Cover picture:

This picture was taken by Effie during the International Roma Day celebration in Govanhill on the 8th of April. It shows the procession walking through Calder Street.

Working towards inclusion

The reshaping of citizenship of Roma through stigmatisation, exclusion and civic activism in Govanhill, Glasgow

Bachelor's project 2016-2017
Cultural Anthropology &
Development Sociology

Universiteit Utrecht

Effie van Betten, 4072510
e.m.vanbetten@students.uu.nl
Maarten Kaptein, 4149319
m.h.kaptein@students.uu.nl

Supervisor: Kees Koonings
Word count: 21767

Table of contents

Maps **5**

Acknowledgements **6**

1. Introduction 7

2. Sketching the research context **13**

2.1 Introduction to Govanhill (Maarten) 13

2.2 History of the Roma's immigration and integration (Effie) 15

2.3 Roma citizenship entitlements in Scotland (Maarten) 16

2.4 Brexit and its impact (Maarten) 19

3. Providing a theoretical background **20**

3.1 The multiple faces of citizenship (Effie) 20

3.2 Social stigmatisation and urban contexts (Maarten) 22

3.3 Cultural diversity, ethnicity and identification (Maarten) 24

3.4 Civic activism (Effie) 26

3.4 Civic activism in the form of social movement (Effie) 28

3.5 Social capital and citizenship as outcomes civic activism (Effie) 29

4. Social stigmatisation and exclusion of Roma in Govanhill **31**

4.1 The dynamics of a neighbourhood 31

4.2 Govanhills' Roma; diverse communities 34

4.3 Blaming the other 36

4.4 Exclusion of Roma 41

4.5 Dealing with challenges 45

5. Civic activism in Govanhill **49**

5.1. Forms of civic activism 49

5.2 Participation of Roma in civic activism 56

5.3 Helping Roma getting a sense of economic and social entitlements 60

5.4 Limited results of social capital 62

6. Discussion and conclusion **66**

7. Bibliography **72**

Maps

Fig. 1: Map of Govanhill. Source:

Acknowledgements

We want to thank all the people who helped us during our research period in Glasgow. It would not have been possible to write this thesis without their help. We were amazed by how willing people were to talk us and help us in many other ways. Despite its challenges, Govanhill has been a very welcoming place to us during our ten weeks of research in the neighbourhood. We also want to thank our supervisor, Kees Koonings, for his support and advice during this project.

1. Introduction

Cities have been attracting migrants from the moment of their conception, both from within the region or country as from further away. The city is a place where different cultures and ethnic groups encounter, both mentally and physically. Although an already longstanding phenomenon, transnational migration flows have increased significantly through processes of globalisation (Eriksen 2013, 92). Among other things, this was caused by the loosening of border regulations (a well-known example being the concept of 'Free movement of persons' within the EU). Upon arrival, migrants try to strengthen their economic base in order to provide in basic needs. Apart from that, however, migrants also try to make their new place of residence a home where they feel a sense of belonging (Eriksen 2013, 93). Acquiring these goals can however be a difficult and time-consuming process. Additionally, parts of the receiving society can be unwelcoming to the newcomers. Through time, an image of the new coming group can be established that is not necessarily realistic but can nevertheless prove to be very persistent. Not uncommonly, these images develop into a stigma, a negative image of the group that is used to draw social distance between the 'normals' and the stigmatised (Goffman 1963 in Clark 2014, 38). These challenges, progressing socially and dealing with stigmatisation, can make it difficult for migrant groups to attain a certain degree of belonging, a degree of citizenship. On the opposite, there are the endeavours of migrants and other members of society to define citizenship in a more inclusive manner through civic activism and community development.

This thesis will give an insight into how and why these processes take place for a specific case of an urban migrant group: the migrant group being the Roma in the neighbourhood of Govanhill, in the city of Glasgow. Glasgow is a city widely known for its problems with inequality and poverty. In few other European cities are there such big differences between people's income and health as in Glasgow (BBC 2016). The Govanhill neighbourhood within Glasgow is known as a deprived area in terms of unemployment, life expectancy and violence. Apart from that, Govanhill is also a very

multicultural place, hosting forty-two nationalities on an estimated population of 15.000 people (Govanhill Housing Association 2016). Since the expansion of the EU in 2004, there has been an increase in the number of Eastern European migrants living in the neighbourhood, with their current number estimated around 3000. Although there are signs of gradual social improvements, we sensed a feeling of discontent about the neighbourhood's situation among a part of Govanhills' inhabitants in the media. Some residents in the field also voiced this feeling. Among some of the neighbourhoods' residents, the presence of Roma in the neighbourhood is deemed problematic and a defining cause of several issues in the neighbourhood such as supposed rises in litter, violence and theft. This has caused Govanhills' Roma population to become victims of stigmatization by media and part of the neighbourhood's population. At the same time, Roma face considerable socio-economic challenges such as bad living and working conditions. In this thesis, the dynamics behind this stigmatisation and deprivation will be discussed in relation to citizenship.

Simultaneously, several organisations are actively pursuing the integration of the Roma and their inclusion in the community. Community development is a broad term that defines the process where community members come together to think of solutions to social problems, which can be seen as an autonomous act to create social order (Ramakrishnan 2008). Qualitative research into these organisations provided insight into existing activities aiming to improve the situation of Roma in the neighbourhood and potentially reduce their stigmatisation and exclusion. This has led us to define our main research question as the following:

How do stigmatisation, exclusion and civic activism reshape citizenship of Roma in Govanhill?

This means that our shared theme is citizenship. Regarding the fact that this research is complementary, we have covered different aspects of this shared research question. The first part is covered by Maarten and looks at the challenges that Govanhills' Roma face by discussing the dynamics of their exclusion through stigmatisation and social

deprivation. The second part is covered by Effie and looks at how civic activism in Govanhill aims to battle exclusion and stigmatisation and at its' effects. Because of the fact that Govanhill is historically a very multicultural neighbourhood and faces considerable social challenges, a lot of research has already been done (Turner 1999; Tarcsafalvi 2012; Clark 2014; Kourova 2015) on the social dynamics that play out on this square mile. When we first started investigating this topic, we found a lot of literature about the different issues surrounding integration of different minorities in Govanhill and a few articles about the integration and stigmatisation of the Roma community in Govanhill. This is important to note because apparently, the neighbourhood is a very important physical dimension that contributes to the integration of minorities in a certain way. However, not a lot of research has been done on the effect of issues around integration and stigmatisation on citizenship. This research is relevant because it provides qualitative insight into to what extent stigmatisation and current forms of civic activism influence citizenship of this minority in Govanhill. Especially now in times of Brexit, it is socially relevant to investigate a European minority within the UK. Although researching a specific case of a minority within a particular city, the findings are also potentially insightful in conceptualising the citizenship of urban minorities more broadly.

The data in this research is gathered through conducting anthropological fieldwork, with a lot of the methods that are described in DeWalt & DeWalt (2011) and Boeije (2010). Anthropological fieldwork is a broad term that contains a variety of research methods. The data we obtained was gathered through a combination of interviews (both informal conversations, unstructured interviews and sixteen semi-structured interviews), participant observation and text analysis. Most of our interviews were arranged through either contacting people digitally or asking them directly on occasion. We got to know a great deal of our informants through the snowball technique; other informants that we met at meetings or at their offices referred us to them.

In order to be close to our research setting and research population, we stayed in an apartment in Govanhill during our ten weeks of research. This helped us to get a feeling of the neighbourhood as well as getting access to events easily. A useful means

of gathering information and getting to know informants was through conducting participant observation at these events held in the neighbourhood. Many of the events and activities we attended (such as a weekly drop-in for Roma and a community canteen) were organised by local organisations. At these events we got the opportunity to come into contact with both Roma and service providers, two of our main research population groups. Additionally, it enabled us to observe how the aims of these organisations played out practically. At the meetings, events and initial informal conversations we took a lot of jot notes, which we worked out into elaborate field notes every evening.

While it was very easy to talk to these helpful service providers it was harder to get into contact with Roma because they generally had limited, if any, knowledge of English and were often rather reserved because of their fear of authority. Looking back, we have been slightly optimistic about the possibility of becoming acquainted with Roma in a period of ten weeks. Nevertheless, we were eventually able to interview two Roma (in one case with the help of an interpreter) and learned about their situation from other informants. In addition to Roma and social workers we also aimed at talking to other neighbourhood inhabitants, the police and education staff, in which we succeeded.

The majority of the data that has been used in writing up the empirical chapters originate from interviews we conducted. Most of these were of a semi-structured nature in the sense that we loosely guided the interview in order to make sure certain topics were discussed. Through this approach we enabled informants to share (additional) information they deemed important. Most of these interviews were conducted by the two of us and were recorded in order to enable transcription afterwards.

In regards to ethical dilemmas, we were very lucky that they hardly arose during our research. However, it was on occasion difficult to introduce our research subject to two groups of informants in particular. One group was the native Scottish inhabitants of Govanhill because of their negative view of Roma. We expected them to be unlikely to cooperate if we presented our research as focussed on Roma integration. The second group that was difficult to introduce our research subject to

was the Roma themselves because we felt and heard that they did not really feel the need to be investigated or be the subject of a research project. In both cases we presented our research goal more broadly as being a research on neighbourhood issues.

In order to answer our main research question, this thesis will firstly discuss the context in which our research takes place. The context chapter will start by giving an elaborate overview of the history of the neighbourhood Govanhill in Glasgow. Next, it will look at the immigration and behavioural patterns of Roma and discuss the social entitlements that are currently in place for European minorities in Scotland. In addition, it will discuss the Brexit situation and how this situation influences these social entitlements.

Secondly, the theoretical concepts that are relevant for answering our research discussion will be discussed in our theoretical framework. The main concept of our research is citizenship, so this will be the first concept to be discussed. Next, this framework will talk about social stigmatisation and how this reinforces exclusion from society and citizenship. Furthermore, we will discuss the concepts cultural diversity and ethnicity and relate them to stigmatisation. Additionally, this theoretical framework will explore how citizenship in migrant communities is supported or enhanced by different forms of community development and civic activism. The theory of social capital as a result of civic activism and social movements will be discussed and how this could contribute to a more inclusive form of citizenship in an urban setting.

In our empirical chapters, we will explore our findings in the field in our own subtopics. In regards to the subtopic social stigmatisation and exclusion, it will set out to explore the two concepts by going through Govanhills' neighbourhood dynamics, processes of stigmatisation, social deprivation of Roma, and how Roma relate to stigmatisation and citizenship. In regards to civic activism, this thesis will look at the different forms of civic activism in Govanhill. It will explore to what extent these forms of civic activism can be related to social movement and how civic activism can have social capital as a result. In the discussion we will look at how our empirical findings correlate with the literature that we discuss in our theoretical framework. To

conclude we will reflect on these findings and draw conclusions about how Roma citizenship is being reshaped by different processes in Govanhill in order to answer our main research question and make recommendations for future research.

2. Sketching the research context

As was mentioned in the introduction, our research focuses specifically on Govanhill and its' Roma population. This section will provide insight into the context of our research by giving an introduction to the neighbourhood, discussing Roma history and migration, providing an overview of Roma citizenship entitlements in Scotland on multiple levels and discussing the Brexit situation.

2.1 Introduction to Govanhill (Maarten)

> A group of Roma women, easily recognisable by their bright long dresses are pushing strollers as they walk on the pavements of Allison Street. A little further behind, some Pakistani men are talking below the canopy of a greengrocer's shop. In addition to the greengrocer a variety of shops are spread out on the ground floors of the tenements lining the seemingly endless street. The street caters to the multitude of things the city dweller could desire, fresh Pakistani 'Pakora', a trip to Mecca, a refreshment in the Irish pub or a bet for one of the upcoming horse races. (field notes 02/02/2017)

Govanhill, the fieldwork setting of this research, is one of the twelve neighbourhoods in South East Glasgow, Scotland. Its population is estimated at 15,000 although the recent increase in migrant workers to the area is unlikely to be accurately reflected in the registered demographic data available. The area is estimated to host forty-two different nationalities while over forty percent of the population is from a minority ethnic origin (Govanhill Housing Association 2016). This fact is also reflected in the abundance of ethnic shops, restaurants and take-aways that have become characteristic for the area. Apart from being a multicultural neighbourhood, Govanhill is one of the most densely populated areas in Scotland and battles with considerable social challenges and tensions. Parts of the neighbourhood are ranked among the five percent most deprived in the country, according to the Scottish Index of Multiple

Deprivation 2016[1]. The overcrowding and deprivation makes Govanhill an enormous waste producer, the streets are often subject to fly tipping (illegal dumping of rubbish) and filthy backcourts and alleys. These circumstances, together with the fact that Govanhill falls within the constituency of Nicola Sturgeon, the First Minister of Scotland, have made the neighbourhood a recurring topic in the public debate.

Govanhill was once a mining village situated outside Glasgow. Its gradual expansion started with the foundation of the Govan Iron Works in 1837. It was around this time that Glasgow's first substantial migrant group arrived: the Irish. They arrived in large numbers escaping famine and seeking employment. At the end of the nineteenth century, heavy industry began to draw Jews from Poland and Lithuania. In the first half of the twentieth century the Glasgow Corporation constructed a significant amount of houses mainly for skilled and semi-skilled artisans and lower paid white-collar workers (Bryant & Bryant 1982 in Thomas 1999, 113).

In the course of the twentieth century Govanhills' reliance on heavy industry proved to be detrimental for employment in the area. Large-scale unemployment during the 1930's resulted in widespread poverty and many people in Govanhill were forced to rely on charity. The outbreak of the Second World War provided a temporary relief of poverty as war resulted in full employment and plenty of overtime for those who worked in munitions factories.

However, the situation exacerbated once again in the 1960's and 1970's with additional losses in manufacturing and engineering. Govanhill has ever since struggled with high numbers of unemployment (Thomas 1999, 115). Around the same time (in the 1960's and 1970's), significant immigration from the Indian sub-continent, in particular from Pakistan, started. In the same period yet another wave of Irish moved to Govanhill with the demolition of the Gorbal tenements elsewhere in Glasgow's Southside.

Govanhill has ever since been a neighbourhood attracting migrants from a large variety of nationalities partly due to the availability of cheap, private-let housing (Ross 2013). The majority of Govanhills' housing stock is rental, with part of the housing rented out by the Govanhill Housing Association and part rented out by

[1] http://simd.scot/2016/#/simd2016_10pc/BTTTTTT/14/-4.2451/55.8442/

private landlords. The role of these two actors will be more elaborately discussed in the empirical chapters. The mass of Govanhills' housing stock is made up of the typical Glasgow sandstone tenements. A great deal of these tenements are in a very bad condition which has lead to renovation projects being carried out with more interventions scheduled for the nearby future.

Following the expansion of the European Union eastwards in 2004, a sizable amount of Eastern European Roma, first from Slovakia, and later Romania, settled in the neighbourhood (Hassan 2016). There is a big lack of statistics about the amount of Roma that migrated to Scotland but it is estimated around 5000. Remarkably, more than half of these 5000 decided to settle in Glasgow, and within Glasgow most of them are concentrated in a couple of streets in Govanhill.

2.2 History of the Roma's immigration and integration (Effie)

To get a better understanding of the people that are categorised as Roma, we are obliged to look into their roots. According to Tanner (2005), Roma (also known as Romani or gypsies) roots can be traced back to the northern part of India. Around the year 1000 A.D., an event triggered their mass exodus. The exact event is still unknown, but possible reasons include a conflict that resulted in the Roma's persecution, a natural disaster or even recruitment into a mercenary military. The Roma typically travelled in patriarchal extended families, consisting up to hundreds of people. The majority ended up in Eastern Europe. The skills they were known for (music, craftsmanship, military and story-telling) often earned them very warm welcomes (Tanner 2005, 33). However, the Roma kept their distance from natives because they believed them to be unclean. As time progressed, they increasingly became victims of accusations of crimes and delinquency. Their dark complexions, constant mobility, strict patriarchal hierarchies and sacred rituals made them easy targets for discrimination. These accusations turned them into outcasts of the cities they were initially welcomed in (Tanner 2005, 36).

As the semi-nomadic Roma became more settled in the early 1900's, they divided themselves into tribes and clans, each with their own traditions, practices and beliefs determined by where they settled and their occupation. These different tribes

and clans do not often associate with each other as being part of the same group, they see themselves as a very heterogeneous group. Patterns of Roma migration tend to show that settlement in extended family networks within concentrated geographical areas is the norm and, to some extent, a preference - mainly for social and economic support and community solidarity (Clark 2014, 40).

In some areas, they have managed to become well integrated. More often, they live apart from the native population and are under-employed and poorly educated, as is the case is Govanhill. The enlargement of the European Union in 2004 meant it would be easier for Eastern Europeans to migrate and live and work in other EU countries. This has lead to a sharp rise of migration from Eastern Europe to Western Europe, the UK included. These factors prompted the British government to restrict access to the welfare system to all EU citizens.

2.3 Roma citizenship entitlements in Scotland (Maarten)

Although Roma arrived in Govanhill through legal ways, because they are EU-citizens, they are generally a disadvantaged group. Roma in Govanhill are often in part-time, temporary employment outside of mainstream 'legal' structures as a result of their exclusion from public sector employment services and reliance on 'gangmasters' for work and housing. These gangmasters are employers who employ a large number of workers, often illegally and for very low salaries. Because of this situation, Roma are often unable to access basic in-work benefits that are customary for many other people working in the UK such as: a contract of employment, a minimum wage, pension rights, paid holidays, maternity leave, and paid sick leave to name a few. Both under EU and UK law the Roma have an ethnic status that safeguards their cultural and social rights. Yet there has been criticism on the perceived lack of recognition and proactive processes in place within the UK to ensure these rights can be accessed and enjoyed by Roma (Poole & Adamson 2013, 3). In order to gain insight in the Scottish welfare system and the entitlements of Roma in Govanhill, a brief overview of this system will be provided.

According to Poole & Adamson, immigration policy, welfare access and entitlement have historically been tied together in the British context. In the

development of the welfare system in Britain, British workers and their families were prioritised. Even after 1945, when the social rights of citizenship were extended and the principles of equity and universalism became the stated cornerstones of the British welfare settlement, successive governments continued to play a significant role in constructing minority groups as a threat to British identity and the nation (Poole & Adamson 2013). The EU project has presented itself a challenge to member states as it has been built on a commitment to the free movement of capital and labour, goods and services. The enlargement of the EU eastwards in May 2004 (with a second minor enlargement following in 2007) further embodies this challenge as a bigger share of immigrants (among them Roma) have exchanged their status as 'asylum seekers/refugees for the status of 'EU migrant' (Poole & Adamson 2013).

In the discussion of welfare provision for Roma it is important to distinguish their country of origin. Currently all of the origin countries of the Roma are EU member states. They, however, joined the EU at different moments, which influences the rights assigned to their citizens. The EU distinguishes between the so-called A8 countries (including Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Slovakia and Slovenia) and the A2 countries (Bulgaria and Romania). For immigrants from both country groups, their right to work, claim benefits, and their access to social housing were initially limited during the accession period, with restrictions being ended at respectively 1 May 2011 and 1 January 2014. (Poole & Adamson 2013)

Once an individual has been employed for twelve months continuously, with no more than a four-week break, they are granted the same rights and entitlements as other EU nationals, which means access to social security benefits. (Poole & Adamson 2013, 37).

Although Central and Eastern European nationals from the A8 and A2 countries have formally been granted rights of Movement, Employment, Education, Retirement, Family reunion and Welfare, limited access to social security and welfare benefits is a recurring problem for the Roma community in Glasgow. Central to this is the issue of the right to claim Job Seekers Allowance and Income support. In order to apply for these benefits one needs to acquire a 'Right to reside' which is in fact a legal

right to reside in the UK. For attaining this 'Right to reside' the 'Habitual Residence Test' has to be passed. This entails answering questions at the Job Centre relating to length and continuity of residence and demonstrating one's residency status (Poole & Adamson 2013). Therefore, trips outside the UK may exclude an individual and his/her family from social security benefits, even if they have completed 12 months full-time employment. Another potential barrier to inclusion in the national social security scheme includes employment in 'non-mainstream' work where National Insurance is not paid. Regarding the previously mentioned fact that most Roma are employed in non-formal jobs, this is a defining cause of restricted access to social benefits (Poole & Adamson 2013, 37).

A study by Govanhill Law Centre (Paterson et al. 2011 in Clark 2014) found that Roma regularly were being denied their rights under EU law in regards to interactions with agencies of the state, such as the Department of Work and Pensions, HMRC and local government. Administrative delays were particularly found to be causing poverty and this deprivation of income has led to subsistence on very limited resources and a reliance on charity, faith groups and food bank support (Clark 2014).

Apart from the more formal support systems previously discussed there is also a variety of (semi-) civic organisations that engage in provision of support to vulnerable groups, Roma included. The services provided by these organisations are vital in a context of restricted rights for Roma immigrants and more general budget cuts. Within the neighbourhood of Govanhill a variety of organizations are actively pursuing social equality and an inclusive community. They will receive more attention within the discussion of the empirical results.

The prior has made clear that Govanhill from past to present has been characterised by migration. In the last decade a large amount of Roma from Romania and Slovakia have settled in the neighbourhood. The presence of Roma in Govanhill has mainly been characterised by bad living conditions (both physical and social) and considerable stigmatisation in the media.

2.4 Brexit and its impact (Maarten)

Following the 2016 UK referendum vote to leave the European Union, commonly called Brexit, the withdrawal process is, at the time of writing this thesis (June 2017) underway. As mentioned before the Eastern European Roma in Govanhill have freedom of movement within the EU because of their country's membership of the EU. With EU legislation on migration becoming obsolete eventually, the situation of Govanhills' Roma is insecure, at least for the majority of them that aren't UK citizens. Thus far there have been no official statements about legislation on migrants rights and entitlements in Post-Brexit Scotland. However, it is not unlikely that the rights and entitlements will be curtailed considerably, with even a possibility of forced expulsion from the UK. Within the fieldwork the context of Brexit was a recurring topic of conversation. Roma, service providers and other inhabitants expressed considerable anxiety about the consequences of Brexit for Govanhills' Roma and the organisations supporting them. Wilma, a deputy head teacher at Annette Street Primary discussed the impact of Brexit on Roma:

> 'And what the difficulty is now, I think it happened last…just prior to Easter when mutterings about Brexit started to happen, there's a huge influx of Romanian families in this area, because they were all worried of being able to get in after Brexit. And we've had our children talking about Brexit to us.' (semi-structured interview 07/03/2017)

Clark, an employee at SouthSeeds (a local community organisation), also mentioned the anxiety that Roma have about the consequences of Brexit:

> 'Obviously it's been a bit more uncertain with Brexit and stuff. I got clients asking me every single day if this is the month we're getting kicked out. You know, they want to go home because their mother, or auntie or someone is sick back home in Romania. They want to go home and visit

> them, or for a funeral or something and they are scared they won't be let back in the country.' (semi-structured interview 29/03/2017)

3. Providing a theoretical background

Having sketched the context of our research, it is necessary to discuss the theoretical topics that we will encounter within this research field with the help of existing scientific literature. The core topic of our theoretical frame will be citizenship as our research aims at exploring how migrant groups are being excluded from society and how civic activists are pursuing equality and integration within in this diverse, urban community. After discussing citizenship from multiple perspectives, we will pay specific attention to one mechanism of exclusion: stigmatisation. Related topics such as cultural diversity, ethnicity and social deprivation will also be explored and connected to stigmatisation. Additionally, this theoretical framework will discuss how citizenship in migrant communities is supported or enhanced by different forms of community development, civic activism and social movement. Subsequently, the theory of social capital as a potential result of civic activism and social movements will be explored. Lastly, we will look at how this social capital could contribute to a more inclusive form of citizenship for urban minorities.

3.1 The multiple faces of citizenship (Effie)

The starting point of our research, is how the Roma community as a minority in Govanhill, are being in- and excluded from citizenship through stigmatisation and how their citizenship is reshaped by civic activists. For the purposes of this research we will therefore be looking at different forms and dimensions of citizenship so we will be able to research to what extent these forms of citizenship apply to the Roma community in the field and how they are being reshaped by the processes mentioned above. We will start this analysis of citizenship with Marshalls' theory, which considers citizenship as the legal status providing rights and duties to members of a nation-state (Marshall 1950). Firstly, it is important to consider Marshalls' three

dimensions of citizenship. These dimensions are civil, political and the social (or socio-economic). Civil citizenship refers to the legal status and civil rights of individuals. Civil rights are basic issues like freedom of speech, rights to a fair trial and equal access to the legal system (Marshall 1950 in Turner 1990, 3). Political citizenship requires electoral rights and wider access to political institutions. Socio-economic rights are at the basis of claims to welfare and establish entitlements to social security in certain periods. In this frame, we would like to add a cultural dimension. Culture can be used as grounds for exclusion from other types of citizenship and it can be used as a dimension of entitlements, recognition and belonging (Kymlicka 1998). This leads us to the definition of cultural citizenship:

> 'Cultural citizenship refers to the right to be different and to belong in a participatory democratic sense. It claims that, in a democracy, social justice calls for equity among all citizens, even when such differences as race, religion, class, gender, or sexual orientation potentially could be used to make certain people less equal or inferior to others. The notion of belonging means full membership in a group and the ability to influence one's destiny by having a significant voice in basic decisions.' (Rosaldo 1994, 409)

This cultural perspective on citizenship is also very important for our specific case because it helps us understand different levels of inclusion and exclusion on a different level that contribute to integration and full citizenship. The question is if cultural rights lead to political rights or vice versa. Also, it makes us wonder how minorities see themselves in relation to natives and what this implies for their notion of citizenship in the world as they know it (Kabeer 2005). Kabeer states that there are certain values that people associate with the idea of citizenship that cut across the various boundaries that divide them. Kabeer connects this to a certain idea of justice: when is it fair for people to be treated the same and when is it fair that they should be treated differently? The definition of cultural citizenship also leads to the idea that citizenship has a demand for recognition (Kabeer 2005). There should be recognition of the intrinsic worth of all human beings, but also recognition of and respect for their

differences. The question arises how this is this happening in our specific case and what forces are trying to implement this recognition. For Kymlicka, claims of citizenship made by cultural groups often represent 'a desire for inclusion which is consistent with participation in, and commitment to, the mainstream institutions that underlie social unity (Kymlicka 1998, 171). He gives the particular example of immigrant communities – who, having chosen to join a society, carry an expectation of integration.

The earlier mentioned distinction between cultural and political citizenship can be linked to Kabeer's distinction between vertical and horizontal citizenship. Vertical citizenship is the relationship between the individual and the state and horizontal citizenship being the relationship between citizens (Kabeer 2005). Our research would like to explore both these aspects. This also leads us to the different levels of citizenship: formal, substantive and subjective citizenship (Holston & Appadurai 1996). This distinction is important because it is useful in identifying how citizenship appears in practice and how it can be studied. Formal citizenship refers to membership in a political community and the objective presence of civil, political, social and cultural rights. Substantive citizenship refers to the extent to which civil, political, social and cultural rights are actually accessible by people (Holston 2009). Subjective citizenship represents how citizens themselves feel about the extent to which they have access to these rights or how they are being excluded from them.

To summarize this section, this research will explore the civil, political, socio-economic and cultural dimensions of citizenship in Govanhill and how they appear on the formal, subjective and substantive level. Furthermore, we will look at the effects of stigmatisation and civic activism within the different dimensions of citizenship on these levels.

3.2 Social stigmatisation and urban contexts (Maarten)

Building upon the concept of citizenship, belonging to a social and political entity is related to specific processes of inclusion and exclusion. The exclusion of particular groups takes place on a political level, but also on a more daily, mundane level. Considering the exclusion of social groups, and migrant groups in particular, the

concept of social stigmatisation deserves discussion.

Stigma, or 'spoiled identity, was defined by the sociologist Erving Goffman as a particular type of social discrediting where certain attributes, behaviours and reputations are drawn upon by 'normals' (the stigmatising group) to draw social distance between themselves and the stigmatised. The stigmatised are considered to be undesirable and devalued, and thus are to be rejected and excluded. However, Goffman also notes a third party, 'the wise' who are 'normals' but are accepted by the stigmatised as being aware of and sympathetic to their plight and condition (Goffman 1963 in Clark 2014, 38-39).

Subsequently Goffman presents a possible explanation for the 'stigmatisation' by the normals, and notes the importance of their situational contexts. He suggest that boosting self-esteem and 'anxiety buffering' are common reasons why a 'normal' would 'downward compare'; to feel better about yourself, you compare yourself to someone less fortunate than yourself (Smith 2006 in Clark 2014, 39). Asymmetric power relations are deemed a prerequisite for effective stigmatisation; the power for the stigma to be effective is dependent on the stigmatising group being more powerful and cohesive than the stigmatised. Furthermore, the 'downward comparing' tends to suggest an interdependent relation, which is shaped by a distinct power imbalance in which the weaker 'perform' an emotional/social function for the more powerful (Clark 2014, 39).

To explain public attitudes and beliefs towards minorities, news coverage is argued to matter (e.g. Boomgaarden and Vliegenthart 2009; Vergeer et al. 2000 in Kroon et al. 2016). How media evaluate immigrants and minorities influence people's willingness to categorize others (Boomgaarden 2007 in Kroon et al. 2016). This may contribute to the reproduction of prejudice and racism and the maintenance of ethnic dominance and inequality in society (Richardson 2014 in Kroon et al. 2016, 2).

In the case of Govanhill, stigmatisation of Roma is argued to be related to perceived disorder at the neighbourhood level, such as the presence of garbage on the streets. Perceptions of disorder are not solely influenced by actual cues related to disorder. Cultural stereotypes are likely to play a role too, in particular when residents are not trained as systematic or neutral observers and are likely to have uncertain or

ambiguous information about the neighbourhood (Sampson & Raudenbush 2004, 320). The relation between culture and stigmatisation will be more thoroughly discussed further in this framework.

3.3 Cultural diversity, ethnicity and identification (Maarten)

Cultural diversity, the presence of a variety of cultural or ethnic groups within a society, is a concept strongly related to stigmatisation of minority groups. It is in a context of cultural diversity that categories and hierarchies are established that may lead to stigmatisation of minority cultural or ethnic groups by majority groups. The culture of the 'other' is deemed inferior and/or dangerous.

Ethnicity is a concept that is strongly related to both cultural diversity and stigmatisation. Cultural diversity is usually constituted through a variety of ethnic groups, and stigmatisation often targets ethnic groups. Ethnicity is defined in a variety of ways by different academic disciplines. In terms of anthropology, scholars agree that ethnicity involves the classification of people and group relationships (Eriksen 2010, 16).

Ethnicity is a concept that is both achieved as well as ascribed. Cultural and/or ethnic groups are categorised through both internal and external criteria. Internal criteria entail the subjective classification of the group concerned. External criteria are the effect of the classification through others. The drawing of these criteria is a two-sided process and an on-going process; ethnicity is thus constituted through social contact (Eriksen 2010, 23).

Considering the influences of stigmatisation on identification of the stigmatised group there are several possible causes to be mentioned. In the light of stigmatisation it is a common reaction of powerless groups in poly-ethnic contexts to conform to a stigmatising classification they are ascribed by dominant groups. Others will choose to suppress their ethnic identity or identify themselves otherwise to escape the stigma attached to their ascribed ethnicity. This raises doubts about the legitimacy of ethnic classifications within census data. Besides these reactions there is also the potential for removing stigma by positive self-identification (Eriksen 2010, 47.) Just as ethnicity as a whole, ethnic identification is by no means fixed and is related to cultural

behaviour, which appears to be amenable to situational interpretation. This oscillation of identification can be seen as a form of positive adaptation to a fluid situation through the use of ethnic roles to the best possible personal advantage (Nagata 1974).

One a more political level, ethnic and national identities have become a field of contestation as a result of influx of labour migrants and refugees to Europe and North America. This process has led to the establishment of new, permanent ethnic minorities in these areas. The presence of these minorities has lead to important questions about national identity. Regarding our specific context, support for Brexit has been argued to be related to opposition to the freedom of movement between EU-countries (Vasilopoulou 2016).

Nationalism and the accompanying drive to homogenisation potentially creates stigmatised others; the external boundaries towards foreigners become frozen, and 'unmeltable' minorities within the country are made to stand out through their 'Otherness' and thereby confirm the integrity of the nation through contrast (Eriksen 2010, 126).

Besides the stigmatisation of a particular social group on cultural and ethnic grounds marginalisation can also take place on a spatial level through territorial stigmatisation. This territorial stigmatisation can subsequently reinforce the stigmatisation of groups within the area. Both outsiders and insiders as perceive these areas:

> 'Social purgatories, leprous badlands at the heart of the postindustrial metropolis where only the refuse of society would accept to dwell.'
> (Wacquant 2007, 67)

Apart from more structural economic developments, such as fragmentation of the wage labour relationship, public policy is partly held responsible for the marginalisation of these areas and the subsequent creation and persistence of these territorial stigmas. Dwellers of these marginalised areas experience an acute sense of social indignity. This can be alleviated by displacing the stigma onto a faceless, demonized other, such as alleged criminal youth or immigrants in the neighbourhood

(Wacquant 2007, 68). This way marginal groups, such as migrants, experience multiple forms of disadvantage or deprivation related to their place of residence in the urban context.

As migrant populations are often stigmatised on the basis of their (ascribed) ethnic identity, it is useful to treat cultural diversity and ethnicity as a central element of social stigmatisation. Subsequently, stigmatisation takes form on a spatial level through territorial stigmatisation. This stigmatisation potentially turns out to be even more detrimental to marginal groups within these areas, as they are deemed responsible for the ills of the neighbourhood. The combination of concepts regarding socio-cultural and spatial stigmatisation is useful when looking at the stigmatisation of our research population in their urban context

Regarding the relationship between the stigmatisation of migrant groups and citizenship, one could state that in the process of stigmatisation people's rights as citizens from a cultural perspective are denied. They are portrayed as being alien instead of equal members of society. Returning to Rosaldo's (1994) definition of cultural citizenship, stigmatisation, instead of calling for equity among all citizens, uses differences such as race, religion, class, gender, or sexual orientation to make certain people less equal or inferior to others.

3.4 Civic activism (Effie)

Contesting exclusion from citizenship through stigmatization in order to create a more inclusive society where everybody contributes and participates happens in many different ways. One of the ways this is happening, which we will mainly be investigating through our research, is through community development and civic activism. For this research, it is relevant to explain the concepts of community development and civic activism and how scholars think this is achieved and why people want to achieve it. To be able to do this, the concepts of civic activism and an effective community itself must be explored.

According to Etzioni, effective communities are responsive to the true needs of all of its members and reflect the appropriate balance between social order and personal autonomy (Etzioni 1994). Etzioni goes on to argue that such a balance is

based on social formations that are continually being reshaped in response to the members' true needs rather than relying only on socializing the members to accept the community's demands or on utilizing control processes. Member identities must closely be followed in order to decrease societal tension and increase civic responsibility. This is the theory that is in the background of community development. This is strongly related to the theory of citizenship. According to Kalberg, civic responsibility and social trust are fundamental conditions to secure the institutionalization of citizenship in the long run (Kalberg 1987 in Turner 1993). This means that an effective community, as defined by Etzioni, is necessary to create social trust in the public sphere and implement feelings of inclusion and citizenship.

Community development is a broad term that defines the process where community members come together to think of solutions to social problems, which can be seen as an autonomous act to create social order. Civic activism stands for the amount of participation that members of a community have in a political as well as a social sense within their community and in what ways they are involved with decision making and social action (Bloemraad & Ramakrishnan 2008). A combination of these two makes a civic initiative that tries to find a solution to a social problem by the onset of certain social problems.

Creating common areas or communal activities to enhance integration, participation and inclusion mostly operationalize community development. In regards to civic activism, individuals as well as self-organizations are normatively no longer expected to operate as representatives of certain interests or as self-centred clubs but are now supposed to effectively contribute to the city especially to the 'diversity' that is now believed to be a major strength (Uitermark et al. 2005).

As a result of these normative expectations and possibly a desire to achieve an effective community as explained by Etzioni, a lot of organizations in cities are working on community development and social equality. In conclusion to this section, civic activism leads to a more active and trusting community in which people feel comfortable to participate and in turn this creates inclusion in a horizontal sense of citizenship.

3.4 Civic activism in the form of social movement (Effie)

Another form of civic activism besides community development comes in the form of a social movement. When minorities are able to take advantage of new opportunities as a result of civic activism, this could lead to political initiatives of de-stigmatisation, which in turn generates social capital, and this might have a positive outcome for citizenship of minorities. This outcome will be discussed in section 3.5. In this section, we will talk about the definition of a social movement as one of these political initiatives and its causes and consequences.

To be able to explore the concept of social movement, it is firstly important to look at the meaning of equality. Equality has a material component, wanting to have equal access to resources as well as a social component, wanting to receive equal group and cultural status (Benhabib 2002). This was also discussed in the paragraph about citizenship. Cultural identity is an entitlement which means belonging is strongly related to equal cultural citizenship (Pakulski 1997).

This exclusion because of inequality in cultural identity causes grievance. According to Touraine, this grievance should be considered as a form of social conflict that has a social movement as an effect. Social movements represent conflicting efforts to control cultural patterns in a given societal type (Touraine 1985). Urban Social Movements (USM's) play a big part in battling this grievance. Manuel Castells introduced the term of urban social movements. Castells defined an Urban Social Movement as everything that organized social unrest, uprisings, pressure groups and oppositional fronts, which claim political power and participation (Uysal 2012). These USM's are connected to the political system but they are ideologically autonomous of any political party. USMs have become important vehicles for transmitting radically diverse grievances and views of the civil society to the state (Nichols in Uysal 2012). USM's emerge after a particular crisis (urban crisis, housing or development projects), which is something that appears to be true for Govanhill, considering about 3000 people from Eastern Europe arrived within a few years within one square mile. USM's have clear demands, which are represented through social action like demonstrations and the hosting of different sorts of activities. Networks play a vital part in USM's,

they allow civic activists to establish and maintain relationships with each other and distant allies. Networks cause support between civic activists in many different ways, they help spread information and they provide financial and political support. This is also crucial for the establishment of social capital, of which the benefits were explained earlier in this frame. Lastly, a USM requires a specific location, like a neighbourhood (Uysal 2012).

Next, we will be looking at social capital and inclusive citizenship as possible results of these types of civic activism.

3.5 Social capital and citizenship as outcomes civic activism (Effie)

As mentioned before, a community is built on relationships and thus on increasing social capital. Social capital focuses on social relations that have productive benefits. As mentioned in the previous paragraph, community development and USM's enable interaction between different groups of people and understanding of members true needs (Etzioni, 1994). This interaction and this attempt at understanding can lead to an increase networks and of social capital. What is social capital and what does it have as a result for a community? The definition of social capital can be traced back to many disciplines. According to Putnam, a political scientist, the definition is as follows:

> 'The central idea of social capital is that networks and the associated norms of reciprocity have value. They have value for the people who are in them and they have, at least in some instances, demonstrable externalities, so that there are both public and private faces of social capital.' (Putnam 2001, 1)

This means that if people have functional relationships, these relationships create a valuable form of interaction and reciprocity that can lead to public returns of social capital (Putnam 2001). To extend on this notion, communities that are densely networked and civic associations are in a stronger position to confront poverty and vulnerability (Moser 1996 in Woolcock & Narayan 2000), resolve conflict (Schafft

1998 in Woolcock & Narayan 2000) and take advantage of new opportunities (Isham 1999 in Woolcock & Narayan 2000) which can also extend to possibilities to take civic initiatives themselves which creates an active form of citizenship on all dimensions and levels.

For our research this means that social capital will be defined as the amount and the quality of functional relationships our research population has that are stimulated through civic activism and community development.

4. Social stigmatisation and exclusion of Roma in Govanhill

4.1 The dynamics of a neighbourhood

The first part of our empirical findings looks at the situation of the Roma in Govanhill and specifically exclusion and stigmatisation. In order to understand the situation of Govanhills' Roma it is necessary to take into account their place of residence, the neighbourhood of Govanhill. As was mentioned in the context Govanhill is a very multicultural neighbourhood that hosts approximately 42 nationalities. The neighbourhood has historically been a place of entrance for migrant groups that entered the city as several informants told us. In the history of migrant groups entering the neighbourhood, Eastern Europeans (for a great deal Roma) are the newest addition to the area. The diversity of the neighbourhood, however, goes beyond its multi-ethnic and multicultural character. When inquiring about the neighbourhood or just chatting with people it became clear that opinions about Govanhill varied strongly.

Parts of Govanhills' 'natives', white Scottish residents, have negative perceptions of the neighbourhood. People lament to the downturn of Govanhill as a respectable area to a disadvantaged and dangerous area. Some media and residents describe Govanhill as a downright ghetto. Bethany, initiator of the Let's Save Govanhill campaign (which will be discussed more elaborately later on), also expressed this:

> 'I see the ghettoization in Govanhill taking place. I don't know whether you have guys been in ghettos around the world but I think we can say there is a process of ghettoization going on. There is infestation of rats, cockroaches, bed lice throughout many blocks in Govanhill. We have backcourts and frontcourts and houses filled with nappies, dead mice, shit, sanity towels, dampness in the inside, no running water. We've got properties with 2-3 bedrooms with maybe 20-30 people all living in them and if that's not slum

> conditions I don't know what it is. You know you've got quite a high antisocial behaviour crime rate here. You've got fear of crime. You've got 45-46 different languages indicating that people are coming from all parts of the world just to one centre.' (semi-structured interview 03/03/2017)

As is also illustrated in the previous quote, crime and insecurity are often mentioned as the main problem in Govanhill within these discussions, along with the condition of the housing stock and fly tipping, the illegal dumping of waste. The feelings of a lack of safety also have its' impacts on people's mobility within the neighbourhood. Throughout the research we have repeatedly been warned to avoid certain streets in Govanhill at night or even walking around on certain streets at all.

Govanhill is a neighbourhood that generally attracts a lot of media attention, both on a local and a national scale. This can mostly be attributed to the fact that Govanhill is a very multicultural neighbourhood and because it is part of the constituency of Nicola Sturgeon, Scotland's First minister. The bulk of media outlets about Govanhill portray a negative picture, focussing mainly on the neighbourhoods' social ills. Figure 2 provides a picture of the way Govanhill is portrayed in the media. According to one informant, it is in the interest of some papers that are aligned to other political parties to portray a bad image of a neighbourhood that is a specific responsibility of the First minister from the SNP. These media outlets contribute to the bad image some inhabitants of the neighbourhood already have. This might in turn make residents more ready to look for a scapegoat, with easy targets being Govanhills' Roma. This will receive more attention in section 4.3.

[2]

Fig. 2: A selection of headlines on Glaswegian news websites

Although the negative view on Govanhill might be somewhat exaggerated and one-sided, Govanhill indeed faces considerable issues related to housing and littering. Sadly, it is the vulnerable groups that are affected most by this, not in the least the Roma. Concerning housing, many of the Southside's tenements have issues with pest, damp and other inconveniences, but, as Gemma from SouthSeeds told us, the Roma in private-rented flats have to deal with all these problems at once. While the neighbourhood offers arriving Roma a network within the Roma communities it also offers little in terms of proper housing. In short, Govanhill offers migrants opportunities such as a network and shops and services suited to their needs as well as challenges. Having looked at the neighbourhood we will now move on to discussing the situation of the different Roma communities in Govanhill.

[2] Upper article: Dalziel, Magdalene: http://www.glasgowlive.co.uk/news/glasgow-news/fears-grow-govanhill-residents-after-13046754
Middle left article: Perring, Rebecca: http://www.express.co.uk/news/uk/815131/Nicola-Sturgeon-Govanhill-video-SNP-Scotland-residents-squalor
Middle right article: Boylan, Connon: https://www.thescottishsun.co.uk/news/scottish-news/1110570/cops-hunt-thieves-who-assaulted-glasgow-shopkeeper-and-raided-the-convenience-store-in-govanhill/
Bottom article: Stewart, Catronia: http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/15056579.Govanhill_campaigners_meet_Sturgeon_as_community_gets__10_times_worse_/

4.2 Govanhills' Roma; diverse communities

When discussing Roma and their culture it is important to start of making clear that there is no such thing as one Roma community in Govanhill. People who are considered Roma originate from different countries and make up part of different communities. Some people who are considered Roma would not even identify themselves as Roma. Angela, a service provider originating from Slovakia, also stated that being Roma is generally not that important for Roma in Govanhill. The annual celebration of International Roma Day, when Roma groups come together to celebrate their Roma identity is an exception to this. This made Angela to express Roma identity in Govanhill as being situational.

When asking Carmen, a Romanian Roma woman, what she considered specific for Roma culture she mentioned cultural elements such as traditional Roma cooking, parties, good music and dancing. She, however also mentioned that these traditions vary per country. This is also true for the languages that Roma speak. Most of the Roma in Govanhill speak the official language of their country, sometimes along with the Roma language. Others, mainly from Romania, only speak Roma. Although the Roma language could be seen as a common cultural element, the language also has its regional variations. So regardless of the willingness of Roma communities in Govanhill to interact with each other, which proves to be fairly limited, their ability to communicate is restricted anyway. Despite their heterogeneous nature the Roma are often portrayed as one homogeneous group in anti-Roma rhetoric, with no real differentiation. This partly signifies the lack of knowledge some communities in Govanhill have of each other.

> A colourful crowd of people meanders through Govanhills' streets lined with typical Glaswegian sandstone tenements. A mixture of Roma, neighbourhood inhabitants and other interested people has taken to the streets to celebrate International Roma Day with a march through the neighbourhood. Once in awhile the somewhat plaintive sound of Roma chanting arises from the front of the group. Along with the singers and musicians a group of Roma women dressed in vibrant Roma dresses compromises the head of the march. Further

> back people are carrying banners with statements such as: Glasgow loves Roma, Proud to be Roma and Celebrate Diversity. The atmosphere is one of cheer, with is once more strengthened by the generous sunlight on this spring Saturday. Along the streets a lot of people are observing the spectacle. The owner of the Bungalow Cafe, Italian from origin, has left behind her duties for a while to look at the crowd passing by. The butcher from the Country Shop has done the same and stands in the door post in his white apron. Shifting focus from the people in the march one can see Roma people hanging out of the windows of their apartments, cheering at the crowd down below. As the march progresses its way through the neighbourhood it grows in numbers as even more people join the celebration. (field notes 08/04/2017)

The fragment above tries to paint a picture of the procession through Govanhill that we participated in on International Roma Day on April 8, 2017. Against the background of ignorance about Roma and, less prevalent, hostility towards Roma, the annual International Roma Day provides an alternative and more positive way of looking at Roma and their culture. The core of this day is a march through the neighbourhood that aims at celebrating Roma culture and celebrating diversity. The march is followed by a meal in a local church hall accompanied by Roma music and dancing.

Although Govanhills' Roma seemed to be in happy unity during International Roma Day it should be noted that there are considerable tensions between different Roma groups, mainly between Slovakian and Romanian Roma. Slovakian Roma were the first group to arrive in Govanhill around fifteen years ago. Generally coming from a less disadvantaged position in their country of origin, having been in Scotland for longer and enjoying more generous government support (support was restricted for new EU-member nationals), the Slovakians are generally more developed in terms of education, employment and cultural adaption. This has made some Slovakian Roma look down on the Romanian Roma who are the most recent newcomers. According to Nadine, the previously mentioned Romanian Roma are in general more prone to becoming victims of stigmatisation because they are the newest arriving group and are more visible because of the sheer size of the group. Additionally, Romanian Roma

are less accustomed to British social norms, such as the way you address service staff, making them stand out even more.

When talking about Roma culture, one should watch out for making haphazard generalisations. As was previously mentioned the group categorised as Roma differs in terms of country of origin, language and other features. Nevertheless, one typical habit of Roma in Govanhill is the widespread habit to hang around on street corners. We encountered this almost every time when walking through the neighbourhood. Several people we talked to attributed this to the Roma culture of living outside, however it has also been linked it to the overcrowded conditions they live in. Whatever the origin may be, this habit is source of a lot of criticism among some of Govanhills' inhabitants. People expressed that it makes them feel unsafe and not at ease. What is often socially constructed as morally reprehensible and anti-social, in this case socialising outdoors, is however, seen as being social, hospitable and inclusionary by Roma themselves (Clark 2014, 41) In addition other residents noted that they do not find it a problem at all. They expressed that they have never been harassed in any way and are, on the contrary, usually greeted friendly when passing by. Just as in the case of the aforementioned general neighbourhood appreciation mentioned earlier, Govanhills' residents are divided in the appreciation of their new neighbours. Negative perceptions of the 'newcomers' can potentially result into stigmatisation, which will be discussed in the following section.

4.3 Blaming the other

Speaking with Roma and other relevant actors within the neighbourhood it has become clear that stigmatisation and racism have been a reality for Roma for centuries throughout Europe. In Romania, Bulgaria and Slovakia it is commonplace for Roma to live on the edge of society and be refused to be served in restaurants and cafés or to receive worse treatment than non-Roma, as we heard from several informants

Additionally the governments of the countries for a long time have put little effort in enabling Roma to develop themselves through education and employment. This has made Roma a very socially disadvantaged group in the Eastern European

countries they live in. This situation, along with general bad economic prospects in their countries of origin, has motivated Roma to move to the UK and Govanhill in particular. Although Roma leave their country behind they take a history of stigmatisation and racism with them.

Without underestimating the particularity of the situation of Roma in Govanhill there are remarkable parallels to draw with the experiences of previous migrants entering the area. Govanhill, as was mentioned before, is a neighbourhood that has always been attracting migrants. Broadly over time there have been waves of Irish, Jews, Italians, Asians and more recently Eastern Europeans settling in the area. All these groups have experienced stigmatisation such as Govanhills' Roma are now suffering from to some extent. Remarkably it is not only the process of stigmatising migrants that repeats itself but also the 'content' of the stigma seems to return. Lucy, an employee at SouthSeeds, for example told us that Irish were considered dirty and poor, and were suspected of not cleaning their houses. The framing of 'unwanted' foreigners seems to follow a similar pattern over time.

Compared to their country of origin, the stigmatisation of Roma in Govanhill is considered to be rather limited. Several Roma and service providers expressed that stigmatisation in their country of origin was considerably worse. This, however does not mean that stigmatisation of Roma is absent in Scotland. Although positive perceptions of Roma prevail in the neighbourhood there are indeed people that have a negative view of Roma and are keen on sharing this opinion. It was a conversation at a pub with some so-called indigenous Scots that provided the most detailed information. By no means being exhaustive it nevertheless paints a picture about how Roma are perceived by some residents.

Regarding the actual stigma of the Roma population, recurring themes are the alleged prevalence of crime, mainly stealing. This partly coincides with a perception of increased crime in the area, which is not supported by crime statistics. A person we talked to elsewhere expressed that there is suspicion among shop owners when Roma are visiting their shops. When inquiring after experiences with stigmatisation when talking to Adam, a young Slovakian Roma man, he mentioned some examples from his work at a car wash centre. In one case, a customer suspected that his purse was

stolen from his car while it was being cleaned at the car wash. The Pakistani employer immediately suspected Adam and another Roma colleague. He thought they must be the culprits 'as they were Slovakian'. Eventually the purse turned out to be tucked away somewhere in the car seat.

Another thing that was mentioned during the conversation in the pub was that Roma moved to the UK because they believe they could attain 'free money'. This is once again related to the common conception that Roma are a group that is unwilling to work, an allegation that is refuted by the incredible long working days, six to seven days a week, many Roma men put up with. It must be said that, like in the previously mentioned story of Adam, in experiences Roma have with stigmatisation they are not necessarily targeted as being Roma but in some cases as Eastern European, Slovakian or just immigrant. Clearly there is only limited knowledge about the variety of the Eastern European Roma. This also becomes clear in the following quote by Angela, a Slovakian service provider:

> 'Loads of people confuse Romanians and Roma people. Some, like, when we did the street work people usually think that everyone that has a darker skin and is from Eastern Europe is Roma or Romanian but they don't even know what they are talking about. Sometimes, they refer to these people as Romanians, sometimes they refer to them as Roma, sometimes they say "oh, oh, these Slovakians" but they still mean Romanian people. So people don't really know what they are talking about, they're blaming them for crime.' (semi-structured interview 06/03/2017)

Apart from blaming Roma for social illnesses our informants also expressed a feeling of Roma being favoured in policies at the expense of the 'natives'. This also became clear in the remark someone at a local pub made when we explained our research goals:

> 'So you are here for the Romanians, not for us?' (informal conversation 12/02/2017)

Concerning the spreading of bad images of Roma, media outlets are subtler. Still, some media outlets have a one-sided approach of Roma focussing on theft and Roma begging outside on the street. Although not necessarily spreading untrue news, these media outlets paint a negative and narrow picture of Roma, which enforce negative images about Roma. Many of our informants expressed that the media have played a big role in creating the bad image of Govanhill and it's Roma communities. Luckily there are efforts underway to encourage more positive media attention to provide a balance to the negative media that has been prevalent thus far. Nadine, a service provider at one of the community organisations, also voiced this concern:

> 'There, however, remains the fact that there are some pretty clear issues in Govanhill that you don't find in other places of Glasgow. Definitely there is more poverty, because there is many people, so diverse, and their needs are so different. And papers tend to report sensationalist kind of negative stuff while there are 10 organisations in the run to help people.' (semi-structured interview 24/03/2017)

During our research we have asked a couple of informants what they thought might be an underlying motivation behind stigmatisation of Roma. Concerning stigmatisation of Roma by Scottish natives, several informants expressed that it might be related to broader trends within Scottish society. Migration has for example become more prevalent in the previous decades. Scottish society is changing and some people do not feel comfortable with these developments. The Roma, being the most recent migrant group and very visible presence in the neighbourhood are an easy target for scapegoating. Llewyn, an officer in Govanhill who has been working in the area for seven years, expressed this as well:

> 'I think it's a fear of change. I think it's definitely a fear of change. Roma groups across Europe have always had bad reputations. And as the Police is there anything we can do about that? Probably not. I think we should be looking at education departments and all of that stuff to build that in. If you look at the difference in Scotland between Protestants and Catholics, over

> the last twenty years the differences have decreased. Well we've done that. It's the perceptions and ideas of an entire culture.' (semi-structured interview 05/04/2017)

Informants also linked stigmatisation to the neighbourhood's (real and perceived) problems and its bad reputation. Some residents hold the Roma accountable for a great deal of the neighbourhood's ills. This reflects Wacquant's (2007) theory about displacing the neighbourhood's stigma onto a faceless, demonized other, in this case Govanhills' Roma.

Others also expressed that it is not just native Scottish resident that harbour negative sentiments about Roma in Govanhill. Several informants mentioned cases of discrimination at the jobcentre in which Roma were treated badly. Apart from that, some informants expressed that stigmatisation and exploitation of Roma by some parts of the Asian community is indeed a problem. It is in their resentment of Roma that parts of previous hostile groups namely native Scottish and Asians find common ground, as was mentioned by one of our informants. This might seem odd as the Asian community have gone through the same stage of stigmatisation and social disadvantage as the Roma are in now. However, as some informants expressed, this might actually be their motivation for stigmatisation. Stigmatising the arriving group after all make the previous outsiders feel like insiders. In this respect the weaker 'perform' an emotional/social function for the more powerful (Clark 2014, 39). This is expressed in the following quote:

> '(...) she was walking by in the streets of Govanhill and this fairly young Pakistani man who is like a shop owner, like a family shop owner who was shouting at a Romanian person: Go back home, go back home, I don't want you here! And she stopped on the streets and she was laughing at him and obviously she's really old right? She's been around for awhile, she also says so herself and.. so she stopped and she's kind of laughing at him and he's like: why are you laughing at me? and she said well, it's just that I remember your grandfather in exactly the same place where your sitting and getting shouted at by a Scottish man to go home, go home. And he was.. very mortified and ashamed.' (semi-structured interview 24/03/2017)

The reaction of the abovementioned woman when experiencing stigmatisation of Roma signifies that Roma in Govanhill are not only confronted with hostility from other residents. There are actually a lot of residents that have a more tolerant attitude and try to be welcoming to the arriving group. In this respect one could say there are broadly two groups in Govanhill that voice their opinion about immigrants and Roma specifically. The first consists mainly of white Scottish people who tend to blame migrants for the problems in the neighbourhood. The second, to which also some service providers belong, tries to defend the Roma and improve their situation. When speaking with informants from both groups and following discussion on the Internet it became clear to us that there is considerable tension between the two groups. Returning to Goffmans' (Goffman 1963 in Clark 2014) theory on parties involved in stigmatisation the second group could be considered 'the wise', those who are 'normals' but are accepted by the stigmatised as being aware of and sympathetic to their plight and condition. (Goffman 1963 in Clark 2014, 38-39). However, we cannot state this with certainty, as we have not been able to ask the Roma about it directly.

4.4 Exclusion of Roma

As has become clear, stigmatisation is a reality for Govanhills' Roma, being both Roma as well as migrant. Although less severe than in their countries of origin, Roma suffer from the negative perceptions that some people harbour towards them. In some instances, as in the case of racism at the jobcentre, this can take on the form of discrimination. However, one of the biggest challenges Roma face concert socio-economic circumstances. For most Roma in Govanhill it is generally their socially deprived position in their countries of origin that has motivated them to move to Scotland. The Roma arriving in Govanhill are thus generally a disadvantaged group arriving in a generally disadvantaged neighbourhood. However, it once again should be noted that there is difference between individuals and communities, it is generally the Romanian Roma that are the most disadvantaged.

One of the biggest challenges for Roma in Govanhill is the high rate of illiteracy that can be as high as ninety percent (Interview SouthSeeds). This can be

traced back to their disadvantaged position in their countries of origin, such as Romania and Slovakia, where education opportunities were limited. Low literacy levels are detrimental for children who enrol in education at a later age. Additionally, because of the high prevalence of illiteracy Roma adults can usually only access low skilled jobs.

Being illiterate or having a low literacy level combined with limited knowledge of English is also a disadvantage for Roma in the field of services and administration. Often Roma struggle to understand their employment contracts or bills, which increases the risk of becoming indebted. In terms of employment, Scotland's better work opportunities are a common motivation for Roma to move to Scotland. Related to their general low level of education, Roma are generally involved in low skilled manual work such as working in factories, car washes and in warehouses. Generally, Slovakian Roma tend to have better jobs than Romanian Roma. It is common for Roma to be employed without a contract or without their contract being respected. Adam, the Slovak Roma informant, for example works six days a week from 8 a.m. till 8 p.m., being paid only four pounds per hour. He expressed that his employer is a very unfriendly man. He mentioned one case in which his employer refused to pay for the hours an employee had missed because he had gone home ill. The combination of being paid little, living in expensive private housing and having a lot of children causes many Roma families to have a bad financial situation. There are however some promising exceptions such as Carmen, a Romanian woman we spoke to. She arrived in Govanhill eighteen years ago with a low literacy level but has put much effort in learning English. At the moment she is working as an interpreter at one of the local community organisations.

Continuing with housing, Roma face challenges as they usually live in apartments rented out by rogue landlords. Besides this private housing a part of Govanhills' housing stock is owned by the Govanhill Housing Association. These apartments are in a better position and tenants' rights are respected. However, due to regulations and a limited supply of GHA housing many Roma end up in private housing. These apartments are generally poorly managed; some of them do not even provide access to gas or electricity. Additionally, because regulations aren't respected

apartments tend to become overcrowded. Having little alternatives and little knowledge of the Scottish system Roma are vulnerable to exploitation. There have been cases of Roma families finding their apartment inhabited by other tenants after having been away on holiday. Other problems mentioned by our informants were that landlords aren't providing necessary repairs, and also that there are a lot of cases of mice, bedbugs and damp. Several of our informants told us that Roma are common targets for exploitation by Pakistani landlords as well as employees. This can be attributed to the fact that Roma have little access to formal work, know little about regulations and are hesitant to complain. Linking this to our theory on citizenship, we can state that there is a gap between formal citizenship, the things that Roma are entitled to, and substantive citizenship, their actual use of these entitlements. (Marshall 1954)

Apart from their disadvantaged position, it has also been mentioned that Roma generally have limited ambitions in terms of improving their situation both economically and socially. Part of this might be attributed to their previous experiences with stigmatisation as Adina, a Roma woman from Bulgaria, mentioned:

> 'Specifically in my country, whenever they become with dark skin, they will not treat you as the white people. You go to coffee shop, not often but sometimes, they may not want to serve you. They say that there is no place while you see that there is plenty of space. They will just say 'we are closing' in the middle of the day. So, yes they are. Maybe that's why the Roma sometimes don't want to integrate, because they are afraid that they are gonna be discriminated.' (semi-structured interview 28/03/2017)

When asking informants about the challenges that Roma face, many of them mention that education is a big issue. Many children arrive in Govanhill with little or no experience in education. Even in Govanhill enrolment of Roma children strongly lags behind other groups. Schools in Govanhill, such as Annette Primary School, have to put much effort in having Roma children to catch up with the rest. The primary schools in Govanhill are struggling to cater in the huge demand for education.

The problem is perpetuated by the fact that many Roma parents, Romanian

parents at least, only to a limited extent regard education as something useful. This leads to the situation that Roma children are often absent several times a week and sometimes even for weeks at a time. Additionally, parental engagement in their children's education is low. Wilma, a head teacher at Annette Primary School, told us Roma love their children very much and involve them in a lot of things, making them very emotionally literate. There is, however, less value attached to the cognitive intellectual development through play and education. Ambition in education is sometimes even disapproved as deputy head teacher Wilma told us. Roma youngsters who move on to study at college or university run the risk of being called *gadjo*, the word for someone who is not Roma. Wilma also expresses this in the following quote:

> 'You are a *gadjo* now, because you work in a *gadjo* job you know, so it's almost as if like you can't go on because then you will become ostracized from their own community'. (semi-structured interview 07/03/2017)

Edward, a deputy teacher at Shawlands Academy told us that getting children into school is not the only issue, keeping them there is another one. At the age of sixteen children in Scotland are no longer obliged to go to school. It is at this moment that many Roma children leave school in order to work in low skilled jobs. However, in recent years there has been a slight improvement in Roma youth continuing their education after this age.

When talking to service providers we heard that Roma generally have a considerable distrust of authority, especially amongst Romanian Roma. This distrust of authority plays out in different fields. Some Roma are reluctant to ask for help from organisations, as they do not expect them to work for their benefit. This is especially true when contact details are needed for some services. In those cases Roma are sometimes afraid that their details will be passed on to other organisations. Distrust of authority is also a problem for the police. Roma often do not expect to be helped by the police, so they often do not report cases of crime. Although distrust of authority is still a problem it is less so the case for the new generation, as was mentioned by Wilma, a deputy teacher at Annette Street Primary. Children who have enjoyed

education see that authorities aren't out to get them but offer them opportunities to develop themselves.

Looking at the relation between social deprivation and stigmatisation one could make at least two conclusions. Firstly, Govanhills' Roma are a deprived group because of their history of social disadvantage in their countries of origin, partly caused by stigmatisation. In that sense social deprivation can be seen as a cause of stigmatisation. Although stigmatisation is less of a problem in Govanhill its heritage still lingers on. Additionally, being a disadvantaged group makes them more vulnerable to exploitation.

Looking back at Roma entitlements discussed in the context we can state that the Roma's formal rights are reasonably well protected. The Scottish government offers them the opportunity to apply for various forms of welfare and social benefits. However, on a subjective level many Roma who are entitled to benefits do or cannot make use of the opportunity. This is related to the aforementioned lack of knowledge of English, informal work and housing situations.

4.5 Dealing with challenges

Having looked at the situation of the Roma and the way they are perceived by other residents, we will now look at how Roma deal with their situation. As we have managed to interview only a few Roma we cannot give a comprehensive account of the way Roma perceive their stigmatisation, or the stigmatisation of their group. Nevertheless we want to include Carmen's view, a Romanian Roma woman, as it illustrates exactly what stigmatisation is: indiscriminately ascribing negative images to a group. Carmen expressed that hearing people saying bad things about Roma makes her sad. She lamented the fact that an entire group, in this case the Roma, is being blamed for the wrongdoings of a few.

Concerning their more practical reaction to stigmatisation and exploitation Roma generally tend to comply with stigmatisation and exclusion. This can partly be attributed to their history of stigmatisation in Eastern Europe and the related fear of authority. It is not uncommon for Roma to be exploited by their private landlords and employers. They are, however, generally reluctant to report these cases. Our

Slovakian Roma informant Adam, however, expressed that he had questioned his employer after he had said bad things about Roma. However, he wouldn't go further in challenging his stigma, because it might make him lose his job. Roma often feel they are not in the position to complain, even if the means are available.

As was discussed in the theoretical framework, experiences with stigmatisation can make the stigmatised to suppress their ethnic identity or identify themselves otherwise to escape the stigma attached to their ascribed ethnicity (Eriksen 2010, 47.) In the case of Roma in Govanhill we found out that Roma often prefer to identify themselves with their country of origin rather than their Roma ethnicity. Adam for instance didn't like to identify himself as Roma because of the negative connotation the term Roma or Gypsy generally has. Because the term Roma was strongly connected to stigma he preferred to identify himself as Slovakian.

Like mentioned before the annual International Roma Day can be seen as a way to challenge stigma about Roma. It shifts the focus from Roma allegedly being a group causing trouble for Govanhill to a vibrant community being a valuable addition to Govanhill. As mentioned before many Roma participate in the activities that celebrate their identity, which contrasts with a general tendency to suppress their ethnic identity. This is also why Angela characterised Roma identification on International Roma Day as situational. This confirms Nagata's (1974) theory that ethnic identification is by no means fixed and is related to cultural behaviour, which appears to be amenable to situational interpretation.

Concerning Roma ambitions to be considered full citizens we have encountered that for the majority of them, subsistence is of a greater concern than the aspiration to be a full citizen of Scottish society in a subjective sense. In addition, some Roma (such as Adam) don't have ambitions to settle in Govanhill in the long term. This explains their attitude towards integration and once again signifies the diversity of the Roma from Eastern Europe that are living in Govanhill. However, as several informants told us, Roma are slowly yet increasingly more empowered to ask for support at local organisations. Organisations such as Govanhill Baths and the Govanhill Community Development Trust are currently struggling to cater for the demand for support by Roma.

Looking at the integration of their predecessors, many of our informants are optimistic about the future of Govanhills' Roma, despite insecurity about the consequences of Brexit. Llewyn, the aforementioned police officer, also voiced this optimism:

> 'If you look back to the 60s, 70s, you would have an Asian influx in Govanhill. There obviously, there were probably tensions around that at that point. So this is just the next step. And in ten, fifteen years Govanhill will be totally different. At the moment you can see that for Eastern Europeans Govanhill is a focal point to come in. But they will definitely spread out across the city'. (semi-structured interview 05/04/2017)

Integration, however, is a timely process that will not just pay off overnight, as was also expressed by several service providers.

The same goes for Govanhills' challenges as a neighbourhood. There are a lot of issues around housing, hygiene, safety and poverty. However, a lot of effort is invested in improving the neighbourhood, not in the least by the great number of charities working in the area. Their potential for improving the neighbourhood and specifically the situation of Roma will be treated in the coming chapters.

When connecting the situation of Roma in Govanhill to citizenship, one can conclude that Govanhills' Roma are currently still on the fringes of Scottish society. Although Roma, staying in Scotland through EU regulations, have few legal hindrances to engage in Scottish society their world often doesn't go further than the edges of Govanhill and their Roma networks. It is their history of exclusion and stigmatisation combined with living in a deprived neighbourhood that explains their difficult situation and their limited degree of citizenship on numerous levels. Concerning socio-economic rights Roma have fairly generous entitlements and access to welfare, although they have become more restricted over time. However, Roma struggle to meet the demands set for acquiring benefits. Barriers include the fact that many Roma are employed in informal jobs and that application procedures are complicated. In addition, Roma often do not know what their rights as citizens are. Looking from the angle of cultural citizenship processes of stigmatisation restrict

Roma's rights as citizens as it denies them their right to be different and to belong in a participatory democratic sense. The following chapters will look at the ways civic activism aims to battle these issues and reshape the citizenship of Govanhills' Roma in a positive way.

5. Civic activism in Govanhill

5.1. Forms of civic activism

There are many different forms of civic activism and community development in Govanhill. We had expected to come across a few organisations and civic activists that were working on development and integration of Roma after finalizing our research design but it turned out to be an overwhelming amount of organisations that work specifically in and for the community of Govanhill. However, there are only a few organisations and civic activists that work specifically with and for the Roma communities. This section will start off from the bigger governmental organisations, working down to institutional activism and the one-man operations. This is relevant to our theoretical conceptualization because it will explore the typology of the initiatives, the related institutional and social positions of these civic organisations and what dimensions of citizenship they try to affect.

The biggest organisation we came across that works with Roma is Glasgow Life, a fairly big organisation that has a bit of a dark and un-homely neighbourhood centre based on Daisy Street. This neighbourhood centre is a common area, open to all inhabitants of Govanhill, where a lot of communal activities take place. This can be related to Uitermarks' theory (2005) which states that common areas or communal activities to enhance integration, participation and inclusion mostly operationalise community development. Glasgow life has around 2600 employees of which around 30 work in the Govanhill division. Glasgow life is an independent organisation but is almost completely funded by the Glasgow city council and the British council. Glasgow life Govanhill offers a multitude of services to promote integration and inclusion. The ones that are relevant to our research are the English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) project and the library as a community hub that is very well used which are both part of the Community Learning Development (CLD) plan. The CLD plan covers the period from 2015 to 2018, which tries to develop different ways of learning across the city but especially in Govanhill to meet the needs of individuals and break down the barriers for learning. This can be tied to Etzioni's theory (1994)

of creating an effective community. The representatives of Glasgow life that we spoke to, told us that they set up different drop-ins and organise activities that the community needs, evaluate them and alter them accordingly. The ESOL project provides free classes to all levels of English speakers so they are able to access services in Glasgow themselves. The Glasgow life library, which is centred in the heart of Govanhill, offers a lot of free services that are well used, among other things a free employment advice hours on Monday and Wednesday (drop-in). The following passage will show the atmosphere of this library.

> When entering the big Victorian style building, three friendly librarians behind the reception that, like most Glaswegians, have bad teeth greet you. The library is divided into two parts. Right from the reception is a kids' area and some free PC's. To the left side of the reception, there are about 6 shelves with books in many different languages and a study area. A lot of Roma youth hang out in the study area showing each other funny videos and listening to music, being shushed by the librarians every so often. A big part of the Roma community makes use of the library, either to use the computers to look for employment or other information. It is also a place where people can sign up for the free ESOL classes. (field notes 12/4/2017)

This passage also shows that this communal area operationalises community development for Glasgow Life. There seems to be a slight one size fits all approach even though they do recognise that the Roma face very specific problems. Facility manager for Glasgow Life, Rose, mentioned these challenges to us multiple times:

> [About Roma]: 'They're very resistant. It's just not…It's a strange country to them and it's just trying to give them that confidence so they feel that they can come out and engage. I think it's down to the communication with them because if they don't speak very good English it's very difficult. But I find the parents more resistant. I think probably they have other interests, so they're trying to encourage their children, they're trying to be kind to their children, most of them put their children first rather than themselves. As you would if

it was your child I suppose'. (semi-structured interview 13-3-2017)

This quote shows that Glasgow life tries to influence the subjective level of citizenship by showing Roma that they can be a bigger part of the community than they are now by increasing confidence. Glasgow Life works with different organisations, the ESOL project is done in cooperation with the Govanhill Community Development Trust (GCDT). To conclude, it can be stated that the main aims of Glasgow life are to affect the socio-economic dimension of citizenship because they try and work on employability, they teach English as a second language which are both things at the basis of claims to welfare and establishing entitlements to social security.

This brings us to the next organisation focussing on community development in Govanhill, the Govanhill Housing Association (GHA) with the subsidiaries: GCDT and Great Gardens. GHA is a parent organisation to the GCDT and Great Gardens because the board members of the GHA oversee the GCDT and Great Gardens. Especially the first two organisations are relevant because they make a lot of effort to reach out to the Roma community and provide for their integration needs. They are three fairly big organisations with 15-30 employees and work closely together. The Housing Association invests in the neglected properties in Govanhill and opens them up under very fair conditions to families in need. The Housing Association that helps Roma families into their properties has a lot of terms to protect its tenants in contrast to private landlords. The Housing Association is a charity that is mostly funded by the city council but it has two subsidiaries of which the GCDT is a commercial organisation.

The GCDT has a commercial property portfolio, it runs social enterprise activities, employability projects, ESOL cafe's and a drop-in shop for information and advice to help Roma families access services related to housing, health, education, employment and training. This is clearly related to the socio-economic dimension of citizenship. A Romanian as well as a Slovakian outreach worker who are very well known and trusted within the Roma communities run this drop-in. They work together with multiple organisations to organise different events and classes for people of Govanhill like International Women's day, Peer education health

programme for Roma and International Roma day. The GHA and its subsidiaries has more of an outreach mentality than the smaller third party organisations which will be mentioned in the next paragraph, they have more capacity to do so.

Another kind of civic activism in Govanhill comes in the form of a few smaller third party organisations that work with a demand approach. The demand based approach means that these organisations listen to what the people of Govanhill are in need of and provide services around these specific needs. They all have between one and eight employees and a variety of number of volunteers. All of these organisations have at least one Slovakian or Romanian speaking employee to be able to communicate with the Roma communities. It is however important to note that the Well and The Space are faith-based and work from a Christian morality. These charity organisations each provide, in their own way, a drop in centre for disadvantaged minorities, with a special focus on the Roma because they are the most recent migrant group, to stimulate beneficial relationships and provide information and advice. They all have their own separate 'product'. We will now expand on these organisations and their products.

The Well is an information and advice centre that aims to build relationships, they not only want to improve or change Govanhill, but improve relationships with and between people in Govanhill. They believe that change will flow out of these relationships. This builds on the theory of Putnam, who states that private faces of social capital have a collective profit (Putnam 2001). The Govanhill Community Canteen provides a space where people can come together, share a meal and get to know each other's cultures. SouthSeeds provides information and advice on home energy for Roma and tries to educate them on the British energy system because a lot of them are not used to it. Crossroads has different projects that offer advice and information to Roma youth and women, helping families access services. Govanhill Baths is a community hub that provides free health and wellbeing classes for the community and houses different organisations like Romano Lav and Stand up to Racism. These organisations showed us that there are citizenship rights present on the formal level but that the Roma communities do not know how to access them on a substantive level. It seems to us that this makes them feel left out on a subjective

level. They try to educate Roma on these rights. The following quote by Ellen, manager of the Govanhill Community Canteen, proves this point:

> 'They sort of do need to be our focus especially given, like I said that they could at times feel not valued or trusted and it's facilitating situation in which opportunities are created for people to develop, integrated, eventually want to have as many regular volunteers as possible from the Romanian community and we're getting there'. (semi-structured interview 14/03/2017)

Romano Lav and Roma Society Scotland are the only organisations in Govanhill that are specifically focussed on Roma. Romano Lav is a small organisation that has existed for four years and works to challenge racism, discrimination and disadvantage experienced by migrant Roma communities in Glasgow by encouraging them to express their culture and helping others understand the Roma culture. This is a telling account of influencing cultural citizenship because they try and stimulate cultural entitlements. Roma Society Scotland is also a very young organisation, founded in 2015 that works to integrate Roma through education, infrastructure and employability. Both these organisations are run by and for Roma, have close ties to the Roma communities in Govanhill, and work specifically to battle discrimination and give Roma a voice in the community by organising different events like an annual march, cultural events and employability support for youth. They do however struggle with a lot of funding problems and seem to be overworked because they only have the means to employ one to three people, which is very little for the incredible amount of work that they try to do.

There is also institutional activism, which is made up of organisations that are run by governmental or religious authorities. Govanhill Free Church provides a drop in centre for Slovakian and Czech Roma every Tuesday evening where Crossroads and the NHS are available every other week to provide information about life in Scotland or any other questions that visiting Roma might have. Mainly it is a safe, clean space where people can come together and enjoy support from one another. They also provide an "Alleluja" church service every Sunday where Slovakian and Czech Roma

can worship God in their own way, with a lot of music and emotional expression. Annette Street Primary is a school at the heart of Govanhill whose population is a little over 80 percent Roma. The school tries to engage parents in their childs' education and has multiple projects that raise childrens' aspirations and prepare them for higher education which is not done by their parents. The same goes for Shawlands Academy, which is a secondary school that is located just outside Govanhill but has an 11 percent Romanian and Slovakian Roma population from Govanhill (G42 postcode area). The National Health Service, has set up a peer education programme in cooperation with the GCDT specifically for Roma to educate a few active people within the Romanian and Slovakian Roma community about all aspects of health.

> A petite woman from the National Health Service with very tightly pulled back black hair asks if everyone can state their name, their country of origin, their employment, and what they learned from the health course. The participants listen to either Nadine or Martina, interpreters from the Govanhill Community Development Trust, who sit behind them and interpret the information into respectively Romanian and Slovakian. Two women with headscarves who work for the NHS are busy taking minutes. *"Hi I'm Alina, I do volunteer at community renewal and what…"* She looks at Nadine and finishes her answer in Romanian. Nadine interprets for Alina into English for the rest of the group: *"I'm very happy that I learned about my rights at the Health centre and that I can always request an interpreter when I need help, I'm very happy to have worked together with such a diverse group of people and that I learned to express my opinion. Alina wants to thank NHS for their patience".* Languages blend together, Martina and Nadine are translating at the same time to their side of the room during the English presentation on vaccination and questions constantly pop in which have to be translated. (field notes 20/03/2017)

The initial ambition of the project was that these active community members would spread this knowledge out to their own network and other members of the

community. However, at the evaluation meeting of this course, which we attended, a few people mentioned that a lot of people within their network did not believe this information nor took it seriously. Scotland Police has a few specific measures for Govanhill targeted at Roma. They try to close the gap between perceived crime and reality of the crime by providing statistics and providing a fortnightly 'surgery' (as they call it) at the local GCDT shop. However, we attended these surgeries twice and no one showed up for them. They also do a lot of extra patrols in Govanhill compared to other areas to make people feel safer. As a last point for institutional activism, Govanhill has a very active community council. This council is made up out of up to 15 volunteers that are elected every year. Everyone that has a Govanhill address can make him- or herself an electable and vote for the council. The council has no political power but tries to co-ordinate local opinion through a monthly meeting and communicate this opinion to the city council. We attended one monthly meeting and there was a very active interest for improving the community and supporting organisations that work with Roma in the 'right way'. For example, they were very critical about the new GCDT shop that, in their opinion, did not provide the right support for the community because they didn't really actively reach out to the Roma. These forms of institutional activism are an example of reshaping political and civil citizenship on a substantive and subjective level.

Besides these organisations that try to work with Roma to improve their circumstances, we would like to discuss the organisation Let's save Govanhill (LSG) more elaborately. As was introduced briefly in section 4.1, LSG is a political campaign initiated by Bethany that demands effective intervention from the city council and the Scottish government in regards to the decline of Govanhill[3]. They are worried about the perceived ghettoization of Govanhill, particularly about the littering, overcrowding and crime rate. They have a website and an active Facebook page that covers everything they perceive to be wrong in Govanhill, in the hope of alarming the authorities. It is unclear how many people are involved in this campaign, according to Bethany it fluctuates.

The last form we would like to discuss is the group of single activists within the

[3] Illustrated by quote on page 31

community who are active on a lot of different fronts. We met and interviewed a few people, Carmen (Romanian Roma), Blair (Scottish) and Dalia (Lithuanian) who are active in and support a lot of the organisations and events mentioned above. They each know the community very well and have a lot of insight into the problems and possible solutions. During various mapping meetings that we attended, Dalia gave us a lot of insight into the many communities of Govanhill:

> Dalia talked about which places in Govanhill had power: housing association because they have access to a lot of the big funds. Govanhill Baths because they have a citizen advice centre and activities for children, the GCDT because they have a lot of information. Police is not even named initially, when I cautiously bring it up, she gets a bit heated. "*Not trying to badmouth them but they don't take enough action, they get mad when someone throws a cigarette on the street but they won't come to help when a grannie gets robbed, we had to put the grannie in a taxi to the police station because they wouldn't take action".* (field notes 07/02/17)

Carmen works as a translator with The Well, volunteers for The Community Canteen and attends every meeting that is aimed at improving Govanhill, like the initiative by Blair "People's Bank of Govanhill" or the peer education programme by the NHS, which will be discussed more elaborately later on.

5.2 Participation of Roma in civic activism

It is very important to consider the participation of Roma whilst analysing the effect of civic activism on citizenship. However, a discussion of the participation of Roma should take the heterogeneous nature of the Roma community in Govanhill into careful consideration, this heterogeneous nature has been described in section 4.2. There is a lot of variety in levels of participation between different Roma communities in Govanhill. First of all, there seems to be a big difference between the participation of Slovakian and Romanian Roma in events and organisations. This can partly be explained by the fact that the biggest influx of Slovakian Roma was in 2004 and the

Romanian Roma did not arrive until 2008. The Slovakian Roma are a more settled group and are more ready for certain integration projects in contrast to the Romanians who are still trying to get their basic needs fixed. This is also what Nadine pointed out to us in our interview with her:

> 'Like Slovakian Roma are different from Romanian Roma I think because Slovakians are a more established group they have been here for longer, they trust institutions more, they're happier to access services, work with the school, the authorities, work with the city council. They less have the feeling that people are out get to them, less so than Romanians. It means that the community is a bit better off and it also means that the project you can involve them in are different for the stuff that I feel most of the Romanians are ready for. So if you are talking about things like volunteering being involved in stuff like community canteens and things like that, it will be more likely to appeal to Slovakians. This is because Romanians are still busy working out basic subsistence, and they are also a bit more sceptical'. (semi-structured interview 29/03/2017)

This means that in general, the Romanian Roma are more active in accessing services targeted at subsistence needs rather than the more integration focussed services that Slovakian Roma are ready for, like employability, peer education programmes and political engagement. This shows us that Slovakian Roma take more advantage of citizenship on a substantive level than the Romanian Roma because they have more insight into what possibilities are available. We observed this in many settings. The employability courses and English classes are much more regularly and actively attended by the Slovakian Roma and a lot more Romanian Roma show up at the drop ins about welfare and housing information. This can be explained by the bigger gap in education that Romanian Roma have and the fact they are quite new to the area, these factors cause a big need for support.

The community development sector of Govanhill invests a lot of money and effort into the education of Roma and they seem to respond to this and be involved in the improvement of their education to a certain extent. Roma seem to find it very

important that their children are enrolled in school. However, this is only important to them because it provides them a way to access benefits. Also, children within the EU have the right to continue and finish their education in the country of residence, which means it ensures their right of residence during these pre-Brexit times. The parents themselves are variably involved in their child's education and higher education is generally not considered important at all. Edward, deputy head teacher of Shawlands Academy, gave us a clear idea of Roma parental engagement.

> 'The challenges again going forward are parental engagement, we don't get that many… It's good when they come in. A lot of the Roma families, they came here to work and to earn money and so they're working during the day. So it's difficult to get them in during the day if something goes wrong. At night, they do shift work so they might be working at night or they might be unable to come out at night [...]. They come up here when there's a good reason or when there's an exclusion. We don't have a lot of exclusions at Shawlands but when they do something wrong or if there's an exclusion, then they come in'. (semi-structured interview 24/03/2017)

Regular attendance at school was a struggle when the Roma first started arriving because they did not see the value of education and did not have good experiences with education in their home countries. However, both the primary school and the secondary school that we talked to have seen huge improvements in this. It is however still very difficult to raise the aspiration of pupils to continue education after the age of sixteen. The following account by shows the effort that is put into education:

> 'Roma people don't see education as important, they don't attend educational activities and they don't want to do voluntary work because they say they don't have the time. They go to events where there is free food and music, nothing else. They tell me that their kids are in primary school and that that is enough but it is not. We cannot change them but we can show them different options.' (semi-structured interview 29/03/2017)

The churches are also very well visited. The church (Govanhill Free Church) that we conducted participant observation at seemed to be very important to the Roma that attended. A lot of the Roma are very passionate believers of the Christian faith and visit either the evangelical church (Romanian Roma) or the Free Church (Slovakian Roma) in Govanhill. The Bothy, which is a weekly drop-in centre hosted by the Govanhill Free Church was very well attended and a lot of people told us that it was a very important place for them. Regarding health and the Police, the Roma are very sceptical of authority. This is a big part of the reason why they don't use their services enough. The NHS and the Police however try very hard to lower the threshold and get Roma to approach them more often for their own benefit.

There is a significant difference between the attendance of men and women. Generally only women show up at activities and drop-ins, sometimes with the exception of one or two men. This can be attributed to the fact that a lot of the men work six to seven days a week and the women don't. However, Glasgow Life has told us that mostly the (unemployed) men show up at their activities because the women are not confident enough and have to stay at home with the children.

Finally, there seems to be little civic activism out of Roma initiative. Our research has shown that this is partly because of the fact that if Roma children continue education and pursue a "good" career, they are considered a *gadjo*[4], no longer part of the group. This is also a big part of the explanation of why Roma do not easily participate in education or more advanced forms of civic activism and engagement. For example, setting up their own organisation or connecting to other groups of people because this would risk losing contact to their own group of people.

To summarize, more Slovakian than Romanian Roma are involved in different types of civic activism, especially institutional activism. This can mostly be attributed to the fact that they have been in Govanhill a little longer than the Romanian Roma and are not as busy with providing subsistence needs. There are not a lot of organisations out of Roma initiative because it is not considered admirable to pursue a higher education and set up companies or social enterprises. A big challenge for

[4] Explained on page 44

civic organisations to get Roma engaged is the Roma fear of authority. The next sections will focus specifically on the desired effects of civic organisations and to what extent the organisations achieve these desired effects.

5.3 Helping Roma getting a sense of economic and social entitlements

The effects of civic activism on the practical political, economic and social situation of Roma in Govanhill can be easily pinpointed. In accordance to the theoretical frame, our research has shown that political, economic and cultural integration very often are perceived to have social relationships as a result and vice versa. This means that efforts to promote political, economic and cultural integration are very much connected to building and increasing trust and feelings of belonging. However, these efforts do not always seem to have the desired effect on social capital, this will be explained in the next section. Our first informal conversation with Margaret at The Well already proved the aforementioned statement about the aimed effects:

> ‘Our aim is to build relationships, not only be professional and improve or change Govanhill but improve relationships with and between people in Govanhill. Integrational change will flow out of these relationships.’
> (informal conversation 09/02/2017)

As mentioned before, most Roma are very focused on providing subsistence needs for their children. This means that they are very active in finding help regarding looking for a job, maintaining a safe roof over their heads and feeding themselves and their children. A lot of drop-in services provide help with searching for jobs, provide information on how to access benefits, and help to register for voting. This seems to be a prominent aim and motivation for actors and organisations: to increase employability and empower people to help themselves.

To expand further on the kinds of civic activism there are specifically aiming at socio-economic entitlements, there are a few organisations and initiatives that need to be discussed elaborately. The GCDT has a very objective integration aim: to provide

help with accessing services and help people find jobs and education about politics and healthy living. They don't have an outreach approach but rely on word of mouth to make sure people know when and where their Romanian and Slovakian speaking community workers will be providing help and support. Smaller, third party organisations have a big focus on employability. Reaching out to people and involving them in projects that gives them more knowledge of the work field and thus making them more employable for employees. Organisations like SouthSeeds, Crossroads, Glasgow life, Romano Lav, and the Govanhill Community Canteen have a big focus on increasing employability. The schools also find this very important, they have a lot of projects that are targeted at raising pupils' aspirations and providing other alternatives to starting a family at a young age and not pursuing higher education or a career. Roma generally seem to be more ready for these forms of civic activism rather than the forms that are targeted at building beneficial social relationships and making people feel more at home in Govanhill.

Organisations have seen small steps in awareness of social and economic rights since the Roma first arrived in Govanhill. The Roma communities are more aware of their rights and a few organisations have managed to build such a level of trust that they have helped them learn English, get employment and access welfare. As we learned at the meeting for Roma equality from Wilma:

> 'Free movement through Europe is fine but people arrive here without any knowledge or support. Don't know of the services that can help them or how to use them. All of us have to work together to get integration, we started with a year long plan for this about three years ago but realistically it will take about ten to fifteen years for children to become educated and for something to actually change.' (field notes 16/02/2017).

It is important to note however that it is very slow progress, Roma are a complex ethnic group that are not always willing or trusting towards organisations so the desired effect takes long.

We have noticed that a lot of Roma are mentally occupied with the current political situation, which is another sign of substantive political citizenship. However,

they are not very well informed and make wild assumptions about the consequences of Brexit. We asked a few Roma women what they thought of the Brexit, and despite the language barrier they all seemed to have an opinion on Nicola Sturgeon. Nicola is First Minister of Scotland and on top of that, Glasgow Southside belongs to her constituency. Mrs. Sturgeon is in favour of free migration and wants to set up a referendum for the independence of Scotland. During the official opening of the GCDT shop, which was led by Nicola Sturgeon, a lot of Roma were very excited about meeting her and wanted to take a picture with her. The Romanian and Slovakian community workers told us that they get a lot of questions about Brexit so they are very keen to stay up to date. However, most of them don't have right of residency so they don't have the right to vote. They are very eager to maintain this status because this means that they will be sure of getting to stay in Scotland after Brexit. To expand further on the formal and substantive political rights, the community council is a very good example of how Roma are able to voice their opinion to the city council through this council. They are also allowed to vote for city council if they have a registered address in Glasgow.

5.4 Limited results of social capital

Roma in Govanhill are in every way very attached to their family. They start having children at a very young age, around 17 years old, and they live together with their extended family. They perceive their social network, especially their family, as extremely important and they trust each other and rely on one another a lot. Family is however a very broad concept to the Roma in Govanhill. Angela who works for Crossroads explained this to us very clearly:

> 'To be honest, everyone is family with everyone in Govanhill, you have cousins, you have aunties if you ask someone: "is she family?" there probably will be some kind of relationship so, you know... Family is also outside family do you know what I mean?' (semi-structured interview 06/03/2017)

Because of this, everything travels by word of mouth and the Govanhill development sector has picked up on this. They use this word of mouth advertisement by specifically engaging a few active, smart community members in their projects and education programmes with the knowledge and/or hope that these community members will spread this out to other members in the Roma community. Their family, the church and a few actors within civic organisations that speak the language seem to be the most important to Roma in Govanhill because they express trust towards them and visit them a lot. The language aspect is a very important part of the effects of civic activism on identity of Roma. Activists or civic workers that do not speak the language, either Slovakian Roma or Romanian Roma, will never be as trusted as activists or civic workers that do speak the language. Jennifer gave us a very telling account about this:

> ‘They don’t want me to learn the Roma language. That is the language they speak to each other when they don’t want other people to know what’s happening. It got better because I got better relationships with them, there are people who wouldn't mind now. But there are still people who would mind. It was interesting because I wasn't expecting that.’ (semi-structured interview 28/03/2017)

This is why organisations that have employed workers that speak either of these languages, seem to be more effective in engaging Roma than organisations that have not. There are a lot of forms of civic activism that try to stimulate beneficial social relationships between Roma that do not know each other or between Roma and other minorities. These forms are variably successful. We have noticed that Roma have a strong tendency to only trust a certain group of people and find it hard, once again, to engage with people that do not speak their language and more importantly, to trust them. This lack of trust also influences the effect of civic activism a lot. Ellen, manager of the Community Canteen told us:

> ‘Engaging with that community is difficult because especially now post-Brexit, trying to make the community feel that they are valued and they are

> welcomed and that they bring a lot to our community and we're happy they're here and we want to get to know each other and we want them to also be involved in developing the community as well.' (semi-structured interview 14/03/2017)

Organisations mainly try to build beneficial social relationships by hosting approachable gatherings like a mum-to-mum support group, arts & crafts meetings or education on each others cultures by getting to know each other through the community canteen for example. They have the desired aim of building these social relations as a background to practical activities, like Rose from Glasgow Life has told us about their youth activities:

> 'Well, encouraging people to come into our programmes, so maybe it's teenagers that are all working together so they can get to know one another and talk to one another and then they can see why they do things this way and we do things this way and it's just trying to encourage that bond.' (semi-structured interview 13/03/2017)

It can be stated that after circa 15 years of Roma living here and an according amount of time and effort in community development, Roma are still very attached to their in-group, are involved in various institutes and find Govanhill a comfortable place to live. This is mostly because a lot of organisations provide services, trust, education and alternative options to their former way of life. As Carmen told us:

> 'Uhm.. I'm liking this country, I'm liking work, it's good people, and help me, too many, and have good school.' (semi-structured interview 27/03/2017).

However, they are not very engaged in forming bonds with people outside of their community because there is a big fear of authority, more focus on providing subsistence needs and a lot of Roma do not feel the need to reach beyond their own community, also because they do not speak English.

To summarize, even though civic activists are trying their best to provide

information about accessing benefits, raise aspirations in regards to education and increase employability in order to create a more inclusive community, Roma are a very tight-knit group who are not very open to people outside of their group. Civic activists work on the strengthening of entitlements of minorities but Roma have the tendency to enforce and emphasize their own boundaries. This makes it hard to stimulate social capital with public returns.

6. Discussion and conclusion

In this discussion we will summarize our most important findings and how they relate to literature. Furthermore, we will answer our main research question and we will conclude with making recommendations for further research.

Govanhill is a neighbourhood with a long history of immigration and numerous social challenges. Having been the entrance gate for many migrant groups over time, in recent years the neighbourhood has witnessed an influx of Eastern European Roma in the area. It is common for economic migrants to have a low socio-economic status in their country of arrival. It usually takes time to get adjusted to the country's habits and systems. This is also true for Govanhills' Roma who come from a particularly bad social situation in their country of origin. However, Roma in particular face a challenge as a group with a generally bad reputation across Europe. Coming from this background they have also arrived in a neighbourhood that has a bad reputation across Glasgow and even across Scotland. Although many informants refuted allegations of the neighbourhood being a ghetto, Govanhill does indeed face a number of problems. One of the most striking problems in Govanhill is the poor condition of much housing and the bad living conditions related to overcrowding. Roma suffer from this especially as they are mostly forced into privately let housing where there are no regulations and conditions are the worst. At the same time several 'native' residents harbour negative sentiments towards Roma and hold the Roma partly accountable for the neighbourhood's ills. This possibly reflects Wacquant's (2007) theory about displacing the neighbourhood's stigma onto a faceless, demonized other, in this case Govanhills' Roma.

Considering the actual stigma of Roma revolving themes are criminality and unwillingness to work. However, Roma are not usually confronted with stigmatisation directly. What they are confronted with, however, is their limited social development that makes it harder for them to progress socio-economically. This disadvantage is partly a result of a history of stigmatisation in the Roma's countries of origin. Their rights as citizens were often neglected as they had limited or no access to work and

education. Returning to Marshall's (Marshall in Turner 1990) dimensions of citizenship we can state in this case the Roma's civil and socio-economic rights were denied. Additionally, Roma stigmatisation on a horizontal level was commonplace. It is with this history of being a second-rate citizen that Roma came to Glasgow. As was mentioned, this has its impact on Roma abilities to progress socially. Because of limited literacy and education, Roma have difficulties in accessing formal jobs, housing and benefits. This is exacerbated by the fact that Roma generally have a distrust of authority, which has been linked to their history of stigmatisation by several of our informants. Returning to the level of the neighbourhood we can see that Roma face similar challenges as preceding migrant groups did. However, stigmatisation, both in past and present, makes it especially difficult for Govanhills' Roma to progress socially.

On the level of identification Roma tend to suppress their ethnic identity to escape the stigma that is attached to it. Through stigmatisation the cultural citizenship of Roma, the right to be different and to belong in a participatory democratic sense (Rosaldo 1994, 409), is denied. Conversely, it is civic activism that aims to enhance the socio-economic dimension of citizenship and aims to respect enhance their cultural citizenship to some extent.

Civic activists in Govanhill, on all kinds of levels within different types of organisations have different approaches but all seem to eventually want the same things: raise aspirations, increase employability and lower barriers between different cultural groups to promote integration and social capital to create a cleaner and more inclusive Govanhill. In the theoretical frame, the concepts community development, social capital and (urban) social movements in relation to citizenship were discussed.

The most important empirical findings in regards to civic activism are that there is firstly an overwhelming amount of both governmental as well as non-governmental institutions and organisations that work with different kinds of minorities in Govanhill with a mostly demand-based approach. Secondly, motivations for developmental organisations are to improve the neighbourhood and to help make everybody feel at home to create a safe and inclusive community. The main areas of focus are English for speakers of other languages programmes, building social capital,

raising aspirations of children through education and improving housing and employability circumstances so the community becomes a better one. Roma participation is variable according to their country of origin and gender. Biggest challenges are funding, lack of aspiration and education, the fact that the Roma are very focussed on their own in-group and the fear of authority that Roma seem to have.

As is stated in the theoretical frame, effective communities are responsive to the true needs of all of its members and reflect the appropriate balance between social order and personal autonomy (Etzioni 1994). Such a balance is based on social formations that are continually being reshaped in response to the members' true needs rather than relying only on socializing the members to accept the community's demands or on utilizing control processes. Member identities must closely be taken into account in order to decrease societal tension and increase civic responsibility (Etzioni 1994). On the one hand, social formations of Roma are indeed being reshaped in response to the members' true needs, for example by offering tailored education and peer education programmes. However, on the other hand there seems to still be a big emphasis on socializing the members to accept the community's demands, for example by trying to teach them that hanging around on street corners is not something people feel safe around or getting them all to participate on whatever level possible. This could be a reason why Govanhill is not yet an effective community according to the definition of Etzioni.

We can only relate the types of civic activism in Govanhill to the theory of (urban) Social Movement to some extent. As explained in the theoretical frame, an urban social movement is seen as everything that organizes social unrest, uprisings, pressure groups and oppositional fronts, which claim political power and participation (Uysal 2012). These USM's are connected to the political system but they are ideologically autonomous of any political party. USM's are important vehicles for transmitting radically diverse grievances and views of the civil society to the state (Nichols in Uysal 2012). USM's emerge after a particular crisis. We can see that there is definitely a case of organized social unrest and pressure groups but that they do not really claim political power because they are mostly bottom-up organisations and they

are more focused on integrating Roma on a social horizontal level rather than passing their grievances on to the state. Also, stigmatisation is not institutionalised which also means that political power is not necessarily needed. However, if we look at an organisation like Let's Save Govanhill, this can be considered as a USM. This particular part of civil society has a certain grievance, Govanhill is turning into a ghetto, and they have organised as a political campaign so they can pass that grievance on to the state even though they are not connected to a party.

The reshaping of social formations and the socialization of members is partly done by building social capital. Networks and associated norms of reciprocity with value (Putnam 2001, 1) are being built by multiple of these civic activists. The civic activists try to create value for the people who are in them, and they have, at least in some instances, collective benefits because it creates a community and common goods, so that there are both public and private faces of social capital. This does not seem to have the aimed effect because there is not enough trust and feelings of responsibility amongst Roma. This can also be related to the theory stated in Turner: civic responsibility and social trust are fundamental conditions to secure the institutionalization of citizenship in the long run (Turner 1999).

To summarize and conclude about the effects of civic activism on citizenship, the forms of civic activism in Govanhill, related to community development through social capital and to some extent to an urban social movement, mostly bridge the gap between formal, substantive and subjective level of citizenship within a socio-economic dimension. The formal rights of citizenship are mostly present in Govanhill. Roma do not know how to access them or they do know but they don't feel confident enough to do so, sometimes due to a fear of authority, which civic activists try to work on. The statement that civic activism in Govanhill mostly works on the socio-economic dimension of citizenship can be explained by the fact that the main focus lies on employability, teaching English, stimulating social capital and improving housing conditions. However, it does also make an attempt at increasing cultural citizenship because civic activists make Roma aware of the right they have to be different and to belong in a participatory democratic sense. Civic activists try to teach Roma about the ability they have to influence their own destiny by having a significant voice in basic

decisions.

Having discussed the implications of both stigmatisation and civic activism for citizenship we can move on to answering our general research question: how do social stigmatisation, exclusion and civic activism reshape citizenship of Roma in Govanhill? Roma are in a socially disadvantaged position, which can partly be attributed to their history of stigmatisation. Due to their limited opportunities for development in their countries of origin Roma have difficulties to progress socially, also in their new context. Shortly, looking from a socio-economic angle the Roma can be considered marginal citizens. Simultaneously, social stigmatisation of Roma in Govanhill, although not widespread, constructs Roma as unworthy citizens as they supposedly cannot meet the standard of a proper Scottish citizen. This partly contributes to the problem that Roma are not willing and/or able to exercise their formal rights as citizens.

On a practical level this means that a lot of means are available for them to progress socially, such as education, support and benefits, but that Roma only to a limited extent manage to take advantage of this. Shortly speaking there is a gap between the formal and substantive levels of citizenship. Civic activism aims at bridging this gap in helping Roma to access services and progress socially thereby improving their socio-economic citizenship. It is hard to draw conclusions about the effect of social stigmatisation and civic activism on subjective citizenship. However, looking at our data it seems that social stigmatisation makes Roma hesitant to strive for belonging to Scottish society. Civic activism also tries to bridge this gap by building confidence but is only successful to a limited extent.

Although our research has resulted in interesting insights in the interplay between stigmatisation and civic activism more time should be spent in the research setting with Roma themselves in order to enable more solid conclusions to be drawn. As was mentioned already in the introduction of this thesis we had expected to spend more time with Roma and gain more insight into their perspective on the research topic. In the field we found out that this proved to rather difficult, especially within a period of ten weeks. As Govanhill and its Roma are a very interesting research topic a longer period of research with more language knowledge could be rewarding in

deepening our knowledge of Govanhill, Roma and theoretical concepts of our research. The upcoming Brexit will inevitably change the face of migration within the UK. Additional research is needed into the consequences of Brexit for migrants and their citizenship in the coming years.

7. Bibliography

Adams, Lucy and Calum McKay. 2016. “A story of Glasgow's Govanhill and its 1960s-style poverty”. *BBC news*, August 25. Accessed December 22, 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-37180037

Benhabib, Seyla. 2002. *The Claims of Culture: Equality and Diversity in the Global Era.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Bloemraad, Irene and Karthick Ramakrishnan. 2008. *Civic Hopes & Political Realities: Immigrants, Community Organizations & Political Engagement.* New York: Russel Sage Foundation.

Boeije, Hennie. 2010. *Analysis in Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Press.

Clark, Colin R. 2014. “Glasgow’s Ellis Island? The integration and stigmatisation of Govanhill’s Roma population.” *People Place and Policy* 8(1): 34-50.

DeWalt, Kathleen M. and Billie R. DeWalt. 2002. *Participant Observation: A Guide for Fieldworkers*. Walnut Creek: Atlantic Press.

Etzioni, Amitai. 1995. “The Responsive Community: A Communitarian Perspective.” *American Sociological Review* 61(1):1-11.

Eriksen, Thomas H. 2010. *Ethnicity & Nationalism: Anthropological Perspectives.* London: Pluto Press.

Eriksen, Thomas H. 2013. *Globalization: The Key Concepts.* London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Fraser, Douglas. 2016. “Unequal Scotland? - How being poor can cut short your life”. *BBC news*, November 17. Accessed on June 16, 2017. http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-38003373

Govanhill Housing Association. 2017. “Our History”. Accessed December 8, 2016 http://www.govanhillha.org/about-govanhill

Hassan, Gerry. 2016. “Govanhill: Glasgow’s Ellis Island and the Battle for the Heart of Nicola Sturgeon’s Constituency.” *The Gerry Hassan Blog*, May 14. Accessed on December 18, 2016. http://www.gerryhassan.com/blog/govanhill-glasgows-ellis-island-and-the-battle-for-the-heart-of-nicola-sturgeons-constituency/

Holston, James & Arjun Appadurai. 1996. “Cities and Citizenship”. *Public Culture* 8(2): 187-204.

Holston, James. 2009. “Insurgent Citizenship in an Era of Global Urban Peripheries”. *City & Society* 21(2): 245-267.

Kabeer, Naila. 2005. *Inclusive Citizenship: Meanings and Expressions*. London: Zed Books.

Kroon, Anne C. 2016. “Victims or perpetrators? Explaining media framing of Roma across Europe.” *European Journal of Communication* 2(22):1-18.

Kourova, Eva. 2015. “Roma people: problem or solution?” Masters Thesis, Glasgow Caledonian University.

Kymlicka, Will. 1998. *Ethnic Associations and Democratic Citizenship*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Marshall, Thomas H. 1950. *Citizenship and Social Class*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Nagata, Judith A. 1974. "What is a Malay? Situational Selection of Ethnic Identity in a plural society". *American Ethnologist* 1(2): 331-350.

Pakulski, Jan. 1997. "Cultural Citizenship". *Citizenship Studies* 1(1): 73-86.

Poole, Lynne. & Kevin Adamson. 2013. "Report on the Situation of the Roma Community in Govanhill, Glasgow". School of Social Sciences, University of West of Scotland.

Putnam, Robert. 2001. "Social capital: measurement and consequences". *Canadian Journal of Policy Research* 18(25): 1-32.

Rosaldo, Renato. 1994. "Cultural Citizenship and Educational Democracy". *Cultural Anthropology* 9(3): 402-411.

Ross, Peter. 2013. "Govanhill: Glasgow's Ellis Island". *The Scotsman*, February 10. Accessed on December 12, 2016 http://www.scotsman.com/news/govanhill-glasgow-s-ellis-island-1-2783217http://www.scotsman.com/news/govanhill-glasgow-s-ellis-island-1-2783217

Sampson, Robert J. & Stephen Raudenbush. 2004. "Seeing Disorder: Neighborhood Stigma and the Social Construction of 'Broken Windows'". *Social Psychology Quarterly* 67 (2): 319-342.

Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation. 2016. "Most Deprived 10%". Accessed on March 24, 2017. http://simd.scot/2016/#/simd2016_10pc/BTTTTTT/14/-4.2451/55.8442/

Tanner, Arno. 2005. “The Roma of Eastern Europe: Still searching for inclusion”. *Online journal of the Migration Policy Institute.*

Tarcsafalvi, Ester. 2013. “Negotiating Identity and Culture: A study of the Romanian Roma in Govanhill”. Masters Thesis, University of Glasgow.

Taylor, Edward, Joaquin Arango, Graeme Hugo, Alo Kouaouci, Douglas S. Massey and Adela Pellegrino. 1996. “International migration and community development”. *Population Index* 62(3): 397-418.

Thomas, Suzanne A. 1999. “Multiculturalism in practice: a study of Govanhill, Glasgow”. PhD diss., University of Glasgow.

Touraine, Alain. 1985. “An Introduction to the study of Social Movements”. *Social Research* 52(4): 749-787.

Turner, Bryan S. 1990. “Outline of a Theory of Citizenship”. *Sociology* 24(2): 189-217.

Uitermark, Justus, Ugo Rossi and Henk van Houtum. 2005. “Reinventing Multiculturalism: Urban Citizenship and the Negotiation of Ethnic Diversity in Amsterdam”. *International journal of urban and regional research* 29(3): 622-640.

Uysal, Ulke E. 2012. “An Urban Social Movement challenging urban regeneration: The case of Sulukule, Istanbul”. *Cities* 29(2012): 12-22.

Vasilopoulou, Sofia. 2016. “UK Euroscepticism and the Brexit Referendum”. *Political Quarterly* 87(2): 219-227

Wacquant, Loic. 2007. “Territorial Stigmatization in the Age of Advanced Marginality”. *Thesis Eleven* 91(1): 66–77.

Woolcock, Michael & Deepa Narayan. 2000. “Social Capital: Implications for Development Theory, Research and Policy”. *World Bank Research Observer* 15(2): 225-249.