

Social Sustainability, Power & Governance

An Ethnographic Account of Imizamo Yethu, a township in South Africa



Supervisor: prof. dr. Kees Koonings

2015/16

Written by: Tarik Jan Scheffers

Studentnr.: 3907368

E-mail: t.j.scheffers@students.uu.nl

Word count: 19.010

Abstract

Central in this research is how social sustainability of Imizamo Yethu, a township in South Africa, is affected by the reproduction of power differences and social division by institutional contexts. As social sustainability is a recently developed concept, it has been linked to well-developed theories in social sciences that focus on power differences, social capital, identity politics, and current development literature on decentralization, governance and participation. This research is ethnographic in nature and data is gathered by use of qualitative anthropological methods, of which participant observation in particular. It is concluded that current frameworks of local governance are unaccountable to the needs of the people due to power differences, social division and the lack of government control on the process. The increasing diversity due to modernization, migration and the shifting values in society pose a threat to the bonds and bridges between people, leaving them fragmented and without a voice.

Acknowledgements

This work has been written with loved ones in mind. As recognizing and being recognized is part of the construction of one's identity I want my grandmother, mother, father, sister and brother to know that they have had a significant influence every step I took in my life to arrive at this point and hope that the recognition of their place in my life will mutually influence my place in their life.

Furthermore, I want to thank Vic, Vuvu, Masi and Thembekile for their heartwarming acceptance of me as a part of their family. Andrew, Kerry, Cube and Shaun for their honesty, the laughs and all the experiences they have shared with me, and all the others who have helped me accomplish what I did by sharing a part of them with me.

A few words to the one I cannot name

I want to thank you, in special, for the unimaginably and fictional introduction to Vic. Unfortunately you have been unable to break your habits which led me to leave Imizamo Yethu with a disgruntled feeling. I hope you are doing well and manage to break the chains that hold you down. Watch your back, stay alive and out of trouble, and hopefully I will get the chance to meet with you again.

Love to all of you.

Content

1	Introduction	5
2	Theoretical Framework	9
2.1	A Path to Social Sustainability	9
2.2	Capitals and Power	11
2.3	Decentralization, Local Governance and Participation	14
2.4	Institutions, Identity and Recognition: ‘Xenophobia’ and Disintegration	15
3	Context	19
3.1	Hout Bay in a National Context	19
3.2	Governance and Development.....	20
4	Empirical Chapters: Social Division, Injustice and Governance	23
4.1	Boundaries of Social Organization.....	23
4.1.1	South Africans: Ethnic Identities	23
4.1.2	Foreign Africans.....	26
4.1.3	Othering.....	28
4.1.4	29
4.1.5	The Extent of Intergroup Interactions	29
4.2	The Experience of Injustice: Resources, Rights & Recognition	31
4.2.1	Being Black and South African.....	31
4.2.2	Disintegration among Youth	34
4.2.3	Afrophobia?.....	37
4.3	Governance, Politics and Mobilization	40
4.3.1	Local Politics and Representation	40
4.3.2	Governance and Organization	42
4.3.2.1	The Community Patrol and the Local Rule of Law	42
4.3.2.2	Transparency, Equity & Inclusion: (Under)privileged	44
4.3.2.3	Responsiveness & Accountability	46

5 Conclusion and Discussion 49

6 References 53

7 Attachment: Reflection on the Field Research..... 60

1 Introduction

The end of Apartheid in South Africa in 1990 appeared to be heralding a new era. The Rainbow Nation ideal, based on universal human rights, promised equity and general improvements of people's lives in a future of solidarity. What used to be known as the homelands, or Bantustans, were abolished. People would be free to move and live where and how they wanted. Or that, at least, was the promise.

It is now twenty-six years later and the legacy of Apartheid is still apparent in many South African cities. Many who the South African census calls blacks, following Apartheid categorizations, are still poor and most people still reside in segregated neighborhoods, now ostensibly based on income and housing costs instead of skin color (Pogge, 2007). An increasing amount of people move from the homelands to the city and from other African countries into South Africa, hoping to improve their lives. Instead they found lack of housing, resources, jobs and low livelihood opportunities in general.

Imizamo Yethu, an informal settlement in Hout Bay, South Africa was a significant political advancement in the deracialization processes of Post-Apartheid South Africa when it was officially established in 1991 due its proximity to a rich white suburb. It is surrounded by an open area in order to create a 'buffer zone' and is in full view of many of the rich residences of Hout Bay (Dixon et al, 2011). These richer residences are mainly inhabited by, in terms of the South African 2011 census, Whites, in the centrally located Valley; Coloreds predominantly make up the population of Hangberg, another suburb of Hout Bay, and the residents of Imizamo Yethu are mainly Black African (Statistics South Africa, 2011). Hout Bay then is segregated in terms of race, income and culture, as well as being troubled by bouts of xenophobic violence against African migrants (Oelofse & Dodson, 2000). The informal settlements are furthermore troubled by shoddy housing, lack of water and sanitation facilities and associated environmental and social repercussions.

The increasing diversity in cities due to the abolishment of the homelands and cross-border immigration increased the need to effectively mediate tensions between different social groups in order to prevent violent conflict and maintain peace. In attempt to create a framework that facilitates the necessary preconditions to achieve this change, international development policies and literature have emphasized the need of a participatory society which should be created by the decentralization of government responsibilities to local spheres, so that the voices of minorities are also heard and responded to (Crook, 2003). The responsiveness of the government to society in general, and minorities in particular, is asserted to be of great

importance as an irresponsible government is threatened to lose its legitimacy in the eyes of the disadvantaged which causes society to become fragmented (Percival & Homer-Dixon, 1998). This has led development practices and literature to increasingly focus on social sustainability; the development of “a series of mechanisms for a community to collectively identify its strengths and needs”, to provide “a positive condition within communities”(McKenzie, 2005), often related to social capital as will be addressed below. In addition, the notion of ‘good governance’ has been developed to complement the concept of decentralization with the underlying principles that are supposed to ensure that poor countries that are susceptible to corruption develop the necessary preconditions to ensure an equal voice of the poor in decision-making processes (IMF, 2016).

The demographic makeup of Hout Bay and its spatial divisions along lines of color and socio-economic status make it especially relevant regarding power differences, social division and inequalities produced in transitional societies in theoretical discourse. Furthermore, contemporary development practice and theory put a sharp focus on social capital and sustainability. Physical communities in an age of globalization, industrialization and rapid urbanization have seen a decline of a sense of community; solidarity and togetherness (Christopher, 2001). Combined, it becomes apparent that research into aspects of (dis)integration processes precisely in such a problematic setting can aid in societal progress.

The transition to democracy and the associated modernization of South Africa has however posed another challenge, namely, social disintegration. The shift from traditional ideologies, often rooted in collectivism, to a Western ideology associated with neoliberal values such as individualism, competition and freedom resulted in a decline of moral guidance among youth due to an increasing influence by public institutions and the inability to cope with the incompatibility of their life-worlds (Stevens & Lockhat, 1997). This is in turn associated with a decreased sense of belonging which negatively influences the social control that formal and informal institutions exert on individuals to adhere to moral values, making them prone to engage in deviant behavior such as violent and criminal activities (Emmet, 2003).

Social capital, a concept often employed in development literature (see Hayward et al., 2004), is embraced as a “sociological superglue” that binds people to gather and increases civic engagement to realize the ideals of democracy in pursuit of a common goal (Putnam, 2001:22-4). A more realistic and skeptical view on social capital, however, argues that social capital is intrinsically infested with power differences that reproduce class divisions and inequalities (Bourdieu, 1984). Therefore the use of social capital in development literature and practice should also address power differences within communities to understand how the collective

good may be disproportionately distributed when local leaders hold the key to the political realm and are not accountable to represent the needs of the local population. To create an insight in the effects of power differences on socially sustainable outcomes the main question of this research is: *How is the social sustainability of Imizamo Yethu affected by the reproduction of power differences and social division by institutional contexts?*

As an understanding of the life world of the research population, the residents of Imizamo Yethu is crucial, this research project is ethnographic in nature, using qualitative anthropological methods, particularly participant observation and qualitative interviews, to gain a deep understanding of local cultural and social conditions in the context of South Africa. To understand the present power differences in the community of Imizamo Yethu a wide range of informants have been included in the research to provide an overall view of the experience among community members. Data is gathered among 61 informants of different backgrounds. South Africans (of different ages and ethnicities), foreign Africans, local representatives, city officials and local NGO's are included in the research to assure an balanced analysis of the power differences in Imizamo Yethu.

Hout Bay is often described as a microcosm of South Africa and is small enough to be readily approached yet large enough to serve as a ground for innovative developmental experiments and research (Froestad, 2005). Successful theories could be transposed to other localities in at least South Africa, especially if these theories are set-up to carefully consider power differences and the influence of local governance and representation on redistribution.

To address the research question the theoretical context will first discuss the eradication of the concept 'social sustainability' in developmental literature and practice to come to an understanding of how it is constructed and how it evolved under the influence of global powers. Hereafter, the commonly used term of social capital in development literature and practice, will be scrutinized to provide insight into the alternative readings of social capital that focus on power differences and the reproduction of inequality. As decentralization, local governance and participation are often employed to underpin the governmental reform that is asserted to provide a responsive state and a strong society, these will be introduced from a somewhat more nuanced perspective to reveal possible challenges and negative outcomes. At last, attention will be paid to the construction of dominant and subordinate identities by institutional pressures that may result in disintegration when one is unable to be adequately recognized in their social world.

The empirical parts of this thesis are divided in three chapters. First, the lines along which social organization and interactions take place and processes that produce these division

will be addressed. Then, the (re)production of experiences of injustice is discussed by addressing identity formation in the context of poverty, resources and rights. Finally, the organizational structure of the civic associations that represent the community of Imizamo Yethu at municipal level will be addressed along the lines of the principles of 'good governance' to come to an understanding of the possible challenges that will arise to create a socially sustainable community.

The conclusion and discussion section will integrate the findings and theory to provide an answer to the research question from a social critical perspective on society and development literature and practice. The main finding is that the current state of fragmentation in the community, due to the lack of adequate governance by local leaders, has resulted in increased fragmentation and division between residents. The differing visions between local leaders and the residents have caused the community to breakdown and lose its real voice. To achieve the goal of social sustainability, attention has to be paid to the social institutions that construct boundaries that prevent the free movement between social groups.

2 Theoretical Framework

2.1 A Path to Social Sustainability

The path that leads to current conceptions of sustainability has been heavily influenced by the evolving priorities of international organizations like the World Bank and the United Nations. It initially began with a perspective of development centered on demands of constant economic growth and subsequently lead to an overall perspective of human development, of which an important part is sustainable development (Alkire, 2010). South Africa has formalized their own definition of sustainable development which they have derived from the first notion of the concept by the Brundtland Commission in 1987 and incorporated it in the law conceptualized as follows:

“Sustainable development means the integration of social, economic and environmental factors into planning, implementation and decision-making so as to ensure that development serves present and future generations.” (Republic of South Africa, 2008:14)

The notion of sustainability and sustainable development arose in the international political sphere governed by externally generated interests of developed countries, as opposed to internally generated perspectives (Smyth, 2011). Though highly influential in the development of new emerging worldviews, these concepts are contested due to the diversity and arbitrariness in definitions as mentioned by, among others, Mebratu (1998) and Morelli (2013). Whereas the focus is primarily directed at environmental and economic sustainability, the role of social sustainability is often left out of sight. Conceptualizations of sustainable development focus on the development of ‘underdeveloped’ nations which would increase their consumptive behaviors instead of focusing on the unsustainability of current consumptive practices nurtured by neoliberalism and advocated by developed nations (McKenzie, 2004:2). The main reason for the unequal treatment of the three dimensions within the sustainable development literature is asserted to be that arguments within the environmental and economic disciplines are more convincing, partially due to difficulties with the vagueness of certain concepts addressed when defining social sustainability (Littig & Griebler, 2005). Therefore attempts have been made to create theoretical and practical frameworks that include social sustainability and transcend the conservative measurement of development in terms of monetary value or conservational success of the ecology.

Social sustainability is a recently developed concept, broadly defined as “a positive condition within communities, and a process within communities that can achieve that condition”, stemming from discontent with the dehumanized prioritization between people and the environment in preceding models of sustainability (Littig & Grießler, 2005). A recurring aim of social sustainability appears to be the improvement of the overall quality of life by creating the conditions that ensure access to basic needs and the subjective satisfaction with the condition that provide these needs, for example a just and equal society (Littig & Grießler, 2005; Dempsey et al., 2009; McKenzie, 2004). As such, “social sustainability blends traditional social policy areas and principles, such as equity and health, with emerging issues concerning participation, needs, social capital, the economy, the environment, and more recently, with the notions of happiness, wellbeing and quality of life” (Colantonio & Dixon, 2009:4). Stressing the social aspects of sustainability unequivocally humanizes current literature by emphasizing the importance of developing sustainable human livelihoods.

De Vries and Peterson (2009), in their efforts to incorporate notions of 'quality of life' and 'well-being' in the conceptualization of sustainable development, address how these notions are (inter)subjectively developed within the boundaries of present resources and socio-institutional systems; resulting in a dynamic development of individual and collective evaluations of needs and quality of life. An example of these constraints is given by Homer-Dixon (1994) in his theory on resource scarcity and violent conflict referring to the notion of 'resource capture'; defined as a manipulated shift in the distribution of resources by and in favor of powerful groups motivated by a perceived decrease in quality or quantity of certain renewable resources (10-1). Which can produce 'ecological marginalization' when resource rich land is unequally distributed in favor of the elite, causing disenfranchised groups to migrate to already overpopulated cities and resource-poor lands, in turn, negatively affecting the local ecology (15-6). These circumstances foster differing values that determine one's perception of quality of life or wellbeing. The main concerns of predominantly white people in Hout Bay are for instance environmental degradation and a green living environment, while the residents of the neighboring township Imizamo Yethu prioritize housing over the conservation of some trees and green fields. Consequently the negligence of the needs and demands of disadvantaged groups, the associated loss of legitimacy due to the state's irresponsiveness, and social fragmentation further perpetuate this pattern, affecting the environment, the economy, as well as, the social sphere (Percival & Homer-Dixon, 1998). The incorporation of concepts like quality of life and well-being in the assessment of social sustainability therefore proves a challenge when all demands need to be satisfied.

A more practical framework commonly addressed to evaluate the social sustainability of individuals and groups is the ‘sustainable livelihoods approach’ (SLA). In the exploration of the concept ‘sustainable livelihoods’ in an urban context Meikle et al. (2001) emphasize livelihoods to be sustainable when they are able to cope with and recover from shocks and stresses while maintaining and enhancing its capabilities and assets, and enhancing opportunities for next generations. Within this framework academics have used different criteria to determine the available opportunities which revolve mainly around ‘assets’; the available resource to create income and satisfy needs. It is however argued that a community’s resilience to unexpected losses is mainly dependent on the social dimension of their livelihoods as social networks are of significant importance in the survival of the poor (Norris et al., 2008; Magis, 2010). Social stability has however posed a great challenge in urban environments that are becoming increasingly diverse due to migration flows, modernization and power differences. To address these issues attention will be paid to the concept of social capital.

2.2 Capitals and Power

Bourdieu’s understanding of capital constructs the idea of the accumulation of social assets by embedded actors in a historicized world, termed ‘habitus’, as being social capital, stemming from his recognition of the inadequacies of the previously used singular concept of economic, materialist capital. Capital is “accumulated labor [...] which, when appropriated on a private, i.e., exclusive, basis by agents or groups of agents, enables them to appropriate social energy in the form of reified or living labor” (Bourdieu, 1986, pp. 3). An individual’s social capital means the resources available to this person, aspects of his or her lifeworld that enable engagement in social activities. It is a theoretical understanding of the continuous nature of status development in a field of interrelated actors, ultimately representing the structure and associated dynamics of life-worlds.

The three principal forms of capital Bourdieu identifies are economic, social and cultural capital. Economic capital means the actual financial and material resources available to a person; it is materially identifiable, measurable and quantifiable. It is however inherently reductionist in its nature as people engage in myriad non-economic transactions characterized by a lack of materialist exchanges. This shortcoming, relative to considerations of the entirety of the social world, inspired Bourdieu to develop the concepts of cultural and social capital. Cultural capital is the least immediately tangible of the forms of capital; it defines culture as an

abstraction objectified and embodied in objects, institutions and people, not directly measurable as much of it only exists in the intersubjective existing perceptions and interpretations through experiences. Social capital represents the social aspects of exchanges. It describes the basic structure and dynamics of the social world, as present and enacted in cultural and material exchanges yet analytically different from it. It can be employed to decrease interpersonal transaction costs of capital.

Putnam (1993), who popularized the term, specifies the components of social capital, which Bourdieu identifies as the possession of a “durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition (...)”(Bourdieu, 1989:5), succinctly being networks, norms and trust.

Networks are the social horizons of people, the linkages between them and others, their social groups and other groups. This aspect serves to enable multiple survival strategies as networks are based on principles of reciprocity. Linkages can be intergroup and intragroup, as well as vertical and horizontal, conceptually enabling diverse analytical approaches. Norms constitute the framework supporting interactions, the rules of social behavior, providing reliability of interactions; people need to be able to rely on learned modes of social conduct in their networks. Trust stems from long-term and/or frequently occurring personal interactions in which people have come to expect certain results from their interactions with people. This can be further specified into horizontal and vertical dimensions, and generalized and particularized projections; meaning trust in relations of equal or different status, and trust of the surrounding social environment or directed at specific social entities (Putnam, 1993).

Differing from the distinction between cultural and social capital Bourdieu addresses, Putnam only acknowledges social capital which leaves inequalities within networks untouched. Bourdieu’s work focusses on the reproduction of inequalities and mentions cultural capital as an instrument to position oneself above others in a hierarchy through the use of cultural knowledge (Bourdieu, 2004:98-9), Putnam solely uses the term social capital in a positive sense as a “sociological superglue” that binds people together and fosters economic growth (Putnam, 2001:23). The optimistic properties attributed to the concept of social capital by Putnam and his followers served as the legitimization of numerous developmental practices and policies. The term is argued to be inconsiderately accepted as normatively good which has resulted in a loss of meaning; making Bourdieu’s understanding more applicable and useful in community development as it theorizes the production of classes and class divisions that will inevitably arise through capital accumulation (DeFillipis, 2001). The critique posed against Putnam is that

he, contrarily to Bourdieu, solely included networks with a positive function (sports associations etc.) in his research and lacks attention for power differences and social conflict, for instance, between state and civil society or within voluntary associations, making his theory of social capital unable to account for social struggle (Siisiainen, 2003). A fourth and less acknowledged form of capital introduced by Bourdieu is explicitly evoked to deal with this issue, namely, 'symbolic capital'.

Bourdieu mentions 'symbolic capital' to refer to the cultural and social preferences and behaviors that position an individual in a certain place in the social hierarchy of a specific context, termed the "field" (Bourdieu, 1989). Thereby, symbolic capital mediates one's access to other forms of capital as this position may provide advantages that enhance the perceived legitimacy of one's ownership of the principal capitals. The focus on a practical measurement of power differences between social groups has developed into 'social dominance theory', which incorporates a wide range of psychological, sociological and political theories to uncover the dynamics that stabilize and maintain group-based hierarchies (Sidanius & Pratto, 2001). Within this theory it is recognized that group-based social hierarchies are constituted by a trimorphic structure entailing age, gender, and 'arbitrary set systems' (33-4), of which the latter is of particular importance since it strongly relates to the cultural and situational context and the former two are argued to be present in all group-based hierarchies. Arbitrary set systems, only arbitrary in the sense that the characteristic can differentiate contrarily to age and gender system, determine ingroup-outgroup boundaries, for example, based on race, religion and socio-economic status and as these also determine the interactions in the in-group along the lines of age and gender it should receive primary consideration. These characteristics within a certain context determine the preference of one group over another in a social system and subsequently provides symbolic capital. As argued by Bourdieu, symbolic power is generally an inequality between two groups which is mutually accepted on the basis of cultural capital that determines one's entitlements in society, as such, someone can possess an academic title which s/he has acquired through cultural capital, in turn, legitimizes a higher income (Siisiainen, 2003); similar to the idea of legitimizing myths addressed by Pratto and Sidanius (2001). Legitimizing myths are "values, attitudes, beliefs, causal attributions and ideologies that provide moral and intellectual justification for social practices that either increase, maintain, or decrease levels of social inequality among groups" (104). These legitimizing myths are also employed in public discourses to influence the direction of social change, for example, the notion of universal human rights in the construction of an inclusive and democratic South Africa.

Evident in the previously mentioned conceptualization of social capital is the emphasis on the benefits social networks can have. These networks are however subjected to cultural and economic factors that determine one's social mobility within a social system, which is often ignored in developmental literature. Although Putnam does identify multiple variables that affect the formation of social capital, his approach is incompatible with the reality in South Africa due to the attempt to unite two previously separated social worlds within a democratic nation that values one's ideology above the other. Putnam merely provides guidelines that can be used to categorize certain social dynamics and their outcome while Bourdieu and others provide a theoretical foundation to address the underlying conditions that determine the origin of these dynamics. As it is argued that intergroup networks are facilitators of peace and intragroup networks increase the likelihood of intergroup conflict (Varshney, 2001), the next paragraph will look into current practices of decentralization and local governance as a means to decrease tension through participation. Creating strong links between the state and its people is asserted to be of great importance to a healthy democracy (Putnam, 1993).

2.3 Decentralization, Local Governance and Participation

In reaction to the decolonialization and development processes in Africa, Asia and South America, global powers like the IMF and World Bank have proposed government decentralization as solution to inequality, poverty, and political instability in the construction of democratic nations. It is argued that decentralization increases the government's responsiveness to the poor as it enhances participation on community level, "Insofar as the majority in developing countries is both poor and excluded from elite politics, (...)" (Crook, 2003:77). This approach is employed in many African countries in pursuit of sustainable development. However, in practice the implementation of local governance structures in developing countries has demonstrated challenges through social, political and economic struggles.

Bardhan (2002) discusses that the trend in decentralization should be followed with certain precautions as they are often theorized from research in developed countries and not readily applicable in the context of political transition and developing countries. He argues that the lack of political accountability by local officials in poor countries tend to increase vulnerability to and likelihood of corruption or resource capture by the local elite who in turn will receive a disproportionate share of the common good. To increase the responsiveness of the government to the local level he concludes that "decentralization, to be really effective, has

to accompany serious attempts to change the existing structures of power within communities and to improve the opportunities for participation and voice and engaging the hitherto disadvantaged or disenfranchised in the political process” (202). These kinds of challenges have evoked notions of ‘good governance’, entailing the promotion of equity, participation, pluralism, transparency, accountability and the rule of law, in a manner that is effective, efficient and enduring (Gisselquist, 2012). The incorporation of these standards is supposed to assure legitimacy, accountability and fairness of power holders through bottom-up decision-making processes so that the interests of different groups are met in an equitable manner.

This emphasis on participation is becoming more and more popular in current developmental practices as it is argued to increase the sense of ownership and consequently encourages public participation as it serves as an incentive to efficiently control common resources capital (Hayward et al., 2004). It has however been proven that disadvantaged individuals and groups often lack the necessary resources and capacity to effectively engage in political discourses and thereby are unable to represent their needs as mentioned by Narayan and Woolcock (2000:232-3). Although power shifts to local arenas are argued to increase state-society responsiveness, it appears that it may even have a negative effect on redistribution to the poor as local elites tend to redistribute resources more often in favor of themselves than those who dominate higher levels of governance. Therefore decentralization may even increase the disjuncture between communities, municipalities and higher levels of government. To understand how conflict arises between different levels of government and within communities, negatively affecting social capital, the next section elaborates on the influence of institutions on identity creation, group formation and conflict.

2.4 Institutions, Identity and Recognition: ‘Xenophobia’ and Disintegration

The influence of institutional structures and processes on the access to livelihood opportunities, and resource and systematic constraints that affect the subjective values that construe individual and collective understandings of well-being are a recurring topic when trying to understand how livelihoods are attained and valued. Therefore attention will be paid to the ethics of recognition as argued in the attempt of Axel Honneth (1996) “to secure a sound normative base, on which social critique can identify contemporary pathologies and point to the directions of emancipation” (Deranty & Renault, 2007:93). This will be done in reflection to the transition to democracy as this provides the point of departure for contemporary practices to construct a participative modern society.

One of the classic sociological theories to explain the causes of pathological societies was developed in the end of the 19th century by Durkheim (1897), entailing a process termed ‘social anomie’. This concept addresses the repercussions of rapid social change on social integration and social stability, often marked by “great difficulties of individual adaptation, resulting in a loss of general social orientation, the development of feelings of insecurity and marginalization, uncontrolled rising expectations, feelings of relative deprivation and the questioning of the legitimacy of core social values” (Huschka & Mau, 2006:467-8). It is a state of incongruence between individual or group standards, and broader societal norms and values that cause a lack of moral guidance by society resulting in the decline of social bonds (or social capital). As mentioned earlier the transition to democracy in South Africa is characterized by the legitimizing myth of universal human rights, providing the new moral foundation of norms and values in society which are enforced by institutions that are supposed to create bridges within civil society and between civil society and the state. This would enhance networks of relationships based on mutual recognition defined as social capital, although, recognition in itself is a concept infested with meaning.

A theory of recognition gained prominence within the political and philosophical field in attempt to reconfigure the concept social justice, referring to the fair and just relation between individuals and society, from a normative and psychological dimension. In the analysis and adjustment of Honneth’s ethics of recognition Deranty and Renault (2007) argues that a critical theory of society should, indeed, take as its starting point “the moral claims of oppressed individuals and groups, and the distorting effects of social domination on their bodies and psyche”, since these claims provide the motivational basis for political action, namely experiences of injustice which, in turn, relate to the three main spheres of recognition: self-confidence, self-respect, and self-esteem. These spheres of recognition are gained through fulfillment of physical and affective demands, (legal) acceptance of one’s being, and through the recognition of one’s individual contribution to a social system.

As identities, the characteristics that define a person or group, are constructed by the unification of various particular identities into an autonomous self-identity within the framework of a vision of society, identity in itself is argued to inherently be a struggle for recognition which makes it a political project; although, “it is only when individuals and groups are fighting against the denial of recognition produced by the institutions of social life that their struggle is political and that it really involves political normativity” (Deranty & Renault, 2007). In addition, the relations between institutions are submissive in their influence on identities to the social structures and historical systems they are part of; past racial divisions may prevent

racial mixing despite institutional change. Within this understanding, there are multiple overarching institutional structures to which the identities of South Africans are subjected, namely the national or public domain and the private domain. One relating to the ideologies of the new Republic, and the other relating to the traditional ideologies of, for instance, the Bantu descendants or Afrikaners; both limited in their influence on identity by the social structures and historical systems of which they are part. When the social world is constituted in such a way that the various institutions are incompatible with each other, it may cause a fragmentation of identity through the unsatisfactory recognition of the constituent characteristics of one own sense of his/her identity, “understood as the internalization of a fragmented society” (Deranty & Renault, 2007:101).

When these different institutional systems insufficiently recognize an individual for its worth it is likely that s/he will experience injustice and a denial of recognition causing social disintegration, which “marks the failure of social institutions and communities to deliver basic material needs, social recognition, and personal integrity”, increasing the probability and intensity of violent and criminal behavior (Heitmeyer & Anhut, 2008:25). In these instances violent and criminal behavior may be employed as a coping strategy to compensate for the lack of recognition. The feeling of inequality and injustice due to structural hierarchies that determine one’s position as inferior might evoke violence in order to regain respect or restore justice. Lastly, the lack of emotional recognition may construct a negative self-image and dysfunctional learning patterns that incorporate violence by means to resolve conflict and gain self-confidence. Thus, when a social system is unable to respond to the needs of individuals and individuals are unable to adapt to change these changes, it is likely that they will engage in violent and criminal behavior through the denial of recognition.

Since social sustainability aims at the creation of mechanisms to collectively identify needs and demands in order to establish a condition that promotes the well-being of the people, it is of crucial importance to recognize people in their autonomy without excluding them from the collective to induce a condition in which people feel that they belong and are committed to act in favor of the common good. The management of increasingly diverse perspectives and experiences is therefore crucial in attempt to reestablish moral values.

The sudden transformation to democracy in 1994 has greatly affected the life-worlds of South Africans, requiring them to adapt to the new circumstances and expectation of society. The legacy of Apartheid: racialization, exclusion, violence, and inequality, are still dominating society despite 26 years of ANC rule. At a local level, the great inequality in Hout Bay shows

how the condition is still deteriorating and how racial politics between civic associations have limited opportunities to promote a common vision. The increasing number of migrants are posing a threat to their ability to secure resources, which induces 'xenophobic' violence against them by disadvantaged South Africans. When one relates the underlying causes of these outbursts of violence to the theory of recognition, it must be argued that the potential for violence is driven by the inadequate recognition of black South Africans rather than xenophobia. Therefore, the challenges of (dis)integration and violence, must be encountered by focusing on the deficiencies in institutionalized structures that produce a denial of recognition.

3 Context

3.1 Hout Bay in a National Context

Hout Bay is frequently described as a “mini-South Africa” or “microcosm of South Africa” due to its sharp spatial division of demographic categories as they were defined in the Apartheid era. The Valley, centrally located in the Hout Bay municipal area, is mostly inhabited by Whites, while Hangberg and Imizamo Yethu, both part informal settlement and part township, are mostly inhabited by, respectively, Coloured and Blacks (Froestad, 2006; Fieuw, 2011; Oelofse & Dodson, 2000); the first area is rich, while the others are poor and severely lacking in facilities. The close proximity to a white neighborhood with its own shopping center that provides work and the relative low rates of crime and violence compared to other townships make it a desire place to live.¹ The main sources of income are domestic labor, the local fishing industry, or occasional day jobs which provide little security. In addition there is a vibrant informal economy in the township that consists of grocery shops, hardware stores, phone repair shops, an abundance of barbershops, car garages and such. However, the segregation and the low living standards make it evident here that after the governmental reforms following the abolishment of Apartheid, little has substantially changed in the lives of many people; despite the constitutional reforms of 1996 and policy initiatives like the Black Economic Empowerment Act (Presidency of South Africa, 2004).

The situation in Hout Bay reproduces national tensions on a local scale. South Africa contains a multitude of identities, languages and cultures, the relations which are often historically problematic. In order to progress, the Republic of South African attempts to reconstruct the meanings of places, cultural traditions and similar markers as “unity in diversity”; exemplary is the representation of South Africa as the ‘Rainbow Nation’ (Chidester, 2012). Anderson (2006:5-7) coins the term ‘imagined communities’ to analyze the social construction of nations and how individuals identify with it. In this light the “imagined community of the new South Africa focuses on citizenship; the participation of all citizens, regardless of difference, in the rights and obligations of citizenship, is a unifying force” (Peberdy, 2001:28). However, the increasing flow of foreign migrants pose a threat to the unity and inclusiveness asserted in the new national identity.

Whereas black South Africans were previously expelled to the ‘homelands’, the post-Apartheid created the opened up the possibility to move freely. Consequently, rural-urban

¹ Fieldnotes, and semi-structured interview with representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

migration, as well as, cross-border migration increased in order to find better living conditions and reach for the opportunities provided by the new democracy (UNDP, 2009). As urbanization is accelerating, cities are unable to accommodate the needs of the increasing number of people and the living conditions decrease with tensions and widespread ‘xenophobic’ violence as its result, as is to the situation in Imizamo Yethu (Oelofse & Dodson, 2000). The unavailability of jobs, low education levels, and the abundance of illnesses (within the household or kin group) results in a decreased labor and income capacity, in turn, negatively affecting their social position as they are perceived to be less hardworking, trustworthy and good citizens at community level, relating to their decreased ability “to participate in wider village life, social, and reciprocal activities” (Cleaver, 2005:396-7). These and other interacting factors contribute to the declining capitals of the poor, their ability to participate in society, and maneuver out of poverty. This is commonly known to result in social disintegration.

Social disintegration has a strong correlation to poverty and is associated to a range of negative effects on social capital. One of them being the decline of social control through informal institutions like the community, family, schools, and the labor market, which in turn causes the breakdown of norms and values and increases the probability of crime and violence (Emmet, 2003). This is vividly present when considering the recent increase in reports of gang violence, murders, robberies, substance abuse, and burglaries in Imizamo Yethu which is allegedly related to the scarce availability of resources (NCA, 2015; PMG, 2015). The lack of resources should however not be seen as merely a material condition. It is well-known that gangs serve material, social and psychological needs, which are otherwise unattainable for certain individuals due to a deficiently constructed worldview within a hostile environment struck by poverty (Kynoch, 1999). Much of these worldviews are argued to be shaped by the shift from collective black identities during Apartheid to the increasingly accepted western ideologies of individuality and competition entrenched in neoliberalism of the post-Apartheid, causing them to feel alienated and marginalized in their social realities (Stevens & Lockhat, 1997). It therefore seems as if younger generations are unable to cope with the current expectations and realities of society.

3.2 Governance and Development

Sustainable development has gained popularity in development literature since its evocation. This is also discernible in the South Africa, especially after they had been re-admitted to the UN in 1994. South Africa, one of the founding nations of the UN, was suspended from

membership of the UN due to international opposition to the Apartheid policies. After the fall of Apartheid in 1990 and the transition to formal democracy they regained access to the international economic and political sphere under certain conditionalities. The continuous international pressure stemming from the Apartheid regime's failure to actualize commitments resulted in the subsequent decision to forge a state definition of sustainable development "to justify [their] national policies and development strategies" in the future (Republic of South Africa, 2008:8).

In the attempt to create a responsive and participative civil society in South African society, the government has increased access to decision-making processes by including civic associations. Civic associations are supposed to report their interests to the ward councilor of Hout Bay who, in turn, functions as mediator in interest conflicts between the different communities and communicates with the municipality. The incompetence of the current ward councilor and her affiliation with the Democratic Alliance (DA) has however made the system inefficient as she is thought to be biased.² As mentioned, Hout Bay consists of a Black, Colored and White community who are racially and spatially divided. Each of these communities has its own civic association that represent the interests of their people. The South African National Civic Organisation (SANCO), is therefore present to plea for the needs and demands of the people in Imizamo Yethu. Conflict and fragmentation within the community has however resulted in a power struggle and caused the local branch of the SANCO to split in two and become unrepresentative for the community.³ As there is great distrust among community members and leaders are accused of corruption, it is a challenge to create a common vision in pursuit of a community development.

It is not only the distrust within Imizamo Yethu that poses a challenge to the future development of the community; the presence of the Rate Payers Association (RPA), representing the white population of Hout Bay, also heavily influences the possibilities of development as they continuously contest the demands of the SANCO and the decisions of the municipality.⁴ The enormous influence the RPA exerts on the municipality by the use of their abundant resources causes the people in Imizamo Yethu to experience oppression which they relate to the white led DA that dominates the Western Cape. This could be understood as an experience of elite or resource capture as resources are redirected in favor of the white residents

² Semi-structured interview with the Human Settlements Department on 8-4-2016; and with a local NGO on 4-3-2016.

³ Semi-structured interviews with a.o. the representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016; and one of the original and respected community members on 5-4-2016.

⁴ Semi-structured interview with the Human Settlements Department on 8-4-2016

of Hout Bay. In turn, the experience of oppression among the black population increases distrust and limits their social networks to their significant others.

4 Empirical Chapters: Social Division, Injustice and Governance

4.1 Boundaries of Social Organization

The abundance of diversity has created a fragmented community through distrust and grievances. Therefore, when I speak about the social organization of the community, it must be kept in mind that the presence of patterns of group formation do not imply they are mutually exclusive. Age and gender are always present as division in social organization causing a third characteristic to be dominant in the construction of in- and outgroups (Sidanius & Pratto, 2001). In general nationality and language are the main characteristics of division in the social organization which are enforced by some processes that affect collective identities and group formation.

4.1.1 South Africans: Ethnic Identities

The social interactions are mainly determined by ethnic differences. Language is the primary marker in the social relations among community members which, except for English as a universal language and Afrikaans, Xhosa and Zulu as vividly present South African languages, all represent a different nationality. Cultural differences play an important role in the social relations community members have, although, this seems to be divided mainly along the lines of the difference in language as those who speak another's language are generally accepted in the group. The small number of Zulu's in IY, for instance, are strongly connected through language, norms and, occasionally, by traditions for which they gather.⁵ The ease with which they are able to learn or communicate with Xhosa's makes it easier to blend in, certainly as traditions appear to be generally the same. For Xhosa's, who constitute the majority, ethnicity has less influence and social relations are mainly established by longstanding trustworthy relationships between individuals and families. This became especially clear when I was drinking a beer together with O'shea, a 27 year old father of a two year old child, in a local tavern in IY:⁶

While sitting outside the tavern we were having a conversation about how I preferred IY above the Valley, O'shea stated that he would prefer to live in a white neighborhood because white people don't bother you with their problems or interfere in your life. In the middle of the conversation a man in his forties made an effort to draw our attention.

⁵ Informal conversation after interview with a representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁶ Summary of expanded fieldnotes of an informal conversation with O'shea, 27 years, 3-4-2016.

*“Umfethu”*⁷ he said while approaching us and reaching his hand out to me. A sigh by O’shea while shaking his head sideways openly revealed his aversion, but that did not bother the man who shortly thereafter claimed they are family since he and O’shea’s mother come from the same clan. O’shea instantly rejected this with a hint of anger in his voice which started an argument, eventually leading the man to ignore him and focus on me. As I kept responding out of politeness, it did not take long for him to ask a sip of our beer, a drag of the cigarette and leave us where we were as expected. *“That is why I hate black people.. they are like predators. He only came to us because he wants something you know. He acts like we are family, like I owe him.. that’s what they all do”*, where after O’shea justified his reaction by emphasizing that *“children are part of the clan of their father, not of their mother”*. This led me to question the role of clans and tribes in IY to which he responded: *“Clans and tribes don’t make a difference, they are only used in the Eastern Cape or when they want something of you. I only trust the people that have always been there for me but that aren’t many”*.

The conversation before the man approached revealed how he feels about the cultural values of Xhosa’s and the social pressure he feels to meet the expectations as a father. Thereafter he expressed distrust towards black people which informants have done in multiple occasions despite being black themselves as it is often believed that white people don’t act in such a way. A reference to black people as leeches, parasites, predators, crooks or thieves has been commonly expressed, certainly among South African youth and in the discourse of politics.⁸ This is often fueled by confrontations and incidences that reflect their poverty and lack of resources; situations in which one who has little is (about to be) left with even less. The presumption that others just seek to take advantage or benefit seems to heavily restrict the establishment of reciprocal relationships. Therefore, their social networks are often entangled with kinship structures that have expanded their reach in the township over time.

In the years after the establishment of the community people kept coming and occupied the land that was allocated for housing during the formalization of IY. Whereas there was space to build their own shacks, the increasing population density makes it impossible which led to a vibrant property market.⁹ Many of the residents who have built a shack during that time, came

⁷ *‘Umfethu’* is used as a greet in Xhosa, meaning ‘brother’.

⁸ Informal conversation with Jay, a father in his forties on 4-3-2016; with Lanez on 15-2-2016; two South Africans in their twenties on 28-3-2016; and a semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016.

⁹ Semi-structure interview with the Human Settlements Department on 8-4-2016; with a representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016; and with Shane on 21-4-2016

to own multiple shacks through inheritance and are renting them out and selling them for large sums. Newcomers mostly enter IY through kinship whereby an interrelated network of social groups is created. The lack of space made it common that when one has a spot left in their home or moves back to the Eastern Cape, a family member moves in. This is a common practice as there is a strong urge to take care of one's family. They often come from the Eastern Cape to become self-supportive and independent, or as some view it: to be(come) a man and provide for their family back home.¹⁰ During an informal conversation with Jamal and Sean it was explained to be ingrained in their culture: "it is pride, you know.. showing respect to your ancestors and your family. That is what makes me want to move up", another added to this: "those kids from here on the street corner don't know about it—I mean the one's from '96/'97 and younger. They never learned to respect, they've never been smacked and taught discipline; now they drop out of school, become addicted, rob and kill".¹¹ Although they are both raised in IY, they seem to have a strong connection with their family and culture. The significance of their explanation lies in the fact that they approach the problem to be the lack of discipline and respect among youth of a certain age and younger which they relate to the transition to democracy and being spoiled. Those who come from the Eastern Cape, however, are seen to share the feeling of pride in their ancestors regardless of their age and many still wear traditional clothing. Moral values appear to be imposed on them by adhering to a collective identity often entailing the spirit of Ubuntu, the traditional wisdom comprising the interconnectedness and interdependency of human beings as one is only recognized as human in relation to others and cannot exist in isolation (Tutu, 2008). In this respect, caring for others and treating them as you want to be treated are important aspects in their culture. The fragmentation among disadvantaged black South Africans through the struggles they are facing has however a devastating effect on the realization of this ideal.

Being cared for, opposing to caring for, is seen as a humiliating situation, certainly among men as manhood and masculinity is shown by responsibility, independency and (self-) supportiveness. A family that was affected by an enormous fire that took place on the 28th of February 2016, destroying a few hundred shacks, was forced to seek refuge at friends. The father told me that he slept in his cab and his wife and children stayed at a friend. He expressed serious discontent about this when I was helping him to rebuild their shack, explaining to me that his children and wife should not need to depend on someone else.¹² There is no uniform

¹⁰ Informal conversation with Smisu on 15-2-2016; with Alicia on 2-3-2016; and with Sean on 9-3-2016

¹¹ Informal conversation with Jamal and Sean, 23 and 25 years old on 24-4-2016

¹² Informal conversation with Jay on 4-3-2016

answer to the question what determines one's social status, except for characteristics such as age or gender. Some refer to material wealth, in forms of luxurious consumption goods and property,¹³ while others assert the amount of daughters and sons to be a sign of status which eventually relates to material wealth as sons are expected to provide for the family and a dowry is received for the daughters when they marry.¹⁴ It seems as if wealth is the means through which to achieve other values. In either case it fosters competition and rivalry often accompanied by jealousy, as I have been told that it is not unusual that kinship bewitch and kill each other.¹⁵ Certainly in the age of modernization, democracy and raising expectations that cause different grounds for (denial of) recognition and consequently (dis)integration.

4.1.2 Foreign Africans

Foreign migrants are grouped according to their language and nationality which causes them to divide themselves in various meeting places and churches. Of the multiple shabeens that are present in IY, some are for example mainly visited by Malawians and others by Angolans, Zimbabweans or Namibians. Most foreign migrants also have the possibility to go to a church where their native language is spoken although for some specific denominations services are only held in English. The influence of kinship structures among foreign migrants seems limited as it has been becoming harder to obtain a legal permit.¹⁶ Most foreign migrants I spoke to have some family members or acquaintances from their home country in IY that have motivated them to move there for a better future. The strong feeling of nationality and the crave to get back to their families in their home country also refrains them from any interest in a future in IY and the development of the community. Motivations to come to South Africa are often found in the political conditions and economic opportunities that make it possible and more favorable to migrate in pursuit to gain financial capital to invest in a future in their home countries while few others wished they could go back.

*“My reason to be here is because the economy in Malawi is so poor. I had to travel to look for a job, to look for a living.. to get some money and help my family in Malawi. South Africans think we come to steal their jobs but that's not the way. (...). We [foreign Africans] don't feel we belong here and we don't want to stay here”.*¹⁷

¹³ Informal conversation Curtis DD-MM-YYYY, informal conversation Shane DD-MM-YYYY

¹⁴ Follow-up after interview with Alicia 25-4-2016

¹⁵ Semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016; and follow-up after interview with Alicia on 25-4-2016

¹⁶ Semi-structured interview with a Zimbabwean pastor on 7-4-2016

¹⁷ Semi-structured interview with Lotti 21-4-2016,

A 22 year old Malawian student told me:¹⁸

“I came here to learn better English and work. I’m a certified welder and plumber you know, so I want to go back [to Malawi] and start my own business.

Some have come for political reasons a 34 year old Zimbabwean man told;¹⁹

“I came here sixteen years ago with my family. We can’t go back anymore.. our family is blacklisted because of the politics in Zimbabwe”.

Foreign migrants in IY obviously do feel a stronger connection when they come from the same village, province or country as they introduce each other to me as brothers because of their nationality or other similarities, but there seems to be little that effectively increases relations of trust as informants have expressed distrust to their fellows regardless of the identity they share. In multiple occasions a Malawian informant expressed distrust in his fellows, often rooted in suspicions of theft and moral wrongs which made him to warn me about them:²⁰

“Don’t trust those guys when I’m not here. They come from Blantyre just like me, but they are no good. They will steal from you if they can”.

Many have left their traditions at home and do not perform them in South Africa and seldom identify with their particular ethnic background. There are still some who practice traditional religious rituals in small groups but most seem to have adapted to the urban life and only celebrate the holidays in November and December.²¹ According to a few Zimbabwean and Malawian informants the main motivation to start a reciprocal relationship is by giving someone the benefit of the doubt because of the shared nationality, which disappointments have often transformed into distrust.²² As foreign migrants have relatively little kinship and they move intra-generationally within their own national group.

Most social relations are based on interest structures, which aside from church, often involving drinking as shabeens and taverns are the most obvious places to entertain oneself. They lack any form of representation as they are only organized through church or the local

¹⁸ Informal conversation with Brandon on 7-3-2016,

¹⁹ Informal conversation with Benjamin on 17-3-2016

²⁰ Fieldnotes and informal conversation with Lotti, a Malawian migrant on 13-3-2016

²¹ Informal conversation with Kerry, a Malawian migrant on 31-3-2016

²² Fieldnotes and informal conversation with Lotti, a Malawian migrant on 13-3-2016

‘national’ football team; neither providing a basis for the representation of their interests as church leaders are only involved in spiritual issues and challenges²³ and the football teams are only a way to spend leisure time. Accessibility to the civic associations and public meetings is also constrained as it requires foreigners to speak Xhosa. This leaves a continuous tension between South Africans and foreign Africans remains a problem in the establishment of a strong and singular voice in the community. The upsurge that followed the brutal murder of a Congolese man at broad daylight is said to be led by an alliance of Congolese, Malawian and Zimbabwean men “against the Xhosa’s”, where after the Xhosa community joined them in pursuit of justice and continued the patrols after the rest had their revenge.²⁴ Cooperation seems to be possible but merely in pursuit of an outcome, instead of a common vision.

4.1.3 Othering

There are common stereotypes and prejudices about different ethnicities, but also about occupations. One’s ethnicity is often used as an eloquent description of people in tales due to the commonly recognized stereotypes. Children from a young age get taught the words “*mulungu, vambo, makwerekwere etc.*”, which are derogatory references to white people, Namibians and Zimbabweans.²⁵ They use the ethnic references to humiliate each other, calling each other’s father Zulu and such. This not only appears to be the case among youth but also among adults. When one is telling a story and refers to a Zulu, for instance, many Xhosa’s evoke an image of a loud and rude person dressed in a certain manner; Congolese are often pictured as “big, bloodthirsty gorilla’s”; and Zimbabweans and Malawians as scared, cautious, insecure or modest.²⁶ In some occasions South Africans are even mistakenly seen as foreigner due to a darker skin color ‘than normal’ and are scolded for this very same misconception by other South Africans.²⁷ Another common misconception is, for example, that all ‘spaza’ shops, informal convenience stores, are occupied by Somalians. At one evening an informant and I were at a spaza shop where we both regularly came.²⁸ He, in a friendly manner, made a remark to the tenant of the shop involving Somalians to which the tenant did not react. I jokingly corrected him and said he is an Ethiopian where after he reacted surprised and asked the tenant

²³ Semi-structures interview with Zimbabwean pastor on 7-4-2016

²⁴ Open interview with three Zimbabwean migrants on 4-4-2016

²⁵ Semi-structured interview with Zimbabwean social worker in IY on 11-3-2016

²⁶ Informal conversation with Zimbabwean Fish and Chips shack owner on 15-2-2016, O’shea on 3-4-2016, Alicia & Curtis on 3-4-2016

²⁷ Informal group conversation at Curtis’ house 8-3-2016

²⁸ Fieldnotes on 21-4-2016

of the shop for confirmation. The tenant thereafter sincerely expressed himself about his feeling of humiliation and his “hate” for Somalians. They did know each other to some extent as he came there daily since he moved into a shack around the corner six years before, and showed each other trust as he could get airtime, a cigarette, or a candle on credit. It appears however that there is a lack of actual interest in foreigners, leaving them misrecognized for their true identity.

This process is not solely influenced by discourses created by outsiders. The way in which football teams are divided along nationality shows how nationality and language play the main role in the construction of identities. This process of “othering”, however, does create a discourse in which differences are enforced and group identities form. Some of these stereotypes have even formed the foundation for bar fights, violence and crime, raising questions and suspicions about xenophobia as will be discussed in another section. The stereotype among foreign migrants about South Africans in Imizamo Yethu is mainly related to the recent violence and their ‘unwillingness’ to work, representing them as “killers” or “lazy”.²⁹

4.1.4

4.1.5 The Extent of Intergroup Interactions

Bridging social capital is seen as social networks that transcend ethnic boundaries and entail interactions between different social groups (Narayan, 2002). Strong ties to family in the home country, language, nationality, and the shared grievances of migrants limit their movement in the community and only provide bonding social capital which can result in isolation (Varshney, 2001). Those who have been living in South Africa long enough to master the Xhosa language are often more assimilated to the community and restrict themselves less by their language and nationality. According to a Zimbabwean and Congolese informant these are mostly refugees who do not have the possibility to return to their home countries and have given up their past life.³⁰ Most relationships that cross ethnic boundaries seem to be established through structures of interest. There are few foreign Africans that do not rent a room of South Africans and interact with them on an economical basis, these interactions are mainly based on personal interests. A week after the fire of the 28th of February I helped a family to rebuild their shack. Later in the afternoon George, a Malawian who rents a room of the family, came to help with the

²⁹ Informal conversation with Zimbabwean migrant of 21 years on 10-4-2016; and with a Zimbabwean Fish and Chips shack owner on 15-2-2016

³⁰ Informal conversation with Casper 17-3-2016; and with Benji 20-3-2016.

construction but was treated slightly derogatory.³¹ Contrarily to me and someone else they did not provide him with food and he expressed his main concern to be that their part of the shack is finished, so he could start rebuilding his room. It seemed as if they solely worked together in pursuit of a personal interest in which they relied on each other. These interactions express a relation of ‘superiority’ of the South Africans over the ‘inferior’ foreign Africans.

Many of the more equal relations my informants have with other ethnic groups are based on sports, music and going out. Age is often an important indicator of these interactions as South African youth seems to be more flexible in their movement in the community, they have a more individualistic mindset than the elderly and are well literate in English. Since communication with foreign migrants is in English, this gives them better access to enter their space. Most intragroup interactions I have observed, take place on the street or in shabeens and involve music, dancing, drinking, playing pool, or smoking marijuana. These interactions do not perform any signs of a strong social bond although the sharing of the hardships in their lives through music does appear to have a strong effect on shared experiences and trust.

³¹ Fieldnotes of the reconstruction of a shack 4-3-2016

4.2 The Experience of Injustice: Resources, Rights & Recognition

It has become clear that for many of the South Africans and foreign Africans social relations are limited to those with whom they share their life-world, often rooted in ethnic similarities and shared experiences of injustice and marginalization. As Percival and Homer-Dixon (1998) have argued, grievances lead to fragmentation as those who feel marginalized identify with those who experience the same injustice. In the next section I will illustrate how the resources and rights that provide access to livelihood opportunities are incorporated in a struggle for equality which perpetuates fragmentation within the community through the politics of identity.

4.2.1 Being Black and South African

Obviously the past has a continuous effect on the current position of black people in society which is not erased by merely implementing a new constitution. The previous racial hierarchy placed white people first, coloreds second, and the blacks on the third place in society, which is still experienced as a great injustice.

*“White people will always see me as a black person, so they will know that I’m a third race in the country. The country is ours; they came as a minority”.*³²

Although they are increasingly aware of their rights, they cannot escape reality. It is undeniable that their skin color affects their opportunities, not only by (the aftermath of) structural segregation but also by their own mental state; the realization that you have less and are less than others despite that they are the original inhabitants.

In one occasion Alicia told me she hasn’t been to the sea for years and has been wanting to go for quite some time but how there is a feeling to be restricted to go out of IY into Hout Bay. One reason is others questioning why you go to the *mulungu*; the other reason being a feeling of not belonging there. It has been occasionally mentioned that some people didn’t want to be seen with me because I am white, *“If they see me with a white guy people will make a problem of it and I’m just out of prison so I want to stay low”*.³³ Pressure is also exerted as black youth are made fun of when they live in a predominantly ‘white’ neighborhood such as Hout Bay, *“In Gugulethu [another township] they call us cheese boys because we live in a white neighborhood. They make jokes about it, asking questions like ‘how does [white people’s]*

³² Semi-structured interview with representative of the new SANCO/ANC on 22-2-2016

³³ Informal conversation with Lanez and other youth on 15-2-2016

food taste?''.³⁴ Although it has not been explicitly mentioned, it is likely that these statements limit the social interactions with white people as they are discarded as treason.

An informant expressed racial exclusion from certain places in Hout Bay to be worse than at other places in the following words during an interview in a local lunchroom about resource access and opportunities, in which he constantly emphasized how the development of IY and its people is contested by the RPA and white residents of Hout Bay:

“Have you ever felt like an intruder in your own home? That is how we feel. We feel like we are intruders, even now those people are watching and saying to each other: ‘there is a black guy at the table’, and they are asking themselves questions because we are only good as waiters and workers in the kitchen in their eyes”.³⁵

This thought is not irrational as I’ve been told by many how they are persistently oppressed in their working environment. If one is able to get a job s/he is often exploited due to the great need to keep the job and the subsequent inability to stand up for one’s rights. *“We [black people] are still slaves being mentally abused, especially those from Kayelitsha and other townships who do not speak good English and cannot stand up for themselves. And if you’re smart, verbally strong and know your rights, you’d better not let your boss know. They don’t like that and will fire you”*.³⁶ It is not often that low-skilled workers get what they deserve and those who address the issue fear being fired and are easily replaced by either migrants or South Africans who are willing to settle with less. It appears to be the case that South Africans are even avoided as employees because “they do not want to work”³⁷ or “they are unreliable”³⁸, making illegal migrants who are more desperate and who do not have any rights more favorable. Consequently, fueling hate against migrants as the rightless seem to enjoy more economic opportunities than those who share the same national identity. In reaction to this one might say that they should have finished school or get an education but that is easier said than done.

Education is often asserted to be the key to success but inequality among the facilities that provide education and the hardships they live in often result in dropping out. The quality of

³⁴ Informal group conversation on 8-3-2016.

³⁵ Semi-structured interview with representatives of the Imizamo Yethu Youth Development Forum and a chairperson of the new SANCO/ANC on 26-2-2016.

³⁶ Semi-structured interview with Alicia on 25-4-2016; and a similar statement in a semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016;

³⁷ Semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016.

³⁸ Semi-structured interview a original and respected community member of Imizamo Yethu on 5-4-2016

education at the three schools most non-whites attend, Moravian, Sentinel and DISA primary school, varies a lot. Whereas every school should be accessible to everyone within the district, some have instated an average grade point for applicants in pursuit of maintaining high quality education. This is a disadvantage to black youth as successful education is at least partially the result of the situation at home; the support and help they can get to accomplish their goals. As their parents are often uneducated and therefore unable to assist their children with their school work, *“they have been set up to fail”*, in addition to this, *“schools that have always been poor, especially during Apartheid, are sidelined. In more than 20 years not that much has changed in terms of that”*.³⁹ Those who did manage to finish their 11th grade or higher often lack the funds and support to get further educated and end up in the Expanded Public Works Program which entails street cleaning and such, which rather insufficient as it is temporary and *“opportunities that should be available must be encouraging to kids to make them realize: ‘I should actually go back to study I can be able, I can be capable’”*.⁴⁰

Under resourced schools are not always the result of the lack of government interest. The Moravian primary school that has been built by the Niall Mellon foundation is currently in a crises due to the fear among community members and teachers that white people want to take over if they accept the funds which pressured the principle and made him resign.⁴¹ This fear is thought to be connected to the memories of Apartheid and the atrocities that happened under white men’s rule. A project planner of a local NGO in the context of the crisis of the Moravian primary school stated: *“They are afraid that the school will be taken from them. They feel it to be theirs and with a history of Apartheid in mind they are afraid that everything will be taken of them again”*.⁴² It is commonly believed that the interference of white people in local initiatives will result in total control by white people which they refer to as the project being ‘swallowed’ by white people. This thought severely restrains socially sustainable development opportunities provided by external groups and restricts cooperation and involvement of community leaders as they fear allegations of corruption and betrayal. It is evident that race politics are still vastly present in South Africa and seriously affect the position of disadvantaged communities. Within the recognition framework of Honneth it could be placed under depreciative recognition.

³⁹ Semi-structured interview with project planner of a NGO in Imizamo Yethu 1-3-2016

⁴⁰ Semi-structured interview with original and respected resident of Imizamo Yethu on 5-4-2016

⁴¹ Semi-structured interview with project planner of a NGO in Imizamo Yethu on 1-3-2016; Semi-structured interview with a representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁴² Semi-structured interview with project planner of a NGO in Imizamo Yethu 1-3-2016

4.2.2 Disintegration among Youth

The situation at home is often claimed to be the main reason for youth to drop out. Some are victims of negligence and abuse while others want to provide for their family. In neither case they see short term benefits in going to school, eventually leaving them uneducated and in the same position as their parents or even worse. Although many of the youth haven't consciously experienced the Apartheid, they are well aware of their position in society which seems to be of great influence on their perceived opportunities. This paragraph is meant to illustrate how disintegration is manifesting itself in youth by conflicting values in their private and public life.

One of my early encounters in IY was with some troubled youth, among whom Lanez, that presented themselves as (ex-)gangsters, accordingly, members of the former Xobo gang that was notorious for being involved in the gang violence. Two of them have been in and out of prison since their youth and another was presented by them as a drug addict. Although the self-categorization as (ex-)gangsters and their stories were surprising and intriguing I first expected them to be tall tales, showing off as an alpha male or suggesting how fearful I should be as a sign of status. This, however, turned out to be all but the case when I met Lanez again and he shared the reality they live in:⁴³

When I arrived at Curtis he appeared to have visitors, among whom Ace. There were two beers in the middle and they were busy rolling some joints, where after I got some more beers when they asked me if I wanted to join. After some time I could not keep my curiosity for myself which led me to question what for Ace had been in prison. He did not approve the question for which he asked me to rephrase it. After a few missed tries I came to question: Why do you live the life you live? What makes you a gangster? Giving me the benefit of the doubt, he shared his story insisting to start at the "roots".

"It's about being black; being a descendant of slaves.(...). I didn't choose this life, white people created this life. Here in the ghetto you don't trust anybody. (...). Why I'm a gangster is because I live in this shit and everybody has his own game to survive. In South Africa it really is survival of the fittest. People start fights over nothing, over girls, because they don't like you, because you are a pussy, or maybe it is just a family thing. (...). I got into a situation about a girl. (...). I was in Dontse Yahke , alone at a party on their territory, and they wanted to fight. (...). I took my knife stabbed him and ran down. By the time they got down I already had my friends there to back me and it

⁴³ Summary of fieldnotes, 15-3-2016

ended up in a fight. No organized crime, just brothers helping each other out". Curtis and the other two constantly confirmed this experience where after they played various gangster rap and reggae songs that preached their realities, hopes, and dreams while highlighting the parts they related to most. This moment has set the topic of the day; an introduction into their grievance.

There are multiple significant indications of disintegration and conflicting norms and values. The first is that "gang activity (...) is unusual among Xhosa's because of their strong norms and values".⁴⁴ The fact that he refused to answer until I asked the 'right' question indicates the denial of being recognized for the crime he was convicted for. He wanted to start at the 'roots' to make me understand that he isn't inherently immoral, but that he is pushed to do what he does by the environment he lives in like many others. In the time I've spent there, Curtis, for example, has been stabbed two times in his chest on his ribs by friends of a family member and was beaten up by them until a bystander saved him from his death.⁴⁵ The contradiction in the statement that nobody is to be trusted while he was asserting that his friends backed him up shows a sense of belonging, concurrently expressing his individuality, isolation, or maybe even alienation as he refrains himself of the association with others. This feeling of alienation is often erased by substance abuse of any kind: "*Some young people are not free in their hearts, they did not let go of the past and hold everything in them. They were abused when they grew up and still feel oppressed by their families and everything. That is how they run into smoking tik; that is their comfort zone. They don't care about anything anymore. They will rob, they will kill.. just to get tik*".⁴⁶

A lot of youth is engaged in making rap music, occasionally coming to gather to freestyle and play around. The rap music they listen and their own lyrics especially emphasize violence, money, sex and power; reflecting their life-world and enforcing their sense of identity by picturing their dreams but also the extent of their possibilities.⁴⁷ Just before I left, Curtis was busy getting his business up and running after he had an inconvenient interruption that had his priority. I was not aware that he used to be active as a drug dealer but it came out during a conversation in which he expressed that his current job doesn't pay enough, being able to buy just what they need to survive; in comparison to the careless spending of money before, when

⁴⁴ Semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016

⁴⁵ Fieldnotes and informal conversations with Curtis and Alicia on 9-4-2016

⁴⁶ Semi-structured interview with Alicia, a 22 year old woman on 25-4-2016

⁴⁷ Video recordings & fieldnotes of a freestyle rap session on 5-3-2016

he was comfortable.⁴⁸ The time and effort it takes to build a future is unsatisfactory to their instant demands. One of the affluent original community members elaborated on the challenges that youth and parents in IY face since the post-Apartheid stating:⁴⁹

“There is nothing worse than being powerless as an elderly person and you cannot deliver to your own children, you’ll depend on somebody else to play a role in developing your own children. (...). It is a huge challenge for our children as well to adapt to this and make a reality of their own out of all of this. If you look at the secularization that we are having today, we have African kids who are brought up in traditional ways but when they go to school they have to take off that jacket of tradition and put on a modern time jacket you know”.

The norms and values of modern society in which the ‘new born’ are raised, collide with the reality in which they live. The freedoms, rights and subsequent opportunities that became possible created more expectations but, the inability to meet those dreams leaves a feeling of injustice and negligence among the youth causing them to rebel while their parents feel powerless and grieve about their inability to provide their household. The lack of resources and the confrontation with the poverty they live in causes fragmentation within the community due to the persistent inequalities in the promise of equal rights. When I asked which differences Alicia perceived between those who grew up in Apartheid and those who grew up afterwards, she strongly emphasized the pugnacity that created unity among black people.

*“The youth back in the days were fighting for one thing, that is freedom.., and equality. The youth of today is confused.. they don’t know what they want. They gained freedom but they don’t know how to use it. They don’t know what to fight for. They don’t have a vision for their country.. they don’t even have a vision for themselves. (...). They want to become rich or superstars but they don’t act to it”.*⁵⁰

Evidently, the grievance that used to unite has shattered into different directions as a result of incongruent norms and values between the traditional social institutions and the modern national institution. They are not fully recognized in their cultural context nor in their national context as they do not comply to either of them causing a lack of institutional recognition. In turn this relates to a "condition in which society provides little moral guidance to individuals",

⁴⁸ Informal conversation with Curtis on DD-MM-YYYY

⁴⁹ Semi-structured interview with original and respected community members on 5-4-2016

⁵⁰ Semi-structured interview with Zimbabwean pastor on 7-4-2016

termed anomie, associated with a rapid change in values and norms of a society. Consequently, they are pressured to achieve socially accepted goals while they lack the means, turning them to criminal activity as argued by strain theory (Agnew, 2001).

4.2.3 Afrophobia?

The influx of migrants seriously affects the opportunities of South Africans as they often settle with lower wages, resulting in large scale violence against foreign Africans. In IY there has also been an increase in violence which has been related to xenophobia, or as some call it “afrophobia”. In particular the ‘gang’ violence that affected predominantly foreign Africans has come under suspicion of hate motives, hate by itself is however less of a motive than resource scarcity and their vulnerability.

A short period of ‘xenophobic’ violence that took place around 2008 is said to have caused foreigners to group together regardless of nationality or language due to constructed discourse of we, South Africans, against them, foreign Africans.⁵¹ A social worker in the community has reported this to come to an end as the amount of foreigners started to exceed the amount of South Africans.⁵² These constructions are thought to arise out of a misunderstanding of the motivations to migrate:

*“(...) because we didn’t travel a lot as black people here in SA, (...), we are ignorant to understand what reason makes other people move and leave their countries to the other countries. It needs a proper education to our people to understand the circumstances that makes some other people move from their country of birth to another country”.*⁵³

It is asserted that the opportunities that democratization brought made South Africa significantly attractive to foreign Africans, whereas there has never been any reason why one of the surrounding countries would be more attractive to South Africans, although surrounding countries did receive some South African refugees during the Apartheid. South Africans seem less aware of this fact, causing some foreign Africans to experience injustice as they have welcomed them at that time.⁵⁴ The fear that resonates among informants is that they come to take their jobs and opportunities, while most of them would have preferred to stay in their home

⁵¹ Informal conversation with Lotti, a Malawian migrant, on 27-2-2016

⁵² Semi-structured interview with project planner of an NGO in Imizamo Yethu on 1-3-2016

⁵³ Semi structured interview with a representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁵⁴ Informal conversation with three Zimbabweans on 4-4-2016; and semi-structured interviews with Lotti, a Malawian migrant on 21-3-2016; and representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

countries. For educated foreign Africans it can be rather disappointing when they discover that their qualifications and credentials are not acknowledged in South Africa.⁵⁵ I have been told for instance that most of the advertisements about abortions are not from traditional healers and charlatans, as I assumed, but from Zimbabweans who are educated and knowledgeable while lacking the legal requirements.⁵⁶ Most public services are however accessible to foreign Africans although in some cases, like education, a legal status of residency must be attained.

It is undeniable that there are tensions between those two groups as often expressed. Considering the lack of resources and poverty among South Africans themselves, they cannot use any competition in their survival of the fittest. *“People don’t have much of a problem with the people that are South African outsiders, but the problem creeps in once we are struggling in term of resources economically, socially and space wise because there is not much space where we live and we live on top of each other that is a fact”*, in the context of the application for primary school the lack of commitment by South Africans was mentioned, stating: *“Sometimes South Africans neglect the timeframe [for the application] because they can always do it tomorrow or they can always go to another school because they are South African anyway. Whereas these people [foreign Africans] are desperate because of knowing they are in another country, they will take any opportunity they get”*.⁵⁷ The desperation among migrants drives them to do what is necessary as they did not come all the way for nothing, whereas South Africans tend to take their opportunities for granted as they have become rights. Causing feelings of injustice when an outsider has achieved what s/he did not.

The gang violence that took place during 2015 is argued to have reinstated the aforementioned we/they discourse due to the vulnerability of foreigners as they were seen as “easy targets” to rob due to their lack of social ties in the community and the lack of a legal status.⁵⁸ Ironically enough it is believed that foreign Africans are ‘rich’ regardless of the lower wages. In addition, the earlier stereotypes seem to have caused Malawians and Zimbabweans to be the main targets as many speak with fear about, for example, Congolese or Namibians. The motives of violence do not appear to be only out of fear. The roots of the violence against foreign Africans seem to manifest themselves in the lack of resources, the subsequent experience of injustice, and the disintegration of youth who resort to criminal means to satisfy

⁵⁵ Semi-structured interview with Zimbabwean social worker in Imizamo Yethu on 11-3-2016

⁵⁶ Informal conversation with Alicia on 2-3-2016

⁵⁷ Semi-structured interview with original and respected community member on 5-4-2016

⁵⁸ Semi-structured interview with Lotti on 21-4-2016; with Alicia on 23-4-2015; with a original and respected community member on 5-4-2016; and an informal conversation with Zimbabwean owner of a Fish and Chips shack on 22-2-2016

their needs due to a lack of moral guidance. Foreign Africans seem moreover targeted because of their vulnerability due to the lacking of rights, either; economically as they are easier employed and pose a threat to employment of South Africans; socially as they have less influence in the community and are excluded; and legally as they often lack the needed papers or due to a biased police force.⁵⁹

Within this narrative there, again, is an evocation of violence due to sources of recognition mediated through resource access. Although I haven't experienced any violence against foreigners myself, many have expressed their hate against foreigners as they are the cause of their unemployment. From the perspective of Honneth (1996) this would leave them unable to contribute in society which leaves them with a lack of self-esteem. Within the framework of Heitmeyer and Anbut (2008), designed specifically to account for disintegration and violence, this form of recognition can be termed positional recognition which is lacking among South Africans as they do not get the chance to succeed and gain social status in traditional nor modern society. One of the coping strategies is to maintain a positive self-image in the face of ongoing stress is "to blame others for one's own fate (...) and to invoke prejudice and hate in order to compensate", eventually, "violence is a possible outlet to compensate for feelings of weakness or to maintain a sense of self-esteem" (29).

⁵⁹ Semi-structured interview with Lotti, a Malawian migrant on 21-4-2016

4.3 Governance, Politics and Mobilization

Current literature emphasizes the need for decentralization to create a responsive society in which everyone is heard and everyone's needs are met. It is however proven that local governance in poor countries is often met with vulnerability to corruption by the local elite (Bardhan 2002). This has also been the case in South Africa. The SANCO has been reported to be an effective organization in addressing the needs of its people, exposing corruption and fraud by the hegemonic structures of the ANC, and providing informal police and conflict mediation systems such as a community patrol and (Heller, 2005). The situation of Imizamo Yethu is however an exception on these findings as the SANCO and ANC have merged.

4.3.1 Local Politics and Representation

Within IY there are a few civic associations and they are largely dominated and influenced by political and personal interests. There are reportedly two SANCO's of which one is acknowledged by the national branch of the SANCO, and the other by the provincial branch of the SANCO. This divide was erected by a dispute among opposing residents and community leaders about the building of a primary school allegedly without the inclusion of the community in the decision-making process and, according to the leader of the first SANCO, due to the influence the ANC wanted to exert on the SANCO.⁶⁰ When the dispute was supposed to be settled by the help of the national and provincial branches of the SANCO, the national and provincial branches both supported another side causing both parties to see themselves as the legitimate civic association of IY. The municipality does not want to interfere in local politics and therefore corresponds with both of the SANCO's,⁶¹ which divides the community in the different interest they address although it is believed that people only engage when it is in their own interest and benefit.⁶² As such, the leader of the first SANCO stated to be primarily supporting the interests of original community members within the legal boundaries set since the inception of the IY in 1991, undertaking a more political approach,⁶³ whereas, the leader of the new SANCO has asserted to "bring chaos" when demands are not met.⁶⁴ A friend of Curtis

⁶⁰ Semi-structured interview with representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁶¹ Semi-structured interview with Human Settlements Department on 8-4-2016 and 14-4-2016.

⁶² Semi-structured interview with an original and respected community member on 5-4-2016; with Shane on 21-4-2016; and an informal conversation and interview with an original and respected community member no.2 on 4/9-3-2016.

⁶³ Semi-structured interview a with representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁶⁴ Open interview with representative of the new SANCO/ANC on 20-2-2016.

who studies law mentioned these aggressive statements to be exemplary for the liberation politics of the ANC during Apartheid, which he views as counterproductive.⁶⁵

“The ANC is using strategies of the time of apartheid and they don’t work anymore. Threats that whites will take over and start a new apartheid push black people to vote for the ANC”.

Although civic associations are supposed to be free of political interests and represent the community in its entirety, most members of the committee of the new SANCO also hold a position within the local ANC branch and strongly represent their political preference. One of the chairpersons of the new SANCO reported in an interview with me that he has no professional affiliation with any political party, but the day after an enormous fire in the upper part of IY called Dontse Yakhe, he was giving an interview while wearing an ANC shirt and the day thereafter he was handing out blankets in an ANC shirt to those who were on his list.⁶⁶ During an interview with a woman who used to be part of the Sinethemba, a former civic association that recently fused with the new SANCO, she referred multiple times to the new SANCO as “SANCO of the ANC”, followed by a few names of the chairpersons to make sure that I would not confuse it with the first SANCO.⁶⁷ Any affiliation with or help from outsiders that are thought to represent white people is encountered as betrayal or corruption causing racial differences to drive politics and limit external support for development.

It seems as if all institutions and organizations that represent the interests of community members in IY are controlled by the new SANCO/ANC regardless of their supposedly apolitical objectives and representation. The Imizamo Yethu Youth Development Forum as well as the Imizamo Yethu Women’s Forum are governed by members of the SANCO and ANC, and most of the informants I have spoken to, as well as the woman who used to be part of Sinethemba are only aware of, or referring to the ANC Youth League and the ANC Women’s league, whereas those informants that have not signed up as member of the SANCO or ANC are not aware of these institutional bodies at all. Even members of the local taxi association referred me to the leader of the new SANCO and did not want to speak openly about the structure and the function of the organization.⁶⁸ During the registration of the municipal elections on the 5th and 6th of march 2016 the show of power and status of the ANC within the

⁶⁵ Informal conversation South African law student, 23 years on 4-4-2016

⁶⁶ Semi-structured interview with a representative of the new SANCO/ANC, & Expanded Fieldnotes, 27/28-2-2016

⁶⁷ Semi-structured interview with a former member of Sinethemba on 10-3-2016

⁶⁸ Informal conversation with local taxi driver on 4-4-2016

community became evident through their representation. The ANC office was decorated with banners of the ANC and Youth League, an expensive car on the driveway and a few respected and affluent community members on a green lawn next to the stand where one could register to vote or register for the Youth League. On the contrary, the DA stand for registration was to be found on the other side of the street on the sidewalk of merely a meter wide, occupied by a few men and women in their twenties. The popularity of the ANC was visible by the dozens of people wearing an ANC shirt from previous elections while celebrating on the streets and in shabeens.

4.3.2 Governance and Organization

4.3.2.1 *The Community Patrol and the Local Rule of Law*

It is not only in the presentation that the new SANCO/ANC expose their power. The establishment of a community patrol has turned into a debate on liberty vs. security since a curfew has been instated. According to the first SANCO they were part of the patrol but withdrew because of the lack of cooperation by and corruption within the local police department. They felt that the police did not do their task because it was already done by the community patrol so they wanted to get recognition and credit for it. In turn, their withdrawal has led (associates) of the new SANCO to take over and abuse their position in the community.⁶⁹ All informants have reported experiences and anecdotes about getting beaten over false suspicions and receiving fines for being outside after ten in the evening. One of the most disturbing statements being the following:

*“There is a tree they call Rihanna, like the singer, and when they punish you they’ll let you hug the tree, tie you up and hit you with the sjambok⁷⁰”.*⁷¹

Whereas most elder male community members and foreign Africans are content with the patrol since they are not affected by the community patrol or they were more affected by the gang violence, younger community members and women often feel a grudge against the patrol and experience oppression and humiliation.

“Well, (...), for me you see, I have not much of a problem because it does not have a negative impact towards me. But to many people it does affect them.. even to my kids..

⁶⁹ Semi-structured interview with representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁷⁰ A *sjambok* is a traditional South African whip.

⁷¹ Informal group conversation with Shane, Curtis and two others on 13-4-2016

and even my wife. Sometimes we are sitting at home and we differ in opinions. You look at the reasons behind the establishment of it; that has been fulfilled. At least there is peace in the community (...)".⁷²

The violence used by the community patrol goes against the human rights stated in the constitution but is perceived to be the only option to prevent another eruption of violence and crime in IY. The lack of resources and the irresponsiveness of the local police department makes them insufficient and ineffective, leaving violence as the only instrument to exert control over the situation. The rule of law employed by the leadership of IY is within the framework of a traditional South African understanding of right and wrong and thereby against the grain of the universal human rights. The leader of the new SANCO stated:

*"Here we rule –we are ruled by South African laws. The police is here, the government is present, but we also tell our government; the people that come here, it may be the police or anything, we tell: 'this is what you're supposed to do; this cannot be done'".*⁷³

Additionally, the leader of the first SANCO argued:

"Somehow the police are not doing very well because they don't have the authority or right, if I can put it that way, to force people to do what.. or not to do what. Their hands are tied somehow and they are very happy to find a group of people [the patrol], who are helping to make sure that people are afraid of a certain group in the community [the patrol] so they [the gangs and criminals] can't do anything".

The leader of the first SANCO also asserted the patrol to be an instrument of oppression to create fear among the community members and maintain the position of power of the current leaders. I have even been told that the patrol tried to beat a guy to death because he tried to mobilize youth against the current leadership but fortunately community members stopped the assault, which sounded unconvincing until someone else came up with the same story.⁷⁴

During a public meeting of the community patrol I was unable to understand everything since it was held in Xhosa.⁷⁵ A woman whose arm was wrapped in a bandage and a man who showed

⁷² Semi-structured interview with original and respected resident of Imizamo Yethu on 5-4-2016

⁷³ Open interview with representative of the new SANCO/ANC on 20-2-2016

⁷⁴ Semi-structured interview with Shawn on 21-4-2016 and informal conversation with Jamal and Sean on 24-4-2016

⁷⁵ Fieldnotes of community patrol meeting on 14-3-2016

fresh cuts on his upper arms and on the side of his face where the main discussion. The sequence in which the different groups spoke and a discussion about a 1000 ZAR or 500 ZAR fine made it seem like they were settling a dispute. Who eventually would receive the money is yet unclear but it seems as if they have made the patrol self-sufficient since it is a fulltime job and it is supposedly on voluntary basis. The stability of this system is however questionable as youth predict an upsurge against the patrol by victims and criminals who have been affected. The shooting at the patrol that took place the 5th of April, in which 8 bullets were fired and a patroller got hit in his knees, is believed to support their predictions.⁷⁶

Heller (2005) mentions the SANCO to be effective in conflict mediation and explicitly differentiates it from the informal justice systems among black South Africans during the 80s, called people's courts, "which often dispensed summary and violent justice". In Imizamo Yethu this is however not the case. In one occasion a megaphone was used to gather all men of the community. As the announcement was in Xhosa I did not find out where or when until the meeting passed. I have been told by one of the involved that they interrogated and punished someone with the sjambok, in the presence of an estimated 40 men, for stealing a phone.⁷⁷

4.3.2.2 Transparency, Equity & Inclusion: (Under)privileged

Every once in a while there is an election that enables the residents to choose a representative. These community leader elections are commonly said to be held solely among a few resident which causes the outcome to be unrepresentative, although some additionally appoint the lack of public participation and social cohesion to make any leadership unrepresentative.⁷⁸ Whereas there used to be street and block committees that served as the eyes and ears of the first SANCO, they became ineffective as the new SANCO gained control.⁷⁹ Community members have even expressed to be surprised to hear who are part of the current leadership, addressing their recent involvement and residency in the community as one of the reasons why they are not representative or legitimate in their function.⁸⁰ The representative of the new SANCO has also stated that he has no skills and barely knows how to write an e-mail but is just a good

⁷⁶ Informal conversations with Curtis, O'shea, Alicia, Jamal and Sean on 7-4-2016

⁷⁷ Informal conversation with the neighbor of the one whose phone was stolen on 23-2-2016

⁷⁸ Semi-structured interview with representative of first SANCO on 18-3-2016; a respected original community member on 5-4-2016; original and respected community member no.2 on 9-3-2016; with Alicia on 21-4-2016; and an informal conversation with an elder original community member on 3-3-2016.

⁷⁹ Semi-structured interview with an original and respected community member no.2 on 9-3-2016; and representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁸⁰ Semi-structured interview with a respected original community member on 5-4-2016; original and respected community member no.2 on 9-3-2016; and Shane on 21-4-2016

communicator, one of the reasons the representative of the first SANCO sees them as illegitimate since representatives are normally engaged in street and block committees for a number of years before they gain a chair in the executive committee of the SANCO.⁸¹

Both SANCO's say to be active on voluntary basis without any funds or resources, although it is commonly believed that the new SANCO receives funds from the ANC and foreign investors, such as companies or trustfunds, for development with which they fill their own pockets. This assumption is grounded in the abundance of experiences of inequality by the misuse of power by, and corruption among community leaders.

"In some cases the community leaders get bribed.. it even goes as far as women selling their body for a house. It is disgusting because the same people get trusted by people who give out sponsors [funds]; people from overseas who don't know anything about this place but who are willing to help, and they are getting tricked by these guys. They give out packages [funds] and they just share it among themselves. (...). There is no development".⁸²

Jamal and Sean have additionally mentioned that,

"The leaders are keeping everything to themselves. When the city provides opportunities to work like building roads in the community and need a tender, they just employ a friend who does half of the work and the money they save is what they split".⁸³

Alicia has also mentioned that,

"When the ANC office knows about opportunities for work or bursaries then they never let us know. I go there regularly, I have grade 13 metrics but they never have any opportunities for me".⁸⁴

Corruption in housing projects are the main source behind these allegation and the prevalence of the suspicions makes them quite convincing as most people point into the same direction when asked who is behind it. There have however never been any official charges or arrests as those who try to expose corruption fear to be threatened or beaten. The lack of official charges

⁸¹ Semi-structured interview with representative of the new SANCO/ANC on 22-2-2016; and with the representative of the first SANCO on 18-3-2016

⁸² Semi-structured interview with Shane on 21-4-2016

⁸³ Informal conversation with Jamal and Sean on 24-4-2016

⁸⁴ Semi-structured interview with Alicia on 25-4-2016

or arrests is used by some community leaders as an argument against these accusations together with complaints about the lack of participation:⁸⁵

“Not everyone is participating, and those ones who are not participating, who doesn't give a damn about what is happening or.. or don't want to change. But those ones are the first ones who are going to say that there is corruption”.

Community leaders often assert the lack of participation to be the problem while all of the South African informants that are not involved in these organizations have addressed feelings of exclusion in decision-making processes and the lack of transparency to be the cause of their lack of participation. It is believed that the community leaders prevent the circulation of information among community members, leaving them uninformed about the procedures of development initiatives as it is the “only way to fulfil their own agenda's”.⁸⁶ The only ones who are informed and benefit are generally thought to be the relatives, friends, and so-called ‘crownies’.

In particular the youth has mentioned to feel excluded. According to them the current leadership is rather conservative and insensitive to their needs and wants, which has been affirmed by one of the elder original community members.

*“Young people want change but they must be members of the ANC Youth League and need to engage politically, socially, and economically”.*⁸⁷

Dissatisfaction about the current leadership and the increase in popularity of a possible future community leader who has great support among youth might however change the tides. Certainly since more than half of the community is under 30 according to the statistics of 2011 (Stats Africa, 2011). There is however a lot of skepticism about the changes it will bring.

4.3.2.3 Responsiveness & Accountability

The presence of an ANC office, where the new SANCO is also stationed, makes them observable and reachable whereas the fulltime job of the leader of the first SANCO and the lack

⁸⁵ Semi-structured interview with representative of the Imizamo Yethu Youth Development Forum and a chairperson of the new SANCO on 26-2-2016

⁸⁶ Semi-structured interview with original and respected community member on 5-4-2016

⁸⁷ Informal conversation with an elder original community member on 3-4-2016

of an office prevents him to actively respond to the needs of community members. It seems as if the new SANCO has more influence and is more engaged in the community but is also the first to be held accountable for unresolved issues by the residents. The fire that broke out during December, destroying more than 200 shack is the lower part of IY, called for a quick response but the lack of resources and influence caused the problem to remain for weeks. Eventually the municipality did supply the new building materials but they were left without electricity until just before I left:

*“The community leaders aren’t doing what they are supposed to. After the fire in December we didn’t get any help and all the people had to sleep in their cars, outside, or with friends for weeks. Now the problem is electricity. Because he [the leader of the new SANCO] knows us he said he didn’t need our box numbers [for the electricity meters] but now it is almost 5 months later and we still don’t have electricity and he comes to tell us that he needs our box numbers”.*⁸⁸

The days before this conversation I had already seen the particular leader which is referred to running up and down and arguing with community members to get things done. The same afternoon he was walking up and down with a megaphone through which he was yelling in Xhosa. Curtis bursted into laughter when he heard what was said where after he translated it for me:

*“He is announcing a meeting for today at 19.00 and is yelling something about us being lazy assholes because we never come to meetings but we always have time to drink beer at Philips [a local tavern]”.*⁸⁹

Since public meetings are rare, a few of the informants mentioned this to be a reaction to the dissatisfaction among community members who were allegedly conspiring against him in the wake of a new community leader election; trying to involve and satisfy the community members to get votes as meetings are rarely held.⁹⁰ It is however understandable and undeniable that it is frustrating when one is held accountable for solutions while just being a messenger and mediator between the community members and the municipality without any resources to effectively bring change. The lack of education among elder community members makes them

⁸⁸ Informal conversation with Jamal on 11-4-2016

⁸⁹ Informal conversation with Curtis on 7-4-2016

⁹⁰ Informal conversation with Curtis on 7-4-2016; with Jamal on 11-4-2016 and a group conversation on 11-4-2016.

also more susceptible to misunderstanding and feelings of negligence when problems aren't solved fast enough due to official procedures.

It is evident that the current state of governance in the community does not amend to the ideal that is supported in academic literature. It seems as if this is mainly caused by the capture of resources by local elite and due to a lack of control by the municipality to evaluate the use of resources that they get provided. Stricter procedures might solve this problem although literature (Bardhan, 2002) suggests that the local power structures have to be brought down before change can be effectively implemented. Therefore, the current conservative ANC and SANCO leaders should make way for new and democratic ideals that undeniably call for the acceptance of diversity and the social changes that are taking place and a need to let go of past sentiments to progress and expand the horizon of its people.

5 Conclusion and Discussion

During the field research I came to understand that the lack of mobilization among community members is mainly a result of poor governance and weak social capital due to increasing diversity which caused the community to become fragmented. Although this research was initially directed at community building through social capital, present social inequalities proved this approach to be ineffective without understanding the construction of social hierarchies within the local and national context. In the empirical chapters I attempted to illustrate how the contemporary social organization and the current leadership of Imizamo Yethu reproduce historical experiences of injustice in a modernizing nation threatened by resource scarcity which subsequently results into violence against foreign African migrants. By the use of previously mentioned findings this chapter is devoted to link contemporary theories in social sciences and development literature to answer the following question: *How is the social sustainability of Imizamo Yethu affected by the reproduction of power differences and social division by institutional contexts?*

In the theoretical framework I employed a deductive approach which led me to argue that current sustainable development literature often includes the concept of social capital as inherently good to legitimize policies and practices without considering the effects of power differences in social hierarchies. Meikle et al. (2001) argue that the accessibility of opportunities is often related to institutional structures and processes that grant and withhold social, economic and legal rights. It is however not specified what an institution is, although, this statement does insinuate that institutions have the political power to grant and withhold rights. If institutions are viewed solely as political bodies, it must be argued that this understanding lacks sensitivity to the informal institutional forces that produce experiences of rights and grant access to opportunities. In addition, the official local institutional bodies in Imizamo Yethu are reproducing inequalities as they hold the power to divert resources in favor of the local elite and their associates since others lack the capacity and resources to effectively address their rights. To illuminate how institutional structures and processes constrain access to opportunities, attention has to be paid to the present hierarchies in the local and national context that produce inequality.

It is evident that the contemporary idealized identity by South Africa is devoid of racial, ethnic, and gender based discrimination which is enforced by the constitution. However, as

mentioned by among others Bourdieu (1986) and Honneth (1996), identities are constructed within the boundaries set by relations between social structures and historical systems. The historical system of Apartheid in which ethnic identities received primacy, maintained in current conceptions and experiences of superiority and inferiority. The continuously experienced contestation of the (formal) equality of black people sustains a racial discourse in which black people are struggling to get recognized as equals. However, the depreciative nature of recognition experienced by black people leaves them to reproduce the inferiority embedded in these hierarchies in everyday life, limiting intergroup interactions within the context of racial divisions.

Similarly, the previous isolation of black people in the Bantustans or 'homelands' have resulted in the conservation of strong ethnic identities and their own traditional social hierarchies which continue to exist in contemporary society as spatial segregation maintains along racial lines. However, modernization made previously closed spheres accessible and introduced new norms and values on society to which youth is gradually enculturated, causing a collision between the realities constructed by public institutions, like the education system, and informal institutions, like the family. As the constitutional reform introduced western ideologies such as individuality, competition and universal human rights as the dominant norms and values, traditional values are losing their significance, in particular for urban youth. As argued in social dominance theory, legitimizing myths provide justifications for increasing, maintaining and attenuating inequalities. A peculiar result hereof is outgroup favoritism among low-status groups that motivates ingroup discrimination (Sidanius & Pratto, 2001:20). This has been overtly expressed in the evaluation of black people as leeches, parasites and crooks. This can be further associated to the idea of cultural hegemony, which causes "the prevailing ideology and values of the dominant social group [to] permeate social institutions and suck subordinates into a mind-set that undermines any impetus for change"(Jost & Major, 2001:440). The increasing legitimacy of the contemporary dominant ideology in South Africa therefore increases the identification with western norms and values while disrupting the influence of informal institutions like the family in the construction of identity. Thus, black South African youth is struggling to get recognized for the autonomous identity they have comprised out of both worlds, while being only recognized for either one or the other depending on the context. They experience oppression in a national context for being black, and may experience injustice in the local context due to their lower social status for not adhering to traditional norms and values. Within the framework of Honneth this would be categorized as unsatisfactory

recognition and the internalization of a fragmented society which is associated with social disintegration and a loss of or weak social bonds.

A problem arises when trying to identify the position of foreign Africans within the framework of Honneth. Foreign Africans do not often have a legal or institutional foundation to make claims for recognition and assert their identities. This would make their identity apolitical within the boundaries of South African institutions of social life. They are excluded from participation in civil society and are merely recognized as rightless unwanted aliens. Their lack of rights, however, does make them more favorable from the point of view of the dominant group who recognizes them as a strong and cheap labor force, providing opportunities to acquire self-esteem. This would imply that they are misrecognized as they are only recognized within the informal economy and invisible or excluded outside of this domain, although they do not engage in any struggle for recognition as they can only conform to their oppressor due to the lack of rights and alternative opportunities. Their invisibility only counts for those who are benefitting while those who are marginalized experience injustice as they are not adequately recognized for their capabilities. Deranty and Renault (2007) argue that “the question of the normative dynamic of political action has to be distinguished from the question of the value of the means and ends of political action”, as illegitimate means may be used to make legitimate claims and legitimate claims may be used to justify illegitimate aims (99). Therefore, violence against foreign Africans could be understood as a legitimate claim of South Africans to regain respect and restore justice that is taken from them by white people, as white people deny to recognize the contribution black South Africans (could) make in society. The means employed to achieve this goal are however illegitimate as they go against the grain of any moral value.

As mentioned in the theoretical framework, social capital is of primary importance when considering the resilience and social sustainability of (livelihoods in) disadvantaged communities. In particular bridging social capital, bonds between social groups, are asserted to increase economic opportunity and social cohesion in social systems that contain asymmetrical distributions of power. Within the national context this asymmetry exist on the basis of race and in the local context this asymmetry exists on the basis of access to dominant outgroups, for example the access local officials have to the government (Narayan, 2002).

Many of the social relations that are based on mutual recognition in Imizamo Yethu are limited to the factors that are attributed to bonding social capital, characterized by in-group solidarity and outgroup antagonism; divisions that are mainly based on ethnic similarities and differences such as language and nationality. In addition to this divide, the current state of

disintegration among the youth that is unable to sufficiently integrate modern and traditional ideologies have also created divisions between generations. The symbolic capital that dominant groups in the local context have attained resulted in subdivisions in Imizamo Yethu which subsequently caused fragmentation as struggles for recognition enforces individuals to increasingly affirm their identity by solidarity with their associated subgroup, cutting of their access to the dominant social groups.

Whereas vertical linkages of networks are supposed to increase bridging capital by identifying subordinate groups with society at large, the inadequate accountability of local leaders to higher governmental structures makes the community prone to corruption and capture by local elites who act on behalf of their own in-group. Subsequently, local minorities are further excluded from access to the benefits of social capital as they do not have the information, resources and opportunities that bridging social capital provide, thereby a downward spiral enforces in-group solidarity and outgroup antagonism which may result in crime and violence.

6 References

Agnew, Robert.

2001 Building on the foundation of general strain theory: Specifying the types of strain most likely to lead to crime and delinquency." *Journal of research in crime and delinquency* 38.4: 319-361.

Alkire, Sabina.

2010 Human development: Definitions, critiques, and related concepts. United Nations Development programme.

Anderson, Benedict.

2006 *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. Verso Books.

Bardhan, Pranab.

2002 Decentralization of governance and development. *The journal of economic perspectives* 16.4: 185-205.

Bourdieu, Pierre.

1984 *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Routledge. 2013.

1986 The forms of capital.(1986). *Cultural theory: An anthology* 2013: 81-93

1989 Social space and symbolic power. *Sociological theory* 7.1: 14-25.

Chidester, David.

2012 *Wild religion: tracking the sacred in South Africa*. Univ of California Press.

Chronic Poverty Research Centre

2015 What is Chronic Poverty. Accessed: 5 December 2015, available on:

<http://www.chronicpoverty.org/page/about-chronic-poverty>

Cleaver, Frances.

2005 The inequality of social capital and the reproduction of chronic poverty. *World Development* 33(6): 893-906

Colantonio, and Tim Dixon,

2009 *Measuring Socially Sustainable Urban Regeneration in Europe*, Oxford Brookes University: Oxford Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD).

Christopher, Anthony John.

2001 *The atlas of changing South Africa*. Psychology Press, 2001.

Crook, Richard C.

2003 Decentralisation and poverty reduction in Africa: the politics of local–central relations. *Public administration and development* 23.1: 77-88.

DeFilippis, James.

2001 The myth of social capital in community development. *Housing policy debate* 12.4: 781-806.

Dempsey N, Bramley G, Power S, Brown C.

2009 The social dimension of sustainable development: Defining urban social sustainability. *Sustainable development*. 19.5:289-300.

Deranty, Jean-Philippe, and Emmanuel Renault.

2007 Politicizing Honneth's ethics of recognition. *Thesis Eleven* 88.1: 92-111.

De Vries, Bert JM, and Arthur C. Petersen.

2009 Conceptualizing sustainable development: An assessment methodology connecting values, knowledge, worldviews and scenarios. *Ecological Economics* 68.4: 1006-1019.

Dixon J., Durrheim, K. Tredoux, C.

2011 *From Divided Space to Shared Space*. In: *urban Diversities - Environmental and Social Issues*, by Bonaiuto, M., Bonnes, M., Nenci, A. M, Carrus, G., *Advances in People-Environment Studies*, 2:237 -248. Hogrefe Publishing, Cambridge, USA.

Durkheim, Emile.

1897 Suicide: A study in sociology. Translated by JA Spaulding & G. Simpson. Glencoe, IL: Free Press. 1951.

Emmett, Tim.

2003 Social Disorganisation, Social Capital and Violence Prevention in South Africa. A Journal of Injury and Violence Prevention.

Fieuw, Walter Vincent Patrick.

2011 Informal settlement upgrading in Cape Town's Hangberg: Local government, Urban governance and the 'Right to the City'. Diss. Stellenbosch: Stellenbosch University.

Froestad, Jan.

2005 Environmental Health Problems in Hout Bay: The Challenge of Generalising Trust in South Africa. Journal of Southern African Studies 31.2: 333-356.

Gisselquist, Rachel M.

2012 Good governance as a concept, and why this matters for development policy. Vol. 30. WIDER.

Hayward, Chris, Lyn Simpson, and Leanne Wood.

2004 Still left out in the cold: problematising participatory research and development. Sociologia Ruralis 44.1: 95-108.

Heitmeyer, Wilhelm, and Reimund Anhut.

2008 Disintegration, recognition, and violence: A theoretical perspective. New directions for youth development. 119:25-37.

Heller, Patrick.

2005 The Antinomies of Civil Society and Democracy: Civics as Publics in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Online accessible via http://www.patrickheller.com/uploads/1/5/3/7/15377686/antinomies_paper_posted.pdf

Homer-Dixon, Thomas F.

1994 Environmental scarcities and violent conflict: evidence from cases. *International security*. 5-40.

Honneth, Axel.

1996 *The struggle for recognition: The moral grammar of social conflicts*. MIT Press.

Huschka, Denis, and Steffen Mau.

2006 Social anomie and racial segregation in South Africa. *Social Indicators Research* 76.3: 467-498.

International Monetary Fund.

2016 *The IMF and Good Governance*. Factsheet. Accessed on 20-6-2016 via <http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/gov.htm>

Jost, John T., and Brenda Major.

2001 *The psychology of legitimacy: Emerging perspectives on ideology, justice, and intergroup relations*. Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Kynoch, Gary.

1999 From the Ninevites to the Hard Livings gang: township gangsters and urban violence in twentieth-century South Africa. *African Studies* 58.1: 55-85.

Landau, Loren B., and Aurelia Wa Kabwe Segatti.

2009 Human development impacts of migration: South Africa case study. *Human Development Research Paper* 2009.5.

Littig, B. and Grießler, E.

2005 Social sustainability: a catchword between political pragmatism and social theory. *International Journal of Sustainable Development* 8.1:65–79.

Magis, Kristen.

2010 Community resilience: An indicator of social sustainability. *Society and Natural Resources* 23.5: 401-416.

McKenzie, Stephen.

2004 Social sustainability: towards some definitions. Hawke Research Institute Working Paper Series. 27.

Mebratu, Desta.

1998 Sustainability and sustainable development: historical and conceptual review. *Environmental impact assessment review* 18.6: 493-520.

Meikle, Sheilah, Tamsin Ramasut, and Julian Walker.

2001 Sustainable urban livelihoods: Concepts and implications for policy. Working paper no. 112.

Morelli, John.

2013 Environmental sustainability: A definition for environmental professionals. *Journal of Environmental Sustainability*, 1(1), 2 Accessed on 19 Janurati 2016 on : <http://scholarworks.rit.edu/jes/vol1/iss1/2> DOI: 10.14448/jes.01.0002

Narayan, Deepa.

2002 Bonds and bridges: social capital and poverty. *Social capital and economic development: well-being in developing countries*. Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar. 58-81.

News Channel Africa

2015 Gang violence erupts in Hout Bay. Accessed on 18-6-2016 via: <https://www.enca.com/south-africa/gang-violence-erupts-hout-bay>

Norris, F. H., Stevens, S. P., Pfefferbaum, B., Wyche, K. F., & Pfefferbaum, R. L..

2008 Community resilience as a metaphor, theory, set of capacities, and strategy for disaster readiness. *American journal of community psychology* 41.1-2: 127-150.

Oelofse, Catherine, and Belinda Dodson.

1997 Community, place and transformation: a perceptual analysis of residents' responses to an informal settlement in Hout Bay, South Africa. *Geoforum* 28.1: 91-101.

2000 Shades of xenophobia: In-migrants and immigrants in Mizamoyethu, Cape Town. *Canadian Journal of African Studies/La Revue canadienne des études africaines* 34.: 124-148

Parliamentary Monitoring Group

2015 Violence against migrants: COSATU; FEDUSA & Imizamo Yethu Representatives briefing. Ad Hoc Joint Committee on Probing Violence Against Foreign Nationals. Accessed on 18-6-2016 via <https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/21379/>

Peberdy, Sally.

2001 Imagining immigration: Inclusive identities and exclusive policies in post-1994 South Africa. *Africa Today* 48(3): 15-32.

Percival, Val, and Thomas Homer-Dixon.

1998 Environmental scarcity and violent conflict: The case of South Africa. *Journal of Peace Research* 35.3: 279-298.

Pogge, Thomas.

2007 Why should people not be poor?. *In* Freedom from poverty as a human right: Who owes what to the very poor?. UNESCO.

Presidency of South Africa

2003 Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act, No. 23 of 2003, Government Gazette, 463, Republic of South Africa, Cape Town.

Putnam, Robert D.

1993 The prosperous community: social capital and public life. *The American Prospect*, Vol. 13: 35-42.

2001 *Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. Simon and Schuster.

Republic of South Africa

1996 The Constitution of the Republic of South African. Accessed: 5 December 2015, available on: <http://www.gov.za/documents/constitution-republic-south-africa-1996>

2008 *People, Planet, Prosperity: a National Framework for Sustainable Development in South Africa*. Dept. Environmental Affairs and Tourism. 1-94

Sidanius, Jim, and Felicia Pratto.

2001 Social dominance: An intergroup theory of social hierarchy and oppression. Cambridge University Press.

Smyth, Luke.

2011 Anthropological Critiques of Sustainable Development. *Cross-sections 7*: 78-85.

Siisiainen, Martti.

2003 Two concepts of social capital: Bourdieu vs. Putnam. *International Journal of Contemporary Sociology* 40.2: 183-204.

Statistics South Africa

2011 South African 2011 Census, South Africa.

Stevens, Garth, and Rafiq Lockhat.

1997 Coca-Cola Kids'-Reflections on Black Adolescent Identity Development in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *South African Journal of Psychology* 27.4: 250-255.

Varshney, Ashutosh.

2001 Ethnic conflict and civil society: India and beyond. *World politics* 53.3: 362-398.

Woolcock, Michael, and Deepa Narayan.

2000 Social capital: Implications for development theory, research, and policy. *The world bank research observer* 15.2: 225-249.

7 Attachment: Reflection on the Field Research

All the expectations and certainties I had before I arrived disappeared as the organization with whom we were supposed to collaborate did not have any funding to continue the particular project we would assist in. As it caused uncertainty about the direction of the research, stress set in and the lack of communication with my former research partner led us to break after a few weeks. Consequently, lost time had resulted in more stress as I felt the need to make up for it; which I tried by locking myself up in the township. This however came to form a short period of anxiety, or maybe even culture shock, as I was swallowed by the environment and had to assimilate to the local ways. Luckily, the heartwarming acceptance by a few of my informants who took me in and introduced me to others made me feel as if it was the place where I belonged.

The shift in the focus of my research from sustainable development and community building to social sustainability and power differences came naturally as the mindset of many of my informants was rooted in the experiences of a glass that is half empty instead of half full. The change to an emphasis on the negative point of view by my informants led me to gain an, in my opinion, realistic understanding as I have been showed the downside of their life which opened my eyes to things that do not present itself to the naked eye. The life stories they have shared with me, involving drugs abuse, sexual abuse, rape of women as well as men, (domestic) violence, murder, crime, gang life etc., made me understand that they really trusted me. The establishment of real friendships and bonds with these informants has also brought along a shared grieve and a promise with myself to stay in touch and go back when the time is there.

The research was conducted in a period of three months without external funding or association with a 'higher authority' which in some occasions has led to increased trust and honesty by informants but in other cases, such as with some local representatives, resulted in dishonest information, non-responsiveness and secrecy as I did not provide any direct benefits for them. This made me experience them as dodgy or sketchy, which caused me to feel like a detective when I was looking for confirmation and answers at other informants who often told me the direct opposite with eloquent descriptions of how the(ir) reality is, increasing my distrust towards a few of the representatives. The insights I came to gain about the effects of poverty and the hardships of their lives, however, made me understand that every story has two sides and that some of the allegations against and judgements about these representatives were actually caused by external factors or without the intention of the particular representatives in question.

Sometimes I felt too involved in the lives of some informants causing me to have short periods in which I slightly lost my objectivity and placed myself in the role of a person instead of a researcher. This especially had some consequences during some of my interviews as I sometimes felt the urge to respond with a judgement or to ask biased questions. After transcribing the first few interviews I became more aware of this and increasingly improved my ability to ask open questions without affecting the answer. This proved a challenges at times when I had gained an understanding of how certain issues are experienced but when they were not explicitly mentioned in the words that I had in mind. At these times I had to work my way around the given answer and ask questions that deepened the understanding of the informant in question.

Against my expectations, the hardest part was analyzing the gathered data. The procedures used in qualitative analysis are very interpretive, which often made me question the validity of my interpretations. Constantly questioning my own position during the analysis has been an important aspect; every interview I analyzed I tried to take the point of view of my informants. In one occasion this was especially hard as an informant had told me that he was a descendant of a lineage of sangoma's, traditional healers, which made him susceptible to contact with his forefathers which he often exposed during conversations. From a Western perspective I was questioning myself if he might have a psychosis or such, but as I understood that the label psychosis is something created in a Western discourse of science and is infested with ethnocentrism, I tried my best to refrain from this prejudice.



In general it has been an unforgettable experience in which I gained a lot of knowledge about their lifeworld and truths, and in which I have had the chance to significantly improve my skills and understanding of what it means and takes to be an anthropologist. I have had the chance to live among black people who would normally not interact with white people, this made it a unique experience. In addition, I had the chance to make some of the people in the community understand that they are not less than me just because of the color of their skin; that not everybody cares about the differences and only look at similarities; and that there are places in the world where black and white people live together in peace, just as it

will hopefully be possible in the future of South Africa. With pain in my heart I have left them which has felt to me like I have betrayed them. Therefore, I feel the need to keep in touch and one day give back what they deserve for all they have done for me.