (of sounds) came later. The symphonic orchestra palette is a little bit too mild (for Minangkabau music) (...) so I tried to think about what I could use to bring out the character (...) then I decided to go with the piccolo (to play the melody), for example, to bring out this character.

A. Weren't composers like Debussy and (Colin) McPhee also tried to do the same thing?

202Interview with Arya Pugala Kitti, 17 November 2017.

AK. I think the approaches are different. What these composers did was composing European composition and quoting some traditional elements in it. (...) But what I did with *Suvenir dari Minangkabau*, and also (what Embut did with) *Varia Ibukota*, was to create a composition with a traditional music spirit, not just quoting. The end results are very different.

A. Do you think this "spirit" can only be captured by Indonesians?

AK. Yes.

Performances of Indonesian Symphony Orchestras: the Case Studies of Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic

During the Reformation era, some more Indonesian professional symphony orchestras were founded, namely Jakarta Concert Orchestra in 2002, Gita Bahana Nusantara in 2003, Jakarta Simfonia Orchestra in 2009, and Jakarta City Philharmonic and Bandung Philharmonic in 2016. In their practices, the prestige of classical and orchestral music are maintained through, among others, the locations of their concerts. Most of these concerts took place in locations that are considered prestigious, such as in Gedung Kesenian Jakarta (formerly the Schouwburg), Balai Sarbini (a large concert hall) in Jakarta, the theaters in Taman Ismail Marzuki complex, or Aula Simfonia, the most recently established and most lavish concert hall in Jakarta owned by a wealthy Christian church. Moreover, the association between classical music and Europeans continues to be perpetuated by the active sponsoring of classical music performances by foreign institutions in Indonesia. During 2005 to 2015²⁰³, the majority of European classical music concerts (includes chamber music concert, solo recital, and symphonic orchestra concert) were held in and by foreign cultural institutions, such as the Erasmus Huis, Goethe Institute, the French Cultural Center, and the embassies of Sweden and Poland.



Figure 3.2. Aula Simfonia in Jakarta, adorned with pictures of the 'great' European composers around the hall²⁰⁴

²⁰³This is based on *Almanak Musik Indonesia 2005-2015*, which contains chronology of music performances in Indonesia from 2005 to 2015. It was published by a private foundation with support from the Ministry of Education and Culture.

See Kelik M. Nugroho, *Almanak Musik Indonesia 2005-2015* (Jakarta: Yayasan Tali Kemanusiaan, 2015).

²⁰⁴Picture was taken from the official website of Aula Simfonia, <http://aulasimfoniajakarta.com/about>.

Gita Bahana Nusantara

Gita Bahana Nusantara (GBN) is a state-organized symphony orchestra and choir. The name Gita Bahana Nusantara can be translated into an echo of songs across the Indonesian archipelago.²⁰⁵ The Ministry of Culture and Tourism²⁰⁶ established GBN in 2003 based on an idea by Megawati Soekarnoputri, the president of Indonesia at the time.²⁰⁷ Megawati's idea of GBN was for the state to have an official orchestra and choir that involve young musicians and singers from all over Indonesia. Among the stated goals of GBN are to (i) strengthen the national identity and character, and to (ii) foster the spirit of nationalism, tolerance, and solidarity among the youth.

GBN's activity each year is started by auditions for the choir and orchestra members, then followed by intensive 3-weeks of training, a premier performance at the Ministry of Education and Culture, a performance at the Annual Presidential Address at the Plenary Assembly of the National Parliament, and culminated in a performance at the Independence Day State Ceremony (in 17 August) at the Presidential Palace in Jakarta. The criteria for the selection of the members are: (i) musical talent, (ii) good sight-reading technique, (iii) clear articulation and character of voice, (iv) good achievement at schools, and (v) good knowledge of their local cultures. In the training weeks, the participants are not only receiving musical training, but also given courses on patriotism and character development. The orchestra of GBN consists of standard Western symphony orchestra instruments as well as band instruments (drum kit, guitar and bass guitar) and traditional instruments.

In her assessment of the establishment of youth orchestras around the world, Margaret Kartomi outlines the common ideals of these youth orchestras: (i) the educational, aiming to improve individuals' and groups' playing standards and career prospects; (ii) the socio-ethical, aiming to find ways of promoting class, racial and gender equity and opportunities for players to join in relatively remote areas; and (iii) the socio-political, aiming to improve relations between groups of people at the various levels, for example, between schools, suburbs, cities, regional or rural areas, nations, and groups of nations.²⁰⁸ The ideals of GBN include all three: it is educational because it strives to train the members and hence improve their musical ability, it is socio-ethical because it commits to provide opportunities for musicians from all over Indonesia, and it is socio-political because it aims to foster solidarity between its members. The opportunity that is supposedly provided for youth musicians from all over Indonesia, however, has not been fully realized. While audition for choir members is held in all 34 provinces, the audition for orchestra members is held only in Jakarta and Jogjakarta, hence limiting the opportunities for potential members from outside Java.²⁰⁹

205Nusantara originally denotes the geographical region of Majapahit kingdom in the fifteenth century, but it is now often used to denote the Republic of Indonesia.

206In 2011, the Ministry was restructured into the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy and the Ministry of Education and Culture. From 2012-2014, GBN was managed by the former. In 2015, the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy gave the management of GBN to the Ministry of Education and Culture.

207Edi Irawan, "Sekilas tentang Paduan Suara dan Orkestra Gita Bahana Nusantara," *Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya: Sejarah & Tutorial Lagu Kebangsaan 3 Stanza*, accessed 15 April 2018, <http://laguindonesiaraya.id/2017/07/31/sekilas-gita-bahana-nusantara/>.

208Margaret Kartomi, "Youth Orchestra in the Global Scene," *Australasian Music Research* 9 (2007): 19.

209Michael Budiman Mulyadi, "17 Agustus dan Musik Gita Bahana Nusantara Sebagai Kebijakan Budaya," *Musical Promenade Blog*, August 20, 2016, <http://musicalprom.com/2016/08/20/17-agustus-dan-musik-gita-bahana-nusantara-sebagai-kebijakan-budaya/>.

In addition to those three ideals, GBN's most striking feature is its fundamentally nationalistic character. It was established by the state government for the purpose of serving the nation. GBN certainly aims to educate the musicians, but the incentive for the musicians and singers to join GBN also largely derived from the pride and honor of performing in honorable state occasions and in front of the President. As with the case of Orkes Simfoni Jakarta, the orchestra and the choir are also brought forward by the state as the 'ambassador' of Indonesia. The orchestra is a showcase of the richness and diversity of Indonesian culture and arts, and the youth Indonesians' capability in performing a 'modern' European art form, including to the foreign guests invited and present at the Independence Day state ceremony. The repertoire they perform is exclusively folk songs and patriotic songs which are arranged into a medley. In the performances, the choir members wear their own traditional attires. These performance styles are not only meant to display the diversity of Indonesia, but also to—in relation to the socio-political ideal—illustrate that all Indonesians can all get along peacefully, despite their differences in cultures, ethnicity, and religions. This is a goal that has been attached to youth symphony orchestras all across the world, such as the West Eastern Divan Orchestra that was conceived as a forum in which Israel and Palestine young musicians can work together in harmony, and the National Youth Orchestra of Iraq, which is also aimed to foster peace and collaboration between Arab and Kurdish musicians. Michael Budiman Mulyadi, an Indonesian musicologist and conductor, writes about GBN in 2016:

The orchestra and choir become the manifestation of the value of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, with 136 singers from 34 provinces. The diversity of the orchestra instruments, combined with traditional instruments, also become something that is brought forward as a manifestation of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*.²¹⁰

In the current political climate in Jakarta, which is thick with debates and dichotomy between Muslim and non-Muslim Indonesians,²¹¹ this idea of orchestra as a metaphor of 'unity in diversity' became increasingly prominent and echoed by some other Indonesian orchestras. In an interview with Addie MS (the co-founder and conductor of Twilite Orchestra) during my internship, Addie remarks that he believes that symphonic music can teach Indonesians about respecting differences.²¹² Addie testifies that Twilite Orchestra's Independence Day concert in 2017 was especially significant, because it was not only to continue their tradition but also to remind the audiences about nationalism and patriotism (as a response to the current political tension). Bandung Philharmonic, with which I also interned, also made the attempt to promote their orchestra as supporting *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* and *Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia/NKRI* (The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia). In a video titled "Celebrating Harmony" (which I directed under the supervision of the orchestra's executive director), the orchestra's vision in promoting a dialogue between Western and Indonesian cultures and their commitment to commission and premiere compositions by Indonesian composers are brought forward as the orchestra's contribution in manifesting *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*. Through music, especially of the Indonesian composers—who came from different backgrounds and whose compositions often incorporate traditional music from various regions in Indonesia—they (and hopefully also the audiences) were reminded of the vastness and diversity of Indonesian culture, and therefore reminded that Indonesia has always been diverse and never been owned by only one religion/ethnic group/race.

²¹⁰Mulyadi, "17 Agustusan."

²¹¹The situation was started with the accusation against Basuki Tjahja Purnama, the former governor of DKI Jakarta and a Chinese and non-Muslim Indonesian, and later his incarceration for blasphemy.

²¹²Interview with Addie MS (conductor of Twilite Orchestra), 3 July 2017.

In the case GBN, the orchestra is not only meant to display Indonesian diversity, but also to showcase Indonesians' capability in performing a modern Western musical form. A GBN choir member re-articulated this idea, by stating that she was very happy and honored to be a member of GBN 2017, because GBN choristers capability in Western-style performance (i.e. ability to read Western notation) is superior to that of other regular singers:

Many people can sing, but not all can read (Western) notation. Here in GBN we are all can read notation.²¹³

The Ministry also makes sure that GBN members are not only playing music (i.e. having pure fun and entertainment), but also receive character development training to prepare them to be the leaders of the nation. At the occasion of the opening of GBN training weeks in 2017, an official of the Ministry of Education and Culture remarked that

I think this (GBN) is exceptional, because it is not only about music training, but also about character development. It is so because (in these training weeks) there will be officers from the National Army and the National Police who will train GBN members about discipline (...) they (GBN members) are expected to be leaders in the future.²¹⁴

It is striking that for such purposes of representing Indonesia in a setting as significant as the state ceremonies and 'developing' the future leaders of the nation the government opted to go with a symphony orchestra form—a thoroughly European performance form. GBN does involve traditional musical instruments, but in quantity they are much fewer than the orchestral instruments. This shows consonance with the stance taken by the governments since the independence—that classical music, especially orchestra, is not only tolerable but also a form that is regarded as 'worthy' for the nationalistic purpose—a highly respected form of art and a symbol of prestige and grandeur. Michael Mulyadi views this adoption of a Western orchestral form in GBN positively—that that is what makes GBN Indonesian, because Indonesian culture has always been a synthesis of foreign and Indonesian culture: :

Orchestra is a Western musical form, and (in GBN) it is adopted into our own. Orchestral music is indeed grand and has a prestige factor, and it allows participation of a large number of people. GBN displays Indonesian value precisely in this adoption of Western culture into our own.²¹⁵

Furthermore, similar to the the argument of *Indonesia Raya* using Western music idiom due to its neutrality, Mulyadi states that:

An orchestra, which consists of many different instruments and governed by an international convention/standard, is considered

²¹³Denny Parsaulian Sinaga, “Gita Bahana Nusantara Bangun Karakter Generasi Muda,” *Media Indonesia Online*, August 16, 2017, <http://www.mediaindonesia.com/read/detail/117714-gita-bahana-nusantara-bangun-karakter-generasi-muda>.

²¹⁴Sinaga, “Gita Bahana Nusantara Bangun Karakter Generasi Muda.”

²¹⁵Mulyadi, “17 Agustusan.”

neutral and therefore apt to represent the diversity of Indonesia.²¹⁶

Moreover, Addie MS points out that performing patriotic songs with a symphony orchestra has the effect of making the songs more evocative for the audiences. When I asked an audience about his opinion regarding Twilite Orchestra's 2017 Independence Day concert, he remarked that the patriotic songs—which he used to consider as banal because he was so accustomed to sing and listen to them during his schooling days²¹⁷—sounded 'grander' and he felt moved by the performance.



Figure 3.3. The Independence Day State Ceremony 2017 at the Presidential Palace, Jakarta²¹⁸



Figure 3.4. President Joko Widodo and First Lady Iriana Widodo watched over the ceremony

²¹⁶Mulyadi, “17 Agustusan.”

²¹⁷Patriotic songs which were performed by Twilite Orchestra in the concert, such as *Padamu Negeri, Maju Tak Gentar*, and *Hari Merdeka*, are mandatory to be known and performed by Indonesian schoolchildren.

²¹⁸Figures 3.3 to 3.7 are stills from the television broadcast of the Independence Day State Ceremony in 2017.



Figure 3.5. Foreign diplomats and guests present at the ceremony



Figure 3.6. GBN orchestra performed at the ceremony



Figure 3.7. Some of the choir members with traditional attires

In 2017, the Ministry of Education and Culture undertook a project to revive and re-socialize the 3 stanzas of *Indonesia Raya*. This project was implemented due to the notion that most Indonesians recognize *Indonesia Raya* as consisting of only 1 stanza. GBN was also involved in this project. The Ministry held a concert of GBN's alumnus performing the 3 stanzas of *Indonesia Raya* in Aula Simfonia. In a comment regarding this project, the current Minister of Education and Culture Muhadjir Effendy again re-articulating the idea of GBN—through its performances of 3 stanzas *Indonesian Raya*—as a reminder for Indonesia's diversity:

Indonesians have only been familiar with 1 stanza of *Indonesia Raya*, but it is important to know, understand, and live the meanings of all 3 stanzas of *Indonesia Raya*, so that our love to this country and nation can grow even stronger. Maintaining our great diversity is not easy. There is no other choice to do this than to instill the love for our nation, for the diversity of our people, continuously.²¹⁹

Below is the text of *Indonesia Raya*²²⁰:

Stanza 1

Indonesia my motherland
The land where I spill my blood
That is where I stand
Be the guard of my 'mother'

Indonesia my nationality
My nation and homeland
Let us cry out
Indonesia unites!

Live, my land
Live, my nation
My nation, my people, all of us
Develop, the soul
Develop, the body
For Indonesia Raya

Stanza 2

Indonesia the glorious homeland
Our opulent homeland
That is where I stand
For ever

Indonesia the inherited homeland
A heirloom belongs to us all
Let us pray
Indonesia jubilant!

Flourish, the land
Flourish, the soul
My nation, my people, all of us
Be awake, the heart
Be awake, the consciousness
For Indonesia Raya

Stanza 3

Indonesia the sacred land
Our powerful land
That is where I stand
Guarding the true 'mother'

Indonesia the prosperous land
The land that I love
Let us make a vow
Indonesia for ever!

Be safe, the people
Be safe, the youth
The islands, the seas, all of them
Prosper, the nation
Prosper, the youth
For Indonesia Raya

Refrain:

Indonesia Raya
Freedom freedom (*Merdeka Merdeka*)
My land, my nation that I love
Indonesia Raya
Freedom freedom
Live, Indonesia Raya!

219“Mendikbud: Jaga Keragaman, Hayati Makna Lagu Indonesia Raya,” *Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya: Sejarah & Tutorial Lagu Kebangsaan 3 Stanza*, October, 30, 2017, <http://laguindonesiaraya.id/2017/10/30/mendikbud-jaga-keragaman-hayati-makna-lagu-indonesia-raya/>.

220The text in Indonesian is taken from the official website of the *Indonesia Raya* project (<http://laguindonesiaraya.id>), translation to English is mine.

Jakarta City Philharmonic

The Jakarta City Philharmonic (JCP) was founded in 2016 by the initiation of the Jakarta Arts Council (*Dewan Kesenian Jakarta/DKJ*) and with the financial support of the Indonesia Creative Economy Agency (*Badan Ekonomi Kreatif/BEKRAF*). It is only the second orchestra in Indonesia (after Orkes Simfoni Jakarta in 1966) which is fully funded by the government (after the independence). JCP states that a professional symphony orchestra is a cultural necessity for a modern metropolis like Jakarta.²²¹ While GBN strives to foster nationalism, patriotism, and character building of its members, JCP and BEKRAF aim to contribute to the 'civilization' of Jakarta citizens in particular and Indonesians in general.

Jakarta City Philharmonic strives (...) to bring a world-class music repertoire to the Jakarta's community in particular, and of course, to all Indonesian citizens. Therefore, quality music becomes affordable, not elitist, and easy to access in order to enrich the cultural life of a healthy society.²²²

BEKRAF believes the success of this programme is one of the endeavours to empower urban civilization (...) in a global society. Furthermore, every effort to materialize the programme might hopefully strengthen plurality, diversity; reverberating the new power of creative economy in music.²²³

Similarly to Bandung Philharmonic, JCP also commits to perform Indonesian compositions in each of their concert:

Indonesian composers' symphonic works are a priority to be performed in each edition, presented side by side with the big names of symphonic music which had been already echoed in world's finest orchestral halls. We duly hope that their works might become part of world's repertoires after being presented by Jakarta City Philharmonic.²²⁴

Echoing the arguments of Pasaribu, Dunga, and Manik, JCP also plays the notion of symphonic music as a universal language:

Jakarta City Philharmonic as an institution also embodies a space for cultural dialogue at both national and international levels, as well as plays an active role in promoting world peace through our universal language: music.²²⁵

The Jakarta Arts Council (DKJ) itself was founded long before JCP. It was established in 1968, in

²²¹Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Italia Abad XX: Daur Ulang dan Opera," June 7, 2017.

²²²Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Italia Abad XX: Daur Ulang dan Opera," June 7, 2017.

²²³Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Lanskap Skandinavia," November 23, 2016.

²²⁴Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Italia Abad XX: Daur Ulang dan Opera," June 7, 2017.

²²⁵Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Italia Abad XX: Daur Ulang dan Opera," June 7, 2017.

conjunction with the founding of Taman Ismail Marzuki (TIM) in Jakarta, which was designed to be the Indonesia's national arts center. DKJ consists of divisions that cover theater, dance, music, film, literature, and fine arts. TIM is the venue which houses halls and facilities for activities related to those arts divisions. In 1974, DKJ started to hold a competition for new compositions by Indonesian composers, therefore JCP's commitment to perform Indonesian composition in their concerts can be seen as a continuation of this program. TIM was named after the renowned composer of *lagu seriosa* and patriotic songs Ismail Marzuki. It was established by the Government of DKI Jakarta, with the full support of Ali Sadikin, the then Governor DKI Jakarta who also initiated the founding of Orkes Simfoni Jakarta. As Indonesian curator and writer Alia Swastika notes, TIM, just like classical music and orchestra, also creates “a sense of grandeur, formality and authority.”²²⁶

In the case of JCP, from the statements I quoted above, it can be seen that DKJ perpetuates the idea of classical and orchestral music as the more civilized form of arts, but at the same time it also aims to de-elitize this form of music. The de-elitization is mainly implemented through free admission for their concerts (starting in June 2018, JCP charges the audiences a considerably small admission fee). For the free concerts before June 2018, before each concert potential audiences need to register their interests to attend the concert, and JCP will choose 1000 audiences from the registrations who will get the admission tickets for the concert. Furthermore, responding to a question from one potential audience who did not receive a ticket (through their official Instagram account), JCP stated that they allocated 50% of the 1000 for audiences who have never attended their concert, and another 50% is for audiences who have attended their concert. They remarked that this strategy was done to ensure that more Jakartans/Indonesians can experience a classical/orchestral music concert. In a press conference for the JCP concert in April 2018, Aksan Sjuman (a prominent musician and composer, member of DKJ, and commissioner of JCP) remarked that the interest for this concert was more than they expected.²²⁷ There were 1700 audiences who registered their interests, while JCP could only provide 1000-1200 tickets. Sjuman also expressed that he did not exactly know the reason why Jakartans/Indonesians were so interested in attending this concert (and JCP's past concerts), considering that symphonic music is not a music that is favored by the general population in Indonesia:

Honestly, I do not know why people want to watch this. But the point is this music is not something that can only be enjoyed by the elites, but also by everybody.²²⁸

From my own attendance in 3 JCP concerts in 2017, I could see that the audiences' response was always positive, even rapturous. In each concert, JCP's Instagram account always re-posted postings from JCP's audiences, who expressed their admiration of JCP's performance and its conductor, Budi Utomo Prabowo. Some audiences expressed that they were really happy that they “finally” got an admission ticket and could watch the concert. As with Sjuman's honest uncertainty of why people want to watch JCP, I also can not know if the positive response is due to JCP's quality of performance, or due to the novelty of the experience of watching a symphonic orchestra concert (for free). As most of the audiences are young people, it is probable too that attending JCP's concert has become a 'cool' trend among the youth. Regardless, JCP is certainly successful in giving opportunity to more citizens to

²²⁶Alia Swastika, “Audiences and Art Spaces in Jakarta Post-1998,” in *Performing Contemporary Indonesia: Celebrating Identity, Constructing Community*, ed. Barbara Hatley and Brett Hough (Leiden: Brill, 2015), 225.

²²⁷Bintang Pradewo, “Lingkaran Keabadian dalam Konser Jakarta City Philharmonic,” *Jawa Pos*, April 18, 2018, <https://www.jawapos.com/read/2018/04/18/205486/lingkaran-keabadian-dalam-konser-jakarta-city-philharmonic>.

²²⁸Pradewo, “Lingkaran Keabadian dalam Konser Jakarta City Philharmonic.”

watch an orchestral concert. An orchestra concert in Jakarta is normally priced quite high and can only be afforded by middle and upper class citizens. The tickets for Twilite Orchestra's Independence Day concert 2017, for example, were priced from Rp. 300.000 to Rp. 1.000.000 and tickets for a concert by Nusantara Symphony Orchestra in 2018 were priced from Rp. 250.000 to Rp. 1.500.000.²²⁹ However, JCP still maintains the 'seriousness' of this music, and commits to 'educate' the audiences about the music (hence, "cultivating the civilization"). So far JCP had held 11 performances, which, in accordance to their mission, always included Western classical music repertoires and Indonesian art music compositions. Their choice of Western repertoires, however, seems to often be repertoires that are considered more 'serious', such as Mahler Kindertotenlieder, Webern Passacaglia Op. 1, Copland Appalachian Spring, and Ravel Piano Concerto for Left Hand. In each of their concert, Eric Awuy, a prominent trumpet player and a member of JCP, always gave an pre-concert introduction for the audiences, in which he explained the context of the compositions the orchestra was about to perform.

The Complex Interrelationship Between Ethnicity and Participation in Indonesian Symphony Orchestras

All of the contemporary Indonesian orchestras discussed so far (i.e. Gita Bahana Nusantara, Jakarta City Philharmonic, Twilite Orchestra, Bandung Philharmonic) have in their agenda a manifestation of the idea of orchestra as metaphor of 'unity in diversity' and tolerance despite differences. However, music education in Indonesia (especially of performance of Western classical music instruments) largely is still expensive and considered as a privilege; it is not something that can be accessed easily by all Indonesians. In this way, classical music performance in Indonesia is complexly connected with the issues of ethnicity, religion, and class.

The history of tension and discrimination towards the Chinese Indonesians

In the time of colonialism, the Chinese in Indonesia were placed second within the social strata, below the Europeans but above the native Indonesians. The Chinese were known to be adept in doing business, and therefore they were mostly wealthy. At a time when native Indonesians were under colonial control and economic struggle, the disparity of wealth between them and the Chinese created discontentment and prejudice among the indigenous towards the Chinese.²³⁰ Anti-Chinese riots broke out in 1912 and 1918 in few cities in Indonesia partly as manifestations of these tension and racial antipathies between the indigenous and the Chinese.²³¹

Since the rise of nationalist movement in the early 1900s, Chinese Indonesians were practically not included in the discourse. Indonesian nationalism and the 'imagined nation' of Indonesia included the diversity of ethnics of indigenous Indonesians, but excluded the Chinese Indonesians.²³² For a start,

²²⁹Around €17-€57 and €14-€85, respectively (according to April 2018 currency rate).

²³⁰Semaoen, the leftist leader of the Sarekat Islam (an association of Muslim merchants formed in 1912 which then developed into a political party with an anti-Chinese tendency), noted that the poor natives could not hate the rich fellow natives because they belong to the same race and religion. The hatred towards the rich Dutch was drowned because the Dutch was the ruler and too powerful, while the hatred towards the "alien" rich Chinese had no counterbalance. As quoted in Leo Suryadinata, "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese," in *The Chinese Minority in Indonesia* (Singapore: Chopmen Enterprises, 1978), 67.

²³¹Suryadinata, "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese," 66.

²³²Jacques Bertrand argues that the very nature of a nation is that it "defines principles of inclusion and exclusion." These principles entail some common bonds that define membership of the nation, such as religions, native languages, common histories, or political principles. See Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 16.

Boedi Oetomo did not admit Chinese members.²³³ The Nationalist Party (PNI) stated in their constitution that the persons eligible for the membership in the party are native Indonesians.²³⁴ Certainly, it is possible that some of the Chinese Indonesians themselves chose to be indifferent to the Indonesian nationalist movement, but at the same time, the majority of Indonesian nationalists also did not make attempt to include the Chinese in their endeavours.²³⁵ After the independence, the cleavage between Indonesians and Chinese Indonesians considerably lessened, due to Sukarno's secularist stance which supported Pancasila and broad inclusive criteria in defining the nation of Indonesia.²³⁶ Since 1957, however, when Sukarno's Guided Democracy began, Chinese identity in Indonesia started to be diminished by the government through, among others, a firm control over Chinese-medium schools in order to safeguard the national interest.²³⁷ Under the reign of Suharto and his New Order regime, the exclusion of Chinese Indonesians from the 'imagined nation' was significantly deepened. In the months of terror against the Communist Party (PKI) following the September 1965 movement, membership in one of the religions recognized by the state²³⁸ became a badge of protection against reprisal.²³⁹ Many of the alleged members of PKI—because PKI supported equal status of Chinese Indonesians within the Republic²⁴⁰—were Chinese Indonesians, and many of them chose to align themselves with Christianity.²⁴¹ This phenomenon strengthened the tension, now not only between Chinese Indonesians and indigenous Indonesians, but also between Muslim Indonesians (most indigenous Indonesians are Muslims) and Christian Indonesians.

The New Order regime was also committed in abolishing the racial segregation made during the colonial era, but this was done to the point that ethnic differences were completely ignored. In the 1970s, the government decreed that all public discussions touching the issues of SARA (*suku, agama, ras, golongan*/ethnicity, religion, race, class) were forbidden. The “government's know-nothing stance on ethnic identity and its positive cultivation of showcase diversity”²⁴² (as a manifestation of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*) resulted in further exclusion of Indonesians of Chinese descent. However, the New Order regime's policies were mostly leaned towards Islam and strengthened the dominance of Java within the nation. As historian Rita Smith Kipp notes, during the New Order era, “the interests of Muslim and of Islam have become institutionally interwoven within state structure.”²⁴³ This was palpable, for example, through programs such as the building of thousands of mosques across the country and sponsoring of the official biennial national Koran reading competition.²⁴⁴ The government also routinely consulted Muslim leaders regarding national matters.²⁴⁵

Another irony was in the New Order regime's blatant discrimination against the Chinese, but at the same time also maintained patronage for a minority of very wealthy Chinese businessmen. The Chinese

233Suryadinata, "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese," 64.

234Suryadinata, "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese," 67.

235Suryadinata, "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese," 68.

236Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 35.

237Leo Suryadinata, "Indonesian Chinese Education: Past and Present," in *The Chinese Minority in Indonesia* (Singapore: Chopmen Enterprises, 1978), 26.

238These religions are: Islam, Christian, Catholic, Buddhism, and Hinduism.

239Rita Smith Kipp, *Dissociated Identities: Ethnicity, Religion, and Class in an Indonesian Society* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1993), 100.

240Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 35.

241Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 100.

242Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 115.

243Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 94.

244Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 94.

245Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 94.

were portrayed to be in control significantly of the country's wealth (up to 70 percent of economic activity), while actually this was partly due to the regime's support for small number of very wealthy Chinese businessmen.²⁴⁶ The New Order maintained close collusion with these businessmen, which allowed the businessmen significant business privileges (and hence great development of wealth), but also enriched Suharto and his families. As for the majority of Chinese Indonesians, their identity was erased through the government's policy to assimilate the cultural group within a common Indonesian identity (e.g. the Chinese Indonesians were asked to change their Chinese names to Indonesian names). This discrimination and suppression then culminated in the 1997-1998 anti-Chinese riots. At the time the economic crisis had caused extreme poverty on many of the people. This severe condition then made worse by the tension which was fuelled by the distrust in the government and the perceived wealth of the Chinese population. In May 1998, Jakarta's and some other cities' ethnic Chinese districts were destroyed, causing many Chinese residents to lose their homes and businesses. Violent rapes of Chinese women and murders of the Chinese also occurred in the cities.

Because Chinese Indonesians were not involved in the nationalist movement and the subsequent conceptualization of nationalism and the Republic of Indonesia, consequently, the discourse of Indonesian national culture since the early 1900s until the end of the New Order also largely ignored the culture of the Indonesians of Chinese descent. As I discussed in the previous chapters, the Indonesian national culture was conceptualized as a totality of 'peaks' of regional cultures. The term 'peaks' is highly ambiguous, and as a result, especially in the New Order era, the government often sought to "identify a single cultural each province, and to play down the extent and breadth of the country's actual ethnic diversity."²⁴⁷ As such, even within the indigenous Indonesians, the ethnic diversity was unacknowledged. Therefore, the existence of an ethnicity and culture as 'foreign' as Chinese would also be ignored.

In nation-wide context, this condition has changed considerably after the fall of Suharto in 1998. Immediately after, during President B.J Habibie's term (1998-1999), the Presidential Instruction no. 26 year 1998 was put into effect, banning all usages of the terms '*pribumi*' and '*non-pribumi*' in all official governmental documents. During his presidential term (1999-2001), Abdurrahman Wahid included the Chinese Indonesians back in 'imagined nation' and acknowledged Chinese culture through his policies of declaring the Chinese New Year as a public holiday and allowing the celebration of the Chinese New Year on the streets of Indonesia for the first time since the late 1960s.²⁴⁸ Moreover, Wahid repealed the laws that had banned the local publication of Chinese characters in Indonesia since 1965 and allowed schools to teach Mandarin to their pupils. In 2008, the government established Law No. 40 of 2008 about Abolishment of Discrimination based on Races and Ethnicities. The Law states that all Indonesians possess equal civil, political, economy, and socio-cultural rights. The Explanation section of the Law states that there cannot be a discrimination based on races and ethnicities in matters such as, admissions to educational institutions or the elections for official positions in public office. However, as proven by the conflict surrounding Basuki Tjahaja Purnama, these policies could not yet completely eliminate the suspicion and prejudice among the society towards the Chinese.

²⁴⁶Bertrand, *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*, 66.

²⁴⁷Kipp, *Dissociated Identities*, 112.

²⁴⁸Sarah Turner, "Setting the Scene Speaking Out: Chinese Indonesians After Suharto," *Asian Ethnicity* 4, no. 3 (2003): 347-348. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1343900032000117187>.

The implication to general education and music education

During the Dutch colonial time in the twentieth century, in accordance with the racial segregation structure, elementary schools were divided into the European Elementary school, the Dutch-Chinese school and the Dutch-Native school.²⁴⁹ The Dutch-Chinese school was exclusive for the Chinese, but it was also elitist because it served mainly the upper class and middle class Chinese.²⁵⁰ During the Japanese occupation, Dutch schools were forbidden, and only Indonesian and Chinese-medium schools were allowed. After the independence, during Sukarno's time, Chinese-medium schools were put under firm supervision but still allowed. From the beginning of the New Order era in 1966, however, all Chinese-medium schools that catered to the needs of Chinese Indonesian students were forced to be closed.²⁵¹ As a part of the 'assimilation' of the Chinese, all Chinese Indonesian students had to enter Indonesian-medium schools. As I have discussed above, due to the suspicion and persecution against the communists and because of the New Order's policy to 'assimilate' the Chinese, many Chinese Indonesians converted into Christianity. The Christians in Indonesia, although also a minority, did not really have the stigma of being 'foreign' as being a Chinese did.²⁵² As the Asian studies scholar Chang-Yau Hoon observes, one of the effects of the conversion of the Chinese to Christianity was the emergence of Christian schools to cater to their needs.²⁵³ Many Chinese Indonesians would not consider sending their children to state schools because their mistrust in the quality of the education in the schools.²⁵⁴ Chinese children who did attempt to go to state schools often faced discrimination in their admission based on their ethnicity.²⁵⁵ As a response to this situation, Chinese Christian churches started to found privately funded Christian schools for Chinese students who faced such problem. These schools became "well accepted among the Chinese, both Christians and non-Christians, who cherished the quality of education and discipline provided by the schools."²⁵⁶ Since the New Order era until the present day, most Chinese Indonesians sent their children to private Christian schools.²⁵⁷

Other than Christian schools that were established by Christian churches, some Christian schools were established by wealthy Chinese Christian business people. Many of these schools are elite; they are attended by mainly middle- and upper class Chinese Indonesians and are equipped with very good facilities compared to most schools in Indonesia. They are also mostly significantly more expensive than state schools or non-Christian private schools. In terms of music education, these schools generally offer more tuition in music than state schools. I attended state high schools, and during my study, music education occupied a very small proportion within the schools' programs. In my experience, music was never included in the main subjects that students had to pass in order to graduate. Music classes were typically short and consisted of singing and playing of basic instruments such as recorders and melodicas. More 'serious' music education (in performance of Western classical music instruments) is

249Chang-Yau Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Class, and Religion," *Asia Pacific Education Review* 12 no. 3 (2011): 404. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-010-9144-7>.

250Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 404.

251Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

252Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

253Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

254This mistrust has been evident since the early years of Indonesian independence. In 1949, all Dutch schools were closed, and as a consequence Chinese Indonesian students who previously attended such schools were switching to Chinese-medium schools, instead of Indonesian schools. Suryadinata notes that this was due to the lack of confidence among the Chinese in the Indonesian schools. See Suryadinata, "Indonesian Chinese Education: Past and Present," 22.

255Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

256Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

257Hoon, "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia," 405.

often obtained through music courses outside of schools, as I did, and these courses are typically quite expensive. In the 13 years of my participation as a student (1990-2013) in such courses, my course mates and my teachers were almost always Chinese Indonesians. In my experience as a piano teacher in a music course place in Jakarta in 2016, a majority of my students were Chinese Indonesians. There are two main reasons for this: first is that music courses are expensive and therefore can only be accessed by Chinese students who in general possess more wealth, and second is that these Chinese students are mostly Christians, and therefore more accustomed to Western music and instruments from their participation in churches. In present day, as I observed during my internship with Bandung Philharmonic, many Christian schools offer extensive music education program. One of the schools in Bandung, for example, created a new and separate program for students who are interested in playing Western music and musical instruments. Music is one of the main subjects taught and assessed in this program. The school provides practice rooms, instruments, and private tutors for the instruments. Since music tuition in general is expensive, the tuition fee for this program is much more expensive than tuition fee in state schools, and cater to the needs and interests of wealthy Chinese students.

Nevertheless, there is *Sekolah Menengah Musik/SMM* (formerly *Sekolah Musik Indonesia/SMIND*), which is a public/state high school in Yogyakarta specialized in Western classical music. There are also some others private high school specialized in music, such as the ones established and managed by the Jakarta Music Foundation (*Yayasan Musik Jakarta/YMJ*) and by Perguruan Cikini. However, SMM is the most well known from the pool of such schools. Many of the graduates from SMM continued their studies in the Indonesian Institute of Arts/*Institut Seni Indonesia (ISI)* in Yogyakarta or other few music programs in other universities such as in Indonesian Institute of Education/*Institut Pendidikan Indonesia (IPI)* in Bandung. A majority of the orchestra musicians I met during my internship were graduates of SMM or ISI. As with other public schools in general, most of the students in SMM and ISI are indigenous Indonesians. I discussed this observation with a musician who graduated from SMM and ISI, who remarked that:

Most of the students in SMM and ISI were native Indonesians. But in Surabaya²⁵⁸, there are many Chinese Indonesian music students. They usually go to informal music course places to learn to play instruments. If they want to continue to the university level, they will most likely go abroad (...) or to *Universitas Pelita Harapan*.²⁵⁹

This comment confirms the notion that most Chinese Indonesians do not have much trust in the government education system and schools. As they are mostly wealthy, Chinese Indonesian parents would prefer to send their children to study music abroad, rather than to ISI. Another popular option for them is Pelita Harapan University/*Universitas Pelita Harapan (UPH)* in Karawaci (a new town development on the outskirts of Jakarta). UPH is a private prestigious Christian university, and the only university in Indonesia which has a department for music (the Conservatory of Music). It is, as with all other private Christian schools, highly expensive, and most of its students and faculty members are Chinese Indonesians.

²⁵⁸Surabaya is a metropolitan in East Java, and there is a large amount of Chinese Indonesians residing in the city.

²⁵⁹Interview with musician, 24 April 2018.

The implication to participation in Indonesian symphony orchestras

Despite the dominance of Chinese Indonesian students in music courses, during my internship with both Twilite Orchestra and Bandung Philharmonic, I noticed that the quantity of Chinese Indonesian musicians in both orchestras was significantly fewer than non-Chinese Indonesian musicians. From my observation of GBN and JCP's performances, I believe it is also the case in GBN and JCP. However, it is improbable that this resulted from a deliberate discrimination towards Chinese musicians by the orchestras. The audition for Bandung Philharmonic's musicians, for instance, was conducted in a blind audition manner. The judges could only hear the performances of the musicians and did not see them until after the audition's results were announced. Therefore, the possibility for discrimination based on ethnicity was, if not entirely impossible, suppressed to a minimum. The members of GBN choir were selected based on several variables, such as sight reading, voice quality, intonation, rhythm, expression, and presentation.²⁶⁰ As I do not have first-hand information of the audition, I would assume that the selection was made strictly based on assessments in those variables. However, it is important to note that the cases of Bandung Philharmonic and GBN are different in some respects. Bandung Philharmonic is a privately-managed professional orchestra, which does not maintain any formal affiliation with any government body, hence is likely less “intimidating” for Chinese Indonesian musicians (as an ethnic minority) to participate. In the case of GBN, since it is managed by a state ministry, it is possible that Chinese Indonesian musicians become more reluctant to participate. Under the New Order's discriminative policy towards the Chinese, Chinese Indonesians were, although not overtly banned, discouraged to be the members of the armed forces or to occupy the highest government positions. Even in the present time, because most Indonesians are Muslims and Islam believes that a leader of the Muslims cannot be a non-believer (*kafir*), it is very unlikely that an elected president of Indonesia is a Christian, let alone a Chinese Indonesian. The proportion of Chinese Indonesians working as civil servants has always been very small. The one time a Chinese-Indonesian (Basuki Tjahaja Purnama) came into power as the Governor of DKI Jakarta, the opposition from conservative Muslim Indonesians were very strong. Within this context, it is understandable if GBN appears to be intimidating for Chinese Indonesians to participate. It is also likely that Chinese Indonesians who studied in UPH would continue their education or look for employment abroad, and those who studied abroad would remain abroad.

Moreover, due to the lack of attention of music course in public schools in Indonesia, the availability of orchestral musicians is rather limited. As I observed during my internship, many musicians played for multiple orchestras in Jakarta (Twilite Orchestra, Bandung Philharmonic, Jakarta City Philharmonic). As a result, from business perspective, according to Addie MS, it is cheaper now to make a recording of orchestral pieces with orchestras in East Europe, such as in Budapest, than to make an orchestral recording in Indonesia.

Conclusion

The fall of Suharto in 1998 marked the beginning of Indonesia in the Reformation era. In general, Indonesia now is a more democratic Indonesia. The recently-established Law No. 24 (2017) demonstrates a less competitive attitude in the positioning of Indonesian culture in comparison to foreign cultures. As also confirmed by many respondents in my research internship, globalization and free flow of inter-nation cultures are fully recognized, and these cultures are all viewed as equal.

²⁶⁰Isty Safitrianingsih Bahar, “Penerapan Metode *Simple Additive Weighting* untuk Seleksi Calon Peserta Gita Bahana Nusantara,” *Progresif* 11 no. 1 (2015): 1105.

However, the cultural policies stated in the Medium Term National Development Plan (RPJMN) 2015-2019, which were also confirmed by some of my respondents, showed that there is still a concern about the negative influences from the global cultures, and that Indonesian cultural identity needs to always be strengthened to filter the incoming global cultures. Nonetheless, European classical music and symphony orchestra continued to be regarded as the acceptable kind of Western cultures. This is evident in the case of Jakarta City Philharmonic, in which symphony orchestra is used as a way for Indonesia to enter the world musical scene, and in the Gita Bahana Nusantara, where symphony orchestra is viewed as a way to instill nationalism, to develop leadership among the youths, and to showcase the ability of young Indonesians in participating in a European/global culture.

Suvenir dari Minangkabau by Arya Pugala Kitti serves as a case study of Indonesian art music composition from this period. The piece is a European music-based composition which embodies the features of national culture and national music as envisioned since the early 1900s by Ki Hadjar Dewantara, to Cornel Simanjuntak, Amir Pasaribu, J.A. Dungga, and L. Manik in the 1930s-1950s. Kitti's intention in composing, just like Dewantara, Simanjuntak, and Pasaribu's, is nationalistic. He strives to develop an Indonesian musical identity which cannot be but incorporating the richness of Indonesian traditional musics. However, Kitti points out that this incorporation needs to be more than mere quoting of Indonesian music idioms. Instead, it should be about capturing the 'spirit' of Indonesia and made it audible through the music. Moreover, according to Kitti, it is only people who are rooted in Indonesia who can capture this 'spirit' of Indonesia.

In the context of classical music and orchestral performances, I have shown that the image of European classical music and the orchestra as the prestigious and the grander kind of music and performance form continued to be perpetuated in the present-day Indonesia, as illustrated by, among others, frequent sponsoring of European classical music performances by foreign cultural institutions in Indonesia, and by the practices of the orchestras Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic. However, these orchestras also demonstrate how European classical music and orchestra are appropriated and reshaped according to their agenda.

At the final section of the chapter, I turned to examine the complex correlation between ethnicity, class, and participation in Indonesian symphony orchestras. I showed that the long history of discrimination towards the Chinese Indonesians has resulted in the exclusion of the Chinese Indonesians in the public discourses of nationalism and national culture, and in the separation between the natives and the Chinese Indonesians in the everyday social and cultural life. This created mistrust among the Chinese Indonesians of all things governmental, including the national education system. Consequently, a majority of Chinese Indonesian students do not attend state schools and attend Christian private schools instead. In state schools, music education, especially of European classical instruments, is practically non-existent. On the other hand, Christian private schools often offer classical music education, firstly because the music is close to the Christian tradition, and secondly because Chinese Indonesian students, who in general are wealthier, can afford the expensive music performance education. If not in schools, these students would often obtain private music courses. However, in Twilite Orchestra, Bandung Philharmonic, Gita Bahana Nusantara, and Jakarta City Philharmonic, a majority of the players is native Indonesians. I argue that this is partly a continuation of the seclusion of the Chinese Indonesians from public forums such as the orchestras. Another reason is that because most Chinese Indonesian musicians would opt to continue their study abroad or in private Christian universities such as Universitas Pelita Harapan, which has their own orchestra and a community dominated by Chinese Indonesians.

CONCLUSION

Indonesia started to build the imagined nation of Indonesia in the beginning of the twentieth century, which was fuelled by the desire to be free from the colonizer. This was immediately followed by efforts in creating a national culture as a part of the identity of the new nation, which ideally is distinct and unattached to that of the colonizer. Nevertheless, since this beginning, the cultural nationalists of Indonesia were aware that Indonesia was and will always be a part of a larger world. Given this cosmopolitan outlook and being colonized by a European nation, the Ki Hadjar Dewantara conceptualized the national culture to be a product of a synthesis between Indonesian cultures and European cultures (including that of the colonizer's). But, as I have argued throughout this thesis, in this stance there always has been an embedded concern, or anxiety, in positioning ourselves in comparison to the European Other whenever we try to define our own cultural identity. I argue that this is one of the most evident forms of colonialism's impacts in Indonesia.

As a part of the discourse for an Indonesia national culture is the search for national music. Indonesia is rich of various traditional musics, yet the music that has been continuously included both in the conceptualization of national music and the compositions of Indonesian art music is European classical music. By analyzing the history of the presence of European classical music in the East Indies, I have shown that the way European classical music was performed, consumed, and enjoyed by the Europeans in the colonial setting had resulted in European classical music and symphony orchestra (as the form of most of the European classical music performances in the East Indies) being perceived by Indonesians as the music of high quality and with loftier status. This perception has proven to be ceaseless, even after many years of independence. As I shown through the policies of the Japanese government to the subsequent Indonesian governments from the independence to the present day, within the politics of inclusion and exclusion of the forms of art that were considered by the governments to be appropriate for the national cultural identity, European classical music and orchestra had never been rejected and even supported in some cases. This is evident, among others, in the orchestration of *Indonesia Raya* by Joz Cleber and in the practice of Gita Bahana Nusantara, a state-managed symphony orchestra that was formed for a fundamentally nationalistic purpose. The influence of European classical music is also ostensible in the Indonesian art music compositions that I discussed in this thesis. Despite the composers' indisputable nationalistic stance, all of these compositions (Ki Hadjar Dewantara's *Kinanthie Sandoong*, Cornel Simanjuntak's *Kemuning*, Amir Pasaribu's *Variasi Sriwijaya*, Mochtar Embut's *Varia Ibukota*, and Arya Pugala Kitti's *Suvenir dari Minangkabau*) combine Indonesian traditional music and European music idioms.

Indonesian National Music: A Loosely-Defined and An Ongoing Venture

At the second national Cultural Congress in 1951, Bahder Djohan—who later became the Minister of National Education in 1952-1953—reiterated Dewantara's idea of national culture to define national music as “the fusion of regional musical peaks.”²⁶¹ If Djohan was reiterating Dewantara's idea, then it can be assumed that Djohan also saw that Indonesian national music should be open to foreign influences. Therefore, based on this definition, compositions like *Kinanthie Sandoong*, *Varia Ibukota*, and *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* can not be considered as national music, since each of them only drew from a traditional music from one region. In the case of *Varia Ibukota*, the Betawi folk songs it incorporated are of the genre of *kroncong*, which, as I discussed in Chapter 2, was generally not

²⁶¹Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," 243.

considered as a 'peak' regional music. *Kemuning*, on other hand, is thoroughly in European classical music idiom, but it was composed based on a poem by Sanusi Pane.

Nonetheless, I doubt that Bahder Djohan meant for his definition of national music to be applied rigidly. Moreover, if, following Philip Bohlman's definition, national music is a music that captures the quintessence of the nation, then those compositions should be acknowledged not necessarily as *the* national music but certainly as *a part* of the body of Indonesian national music, exactly because of its hybrid and ambivalent character, because this is what defines Indonesia. Franki Notosudirdjo has argued a similar point, in the way that he sees Dewantara's *Kinanthie Sandoong* as the genesis of Indonesian art music, because it embodies a synthesis between West and East cultures.²⁶² However, Notosudirdjo's argument is countered by the traditionally-based *musik kontemporer* with its 'Indological' character which emerged in the late 1970s.

Therefore, I suggest that in the case of Indonesia, there cannot be only one definition of national music, be it Djohan's (and Dewantara's), Notosudirdjo's, Pane's, or Boediardjo's. Benedict Anderson had rightly observed that the concepts of nation, nationality, nationalism (and national music, I would add) are all notoriously difficult to define.²⁶³ With regards the conception of Indonesian national culture as an aggregate of 'peaks' of regional cultures, Philip Yampolsky aptly asks:

But does it need national culture *instead of as well as* regional culture? And why are regional achievements not considered the heritage of all citizens of the nation?²⁶⁴ (italics are mine)

Therefore, it is futile work to try define what is the Indonesian 'national' art music²⁶⁵, but it certainly needs not be: (i) a fusion of several regional music, (ii) purely of Indonesian music idiom, or (iii) a synthesis of West and East cultures. What considered as national music is certainly continuously changing, and not only depends on the composers. As Bohlman argues:

The question is not which genres or repertoires are nationalist, but how musicians weave their own national identities in the many musics they create and reproduce. Nationalism no longer enters music from the top, that is from state institutions and ideologies; it may build its path into music from just about any angle, as long as there are musicians and audiences willing to mobilize cultural movement from those angles.²⁶⁶

'Doing it Ourselves': Decolonizing European Classical Music?

There is also a possibility, that the factor that ultimately makes a music 'national' is if the person doing it is an Indonesian. In his account of the performing arts in Indonesia, Matthew Cohen notes that in the 1930s, when plays such as Dardanella was popular, attending a Dardanella performance was regarded as a nationalistic act, because, as a reporter in Manado wrote about a Dardanella's performance:

²⁶²Notosudirdjo, "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia," i.

²⁶³Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, 3.

²⁶⁴Yampolsky, "Forces for Change," 702.

²⁶⁵I definitely do not exclude Indonesia traditional music and popular music from the discussion of national music.

However, in this thesis I focus the discussion on Indonesian art music.

²⁶⁶Bohlman, *The Music of European Nationalism*, 10-11.

Each and every Indonesian and Asian feels proud of the existence of this opera made up of *people of our races*. Dardanella certainly is in step with the time. The time of change and progress. [. . .] Attending [. . .] bolsters the progress of our people.²⁶⁷ (italics are mine)

Dardanella was a Malay opera company owned by Russian artists, produced plays based on European and Indies novels, performed features from various cultures (e.g. *kroncong*, Hawaiian music, jazz music), and had members from various ethnic backgrounds from all over the East Indies.²⁶⁸ Clearly, Dardanella's performances were not thoroughly Indonesian, but because they were performed by Indonesians, then attending the performance was considered as a nationalistic act. In other words, it does not matter where the cultures originated from, but if Indonesians are the ones doing it, then the cultures can be considered as a part of our own.

In terms of classical music, as I have discussed throughout this thesis, European classical music and symphony orchestra continued to be perceived as the loftier kind of music because it was attached to the Europeans in the East Indies who were the 'marked' for the Indonesians due to their power and status in the colonial setting. It is possible then that—drawing from this importance of markedness and the example from the Dardanella performances—for the Indonesians, one way to decolonize European classical music in Indonesia and making it a part of our own national musical identity is by doing it ourselves with our bodies and make it visible for the world. As Arya Pugala Kitti remarks, it is only the Indonesians—with both their bodies and minds—who have the ability to capture the 'spirit' of Indonesia and hence can make even a symphonic music sounds like our own. This is in line with Nikita Dhawan's concept of decolonization through the way of "employing the master's tools to dismantle the master's house," and what Frantz Fanon did by bringing forward the blackness of his body to engage in "knowledge-making to de-colonize the knowledge that was responsible for the coloniality of his being."²⁶⁹

This importance of the Indonesian bodies as the doers was also apparent in Bandung Philharmonic, as I observed during my research internship. Bandung Philharmonic's artistic directors are USA-based conductors/musicians Robert Nordling and Michael Hall. Airin Efferin, the co-founder of Bandung Philharmonic, chose Nordling because she well knows Nordling's quality as a teacher and a conductor from her acquaintance with him during her study in the USA. Efferin has since received many questions about why she had to choose a Western conductor for an Indonesian symphony orchestra. Efferin explains that she decided solely for Bandung Philharmonic to learn and gain knowledge from Nordling who is experienced in running and conducting a classical symphony orchestra.²⁷⁰ Nonetheless, the fact that many people were questioning Airin's decision to hire a Western conductor indicates that the markedness of the Western people is still apparent, and that it is important for an Indonesian symphony orchestra to be led by our own people (regardless of the orchestra itself being a European performance form). Some of the musicians I talked to also bring the point that someday they would want to see an Indonesian conductor leading the orchestra. Since 2016, Bandung Philharmonic has been doing a Conducting Fellowship program, which can be viewed as a way to prepare Indonesian conductors for the orchestra. In this program, 2-3 conductors are selected each year to be trained by

²⁶⁷Quoted in Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 145.

²⁶⁸Cohen, *Inventing the Performing Arts*, 141-145.

²⁶⁹Mignolo, "Epistemic Disobedience," 17.

²⁷⁰Interview with Airin Efferin, 15 November 2017.

Robert Nordling. Early this year, Wishnu Dewanta, a Conducting Fellow in 2017 was appointed as Bandung Philharmonic's Assistant Conductor for the orchestra's third season (2018-2019).

As an Indonesian, I have great respects for the composers I discussed in this thesis, for Bandung Philharmonic, Gita Bahana Nusantara, and Jakarta City Philharmonic, because all of them work their own way to build a distinct national identity for themselves and for Indonesians. However, I am also uncertain that those efforts have done much to decolonize European classical music and orchestra, and shift the power from the Europeans to us. For instance, the fact that Airin appoints Nordling is not, in my opinion, hinting at her distrust in the ability of Indonesians, but nonetheless admitting that there is still an inequality of competence (and therefore, an asymmetry of power) between Indonesians and Westerners in the case of conducting a symphony orchestra. In this case, this orchestra can be viewed as a 'contact zone,' which is:

(A) Social space(s) where cultures meet, clash, and grapple with each other
 (...) in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power, such as colonialism
 (...) or their aftermaths.²⁷¹

Homi Bhabha contends that for decolonization to happen, there needs to be a third space of enunciation, because:

Without a transformation of the site of enunciation—there is the danger that the mimetic contents of a discourse will conceal the fact that the hegemonic structures of power are maintained in a position of authority through a shift in vocabulary in the position of authority.²⁷²

In a similar vein, Walter D. Mignolo contends that there are two directions that the former *anthropos* advance in engaging in epistemic disobedience and de-linking from the Western idea of modernity and knowledge. One direction is dewesternization, which means that "the rules of the game and the shots are no longer called by the Western players and institutions."²⁷³ The second direction is de-colonial option, which is similar to dewesternization in the way that it rejects "being told" about what 'we are' and "what our ranking is in relation to the ideal of *humanitas*"²⁷⁴, but it is fundamentally different from dewesternization because it aims to shift the geography of reason to the place of the *anthropos* and de-link from the coloniality of knowledge by changing the terms of the knowledge.²⁷⁵

In the case of European classical music in Indonesia, I would argue that the dewesternization of classical music and symphony orchestra has been happening in some ways, but I doubt that the knowledge of and about the music has changed much. In *Varia Ibukota* and *Suvenir dari Minangkabau*, for instance, both composers made attempts—consciously or unconsciously—to dewesternize the genre of symphony, by being unabashedly nationalistic and determined in making a distinct Indonesian symphonic sound. But on the other hand, the epistemic ideals and ideas regarding European classical music and symphony orchestra remain unchanging. European classical music is still perceived as the higher, more serious, and more prestigious form of music. The music and the orchestra continue to be

271 Mary Louise Pratt, "Arts of Contact Zone," *Profession* (1991), 34.

272 Homi K. Bhabha, "'Race' Time and the Revision of Modernity," in *Theories of Race and Racism: A Reader*, eds. Les Back and John Solomos (London: Routledge, 2000), 359.

273 Mignolo, "Epistemic Disobedience," 3.

274 Mignolo, "Epistemic Disobedience," 3.

275 Mignolo, "The Darker Side of the Enlightenment," 338-339.

seen as universal and as a perfect embodiment of 'unity in diversity' or *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, Indonesia's very own national slogan. Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic aim to put Indonesia in the cultural arena of the world—to be among the *humanitas*—through symphony orchestra. The custom of symphony orchestra concert is also largely maintained; from the formal outfits of the musicians and the audiences to the code of conduct for clapping. In this respect, it is possible that the compositions and performances of *musik kontemporer* with its 'Indological' character—which I do not delve on much in this thesis—have been doing more successful attempts at changing the terms of knowledge of not just Western art music, but also the terms of knowledge of Indonesian traditional music. However, the performances of this kind of *musik kontemporer* have been limited to a small niche of audiences. I am admittedly unfamiliar with those compositions and performances, and I know that many of my friends and relatives are too. I would argue that the ideals European classical music and symphony orchestra, although many of them are also elitist, still bear more familiarity to the Indonesians than the stream of the Indological *musik kontemporer*.

Epistemic Disobedience in 'Domestic' Matters

I would also suggest that the epistemic disobedience is needed not just to dismantle the coloniality of European knowledge, but also the coloniality of knowledge created by our own people. It is clear that many acts of colonialism that were done by the Dutch and the Japanese were repeated and revitalized by our own people, especially during the Old Order and the New Order eras. To name a few of these acts: racial discrimination towards the Chinese Indonesians and the segregation between native Indonesians and Chinese Indonesians, imposition of the 'right' values (e.g. 'respectability' of arts, the doctrine of *pembangunan*), and the set up of a false narrative to justify lawless extermination of the oppositions to the governments (e.g. the alleged members of the Communist Party after the 1965 coup). These acts, as I have shown in Chapter 3, have resulted, among others, in the exclusion of Chinese Indonesians in the discourse of national culture, including in public musical forums such as Gita Bahana Nusantara and Jakarta City Philharmonic.

In present day, the Indonesian muslim society in general has grown more conservative. A recent survey of over 4200 Muslim students by Jakarta-based pollster Alvara showed that while the vast majority of the students disagreed with the establishment of an Islamic state in Indonesia and the use of violence, there was also a share (twenty percent) of the students who supported the establishment of an Islamic state.²⁷⁶ One of the results of this growing conservatism is the reinvigorated tension towards the Chinese Indonesians and non-Muslim Indonesians (as I have discussed in the case of Basuki Tjahaja Purnama). For example, in the swearing-in speech of Anies Baswedan (the current elected Governor of DKI Jakarta who replaced Purnama), there were some banners hinting on Baswedan's victory (as a Muslim Indonesian, in contrast to Purnama who is a Christian and a Chinese Indonesian) as the victory of *pribumi* Indonesians.²⁷⁷ Baswedan indeed owed his victory largely to the conservative Islamic organizations (e.g. *Front Pembela Islam/FPI*, *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia/HTI*) who rallied for the utmost importance of Muslims (the majority of *pribumi* Indonesians are Muslims) as political leaders in Indonesia.²⁷⁸ Within this situation, it is even more urgent now to take a critical look at our set of knowledge about our own nation and people. My personal stance is for pluralism in Indonesia and against the establishment of the Islamic state in Indonesia, for Indonesia is a home for all Indonesians

276Neil Thompson, "Islam and Identity Politics in Indonesia," *The Diplomat*, November 17, 2017, <https://thediplomat.com/2017/11/islam-and-identity-politics-in-indonesia/>.

277Thompson, "Islam and Identity Politics in Indonesia."

278Thompson, "Islam and Identity Politics in Indonesia."

and have never been a home for one religious/ethnic group only. In this, like many fellow Indonesians that I discussed throughout this thesis, I find myself in the state of ambivalence. Is it very necessary then, to de-link ourselves from the coloniality of knowledge such as European classical music and symphony orchestra as universal and an embodiment of 'unity in diversity,' if this very knowledge can help to maintain the inter-religions and inter-ethnicity harmony in Indonesia?

Positioning My Contribution

The differentiation between musicology and ethnomusicology (or rather, the need for divergence of the two) has been widely discussed (e.g. Cook 2008, Born 2010). One of the related issues discussed in the discourse is the intercultural encounters in the practices of musicological researches (e.g. Witzleben 1997, Cook 2012, Qureshi 1999, Agawu 2003). This issue of intercultural encounters includes the positionality of the researcher in examining music of cultures other than their own. This seems to be more urgent in the case on an encounter between a Western scholar and non-Western musical cultures, due to the general power imbalance between Western and non-Western entities.

In the case of this thesis, the matter becomes more complicated: I am an Indonesian educated in Western countries, hence I am both an 'insider' (for being an Indonesian) and an 'outsider' (for being educated in Western countries, therefore largely adhering to Western intellectual discourse). In terms of the music, I study Indonesian art music and performances that are ambiguous in nature: they are often influenced by European music idioms (which is perhaps why it is perceived as not 'authentically' Indonesian, therefore the music has not been widely studied by Western scholars, in contrast to traditional music such as *gamelan*), but, as I have discussed throughout this thesis, the ideas behind those music and performances are often very nationalistic and specific to Indonesia. If ethnomusicology is perceived as oriented towards the study of 'others' music by Western scholars, and musicology is oriented towards the study of Western music²⁷⁹, then this thesis would not fit into either, and it does not need to. As Nicholas Cook states in his argument for relational musicology, in the world where everything is enfolded within one another, it is no longer plausible to maintain "stable distinctions between self and other, and consequently between musicology and ethnomusicology."²⁸⁰ Further, Cook argues that the essence of the intercultural, relational musicology lies in the awareness that any attempt in intercultural sense-making by a researcher is always a situated encounter and always replete with meanings, and that "all musical encounter(s) (...) are afforded but not determined by the specific circumstances within which people act, judge, and choose."²⁸¹ Therefore, this thesis contributes to this growing scholarship of intercultural, relational musicology through my intercultural positionality as I stated above, and the performance of that positionality in my analysis of the case studies of Indonesian music and performances, in which I show that (i) they cannot be examined without relating them to the surrounding circumstances (the history of colonialism, the coloniality of European knowledge, the anti-imperial nationalism, the discourses of national culture and national music, the policies of the subsequent governments, and the contemporary political and social situation), and that (ii) these music and performances embody the actions and choices made by the active agency of the Indonesians in response to those circumstances.

²⁷⁹See Lawrence Witzleben, "Whose Ethnomusicology? Western Ethnomusicology and the Study of Asian Music," *Ethnomusicology* 41, no. 2 (1997): 220-242. doi: <https://doi.org/10.2307/852604>.

²⁸⁰Nicholas Cook, "Anatomy of the Encounter: Intercultural Analysis as Relational Musicology," in *Critical Musicological Reflections: Essays in Honour of Derek B. Scott*, ed. Stan Hawkins (Oxford: Taylor & Francis, 2012), 197.

²⁸¹Cook, "Anatomy of the Encounter," 204, 206.

Lastly, I would like to point out that in this thesis, I certainly do not intend, nor do I able to come up with suggestions on how to do the epistemic disobedience. As I have mentioned at the very beginning of this thesis, I am entirely aware that there are many streams of thoughts within Indonesian politics, cultures, and music that I have not touched yet. But I would like to view this thesis as the first step in, at the very least, to increase understanding of post-colonial society of Indonesia, and to begin to be aware of what we think we know about Indonesia , its culture, its people, and its history.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abdullah, Taufik. "Dari Hasrat 'Kemajuan' ke Pembentukan Bangsa." In *Indonesia dalam Arus Sejarah: Masa Pergerakan Kebangsaan*, edited by Taufik Abdullah and A.B. Lopian. Jakarta: PT. Ichtiar Baru van Hoeve, 2012.
- Adithyo, Dirdho and I Gusti Agung Anom Astika. *Bunyi Merdeka: Sejarah Sosial dan Tinjauan Musikologi Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya*. Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia, 2017.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities*. New York: Verso, 1991.
- Aula Simfonia. <http://aulasimfoniajakarta.com/about>.
- Bahar, Isty Safitrianingsih. "Penerapan Metode *Simple Additive Weighting* untuk Seleksi Calon Peserta Gita Bahana Nusantara." *Progresif* 11 no. 1 (2015): 1105-1116.
- Bertrand, Jacques. *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Bhabha, Homi K. "'Race' Time and the Revision of Modernity." In *Theories of Race and Racism: A Reader*, edited by Les Back and John Solomos, 354-372. London: Routledge, 2000.
- Bohlman, Philip V. *The Music of European Nationalism: Cultural Identity and Modern History*. Santa Barbara, California: ABC-CLIO, 2004.
- Born, Georgina. "For a Relational Musicology: Music and Interdisciplinarity, Beyond the Practice Turn." *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 135 no. 2 (2010): 205-243. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/02690403.2010.506265>.
- Bourchier, David and Vedi R. Hadiz. "Introduction." In *Indonesian Politics and Society: A Reader* edited by David Bourchier and Vedi R. Hadiz, 1-24. New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.
- Brekhus, Wayne. "A Sociology of the Unmarked: Redirecting Our Focus." *Sociological Theory* 16 no. 1 (1998): 34-51. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/0735-2751.00041>.
- Carter, Tim and Erik Levi. "The History of the Orchestra." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra*, edited by Colin Lawson, 1-21. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Chatterjee, Partha. *Our Modernity*. Rotterdam/Dakar: South-South Exchange Programme for Research on the History of Development (SEPHIS) and the Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA), 1997.
- Cohen, Matthew Isaac. *Inventing the Performing Arts: Modernity and Tradition in Colonial Indonesia*. Honolulu: Hawaii University Press, 2016.
- Cook, Nicholas. "Anatomy of the Encounter: Intercultural Analysis as Relational Musicology." In *Critical Musicological Reflections: Essays in Honour of Derek B. Scott*, edited by Stan Hawkins, 193-

208. Oxford: Taylor & Francis, 2012.

Cottrell, Stephen. "The Future of the Orchestra." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra*, edited by Colin Lawson, 251-264. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Dhawan, Nikita "Affirmative Sabotage of the Master's Tools: The Paradox of Postcolonial Enlightenment." In *Decolonizing Enlightenment: Transnational Justice, Human Rights and Democracy in a Postcolonial World*, edited by Nikita Dhawan, 19-79. Leverkusen: Barbara Budrich Publishers, 2012.

Ensiklopedi Jakarta, Buku II: Budaya dan Warisan Sejarah. Jakarta: Dinas Kebudayaan dan Permuseuman Provinsi DKI Jakarta, 2005.

Geertz, Hildred. "Indonesian Cultures and Communities." In *Indonesia*, edited by Ruth McVey, 24-96. New Haven: HRAF Press, 1963.

Greenfeld, Liah. *Spirit of Capitalism: Nationalism and Economic Growth*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2003.

Habermas, Jürgen. "Modernity—An Incomplete Project." In *Contemporary Sociological Thought: Themes and Theories*, edited by Sean P. Hier, 163-174. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc., 2005.

Hardjana, Suka. "Catatan Musik Indonesia: Fragmentasi Seni Modern yang Terasing." *Kalam 5* (1995).

Hoon, Chang-Yau. "Mapping 'Chinese' Christian schools in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Class and Religion." *Asia Pacific Education Review* 12 no. 3 (2011): 403-411. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-010-9144-7>.

Irawan, Edi. "Sekilas tentang Paduan Suara dan Orkestra Gita Bahana Nusantara." *Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya: Sejarah & Tutorial Lagu Kebangsaan 3 Stanza*. <http://laguindonesiaraya.id/2017/07/31/sekilas-gita-bahana-nusantara/>.

Jakarta City Philharmonic. Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Italia Abad XX: Daur Ulang dan Opera," June 7, 2017.

Jakarta City Philharmonic. Program book of Jakarta City Philharmonic's concert "Lanskap Skandinavia," November 23, 2016.

Jones, Tod. "Indonesian Cultural Policy, 1950-2003: Culture, Institutions, Government." Ph.D., Curtin University of Technology, 2005.

Kartomi, Margaret. "Youth Orchestra in the Global Scene." *Australasian Music Research* 9 (2007): 1-26.

Khoiri, Agniya. "Si Pemalu di Balik Lagu Kasih Ibu." *CNN Indonesia*, December 22, 2016. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/hiburan/20161222133605-227-181513/si-pemalu-di-balik-lagu-kasih-ibu>.

- Kramer, Lawrence. *Why Classical Music Still Matters*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Kipp, Rita Smith. *Dissociated Identities: Ethnicity, Religion, and Class in an Indonesian Society*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1993.
- Masalah Kebudajaan: Kenang-kenangan Promosi Doctor Honoris Causa*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Taman Siswa, 1957.
- “Mendikbud: Jaga Keragaman, Hayati Makna Lagu Indonesia Raya.” *Lagu Kebangsaan Indonesia Raya: Sejarah & Tutorial Lagu Kebangsaan 3 Stanza*, October, 30, 2017. <http://laguindonesiaraya.id/2017/10/30/mendikbud-jaga-keragaman-hayati-makna-lagu-indonesia-roya/>.
- Merrillees, Scott. *Batavia in Nineteenth Century Photographs*. Surrey: Curzon Press, 2000.
- Mignolo, Walter. "The Darker Side of the Enlightenment: A Decolonial Reading of Kant's *Geography*." In *Reading Kant's Geography*, edited by Stuart Elden and Eduardo Mendieta, 319-344. New York: SUNY Press, 2011.
- Mignolo, Walter. "Epistemic Disobedience, Independent Thought and Decolonial Freedom." *Theory, Culture and Society* 26 no. 7-8 (2009): 159-181. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276409349275>.
- Miller, Christopher J. "Cosmopolitan, Nativist, Eclectic: Cultural Dynamics in Indonesian *Musik Kontemporer*." Ph.D., Wesleyan University, 2014.
- Mintargo, Wisnu. *Musik Revolusi Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Ombak, 2008.
- Mulyadi, Michael Budiman. "17 Agustusan dan Musik Gita Bahana Nusantara Sebagai Kebijakan Budaya." *Musical Promenade Blog*, August 20, 2016. <http://musicalprom.com/2016/08/20/17-agustusan-dan-musik-gita-bahana-nusantara-sebagaikebijakan-budaya/>.
- Notosudirdjo, R. Franki S. "Music, Politics, and the Problems of National Identity in Indonesia." Ph.D., University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2001.
- Nugroho, Kelik M. *Almanak Musik Indonesia 2005-2015*. Jakarta: Yayasan Tali Kemanusiaan, 2015.
- Pratt, Mary Louis. "Arts of Contact Zone." *Profession* (1991): 33-40.
- "Polemik Kebudayaan." Government of DKI Jakarta official website. <http://www.jakarta.go.id/web/encyclopedia/detail/2403/Polemik-Kebudayaan>.
- Pradewo, Bintang. "Lingkaran Keabadian dalam Konser Jakarta City Philharmonic." *Jawa Pos*, April 18, 2018. <https://www.jawapos.com/read/2018/04/18/205486/lingkaran-keabadian-dalam-konser-jakarta-city-philharmonic>.
- Reid, Anthony. *Imperial Alchemy: Nationalism and Political Identity in Southeast Asia*. Leiden: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

- Sinaga, Denny Parsaulian. "Gita Bahana Nusantara Bangun Karakter Generasi Muda," *Media Indonesia Online*, August 16, 2017. <http://www.mediaindonesia.com/read/detail/117714-gita-bahana-nusantara-bangun-karakter-generasi-muda>.
- Suryadinata, Leo. "Pre-War Indonesian Nationalism and the Peranakan Chinese." In *The Chinese Minority in Indonesia*, 63-79. Singapore: Chopmen Enterprises, 1978.
- Suryadinata, Leo. "Indonesian Chinese Education: Past and Present." In *The Chinese Minority in Indonesia*, 1-32. Singapore: Chopmen Enterprises, 1978.
- Susilo, Y. Edhi. "Aktivitas dan Perkembangan Orkes Simfoni Jakarta." Ph.D., Universitas Gajah Mada, 2014.
- Swastika, Alia. "Audiences and Art Spaces in Jakarta Post-1998." In *Performing Contemporary Indonesia: Celebrating Identity, Constructing Community*, edited by Barbara Hatley and Brett Hough, 221-236. Leiden: Brill, 2015.
- "Theosophy." *Encyclopedia Britannica Online*. <https://britannica.com/topic/theosophy>.
- Thompson, Neil. "Islam and Identity Politics in Indonesia." *The Diplomat*. November 17, 2017. <https://thediplomat.com/2017/11/islam-and-identity-politics-in-indonesia/>.
- Tsuchiya, Kenji. *Democracy and Leadership: The Rise of the Taman Siswa Movement in Indonesia*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1987.
- Turner, Sarah. "Setting the Scene Speaking Out: Chinese Indonesians After Suharto." *Asian Ethnicity* 4, no. 3 (2003): 337-352. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1343900032000117187>.
- Vickers, Adrian. *A History of Modern Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- Wallach, Jeremy. "Exploring Class, Nation, and Xenocentrism in Indonesian Cassette Retail Outlets." *Indonesia* 74 (2002): 79-102. doi: <https://doi.org/10.2307/3351527>.
- Weintraub, Andrew N. "The "Crisis of the Sinden": Gender, Politics, and Memory in the Performing Arts of West Java, 1959-1964." *Indonesia* 77 (2004): 57-78.
- Witzleben, Lawrence. "Whose Ethnomusicology? Western Ethnomusicology and the Study of Asian Music." *Ethnomusicology* 41, no. 2 (1997): 220-242. doi: <https://doi.org/10.2307/852604>.
- Yampolsky, Philip. "Forces for Change in the Regional Performing Arts of Indonesia." *Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia* 151 no. 4 (1995): 700-725. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-90003035>.
- . "Kroncong Revisited: New Evidence From Old Sources." *Archipel* 79 no. 1 (2010): 7-56. doi: <https://doi.org/10.3406/arch.2010.4159>.

LIST OF FIGURES

- Figure 1.1 A young Indonesian porter greeted the guests 16
- Figure 1.2 A young Indonesian porter saluted the Dutch admiral 16
- Figure 1.3 The orchestra/big band performed at the occasion 17
- Figure 1.4 The Dutch/European attendees 17
- Figure 1.5 Melody and lyrics of *Indonesia Raya* 25
- Figure 2.1. The original melody/theme of *Jali-Jali* 37
- Figure 2.2. Variation 1 of the melody 38
- Figure 2.3. Variation 2 of the melody 38
- Figure 2.3. Variation 3 of the melody 38
- Figure 2.4. Variation 4 of the melody 38
- Figure 2.5. Variation 5 of the melody 38
- Figure 2.6. *Kroncong* rhythm in *Varia Ibukota* played by the violas, cellos, and double basses 39
- Figure 3.1. Rhythmic pattern in *Suvenir dari Minangkabau* played by the lower string instruments (bars 1-2) 46
- Figure 3.2. Aula Simfonia in Jakarta 47
- Figure 3.3. The Independence Day State Ceremony 2017 at the Presidential Palace, Jakarta 51
- Figure 3.4. President Joko Widodo and First Lady Iriana Widodo watched over the ceremony 51
- Figure 3.5. Foreign diplomats and guests present at the ceremony 52
- Figure 3.6. GBN orchestra performed at the ceremony 52
- Figure 3.7. Some of the choir members with traditional attires 52