

SPAIN AT A CROSSROADS

The Aftermath of Recovering Memory Practices in a Rural Village
in Spain, a Generational Case Study of Chillón



Sanne Terpstra
Diede Verstegen

Photograph FrontPage¹

¹ This picture was taken by us the day we visited this site with Juli, one of our main informants, on 30-03-2013. On the picture you see a sign with the text: *Finca 'El Contadero'*, which marks the entrée of this estate. This estate houses the former mass grave where the nine have been buried for over 70 years. We chose this picture, because recovering memory practices in Chillón mainly revolve around the nine who were assassinated at this *Finca*.

Spain at a Crossroads

The Aftermath of Recovering Memory Practices in a Rural Village in Spain, a Generational Case Study of Chillón

Bachelor Thesis 2012-2013

Sanne Terpstra 3463095
S.Terpstra@students.uu.nl

Diede Verstegen 3534162
D.D.G.Verstegen@students.uu.nl

Coordinator: Eva van Roekel

Universiteit Utrecht



Contents

Acknowledgements	6
Introduction	8
<u>Theoretical Part</u>	
1. Living Peaceful together after a Civil War	12
1.1 <i>Justice</i>	13
2. Politics of Forgetting	14
2.1 <i>Touchstones of Transitions into Democracy</i>	14
3. Absent Dead and Exhumations	16
3.1 <i>Presence of mass graves</i>	16
3.2 <i>Exhumations</i>	16
3.3 <i>Afterlife of Exhumations</i>	17
4. Memory and Importance of Imagery	19
4.1 <i>Post Memory and Importance of Visual Aspects</i>	19
<u>Context</u>	
5. Recovering Memory in Spain	21
5.1 <i>Spain in General</i>	21
5.2 <i>Chillón</i>	23
<u>Empirical Chapters</u>	
6. Revival of memories of the Francoist past in Chillón	24
<u>6.1 Previous Commemorations</u>	<u>24</u>
6.1.1 <i>Placing a Monolith</i>	25
6.1.2 <i>Publications of a Book</i>	26
<u>6.2 Exhumation and Ceremony</u>	<u>27</u>
6.2.1 <i>Exhumation and Ceremony of the Reburial of the Nine</i>	27
6.2.2 <i>Physical Presence and Visual Impressions</i>	31
7. Generational Memory Transmittance and Incorporation	34
7.1 <i>Political Background</i>	35
7.2 <i>Before the Exhumation</i>	36
7.3 <i>After the Exhumation</i>	39
7.4 <i>Importance of Memory Transmittance</i>	41
8. Recovering Memory of the Francoist Past in Present Debates	43
<u>8.1 Political Discourse Surrounding the Recovering of Memory</u>	<u>43</u>
8.1.1 <i>Law of Historic Memory</i>	43
8.1.2 <i>Recovering of Memory by means of Exhumations</i>	45
<u>8.2 Present Day Views</u>	<u>46</u>
8.2.1 <i>Opinions towards Recovering Memories and Exhumations</i>	46
8.2.2 <i>Responsibility</i>	48
8.2.3 <i>Future Role for Younger Generations</i>	49
9. Conclusive Remarks	51
Bibliography	56
Appendixes	60
A. Letter for my Grandfather Pablo	60
A.1 <i>Original Version in Spanish</i>	60
A.2 <i>Translation in English</i>	62
B. Illustrative Photographs	63
C. Research Summary	70
C.1 <i>Summary in English</i>	70
C.2 <i>Resumen en Español</i>	74

Acknowledgements

Entering your fieldwork and research location for the very first time is a very special experience. In our case we believe we never felt more anxious in our lives than during that the two and half hour bus ride which would take us to Chillón, a small secluded town in Castilla la Mancha. The moment we arrived in Chillón all our fears disappeared, because of the two old ladies waiting for us at the bus stop whom kind-heartedly welcomed us into the village and immediately introduced us to a lot of people. From that moment on, everyone in Chillón treated us like family and made us feel at home. After the amazing three months we spent there, we can say without a doubt that 'we will never forget our time in Chillón'.

We would like to thank everyone in Chillón who helped us with our research and made us feel at home. There are a few people we would like to thank in particular. Jerónimo; for your granted permission to carry out our research in Chillón, for welcoming us into the village and your kindness. Julí and Paulí; for welcoming us into your family, treating us as if we were your children and for introducing us to a lot of people. Luis Miguel; for your kindness and willingness to provide us with a lot of information concerning the Francoist past in Chillón. Marí, Luís and Cristina; we want to thank you, such lovely people, for everything you have done for us and your friendship. David, ARMH; for sharing your critical view on Spain and our research every once in a while, for your very well organized historical tours, which we enjoyed very much, and of course for being a good friend. Maruja; for our nice get-togethers and being our dear landlady. Jorge Moreno Andres and Fransisco Ferrándiz; for introducing us to this village which proved to be a very suitable location for our research. Ton Robben; for pointing us into the right direction concerning our research topic and putting us in contact with Fransisco Ferrándiz. Last but not least, our coordinator Eva van Roekel; for her guidance, motivation, critical eye, expertise and feedback which helped us writing this bachelor thesis.

Sanne & Diede

I would like to thank Sanne; for being such a good friend and spending three months in the field with me. We have worked together very well and supported each other whenever it was necessary. I am very proud of this thesis, which we created together.

Diede

I would like to thank Diede; for being my research partner during our fieldwork period. It was very nice to have such a close friend with me in the field, who knows me through and through. We could talk about everything, both on a personal and professional level. Whenever we felt confused or did not know how to continue with our research, we received the right amount of support and motivation from each other to carry on.

Sanne

Introduction

“It is never too late for the past to become the present” (Achterberg in Igreja 2008:540).

In contemporary Spain a lot of commotion surrounding the recovering of memories of the Franco regime and the Spanish civil war has made its appearance and is now an important subject in public debates. The past of Spain has been silenced for a long period of time, but now the ‘digging-up’ of the past has started; since 2000 exhumations have been carried out frequently.² The goal of these exhumations is to identify the people who died during the Franco regime and the Spanish civil war, give them a proper reburial, sooth the pain of relatives and offer some form of acknowledgement for the past atrocities. Spain's Francoist past has eventually made its appearance in the present, after years of silence *“el pacto del olvido”*³ has been broken and a law that facilitated the recovering of memory was installed in 2007⁴. A great contrast exists between people who want to recover the past versus people who are opposed to it (Ferrándiz 2006:9). People can have several reasons whether they want to recover the past or not, these different reasons will be elaborated in our thesis. Nevertheless, exhumations have already been carried out throughout Spain, and people are forced to deal with that, one way or another. As a result of the current economic crisis in Spain, the amount of exhumations has decreased. This economic crisis entails governmental budget cuts, which affect the financial support for the ARMH⁵; who are in charge of the recovering of memory projects in the form of exhumations.⁶

The aim of our research project is to gain some understanding of several recovering memory practices, which influenced people’s opinions towards the recovering of the Francoist past. In order to understand the importance and influence of these recovering memory practices our research focused on the aftermath of an exhumation in Chillón, a small village in Spain. The exhumation in Chillón took place in 2011; they exhumed the bones of nine Republicans that were assassinated in 1939. Before the exhumation other practices already took place in order to recover memories; a monolith was placed and a book was published. We were interested in how different generations experienced the revival of the past in the present and how these several practices shaped their opinions. How do these different generations in Chillón feel about the past, present and future in relation to the recovering of memories?

² In 2000 Emilio Silva carried out the first exhumation, he is a grandson of one of an assassinated Republican. Emilio is also founder of the ARMH (see note 5)

³ A pact that was implemented by the Spanish government to ‘forget and silence’ the past (Davis 2005: 859 and Renshaw 2010:46).

⁴ *Ley de la memoria histórica* (Law of historic memory)

⁵ *Asociación para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica* (Association for the Recovering of Historic Memory)

⁶ See Appendix B photograph one; for an illustrative photograph of the ARMH at work during the exhumation in Chillón.

This research has been divided among generational lines; we found that the impact of recovering memories on a younger generation is different than the impact on an older generation. Different generations have different reasons why they can, or not, have interest in recovering memories about the Francoist past. We divided our informants in three different generations. The oldest generation, people from this generation have first-hand memories of the Francoist past, because they lived during this period. The second one consists of their children; they form the 'in-between' generation. They were born after the Civil War, have lived during the final years of the Franco period and experienced the transition into a democracy. The last one concerns the youngest generation that was born after the Francoist period and therefore only knows about this period from the stories they have been told. Sanne focused on the youngest generation and Diede focused on the oldest generation during our research period. While in the field, we both talked to people from the generation in-between, because this in-between generation turned out to be the crucial link between the youngest and oldest generation when it comes to the transmission of memories.

One of our goals was to gain insight in the lives of people dealing with practices concerned with recovering memories of the Francoist past in contemporary Spain. Another goal was to see how several recovering memory practices, in particular the exhumation, have been of influence on our informant's opinions concerning this topic. Our overall goal was to create a complementary view, by revealing how different generations coped with recovering memory practices and interacted with each other. The main question we aimed to answer with this thesis is: *'How do people from different generations, living in Chillón, Spain, recall various practices concerned with recovering memories of the Francoist past and how did these practices shape their present opinions concerning the revival of this past in the present?'*

In order to answer this question we looked at several aspects, such as; daily lives which will provide us with contextual data, previous recovering memory practices, in particular the exhumation process and its visual aspect, talking about the Francoist past with friends and family, the influence of the political and economic situation concerning the recovering of memories, and the opinions concerning the continuation of the recovering of memories and exhumations in Spain.

A lot of research has already been done concerning recovering memories, exhumations and the way in which people prepare for them in Spain as well as the rest of the world.⁷ For example, in Spain research has been done by *'Las políticas de la memoria'*.⁸ When we started out with our

⁷ <http://www.memoriahistorica.org.es/joomla/> (Website ARMH) and <http://politicadela memoria.org/> (Website *'Las políticas de la memoria'*.) Both Accessed on June 13, 2013.

⁸ 'This project proposes an interdisciplinary, international and comparative analysis on the impact of the exhumations of mass graves from the Spanish Civil War in contemporary Spain, with the double aim of producing systematic scientific knowledge on the process fostering a deeper and critical understanding of this complex process of revisiting the traumatic past and, on the other hand, feed public debate with this scientific analysis.' <http://politicadela memoria.org/en/the->

literature study we found that a lot has been written about the preparation and implementation of an exhumation. Though, not a lot of research has been done on the aftermath of an exhumation. Our research focused on how people deal with the revival of the past, a while after several recovering memory practices took place. This research might be interesting for future recovering memory practices in and around other local communities, because it gives an insight in the negative or positive, complex and difficult outcomes. Our research provides insights in the perceived necessity of the exhumation in Chillón. Whether it has been necessary according to our informants and whether or not they feel the need to continue with recovering memories in Spain. It also addresses the notion of temporality, concerning recovering memories of the Francoist past, in the eyes of several generations.

Anthropological fieldwork is an important approach towards an understanding of the recovery of memory practices. Recovering memories is a personal matter, because everyone has a different experience and way of interpreting the past. Anthropological fieldwork helps with exploring the process of memory-building (Ferrández 2006:7-8); the way in which memory is constructed. Recovering memories and the recovering of memory practices can be sensitive topics in a small village, because these might reveal conflicting political and social opinions about the past. To unravel these feelings towards recovering the past, anthropological fieldwork proved to be very useful for us. Giving people the opportunity to be heard is important; therefore qualitative anthropological fieldwork is an appropriate method. Qualitative methods gives people the opportunity to speak in a less structured way, not pointed into a certain direction, and therefore more freely. Anthropological fieldwork requires that the researchers enter their research population for a long period of time, in our ten weeks. During these weeks we lived in Chillón and participated in daily live activities while doing research. This way we got to know our participants on another level than simply questioning them without knowing them personally, which made them more willing and feel more comfortable to share their stories with us. People from Chillón did not only see us as researchers but also as inhabitants of Chillón.

We used several research methods from DeWalt & DeWalt (2011) and Boeije (2010) during our fieldwork. Participant observation was one of these methods we used during social activities within the village in order to get to know people, build rapport and to experience what their daily lives are like. Chillón is a small village, which made it possible for us to use the snowball method to get to know people. Through our gained informants and participants we got in contact with other people; who were potential informants. Informal conversation was one of the most important methods we used, because with this method we found out what they knew about our research topic

and if they were willing to talk about it. The same applied to the use of unstructured interviews. This method enabled us to ask a bit more specific about certain topics people already spoke about while having informal conversations with us. We used semi-structured interviews to get more structured and detailed information from an informant. We accomplished this by asking open questions and let the informant take the initiative during the interview. We also used life-histories in order to understand how people relate to the recovering of memories. Life histories did not only provide us with contextual information, but it was also important for building rapport. With the use of this method people felt like they were listened to and that we were interested in their lives.

In order to answer our main question we will first discuss some relevant concepts and theories. In our theoretical part we discuss how countries can deal with a post-civil war situation on a personal and a state level. Concepts such as 'justice' and 'responsibility' are being discussed. After that we continue with 'politics of forgetting' in order to explain how certain politics deal with its country's past in a post-civil war situation. Furthermore, we discuss the temporality of history, the role of absent dead and the exhumations. Finally we address concepts concerning memory and the way visual aspects are able to create more affiliation with the past. In our chapter on context we discuss the situation in Spain during and after the Francoist period regarding the recovering of memories. We will also introduce our research location; Chillón.

In our empirical chapters we show the data we collected during our fieldwork and link this to our theoretical framework. We did this with the use of several chapters; '*Revival of memories of the Francoist past in Chillón*', '*Generational memory transmittance and incorporation*' and '*Recovering memories of the Francoist past in present debates*'. Throughout our empirical chapters we intertwined the different generations. In our concluding remarks we iterate the most important theories with our own findings and come to a conclusion, which will answer our main question. In appendix A we added a story written by a granddaughter of one of 'the nine'⁹. She described the way she experienced the exhumation site, after the exhumation, when they gathered at el *Finca 'El Contadero'*¹⁰ to place nine olive trees to remember the nine lives that were lost at that place. In appendix B we placed some illustrative photographs as a visual addition to the text. In appendix C we added a summary of our research in English and Spanish.

⁹ The nine Republicans which were assassinated in Chillón in 1939 and recently exhumed.

¹⁰ Finca 'El Contadero' is the property, where the nine were left after their assassination.

Theoretical Part

Living Peaceful together after a Civil War

"If history had taught us anything it is that unresolved pasts are not easily put to rest." (Viejo-Rose 2011: 477)

Especially after a civil war reconciliation can be difficult; *'restoring broken relationships and learning to live non-violently with radical differences'* (Ramsbotham 2005:231). The way a nation deals with reconciliation is of influence on how historical memory is created; memory-building. It gives war a legitimate place and it creates space for relations to be reconstructed. When dealing with a post-civil war situation, this is particularly important on an individual level, because families, friends and entire villages have to create a habitat in which they can live peacefully together, again. Where personal contacts and relations used to be strong, these strong relations can be damaged after a civil war (Ramsbotham 2005:231). A key factor is a redefinition of 'self' and 'other', which can be seen as 'we vs. them'. The goal is that this changes towards 'us'; a process called re-humanization (Ramsbotham 2005:233,244).

Ramsbotham (2005:233) suggests that there are several stages in the process of reconciliation. A starting point for reconciliation is that there is some sort of political closure. The division within politics has to be solved, so they can be sure that a return to violence is unlikely. As will be shown in our empirical chapters, some of our informants believe it is important that the government should not be divided on the matter of recovering memories, political parties should leave the link with their political past behind. The next stage is overcoming polarization. Assassinations have had a big influence on social relations by creating a tension between the victims and the perpetrators (Fernández de Mata 2008:256). A possible form of overcoming this tension is through an Amnesty Law, which was implemented in Spain in 1977 (Ferrándiz 2006:11). This meant no prosecution of people who had committed crimes during the Franco period (Rigby 2000:77). This is an attempt to create 'we vs. them' into 'us', by not pointing any fingers. The last stage of reconciliation, according to Ramsbotham (2005:233) includes acknowledgement and looking at a shared future instead of a troubled past. In our empirical chapters it becomes clear that stages are not that fixed as implied here, other factors play a role as well. This involves cultural aspects, as media, education, everyday experiences and collective and individual historic memory (Ramsbotham 2005:244). Another important aspect of dealing with the past is some form of justice, according to our informants.

Justice

Justice implies a form of reparation which only matters when the historical wrong that has been done has caused a present injustice (Encarnación 2012:180). When legal justice is not possible anymore, since the historical wrongs happened a long time ago and the ones responsible are either very old or dead, other forms of justice become more important. For example uncovering the 'truth' and knowing what has happened. During transitional justice practices, recovering truth, memorialization and reparations, the recognition of victims and their rights can be seen as key factors (McEvoy & McConnachie 2012:527-528). For victims it is important to be recognized by the state as well as on an international level (Moon 2012: 188). States don't always apologize or acknowledge their wrongs. Sometimes non-state attempts¹¹ may help victims of war crimes to find closure (Suzuki 2012:203).

There are other difficulties with justice, after collective violence, in the form of responsibility. Who is responsible for such past wrongs? Who are the 'good' and who are the 'bad' people? These issues are decided by public as well as political opinions. The line that separates the two is very difficult to draw, also called the grey zone (McEvoy&McConnachie 2012:531-532 and Scheper-Hughes & Bourgois 2004:83-90). Our empirical chapters will show that in Chillón this line between good and bad is less difficult draw, according to our informants. The nine were the only ones killed, they were politically left orientated; therefore people who were politically right are looked upon as the 'bad guys'. The question does remain whether or not next generations should be held, or feel responsible, for wrongs they were not directly responsible for? What if the historical wrong happened before they were even born? How can younger generations of a nation apologize for wrongs they were not responsible for (Thompson 2012:220)? And the same goes for governments; how must they apologize for wrongs of a past regime they were not responsible for and to whom exactly?

¹¹ For example the ARMH in Spain; through the collaboration of numerous individuals, we have been able to assist dozens of families to recuperate the remains of their loved ones and hundreds more to know the fate of their relatives. This is something that democracy has failed to provide the citizenry with. Since 2000 we have worked towards dignifying the past and demanding justice for those who have not had a voice within our profound democracy. <http://www.memoriahistorica.org.es/joomla/index.php/quienes-somos/629>. 14-06-2013.

Politics of Forgetting

There are different opinions, within politics, on whether or not it is better to silence the past after a civil war. Silence can be seen as a mean to achieve peace, but also as a hindrance in the creation of a culture of accountability, because nothing is done with the memories of victims or human rights abuses (Igreja 2008: 539). After the Spanish Civil War¹² a period of dictatorship followed until 1975.¹³ When the period of transition towards a democracy was initiated in 1975, the transformations of the war had already been 35 years underway (Carr 2000:297). A long period of silence followed, because people, and especially politicians, seemed scared to dig up the past. Therefore it seemed to be a good option to forget. *“No one in Spain was ever judged, no one was ever deemed guilty. And since no one was ever deemed guilty, forgiveness never entered into it. It was just a matter of forgetting.”* (John Hooper in Rigby 2000:77) Digging up the past might bring back the division there was and destabilize the country (Encarnación 2008: 447). Amnesia can be an approach to ‘move on’. When there has been a widespread division between two opposing parties, that even affected family ties and relations, it is often considered a ‘plausible’ option to forget ‘ancient hatreds’. There can be a fear of the consequences of revealing each other’s past (Rigby 2000:78). On the other hand, it can be important to remember why violence has to be prevented in the future and to learn from past wrongs. This is in order to prevent violence and traumatic events from occurring again (Rigby 2001 *In Ramsbotham* 2005:237). Igreja states that analysis of the dynamics of official silence has shown that *“(...) silence is neither complete nor does it result in the political death of memory”*, one way or another the past is unavoidable (Igreja 2008:540). As our empirical chapters will reveal, our informants had different points of view on the importance of remembering the past in order to prevent traumatic events from occurring again. We found their points of view to be inseparably linked to their political preferences and backgrounds.

Touchstones of Transition into Democracy

The state has a task, during a transitional period; how to deal with atrocities made in the past. New transitional states have their authority grounded on the touchstones of demands for truth, justice, accountability and reparation (Moon 2012:188). During a period of transition towards democracy the state and its society go through a process of mutual transformation (Groves 2012:307). Especially the performances by the state have an influence on the society; for example in their way on how to deal with the past.

¹² 1936-1939

¹³ The dictatorship from 1939 till 1975 came to an end because Franco died.

It is important to consider the existing paradigm on reconciliation that implicates that a post-war society 'needs' to deal with the past in order to move on. This paradigm is integrated in the public opinion that people 'need' to talk about a 'traumatic past'. Dealing with the past can also be seen in terms of tensions, as in different interpretations of the past and different opinions on how to deal with the past, and responses to those tensions (Dwyer 1999:85-87 and Opatow 2001:166). Silencing can be seen as a hindrance towards democratization, as mentioned before. On the other hand, confronting the past, which is embedded in the transitional justice paradigm, can also be seen as a hindrance towards democratization; because of the fear to revive old sentiments (Encarnación 2008:436 and Davis 2005:880). The transition in Spain towards democracy was based upon this realization, therefore forgetting and repressing past tensions was seen as the best option for moving on. Looking at the past during the transition means reopening old divisions (Encarnación 2008:447). Forty years later though, the sentiment that remembering the past is no longer a threat to the stability of the state has gained in strength.

The history of silencing memory and digging it up decades later, *"reveals deep societal scars left by the experience of the dictatorship and adds weight to the view long held by some analysts of democratization, that a society cannot indefinitely avoid coming face to face with past trauma"* (Davis 2005:880). Silencing the past will not make memories of the past go away. A lesson learnt from the Spanish case is that it is important to question when, where and how the uncovering of the past takes place. Dealing with the past requires peaceful conditions in a society and the risks of renewed violence or ruptures should be reduced (Brounéus 2003:55), which might take several generations, as was the case in Spain. It is believed that people in Spain are now capable to carry the burden of memories and dealing with their past, because of the contemporary 'stable' political condition in democratic Spain (Brounéus 2003:12 and Encarnación 2008:456). Waiting several generations to achieve peaceful conditions has a down-side because of memories falling into oblivion, as will be shown in our empirical chapters.

Exhumations, identifications and reburial of the remains of those who were assassinated are an important element in the recovering of memory in contemporary Spain (Jump 2012:157). Relatives feel a need to exhume bodies of lost family members who were murdered and thrown into mass graves during the civil war under Franco's reign. Exhumations seem to be an important recovering memory practice in order to deal with the past (Ferrándiz 2006:12-13).

Absent Dead and Exhumations

Presence of Mass Graves

When talking about the recovering of memory in general it is assumed that there is memory to recover and that it is found to be important to recover memory about this past in the present and in some cases to create a 'better' or 'more stable' future. One can wonder how it is possible that after a long period of time, in the Spanish case over seventy years, the need or willingness to recover the past has not been lost. The temporality of history depends mostly on the presence of historic elements in the present, both physically and mentally. Schramm (2011:8,16) and Kasten (2013:1) both talk about the temporality of history in connection with the presence of landscapes and 'trauma-spaces' as Kasten (2013:2) calls them. Certain landscapes and spaces become historically significant after a specific traumatic event (Kasten 2013:1). In Chillón, for example, such a place is a mass grave, the meaning of this piece of land changed after the bodies of the nine were being left there. The presence of mass graves is a physical, historic element that reminds people of the past. The meaning that is given to such a place is different for each generation though, these differences will be further elaborated in our empirical chapters. Schramm (2011:12) sees a connection between landscape, violence and memory within the struggle over the dead bodies of victims of violence, either in attempts of retrieval or of reburial.

Exhumations

'Exhumations are laden with transformative capacity in the area of memory politics, as bodies convey a realness which catapults the past into the present, thus defying the linear sequence of temporality (Verdery 1999:27).'

The way exhumations influence the process of people trying to reconcile with the past can only be understood when there is an understanding of the role of 'dead bodies'. According to Renshaw; *'the absent dead are a site of unresolved emotion and ongoing political tension, tensions revolving around the role of the state in 'acknowledging' past wrongs'*(2010:48). These unresolved emotions and political debates surrounding the absent dead make them more potently present (Robben 2005 in Renshaw 2010:48). Not only the debates surrounding the absent dead, but also the absent dead in their own concreteness and physical presence make the past immediately present; bodies in themselves transcend time (Verdery 1999:27).

Exhumations seem to offer some form of resolution or closure regarding the past. By exhuming dead bodies, people seek acknowledgement over certain historical periods and regimes. Exhumations are also experienced differently by each generation as we found out during our research in Chillón. We will discuss the experiences each generation had in our empirical chapters.

Afterlife of Exhumations

After an exhumation has been carried out and bodies have been returned and reburied a sense of anti-climax might occur (Renshaw 2010:49). The bodies are being incorporated in the category of the normal of everyday dead by cultural specific mourning and a formal reburial. The notion that the reburial of exhumed bodies leads to closure and helps people in their mourning process is embedded in the cultural meaning people give to dead bodies and reburials (Renshaw 2010:50). As will become clear in our empirical chapters, the aftermath of the exhumation and reburial in Chillón provided the relatives with a form of closure. The decreased interest in recovering memory practices after the exhumation was in our eyes not because of a sense of anti-climax, Renshaw mentioned could happen, but we found it to be a result of a fulfilled need. When the remains of dead bodies have been found and are rendered corporeally present and accounted for, their physic and symbolic presence may become destabilized and even diminished (Renshaw 2010:49). In Chillón the presence of the nine diminished a bit, not completely though; they are still executing practices to keep the memory of the nine alive. These practices will be discussed further in our empirical chapters.

“The act of unearthing the bones of family members allows individuals to acknowledge and reconcile the past openly, to acknowledge at last the culpability for the death of their loves and to lay them to rest. Such unearthing is, at the same time, a most powerful statement against impunity because it reveals the magnitude of the political repression that has taken place (Green 1994:241).

We found that the exhumation in Chillón indeed offered a form of acknowledgement for the death of the nine assassinated and their relatives. Our informants emphasized the fact that they did not exhume the bodies as a statement against impunity; pointing fingers and blaming others was not the intention of the exhumation.

Exhumations can trigger younger generations to form an opinion on their country which houses mass graves and untold stories. According to Ferrándiz (2008a:4), younger generations are triggered to pay more attention to their elders' war stories or to search for their buried relatives. In this way, exhumations and the presence of dead bodies provide an emerging context for the telling and sharing of narratives about the past and prove to be a step towards a belated and attenuated

form of reconciliation and towards the recovering of historical memory. *'Exhumation and narration are inextricably entwined, exhumations elicit storytelling'* (Ferrándiz 2008a:1).

When a state is not able or willing to give a full account of the narratives around these deaths, the bodies do the work for them. By doing this *"they delegate the mourning and commemoration of these victims of structural violence onto individual, private families"* (Robben 2005 in Renshaw 2010:51). According to the human rights discourse, in which exhumations are embedded, people have the right to recover the truth in order to find some peace of mind. The prestige surrounding exhumations is growing; it makes it possible to use the exhumations as a tool to recover past grievances because it fits perfectly within the transitional justice paradigm (Ferrándiz 2011:533). A dangerous aspect of this justice paradigm is that people who are opposed to the recovering of historic memory are unable to speak up; they are forced to agree that the people who want to recover historic memory have the right to do so. This aspect will be further dealt with in our empirical chapters.

Memory and the Importance of Imagery

To understand why people can feel the need to reconcile with the past, it is important to understand how the past is still alive within the minds of the living. Most contemporary societies have to deal with a painful collective memory. Societies that have experienced authoritarian or totalitarian regimes have to deal with a problematic legacy of national conflict when transitioning into a democracy. New democratic governments will have to decide how to integrate this past period into the history of the nation (Aguilar & Humlebaek 2002:121). One of the most important decisions, concerning history and memory, is the need to decide which national commemorations to discard, given the need to detach itself from the dictatorship (Aguilar & Humlebaek 2002:122). A strategy of new political orders to deal with the past is by repressing and not talking about it anymore; compulsive silence or injunction to forgive and forget (Ramsbotham 2005:235). This makes it easier for a new democratic regime to move on without risking the past to interfere with positive progression and modernization. All new democratic regimes have to dissociate themselves from their predecessors in order to make it clear that a different period is being inaugurated (Aguilar & Humlebaek 2002:124) and to create a form of legitimacy. The repression of memory, in Spain, is a political process in which information about the past is vigilantly kept from individuals. However, these politics of memory do not always meet the needs of societies regarding the recovery of a traumatic memory or past (Aguilar & Humlebaek 2002:123). Even when the repressing of memory has been successful for a long period of time, the memories about the past will not be forgotten.

Post-Memory and the Importance of Visual Aspects

An important concept about recovering memory after a longer period of time is 'post-memory'. The term post-memory tries to capture how a generation that witnessed cultural or collective trauma transmits traumatic memories onto younger generations and how these generations incorporate these memories and keep them alive. Schwab (2010:13) refers to transmissions of memory as legacies of trans-generational haunting. The legacies of violence not only haunt the actual victims but also are passed onto next generations. This haunting operates through family stories and other forms of silencing. Such silences and family stories affect the way later generation narratives are constructed and passed on. Family is important in the cross-generational transmission of memory. Generational transmittance of memory through family histories is something we also encountered during our fieldwork in Chillón and will be further elaborated in our empirical chapters. Not as legacies of violence, but the way in which memories of the Francoist past have been transmitted from one generation onto the next. The way in which they speak or not speak, about the past, influences the way the younger generation incorporates traumatic memories (Jacobs 2011:346).

Second and third generations *'are the sites of mediation between the personally lived past and the inherited past'* (Goertz 1998:34-35). We found these generations to be crucial in transmitting the past onto younger generations.

When assuming that memories of the past can be transmitted onto younger generations we need to take into account the extent and meaning of the memories that are being transmitted. Transmitted memories cannot be seen as reliable information about what happened in the past, it can help create historical understanding by showing how the past affects the future. Memory is constructed from the vantage-point of the present which makes memory reveal its present day attitudes towards the past (Labanyi 2008:122). Loureiro (2008:228) emphasizes that what matters about the past is its effect on the present. In the Spanish case, the recovering of historic memory and the importance of transmitting it onto younger generations has to do with time pressure. The urgency of dealing with the Francoist past stems from the fact that soon there will be no remaining living eye-witnesses (Labanyi 2008:119).

When trying to transmit memories onto younger generations the distance between the past and the present needs to be diminished. A medium that makes the distinction between the past and the present more blurry is through photos (Fernandez 2011:345). Family photos and the familial aspects of post-memory tend to diminish distance and facilitate identification and affiliation with the past (Hirsch 2008:116). What exceeds looking at photographs is looking at the past yourself, for example by visiting sites which contain historic memory (Schramm 2011:6). Visiting a mass grave which contains historic memory about one's own village, its people and its history will make the past resurface in the present.

'Any open grave is a book with pages of soil where words are written whose letters are bodies, bones, fractures, bullet holes, Mauser bullet shells, handgun shells, buttons, buckles, clothes, shoes, pencils, glasses, watches, and rings' (Torres 2007 in Ferrándiz 2008b:5).

The visual presence of the past can help create more affiliation with the past. When looking into the past through visual means the illusion of accessibility arises (Fernandez 2011:344). We found that witnessing an exhumation brings the past more to life than any other visual medium is able to do. In particular younger generations are triggered by witnessing an exhumation, their curiosity about the past grows and shared narratives become more vivid.

Before we look at the way exhumation in Chilón triggered peoples interest, according to our findings, we will first provide a context of our research location in which the previous discussed concepts and theories must be placed.

Context

Recovering Memory in Spain

Spain in General

During and after the Spanish Civil War a lot of people were murdered from the Republican as well as the Nationalist side (Davis 2005:860). Francoists murdered over 90.000 Republicans, a lot of them were put into mass graves (Fernández de Mata 2008:254 and Ferrándiz 2006:8). There were also losses on the Nationalist side; these were already exhumed during the Franco period. People from the republican side were not exhumed during this period. There has never been a rehabilitation policy for these murdered Republicans and their relatives, not even during the period of transition in the seventies; after Franco died. During this transitional period, the government decided to deliberately forget the past. They wanted to suppress the polarization there was in the country in order to prevent the outbreak of another conflict. They wanted to focus on the future and forget the past. A pact, '*El pacto del olvido*', was reached by political parties to avoid dealing with Franco's legacy (Davis 2005:859 and Renshaw 2010:46); which includes war atrocities and the existence of mass graves all over the country (Fernández de Mata 2008:255). Memories of the war and the Franco regime were silenced but not forgotten; they were deliberately disremembered in public (Davis 2005:864). With '*El pacto del olvido*' they wanted to create a more stable situation and a collective amnesia about past political excesses (Encarnación 2012:180). They continued with their attempt to create an 'us' feeling by not strengthening the differences between victims and perpetrators. The Amnesty Law in 1977 was an attempt to end the division between Republicans and Nationalists (Ferrándiz 2006:11). With this amnesty law there would be no form of transitional justice in Spain, because there would be no military trials, no truth commissions and no disapprobation of the old regime. This way, forgetting became an important part of the democratization process in Spain (Encarnación 2012:180).

Between the 1970s and 1990s the past was not totally silenced. That people did not talk about it in public did not mean that people did not think or talk about it within the family (Blanes 2011:33). The Pinochet affair¹⁴, in the late 1990s, served as a catalytic event for the revival of Spain's dictatorial 'unresolved' past. Starting with the recovering of memories was considered to be possible at this time. The political situation was different; Spain was a more stable country and people weren't

¹⁴ The Pinochet affair: Spain's interest in the case, and their opinion in favor of putting Pinochet to trial, attracted attention from other countries; who believed Spain had to do the same thing. Why support these actions when it comes to other countries violent pasts, but still deny their own violent past. This pushed Spain into doing something with their own past. "(...) It is time for Chile to show its civic maturity and to demonstrate that its democratic institutions have the strength to resolve matters which concern national life." http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/world/monitoring/media_reports/665249.stm accessed 24-06-2013. This has been the exact critic Spain received as well.

afraid of an outbreak of war as much as they were during the period of transition. It remained difficult for older generations to talk about this, even after the transition into democracy. The in-between generation was looking for their family history, trying to fill in the gaps of their family biographies (Renshaw 2010:46). Generations born after 1960 were discovering that the democratized country they live in is built upon a period of neglected victims and mass graves (Ferrándiz 2006:11).

The fear of a division among lines of 'us' versus 'them' no longer holds, because the people responsible for past atrocities are already dead or at least very old (Davis 2005:877). Therefore, the focus of recovering historic memory will come down to documenting the truth and restoring dignity of the victims and their relatives (Encarnación 2008:435). Documenting the truth about what happened turned out to be an important aspect for our informants.

The changed political situation made it possible to start carrying out exhumations of mass graves from the Franco period (Davis 2005:871 and Fernández de Mata 2008:258). There had already been some exhumations, organized by relatives of victims of the Francoist repression, in the 1970s and 1980s. This did not grow out into something big until the twenty-first century, when it became a systematic process of excavation, documentation and dissemination of information about the victims and the graves (Ferrándiz 2008a:3). Different regional organizations were founded in order to help families excavate the bones of relatives. The ARMH¹⁵ is such a national organization which was founded in 2000.¹⁶ The organization's aim is to find out the truth about the disappeared people, by exhumations, gathering stories from families of the assassinated and giving them a proper reburial.

During the Franco period public mourning was not possible; imposed silence made the relatives of the assassinated invisible. Their memories were being kept from the post-war national narratives (Fernández de Mata 2008:255). In 2007 the PSOE¹⁷ implemented a '*Ley de la Memoria Histórica*'; this law entailed the recognition and rights of victims and their relatives from the Spanish Civil War and the Franco Regime on both sides (Viejo-Rose 2011:478). Exhumations became an aspect of the recovering of memory.

At this moment the government does not support the '*Ley de la Memoria Histórica*' financially, therefore, nothing is done with this law at the moment. The PP¹⁸ is in charge within the government and they do not feel for the recovering of memory as much as the PSOE. This makes it almost impossible for the ARMH to continue with carrying out exhumations; they have no money at the moment. Right now they have to arrange exhumations with volunteers and family only, without

¹⁵ *Asociación para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica* (Association for the Recovering of Historic Memory).

¹⁶ <http://www.memoriahistorica.org.es>

¹⁷ PSOE *Partido Socialista Obrero Español* (The Spanish Socialist Workers' Party). This party stems a bit from the republicans; they are not the same though.

¹⁸ PP *Partido Popular* (People's Party). This political party descends from the former nationalists/falangists.

any governmental financial support what so ever.¹⁹ ²⁰ This is an outcome of the economic crisis in Spain, but also a political issue.

Chillón

Our research project focuses on a village in Spain, Chillón, which is dealing with recovering memory processes and where an exhumation has already been carried out in 2011. Chillón is a village with a little over 2000 inhabitants and is situated in the province of Ciudad Real, Castilla-La-Mancha. It used to be a mine-workers village, but with the closing of the mine in 2000, a lot of people told us that they have lost their jobs because of that. The economic situation in Chillón is very bad. There are less and less jobs, this is also because of the economic crisis in Spain in general. Therefore a lot of people from the younger generation are leaving the village in order to study or find a job elsewhere.

Chillón is mainly politically left minded, since the transition period (1975-1978) Chillón has had a politically left mayor and municipality. The current mayor of Chillón is Jerónimo Mansilla Escudero, from the PSOE. The link between the political party and its origins is not so strong anymore, but it is still a bit present. This also affects the relation people have with the church. A lot of people in Chillón do not go to church anymore; this has a lot to do with politics, because the church has always been linked to the political right and the Francoist regime. The church began to distance itself from the Franco regime since the 1970s (Larson 2000:862). A lot of our informants have stated that they believe in God, but not in the Church.

On the third of June, 1939, a while after the Civil War had officially ended; nine men from Chillón were assassinated and thrown into a mass grave at *Finca 'El Contadero'*; without any form of justice or dignity. These nine men were from the political left side and were murdered by people from the political right side. There has never been the possibility to dig up these bodies and rebury them at the cemetery, until 2011. In 2011, an exhumation was carried out by the ARMH, executive group of PSOE and family of the nine. Before this was possible though, several other recovering memory practices took place within Chillón, our informants emphasized the importance of the monolith and the published book. These previous practices will be discussed in the following empirical chapter.

¹⁹ We have decided to use the real names of some of our informants and with others, who do not want to be mentioned in our thesis with their names, we left their names out.

²⁰ David (ARMH), informal conversation, 05-02-2013, Chillón.

Empirical Chapters

Revival of Memories of the Francoist past in Chillón

Previous Commemorations

Recovering memory in Chillón seems to revolve around the history of the nine assassinated republicans in 1939. This history is of particular importance to the people living in Chillón, because it is their own local history. The Spanish civil war in general did not affect Chillón as much as the period afterwards, called post-Guerra by many of our informants. Especially the oldest generation still remembers this difficult period, when they talk about this period they refer to the hunger, poverty and controlled lifestyle. Luis-Miguel is a historical writer who lives in Almadén, but his family is from Chillón and related to one of the nine. Luis-Miguel belongs to the younger generation and therefore only got to know about stories of the Francoist past through his family. Besides the poor living conditions, he pointed out that living together in such a small village means that everyone knows everything about each other, which political side families supported during and after the Spanish civil war and their pursuits at the time. It was not possible to talk about this in public.²¹

Ramsbotham (2005:232) mentioned that dealing with a post-civil war situation is particularly important on an individual level; families, friends and entire villages have to create a habitat in which they can live peacefully together, again. During our time in Chillón, we found that people created a habitat in which they could live peacefully together by not talking about politics or referring to past events in public and by avoiding confrontations. One concrete example of such an avoidance of confrontation with the past has been mentioned by Julí, an older lady who has lived her whole life in Chillón. She told us that her mother refused to walk through a certain street in Chillón, because she knew the one responsible for the death of her brother lived there.²² This indicates that people did not reconcile with the past and it demonstrates that for some people the past was still very sensitive during the transition period. This is not what Ramsbotham meant when he talked about reconciliation efforts which would give war a legitimate place and whether it would create space for relations to be reconstructed. Manuel also told us about this difficult period for his family.

A lot of our informants have pointed out that during the transition towards democracy people were allowed to start talking about the past. Jose-Luis, a middle-aged man, explained that during the transition more openness arose concerning what had happened during the Franco period.²³ The period of transition opened up things about the past, but a lot of people were still too scared to talk about it, especially older generations, because they experienced the Franco regime.

²¹ Luis-Miguel, informal conversation, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

²² Julí, informal conversation, 17-02-2013, Chillón.

²³ Jose-Luis, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

Talking openly about your political preferences had been dangerous for a long period of time; this fear decreased but is still present. We noticed this while we were talking to Luis-Miguel at the main square in Chillón. He was sharing stories with us that he recovered from talking with his family about the captivation of the nine and the day they were taken to *'El Contadero'*, where death awaited them. Abruptly he stopped talking and lowered his voice, when an older man passed us by. When this man reached the other side of the square, and Luis-Miguel felt the man to be at a safe distance he explained in a lower voice; *'that man is related to one of the perpetrators'*.²⁴ This specific moment told us about the attentiveness that still goes with talking in the public sphere about the past.

In this chapter we will discuss how recovering of memory took place in Chillón, according to our own data related to our theoretical framework. We will do this on the basis of three recovering memory practices; the placing of a monolith on top of the mass grave, the publication of a book about the lives of the nine before they died and the exhumation of the nine; including the ceremony of their reburial. We will also discuss how our informants experienced each of these practices and we will look at the different aspects of each practice to understand the importance of it in the process of recovering of memory.

Placing a Monolith

The presence of the mass grave at *'El Contadero'* helped keeping the Francoist past a part of the present in Chillón for over seventy years. Rafael, a guy in his late twenties, shared with us that: *'All our elders have always known where the nine were located, at which finca'*.²⁵ This information has not perished over the years, which we found to be quite impressive when taking into account that this grave has never been marked during the Francoist era. The families of the nine have been able to keep the memory of the approximate location alive. The survival of this specific memory can be explained by the importance the families attached to this place, it was preserved in memory of the nine. The site of *'El Contadero'* became historically significant after the assassination that took place over there. This is in line with what Kasten (2013:1-2) stated about certain landscapes and spaces, which become historically significant after a specific event. The physical presence of a mass grave helps people to make the past transcend generations, because it is a place that relates to a specific memory. This goes in line with what Schramm (2011:6) stated about landscapes as containers of memory.

According to our informants, during the transition into democracy a possibility and willingness to commemorate the nine assassinated republicans arose in Chillón. In 1987 relatives of the nine together with the executive group of PSOE in Chillón approached the landowners of *'El*

²⁴ Luis Miguel, informal conversation, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

²⁵ Rafael, semi-structured interview, 04-04-2013, Chillón.

Contadero' and requested them to permit the placing of a monolith. This request was granted and a monolith has been placed on top of the, approximate location of the, mass grave. Now the mass grave was no longer unmarked but became visually present. Marking the grave helped people remember what happened at that specific place. The monolith became a physical and visual element in remembering the nine. Facial portraits of the nine were added next to their names on the plaque, which is a component of the monolith. These pictures served as a personalization of the mass grave and to commemorate the nine individuals who were in the grave. After the placing of this monolith lots of people visited this place each year at the first of May to commemorate the loss of the nine by placing floral wreaths. This site became a place of remembrance.²⁶ Marí, a middle-aged women, who works for the executive group of PSOE in Chillón, and her daughter Cristina, a 23 year old girl, told us about the ceremony every first of May. Especially relatives of the nine would go there and other interested people from Chillón as well.²⁷ David, a history student living in Chillón during the weekends, also mentioned the first of May ceremony as something that took place every year to remember the nine assassinated.²⁸

Publication of a Book

Another event concerning the recovering of memory about the nine was a book, published in 2009, about the nine prior to their assassination on the third of June 1939. It is written by Luis Miguel and the Mayor of Chillón; Jeronimo, both of them are historians. They wrote this book in co-operation with the PSOE. This book; *'El crimen del Contadero: Los nueve asesinados de Chillón, 3 de junio de 1939'*²⁹, about the nine provided the people of Chillón with information about the lives of the nine. The mayor mentioned that the intention of the book was not to not write it only for the families of the nine, but for all the Spanish people in general.³⁰ It is a book that educates people about what happened, not only about the nine in particular, it makes the Francoist past in general more accessible for people throughout Spain.

The response in the village on the published book was very positive among the older generation and especially among direct family members of the nine. As mentioned above Julí was very pleased with the book, because of the importance for other people to know about the past.³¹ Marí described the book *'as something that brought light to a very dark case in Chillón'*.³² The book openly discussed the lives of the nine; this brought some clarity and openness on the matter, which is something the family appreciated after years of silence on this topic in the public sphere. Young

²⁶ See Appendix B photograph two; for a photograph of the monolith, previously located at *finca 'El Contadero'*.

²⁷ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

²⁸ David 2, semi-structured interview 08-03-2013, Chillón.

²⁹ *'The crime of El Contadero: the nine assassinated of Chillón, 3rd of June, 1939'*.

³⁰ Jerónimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

³¹ Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

³² Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

people living in Chillón are aware of the existence of this book and the ones we talked with have seen it, opened it and looked at some pictures. Only the ones interested in the history of Chillón and especially in the history of the nine read it all. Most of their parents, from the in-between generation, have read the book. Cristina read the book partially; she came across this book because of her mother, who has a great interest in reading history books about the Francoist past and especially this region's history.³³ The book also contains pictures of the nine, their families, official documents and working permits. These historical visual images made the past more vivid. According to Fernandez (2011:345) photos can be seen as a medium that blurs the distinction between the past and the present. Some of our informants mentioned that looking at these pictures made the past more accessible, it revealed the importance of photographs to create more affiliation with stories from the past for people who did not experience it for themselves. People who read it got to know more about the lives of the nine, which made personalized them in the eyes of the readers of the book. These stories and photos diminish the distance and facilitate the identification and affiliation with the past (Hirsch 2008:116). The book made people curious to find out more about the nine and the Francoist past; it opened up conversations about it. It triggered people's need to recover more detailed memory about this specific event in Chillón. When the possibility of an exhumation was introduced most people showed interest in it and already knew a bit about what had happened, the book had already triggered people's minds.³⁴ A direct link between the book and the exhumation was made by Luis-Miguel; he mentioned that with the publication of the book people started to show more interest in knowing something about this specific history and that it moved the conversation from within the house to the street. When they started to exhume the remains of the nine, this happened even more.³⁵ The book clearly contributed to the excitation for an exhumation.

Exhumation and Ceremony

Exhumation and Ceremony of the Reburial of the Nine

As has been mentioned before, in Chillón the exhumation and the ceremony of the reburial have been important aspects of the recovering of memory. For a lot of our informants the exhumation is the most important aspect of recovering memory, which is something Jump (2012:157) pointed out as well. Finding out what has happened to the nine and the ceremony of the reburial were considered important in order to find closure with the past. This goes in line with what Encarnación (2008:435) stated; since it is impossible to designate the ones responsible, the focus of the recovering of memory will lie on documenting the truth. Truth is also seen as one of the touchstones

³³ Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013, Chillón.

³⁴ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

³⁵ Luis-Miguel, semi-structured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

for democracy as Moon (2012:188) described as well. That is also why the idea to carry out an exhumation fits within the transitional justice paradigm (Ferrándiz 2011:533).

Manuel told us that he had talked with Jose Capilla, an old man who is son of one of the nine. This man had explained to him that the goal of the exhumation was to give his father a reburial at the cemetery; it is a form of recognition he wanted his father to receive. A proper reburial is the least they can do. People who say that the goal of the exhumation is to point fingers at families related to the people responsible for their dead are wrong in his eyes. It has nothing to do with blaming people for what happened. It is something that needs to be done as some form of justice.³⁶

The exhumation carried out in Chillón was in the eyes of many people from the village a good thing; it however also triggered some negative opinions and responses from people who thought that an exhumation might not have been such a good idea. Even though some people might have been against the recovering of memory, everyone agrees with the fact that family has the right to know what happened to their family. Jerónimo emphasized the fact that the people who wanted to exhume the bodies of their family members had a right carry out this exhumation, which exceeded the opinions of people who were opposed to it. For example, a middle-aged man who is politically right, thinks the exhumations have been *'a huge mistake from the beginning, because if they do it, they have to do it for both sides'*. Right now, he is of the opinion that the recovering of memory is mainly focussed on the political left.³⁷ We will elaborate the political agenda of the ARMH and the law of historic memory later on in chapter eight. Manuel mentioned that there were people who opposed to the exhumation, because it would dig up dirt from the past, which might revive old sentiments.³⁸ A lot of our informants told us they heard rumors in the village: *'it has been 70 years'*, *'what is the point'*, *'why do they have to dig up the past'*. There have never been actual protests against the exhumation in Chillón though, because everyone agrees that people have the right to bury their family properly and that the way the bodies were left in the field, like animals, is not humane. The opinion of the mayor is very clear, and in line with what a lot of our informants, especially the ones related to the nine, have told us as well, concerning the importance of the exhumation; *'it does justice to the nine who have been assassinated and to their families. The nine were treated like animals back then, and they deserve some recognition'*.³⁹ A lot of our informants have also stated that it brought peace and quiet. Like Emilio, a young guy who lives in Chillón, has told us: *'I am sure it is a need families have. Because, clearly, when they kill a family member and they knew nothing, not where they were, nothing... of course this exhumation brings internal*

³⁶ Manuel, unstructured interview, 01-04-2013, Chillón.

³⁷ A middle-aged man, informal conversation, 10-04-2013, Chillón.

³⁸ Manuel, unstructured interview, 01-04-2013, Chillón.

³⁹ Jerónimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

peace'.⁴⁰ Their opinions fit within the existing bias in favor of confronting the past (Encarnación 2008:435); people have the right to recover the truth in order to find some peace of mind. This exceeds the opinions of people who were opposed to the exhumation. The above statements emphasize the fact that the way in which these nine have died and were left at 'El Contadero' is inhumane. We found that both the reason for their deaths and the way they were killed is considered to be a legitimate argument, by our informants, to claim the right to uncover the truth.

Plans to carry out an exhumation in Chillón were made by the PSOE in the municipality around the time that Jerónimo became the mayor of Chillón. The ARMH contacted Jerónimo and Luis-Miguel to find out if there was interest within the village for an exhumation of the nine. Jerónimo and Luis-Miguel started off, with help of the executive group of the PSOE in Chillón, with finding out the possibilities and if the owner of 'El Contadero' wanted to co-operate. After they prepared the plans and created the possibility, the ARMH contacted the families and talked with them about the possibility to exhume the bodies of their relatives. That all families agreed with the plans and were pleased with the possibility to exhume their relatives and give them a proper reburial, is what Jeronimo told us.⁴¹ Julí, a relative of one of the nine: *'the day after they were reburied I woke up and felt very fortunate, because my uncle was finally with his family'*.⁴² All of our informants believed the nine deserved a proper burial and a place at the cemetery where they can be remembered and rest in peace. Inocenta, a daughter of one of the nine, Manolí, an older lady living in Chillón, Julí and others pointed out that they were very pleased with the exhumation, but at the same time sad because of the fact their parents will never know that they finally exhumed the bodies and reburied them at the cemetery in peace.⁴³

During the ceremony of the reburial, which took place in 'la verbena'⁴⁴ on the first of May 2012, family members of the nine and the mayor said a few words.⁴⁵ After this ceremony they collectively took the coffins to the cemetery, where a lot of people were present. Melhor, an older man who used to work in the town hall as counsellor for the PSOE, called the ceremony '(...) *not really a reburial, but more a homage for the nine*', because the intention with the ceremony was to honour the nine.⁴⁶ While the coffins were being placed into the grave, the family-members released nine white pigeons; which symbolized freedom and peace.⁴⁷ This special ceremony concerning the

⁴⁰ Emilio, semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

⁴¹ Jerónimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁴² Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

⁴³ Inocenta, semi-structured interview, 30-03-2013, Almáden. Manolí, semi-structured interview, 02-04-2013, Chillón. Julí, semi-structured interview 06-03-2013, Chillón.

⁴⁴ *La Verbena* is Chillón's community center where all the social events, such as carnival, take place

⁴⁵ See Appendix B photograph three; for a photograph of the Mayor saying a few words during the ceremony at 'La Verbena'.

⁴⁶ Melhor, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

⁴⁷ See Appendix B photograph four; for a picture taken during the reburial ceremony of the nine.

reburial of the nine was a one-time thing, the coming years a commemoration will take place at the cemetery on the first of May; the same way they commemorated the nine before at 'El Contadero' by placing flowers on their grave and say a few words. At the exhumation site they have planted 9 olive trees with a personal message, written by a family member, buried in the roots of each tree.^{48 49}

An interesting aspect of the reburial of the nine is that the church was left out of the entire ceremony. During the ceremony all the family-members and interested people met in '*la verbena*', not in the church, because the family did not want the church to be involved. As already mentioned, the church had ties with the Franco regime (Larson 2000:862). Luis Miguel explained to us that it was a choice of the families to leave the church out of it and that this choice had to do with the fact that the idea of the political left has always been opposite to the church's ideas. The ones responsible for the death of the nine were religious; therefore they did not want anything to do with the church.⁵⁰

According to some informants, from the older generation, almost the entire village was present except for the people who did not feel like attending the ceremony; '*which must have been the ones from the PP*'. For example, a middle-aged man who is very politically right orientated did not go. '*I did not feel like it was my place to go and I did not feel invited to his ceremony*'.⁵¹ Our informants from the older generation sometimes tempt to live in the past; in their 'own history'. Therefore some of them, especially from the political right, have no idea what is going on regarding the exhumation and recovering of memory. An old Nationalist, still loyal to Franco, from a neighbouring village has no idea that exhumations are being carried out in Spain at the moment. His family explained to us that he cannot handle this change after so many years.⁵²

On the contrary, there were also people present during the ceremony that were not related to one of the nine but felt the need to go. For example Guadeloupe, an older communist woman who is not from Chillón and not related to one of the nine, felt the need to go. During the ceremony she could feel the pain the people had because of the loss of the nine, innocent, people; this touched her very much.⁵³ She experienced the pain in an inter-subjective way, Guadeloupe herself had also memories of the Franco period and this way the pain of others became socially shared through the transmission of memory and the aspect of being present during the ceremony. People from the younger generation who visited the exhumation also visited the ceremony. It was the same curiosity they experienced which made them want to attend. They did not remember much from the ceremony however, which indicates that the actual exhumation was more impressive to them than

⁴⁸ See Appendix B photograph five; for a picture we took of the nine olive trees, now located at 'El Contadero' instead of the monolith.

⁴⁹ See Appendix A for an example of one of these letters, written by a granddaughter of one of the nine.

⁵⁰ Luis-Miguel, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁵¹ A middle-aged man, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁵² An old Nationalist, semi-structured interview, 28-02-2013, Agudo.

⁵³ Guadeloupe, semi-structured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

the ceremony was. We found the visual aspect of seeing the actual bones had a greater impact on younger generations, because it made the past more vivid and accessible than the ceremony did. The ceremony was especially important for the families of the nine who were able to put their relatives to rest at the cemetery, because this is why they exhumed their relatives in the first place.

Physical Presence and Visual Impressions

Fernandez (2011:344) stated that looking at the past through visual means could provide a sense of accessibility. He mainly refers to the use of visual means such as photographs or documentaries. We found that being present at an exhumation site has an important visual impact, in particular for younger generations, because it triggered their interest in the Francoist past. It brings the past closer to the present, because these graves contain memory (Schramm 2011:6). The presence of the bones within the mass grave make that a narrative about what happened can be constructed. The bones tell a story about what happened, which has never been done by the state. The state has never been able or willing to create open narratives around these deaths and leave the mourning and commemoration of victims to their relatives (Robben 2005 *in* Renshaw 2010:51). People feel a need to construct the truth about what happened; visualization of the bones can be helpful in this case.⁵⁴

Seeing the exhumation in real-life had a greater impact on the younger generation than, for example, watching a documentary about the Francoist past. The younger generation described the exhumation as something that touched them and made them more curious about the nine. Maria-Jesus, a girl in her mid-twenties, told us about her experience during the exhumation: *'Seeing the nine corpses lying there and the bullet wound one had in his skull, made me think about what it must have been like for them and their families to go through that'*.⁵⁵ Some of our informants of the older generation are of the opinion that younger generations will never be able to fully understand what has happened during the Franco period. For example Manolí understands why it can be difficult for younger generations to understand what happened: *'it happened a long time ago and times are very different now'*.⁵⁶ Visual aspects, though, proved to be helpful in bringing the younger generations closer to the past and create a better understanding of it. Cristina described how the exhumations changed her interest in the past:

⁵⁴ See appendix B photograph six and seven; for illustrative pictures of the bones in the mass grave, we feel function as narrators. It also shows what people attending the exhumations have witnessed.

⁵⁵ Maria-Jesus, unstructured interview, 27-03-2013, Chillón.

⁵⁶ Manolí, semi-structured interview, 02-04-2013, Chillón.

'We all know about the past and heard stories about it, but we never talked about what exactly happened to the nine that were being exhumed. We know the stories but cannot really relate to it, because we will never know how people experienced it for real, therefore we cannot relate to the pain and emotions of the past. This changed a little bit during the exhumations, because it brought the past closer to us. It triggered our curiosity and we started to talk about it more'.⁵⁷

At first she indicates that the younger generation is not able to relate to the pain and emotions of the older generation because they did not experience it for themselves. After that she states that the exhumation changed this a little bit, because she shared in the specific experience of the exhumation. This indicates that stories and narratives are not able to make pain or emotion socially shared; witnessing the exhumation being carried out made it become more socially shared.

The event of reburying the nine gave closure to the family-members of the nine. Without a proper burial and no real proof that they are dead, it is more difficult for relatives, or even impossible for some, to mourn. The need for reburial is embedded in the cultural meaning people have given to mourning processes (Renshaw 2010:50). This can be different for different generations though. For example Julian, grandson of a sister of one of the nine, mentioned that his grandmother was very pleased with the carried out exhumation, but that he personally did not care whether or not they exhumed his grandmother's brother. The reason he gave was the fact that it happened a long time ago and that it was not his history to deal with, but that of the older generation.⁵⁸ This example shows that even though Julian was related to one of the nine, he did not share the same need and interest as his grandmother concerning the exhumation. This indicates that with the passing of time the interest in recovering memory practices might perish among the generations to come.

The presence of younger generations at the exhumation and ceremony was important for older generations. A lot of our informants from the older generation are of the opinion that the younger generation does not have any interest in their past. The example described above shows that this idea of disinterest is not completely unfounded. For example an older man who works for the executive group of PSOE in Chillón is of the opinion that the younger generation does not care about anything else than having fun.⁵⁹ Through the presence of younger generations at the exhumation site and ceremony it became clear for the older generation that some people from the younger generation are interested in their past. Other results were that they started talking with the older generations about the past, which will be further elaborated in chapter seven. They also picked

⁵⁷ Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013, Chillón.

⁵⁸ Julian, Semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁵⁹ An older man, semi-structured interview, 12-03-2013, Chillón.

up the book⁶⁰ again to gain more information about the nine.⁶¹ Before the exhumation some of them had only looked at the pictures, now they were interested in the stories behind the bones they saw at the exhumation site. This indicates that the visual aspect of an exhumation is crucial in triggering the younger generation to *“take another look at the past”* in the present.

In the next chapter we will elaborate on the opened up conversations different generations have had with each other before and after the above described recovering memory practices about the Francoist past. These conversations among different generations will reveal how memory is transmitted and how younger generations incorporate these memories.

⁶⁰ Book: ‘El crimen del Contadero: Los nueve asesinados de Chillón, 3 de Junio de 1939.

⁶¹ Maria-Jesus, unstructured interview, 27-03-2013, Chillón. Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013, Chillón. David 2, semi-structured interview, 08-03-2013, Chillón.

Generational Memory Transmittance and Incorporation

We discovered that the way the older generation talks about the Francoist past with their children and grandchildren reveals a lot about the opinion our informants have on the recovering and transmitting of memory. The way people share their memories reveals present day attitudes towards the past (Labanyi 2008:122). On a political level, the way people talk or remain silent about the Francoist past reveals their political view on how to deal with this past. On a familial level, it reveals how the oldest generation experienced the past and why they deem it important, or not, to share their memories with younger generations about the Francoist past. Which memories are being transmitted reveals present-day attitudes towards the past. It also reveals how the in-between generation experienced the transition into democracy and with that a change in the way their parents communicated about the past with them.

The in-between generation plays a crucial role in the transmittance of memories of the past, as Goertz (1998:34-35) explained. We found the interaction between each generation to be of importance, especially the in-between generation; they form the link between the oldest and youngest generation; between the lived and inherited past. We found that the knowledge the younger generation possesses about the Francoist past depends on the stories and information they received from their grandparents, parents and or other people they spoke with. The knowledge they have gained was gathered in combination with the experiences concerning the practices that have been discussed in the previous chapter. The way in which older generations speak, or do not speak, about the past influences the way younger generations incorporate memories (Jacobs 2011:346). Luis Miguel and his family explained that, especially in Spain, the most important way of transmitting information from the Francoist period is through the form of narratives, because the educational system lacks in providing information about the Francoist past.⁶² Manolo, a man in his mid-fifties whose grandfather's brother was one of the nine, added to this that the best form of education is telling the younger generations about the Francoist period through personal stories;

'What their parents and grandparents have been through must never be forgotten; whether or not they do something with it is up to them. We can transmit the stories but not the pain and emotions that come with it. Emotions are not transmittable in a similar degree, only in weaker forms'.⁶³

⁶² Luis Miguel and his family, semi-structured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

⁶³ Manolo 2, unstructured interview, 11-03-2013, Chillón.

We want to emphasize here the fact that Manolo is talking about emotion transmitted through stories. As discussed in the previous chapter, witnessing the exhumation had a stronger affect regarding the transmittance of emotions onto younger generations.

In this chapter we will further discuss the most important way of transmitting memory, which is talking with each other about the Francoist past.

Political Background

An important aspect, which cannot be left unnoticed, in combination with talking about the Francoist past, is the political background people have. We found that the PSOE and PP are still interrelated with their past, respectively the Republican and Nationalist side, which influences whether or not people talk with whom and about which topics. Especially for our informants of the oldest generation the political background people have is of great importance. Luis Miguel's old aunt does not talk to people she does not know, because she does not know if they are politically left or right.⁶⁴ The political background is becoming less important though for a lot of our informants. As Manolí, Inocenta and others have mentioned: *'Friendship is one thing, politics another'*.^{65 66} It does not really matter to them what the political preferences of their friends are, as long as they treat each other with respect. Still, they avoid talking about it with friends or people with a different political view, mainly in order to prevent discussions. An older informant of us is of the opinion that this makes the interaction between people within the village more superficial, because they do not want to talk about political issues with each other.⁶⁷ Marí and Julí do not see this as a problem as long as everyone respects each other it is alright that: *'everyone has their own ideas'*.^{68 69} For the younger generation friendships are no longer based on political backgrounds.

Different political backgrounds within families are not very common in Chillón, but also not non-existent. Luis Miguel told us about his grandmother, related to one of the nine, who broke contact with her daughter; her husband was politically right orientated.⁷⁰ Nowadays the youth feels free to date whom they want, they believe that dating someone with a different political background is no longer a taboo. The following example reveals the interaction between different generations on the matter of importance given to political backgrounds: A politically left orientated mother has a daughter who has a relation with someone who is politically right orientated. Her daughter and boyfriend have opposing political backgrounds, but both of them do not care about that. The mother respects her daughter's choice and likes her daughter's boyfriend, but they do not talk about the past

⁶⁴ Luis Miguel's old aunt, unstructured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

⁶⁵ Manolí, semi-structured interview, 02-04-2013, Chillón.

⁶⁶ Inocenta, unstructured interview, 30-03-2013, Almadén.

⁶⁷ An older man, semi-structured interview, 12-03-2013, Chillón.

⁶⁸ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁶⁹ Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

⁷⁰ Luis Miguel, unstructured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

with each other. When we asked the daughter if her boyfriend would be interested in talking with us for our research, she responded positively and told us she would ask his mother as well. The mother immediately interfered and told her daughter that it was not appropriate to ask such a thing.⁷¹ This conversation reflects the difference between the older and younger generation when it comes to handling political issues; the youth does not care about it and believes it not to be a problem. The older generation has become milder when it comes to friendships and interfamilial relations between people with different political backgrounds, they feel comfortable with it as long as they do not engage in conversations about the Francoist past in relation to politics.

We will further elaborate on the political situation in Spain and Chillón in chapter eight. We now continue with the way people in Chillón talked and communicated with each other about the Francoist past before the exhumation was carried out was carried out. This is according to what our informants told us about it. We found the exhumation practice to have the greatest impact on all generations of all recovering memory practices that took place. We start out with this, because it is important to know how people in Chillón dealt with and talked about the Francoist past, before the exhumation, in order to understand what the impact of the exhumation was in Chillón concerning the recovering of memory.

Before the Exhumation

The past was silenced by the government, through *'el pacto del olvido'*, during the period of transition. Ramsbotham (2005:244) stated that cultural aspects; as media, education and collective memory, imposed by the government, are important aspects in dealing with a troubled past. In Spain, Chillón, this has been quite opposite. Luis Miguel and others have told us that efforts by the government, concerning the Francoist past, through media or education systems have been minimal. This shows that not much attention was paid to the Francoist past in public. But lacking attention or actual silence about this topic did not result in the political death of memory in Spain, this is in line with what Igreja (2008:540) stated about the past; its revival is unavoidable. As Manolí explained to us; *'what hurts, still hurts and that is something you cannot just forget'*.⁷²

Our informants told us it was a taboo to talk about it in public; this taboo came from decades of fear to talk about this topic. People did talk about it within the household sometimes. Maruja and Anastasia, two old sisters, told us that talking about the Francoist past reminds them of a bad period in history which they rather forget. They talked within the household about these topics sometimes with their children, but not often, because the Franco period was a difficult time for them. They, and others, have told us that they had to focus on surviving and dealing with hunger, instead of talking

⁷¹ Mother and daughter, informal conversation, 02-04-2013, Chillón.

⁷² Manolí, semi-structured interview, 02-04-2013, Chillón.

about the things that had happened.⁷³ David, a young historian, told us that the older generation avoided talking about what happened in front of their children, out of protection; so that their children would not be able to talk about it in the streets with their friends, which could jeopardize their own safety.⁷⁴ When talking with their grandparents, some of our young informants experienced their grandparents being scared, or not completely open about the past. David tried talking about it with his grandmother, but she only shared what she wanted to share; *'maybe it is a painful subject for them'* (his grandparents).⁷⁵ Inocenta, daughter of one of the nine, told us about her brother, who died a few years ago at the age of 97. Even after so many years, he still felt the pain and fear every day, he died with this fear.⁷⁶ After the Franco regime had ended the older generations still did not like to talk about their memories on a political level with their children and grandchildren. Manuel, a middle-aged man, told us his grand-parents shared a lot of stories with him about the past and how they lived during the Franco era, but they always left out the political aspect. The fact that they avoided political terms does not mean they did not refer to their political opinions, as Manuel told us:

'My grandparents talked about what happened in the village with indirect political statements, they talked about bad people and bad things that happened because of those people. I knew who they were talking about, but for them it was a taboo to directly refer to people and their actions in political terms'.

Even though they did not refer to a specific political side, Manuel knew exactly what they were telling him.⁷⁷ Their way of telling him about what happened reveals their present day attitude towards the past, his grandparents transmitted their stories without direct political statements, but their real political opinion shimmers through. We can agree with Labanyi (2008:122) that the way memory is transmitted reveals present day attitudes towards the past.

The in-between generation did not often talk about the Francoist past with their parents in their youth, because their parents did not really want to talk about it. As they grew older, during the transition into democracy a 'forced silence' was implemented by the government (Viejo-Rose 2011:469). Jose-Luis, Santiago's son, explained that a lot of things he knows about the Francoist past he learned from manifestations in the streets, because of the political change during the transition. He also talked about it with his father, who is very open in talking about this which is exceptional for

⁷³ Maruja and Anastasia, semi-structured interview, semi-structured interview, 15-03-2013, Chillón.

⁷⁴ David 2, semi-structured interview, 08-03-2013, Chillón.

⁷⁵ David 2, semi-structured interview, 08-03-2013, Chillón.

⁷⁶ Inocenta, unstructured interview, 30-03-2013, Almaden.

⁷⁷ Manuel, semi-structured interview, 01-04-2013, Chillón.

a man his age.⁷⁸ For the in-between generation it is easier to talk with the younger generation than it is for the older generation. Marí explained this: *'I don't feel the fear as much, I can talk about it with my children, but my parents still have a lot of fear.'*⁷⁹

The youngest generation did not know a lot about the Francoist past before the exhumations. Most of them received their information through their parents and grandparents; depending on what they wanted to tell them about it. Julian, a twenty year old guy, mentioned that he did not learn about the Francoist past in schools, because they only talked about the past in general.

*'They do talk about the past sometimes in school, but never about what happened over here in Chillón. I only know about stories my grandmother told me when I was young, about what happened to her brother (who is one of the nine) and living conditions during the Franco era.'*⁸⁰

Roque, from a politically right orientated family, did ask questions to his parents about the Francoist past when he was younger. His parents told him stories about his family's lives during the Franco era, but they never spoke about the political division or tensions within the village at that time. His family did not feel the need to share their memories of that time with him; they wanted to leave the past behind them. He mentioned that he did not acquire his knowledge of the Francoist past by talking to his parents; *'All that I know, I know because of the people I talked with in this village'*. He clearly felt a personal need to require more information than his parents shared with him about the past, this is why he turned to other people to talk about it.⁸¹ The idea of politically right people being opposed to the recovering of the Francoist past, as we found out, stems from the political opinion of the PP concerning the recovering of memory. These political views towards the recovering of memory will be further elaborated in the next chapter.

The younger people in the village who did not have the opportunity to talk with their grandparents about what happened in the past are depended on their parents to tell them everything they know. Rafael, who is such a guy, mentioned that; *'I only know about the things my grandparents have told to my parents'*.⁸² Again, the importance of the in between-generation as mediators between the personally lived past and the inherited past (Goertz 1998:34-35) has been emphasized.

⁷⁸ Jose-Luis, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

⁷⁹ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁰ Julian, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁸¹ Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

⁸² Rafael, semi-structured interview, 04-04-2013, Chillón.

After the Exhumation

The exhumation provided more information and clarity about what happened during the Franco period in Chillón, in specific about what happened to the nine. The book about the lives of the nine had already provided some information about their lives, but did not shed light on how they died and the impact it had on their relatives; this information was not available yet. We found the information that could be derived from the exhumation proved to be a stronger trigger to start talking about the Francoist past than the book was. Talking about the past and what happened to the nine moved from within the household towards the streets. Manuel mentioned that the exhumation made people talk about the past more than before. Before the exhumation, people in this village almost never talked about the Francoist past in everyday conversations or in public at all. During the exhumation people became curious and started to talk about what happened in this village during the post-Guerra a little bit more.⁸³ The fear that existed to talk about the past and politics had diminished since the transition period.

Even though the exhumation brought more openness and clarity concerning the Francoist past, a lot of people from the oldest generation are still afraid to talk about this topic. As Marí explained to us, it was still a closed era for them.⁸⁴ Joselita, an old lady, mentioned that the pain and fear is becoming less with every new generation, because their relation with the Francoist past becomes less and less strong.⁸⁵

The in-between generation is a crucial generation for the transmittance of memories from their parents to their children. They can be seen as a key mediator between these generations. They now possess more information about what happened, information they did not have before. Marí told us that she talked about the Francoist past before with her children, but after the exhumation there came more openness about this topic and therefore she was able to tell more about it.⁸⁶ Her daughter, Cristina, confirmed this:

'We all know about the history of Chillón, but we never spoke about what really happened because nobody knew what really happened. When they started digging, the earth itself started to reveal more about what happened, people became more curious and started talking more'.⁸⁷

⁸³ Manuel, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁴ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁵ Joselita, unstructured interview, 11-03-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁶ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁷ Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013, Chillón.

The lack of information about what 'really' happened indicates that the youth was not able to know everything about their local history because the information simply could not be provided. The information, provided by the exhumation was needed to construct a 'more complete' narrative around these deaths. The younger generation was triggered by the exhumation to get to know more about what happened and their curiosity about this period in history grew which stimulated conversations about the past. That exhumations elicit storytelling (Ferrándiz 2008a:1) is true according to our findings. People started to talk more about what happened and the bodies in themselves made this possible. *'Being able to see the distance between the corpses within the grave and their positioning revealed a lot about how they were killed and in which order'*.⁸⁸ Bodies revealing what happened in the past make them able to transcend time, which we found to be in line with what Verdery (1999:27) stated. It also corresponds with the fact bodies are evidently able to help people create a full account of the narratives around their deaths as Robben indicated (in Renshaw 2010:51).

The triggered interest of the younger generation who attended the exhumation resulted in talking more about the past. It also triggered some of our informants of the younger generation to pick up the book again to actually read the stories behind the pictures and the bones, this time. Carmen, a young girl, mentioned that she read the book before the exhumation, only partially though. During the exhumation she picked it up again to read about the nine prior to their death more carefully. Maria-Jesus, a young girl who studied history, emphasized that the stories in the book did not affect her as much as the exhumation; *'the narratives did not bring me closer to the past, the exhumation did'*.⁸⁹ The impact of witnessing an exhumation as discussed in chapter six triggers the younger generation's interest in the past. Manuel also noticed this grown interest the younger generation experienced during the exhumation, but a while after the exhumation this interest decreased again.

*'Directly after the exhumation we again collectively forgot what happened and what we had talked about and with whom. You could say there was a brief moment of revival of the past in the present, but directly after the exhumation we went on with our daily lives like nothing happened. We still do not talk about the past more than we used to do before the exhumation.'*⁹⁰

⁸⁸ Emilio, semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

⁸⁹ Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013 and Carmen & Maria-Jesus, unstructured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁰ Manuel, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

This is an interesting aspect for us, concerning the temporality of history. As long as historic elements are present physically and mentally, in Chillón the presence of a mass grave, it reminds people of the past.

Importance of Memory Transmittance

According to Marí, a 'never-again-feeling' was triggered by the exhumation; it reminded people of what had happened and made them realize that they never wanted this to happen again.⁹¹ In Spain, and therefore Chillón as well, the transmittance of memories of the Francoist past has to deal with time pressure. Soon there will be no more living eye-witnesses (Labanyi 2008:119). *'The younger generation does not know enough about the past to care about it and preserve it'*.⁹²

There are different opinions among our older informants whether it is important for the youth to know about the Francoist past. Julí is of the opinion that it is very important to talk with other people, especially of younger generations; history should be brought to light and people should have no fear anymore to talk about this topic.⁹³ Marí is of the opinion that it is important that the youth knows about the Francoist past, because:

'Remembering what happened to prevent it from happening again in the future (...) not forgetting what happened is important so it will not happen again. A return to violence is not the intention (...) it is meant to create peace and quiet'.⁹⁴

Marí's opinion goes in line with Loureiro (2008:228) who emphasized that what matters about the past has its effects on the present. Santiago emphasized that in order to move forward people should be *'forgetting the hatred and focussing on the goodness'*.⁹⁵ This goes in line with the theory Ramsbotham (2005:234) has concerning dealing with the past; looking at a shared future instead of a troubled past. On the other hand some of our informants have different ideas concerning the transmittance of memory. An older man who did not want to reveal his political preferences mentioned; *'Let us forget the bad period in history and not talk about it'*.⁹⁶ For this reason he did not share his memories of the Francoist past with his children. Another older man, who is politically left orientated, and a middle-aged woman, who is politically right orientated, share the opinion that it is important for the youth to know about the Francoist past, but this should not be seen as a specific topic; more as history in general.^{97 98} We conclude from this that they do not think memories of the

⁹¹ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹² Manuel, unstructured interview, 01-04-2013, Chillón.

⁹³ Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁴ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁵ Santiago, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁶ An older man, semi-structured interview, 15-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁷ An older man, semi-structured interview, 07-03-2013, Chillón.

⁹⁸ A middle-aged woman, semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

Francoist past to be of particular importance, they have become part of the general history of Spain; this indicates that the temporality of this particular history is forthcoming.

Some of our informants of the younger generation also stated it as important to know about the Francoist past. Manoli believes that it is important to tell her future children about the past, and share the stories she heard. This is the least she can do to keep the awareness of the past alive.⁹⁹ Rafael and Manuel agree with Marí that it is important the youth knows about the Francoist past in order not to make the same mistake again in the future.¹⁰⁰ *'If we don't know our history, it can repeat itself'*.¹⁰¹ There are also informants who think that it is better to turn the page on the past and look at the future. Roque was very clear about this:

'Young people are getting tired of hearing about the past all the time, there are still people who publicly say and think in terms of: these are the good guys and these are the bad guys. This is getting old and we need to move forward, that is how we, the young people, feel'.¹⁰²

The way he stated this indicated that he feels very strongly about the still ongoing monochrome political way of looking at 'good' vs. 'bad'. Rafael cited the importance of generational transmittance of information: *'The younger generation does not know as much as the older generation knows; only when their parents have shared this information with them they are more aware of Chillón's history'*.¹⁰³ These examples underscore the importance of these family histories in the recovering of memory, because other sources to draw information from are scarce. When parents or grandparents choose not to tell their children and grandchildren about the past they will not develop an awareness of the Francoist past and this history will eventually fall into oblivion. Repeatedly mentioned phrases were; *'this history will be forgotten by a lot of people'* and *'this history will get lost over time'*.^{104 105}

⁹⁹ Manoli, semi-structured interview, 15-03-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰⁰ Rafael, semi-structured interview, 04-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰¹ Manuel, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰² Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰³ Rafael, semi-structured interview, 04-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰⁴ Manuel semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰⁵ Julian, Semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

Recovering Memory of the Francoist Past in Present Debates

Previously we focussed on various practices concerning the recovering of memory and in particular the exhumation that was carried out in 2011 and the way people experienced these practices, look back on it and the way it shaped their opinions about it. We found that their opinions are not only shaped by these practices and the way people talk or remain silent about the past within or outside the household, but also by the existing political discourse surrounding the recovering of memory. So before we continue with the current opinions our informants obtained about the continuation of recovering memory practices and the future responsibility question, we will start out by showing how the political discourse has its effect on people's current opinions as well as on the recovering memory practices.

Political Discourse Surrounding the Recovering of Memory

Law of Historic Memory

As mentioned before, in 2007 the PSOE implemented the '*Ley de la Memoria Historica*'.¹⁰⁶ One of the aspects of this law was creating a possibility to carry out exhumations. A lot of our informants have never even heard of this law. Luis Miguel explained to us that even though a lot of people might not have heard of this law, they have noticed the effects this law has had; without this law it would have been more difficult to carry out exhumations.¹⁰⁷ The focus on the recovering of memory will lie on documenting the truth and restoring the dignity of the victims and their relatives (Encarnación 2008:435). The exhumations are inseparably linked to the recovering of memory and the political situation, because the fact that the nine died a political death cannot be overlooked. Jeronimo pointed out to us that the ARMH was of great importance in order to make the exhumations happen. And vice versa, the ARMH needed this law of historic memory; it has been the backbone of the organization, it made it possible to carry out this amount of exhumations throughout Spain.¹⁰⁸

The intentions of this law have been questioned; in particular by people from the right. Roque was specific about the tension that this law provoked. '*There was moment of tension, with the law, people just started to live well together. We were scared that this law would divide Spain again, because we started talking again like: who killed whom and who were the ones killed. People did not like this*'.¹⁰⁹ By mentioning that people just started to live well together he indicates that Spain was heading in the direction of no longer talking in terms of 'we' vs. 'them'; politically left vs. politically right. This is in line with what Ramsbotham (2005:232) called the process of re-humanization,

¹⁰⁶ '*Ley de la Memoria Historica*': Law of Historic Memory.

¹⁰⁷ Luis Miguel, semi-structured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰⁸ Jeronimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁰⁹ Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

restoring relationships that were damaged after civil war. Roque used this re-humanization accomplishment as a notification that things were going well, but this was threatened by this law according to him. The amnesty law implemented in 1977, was an attempt to create an 'us' within Spain (Rigby 2000:77), the law of recovering memory is doing exactly the opposite according to Roque.

A middle-aged man who is politically right orientated explained his point of view on how the PP and PSOE use the recovering of memory as a political move to mobilize members. In his opinion the PP does not support this law in order to preserve their members; especially for their members who do not want to dig up the Francoist past. Vice versa, the PSOE wanted to gain more followers by implementing this law to recover memories of the Francoist past. He asked us a critical question; *'Why did the PSOE not carry out the exhumations before?'* With this question he implied that the intention of the PSOE was a political move. He is also of the opinion that this law only serves people from the left side, according to him they only wanted to exhume bodies and recover the memory of the left side.¹¹⁰ David, who works for the ARMH, argued this point of view by explaining that the law is meant for both sides. According to him, the ARMH tries to recover historic memory and carry out exhumations in general, without political preferences.¹¹¹ The thing is however that a lot of assassinated from the political right had already been exhumed during the Franco period; right after the civil war. Therefore a lot of the exhumations nowadays are in favor of the Republicans.

Marí emphasized that especially under the younger generations the feeling of 'us' versus 'them' is less strong than for older generation, because the political background is less linked to its Francoist past for the younger generation.¹¹² According to Carmen and Maria-Jesus this has to do with the general disinterest of the younger generation in the Francoist past and in politics.¹¹³ Especially the younger generation believes that a political division cannot occur again, at least not only because of this law and the exhumations that can be carried out because of this law.

David, a young historian, explained his point of view very well; *'If it does happen, the two Spains, it is not because of the mass graves and for this past. It will be for other reasons, like the economic crisis or political motivations. These are much stronger then exhuming people who died 75 years ago'*.¹¹⁴ Because of the contemporary 'stable' political condition in democratic Spain, it is believed that the people are capable of carrying the burden of memories and dealing with their past

¹¹⁰ A middle-aged man, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹¹¹ David (ARMH), informal conversation, 13-04-2013, Almadén.

¹¹² Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

¹¹³ Carmen & Maria-Jesus, unstructured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

¹¹⁴ David (2), semi-structured interview, 08-03-2013, Chillón.

(Brounéus 2003:12 and Encarnación 2008:456). Our informants do not fully agree with this, that Spain is in a more 'stable' condition, they believe Spain to be in another situation than 70 years ago.

Recovering of Memory by Means of Exhumations

Concerning the issue of the recovering of memory, including the exhumations, the PP and PSOE differ a lot. The PSOE has implemented this law which is not supported by the PP. A remark has to be placed here however; the division between the PP and the PSOE in the government is different than within a small village, such as Chillón. The PP in the government is not willing to support the recovering of memory, because, as Melhor explained, it would feel for them as admitting they have done something wrong.¹¹⁵ This indicates that the political background of these parties, the clear political division between left and right, presents itself when it comes to discussing themes concerning the recovering the past. Right now the PP is ruling within the government and they do not financially support the law of historic memory, because of the economic crisis and their political stance towards recovering the past. Therefore this law becomes empty, as David (who is working with the ARMH), Santiago and several others have called it.^{116 117} When there is no financial support, the only thing this law does is showing the outside world that the government of Spain is involved in the recovering of memory, but does not actively do something with it. On a more local level the PP and PSOE are getting along pretty well. An older man, who used to work in the town hall, explained that the PP was not very enthusiastic when they heard the plans of the exhumation in Chillón, but they did not try to stop it either.¹¹⁸

Even though, or maybe because of, everyone knows each other in such a small village there were people who did not want to talk with us at all, especially people from the political right orientated side. This shows that there still is some political tension present nowadays in this small village. Even though Brouneús (2003:12) and Encarnación (2008:456) have stated that the people in Spain are capable to deal with their past, in our opinion not everyone is ready to deal with it publicly. Luis-Miguel confirmed this by stating the reason why people from the political right are not willing to talk about the past. *'They feel like they are not able to defend "their side", they are afraid of being accused for things they are not directly accountable for and therefore avoid the subject'*.¹¹⁹ This shows that even though the law was implemented for both sides, some people feel that recovering memory processes are politically charged and they still feel that confronting the past and looking into the past might reopen old divisions (Encarnación 2008:447). We experienced for ourselves that we could not talk about everything concerning the recovering of memory, we had to take into account

¹¹⁵ Melhor, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹¹⁶ David (ARMH), unstructured interview, 11-02-2013, on the way to Cordoba.

¹¹⁷ Santiago, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

¹¹⁸ An older man, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹¹⁹ Luis-Miguel, semi-structured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

the political sensitivity concerning this topic. At first it seemed that the people from this village were dealing openly with their past, but we found that not everything is out in the open, there are still things left unsaid and unknown. For example a middle-aged man we talked with told us that he was politically left orientated, but other people from the village we spoke with had told us he was politically right. We had the feeling he was not completely open about his political preferences, this underscores the statement we made before; about the taboo concerning publicly revealing political preferences.¹²⁰ David, the young historian, believes that people who are afraid to talk about the past and politics in public are 'separatists', which means that those people think that Spain still runs the risk to become divided among political lines again.¹²¹

The above discussed political and economic situation within Spain and Chillón helps understand the present day opinions towards recovering memory practices, especially towards exhumations and how these are influenced by the current economic and political situation.

Present Day Views

Opinions towards Recovering Memory and Exhumations

In the previous chapters we described how people experienced and thought about the recovering of memory in Chillón. In this part we will describe how people look back upon and feel about the exhumation and the recovering of memory in general; what their current opinion is on the matter, if it occupies their minds and if they feel the need to continue with such practices, in Chillón and elsewhere in Spain, or not.

The exhumation provided people from the older generation with a form of closure regarding the Francoist past. For example Julí, as has been mentioned before, felt very fortunate to know where her uncle was now; *'but at the same time I felt very sad, because I know a lot of people in Spain are not so fortunate to know where their family is'*.¹²² She thinks that the recovering of memory can never be fulfilled as long as there are still people who do not know where their family is. This indicates that she believes that what happened in Chillón should also be possible for other families. The fact that she herself is related to one of the nine makes her think about other families who might want need closure as well. For some it is still too difficult and they have too many painful memories to talk about the past. For example Luis Miguel's old aunt still has to cry every time she thinks or talks about the nine, to whom she was related.¹²³ Santiago told us that he thinks that without closure regarding the past it is impossible to move forward, therefore it is important to continue with the

¹²⁰ A middle-aged man, semi-structured interview, 15-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²¹ David 2, semi-structured interview, 08-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²² Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²³ Luis Miguel's old aunt, unstructured interview, 09-04-2013, Chillón.

exhumations and for the younger generations to know about what happened.¹²⁴ Marí sees the exhumation as a step towards the recovering of memory; she thinks it is a good lesson for humanity and the youth to learn from it. Therefore she still thinks it is important that the youth is aware and learns about the Francoist past, not only during the exhumation.¹²⁵ Others, for example two older men, are of the opinion that talking about it is not good for the relations between people, concerning different political views.¹²⁶ They are afraid that talking about the Francoist past might divide people among the political division.

As we mentioned briefly in the previous chapter; the exhumation induced a short peak in the interest of the youth towards the Francoist past, but this interest decreased after the exhumation and ceremony were over. Manuel told us that: *'Currently we do not talk about this theme more than we did before'*.¹²⁷ With this he implies that the impact of recovering memory and especially an exhumation is only temporarily active when looking at the younger generation. At the time of the exhumation they got mentally involved, because the exhumation left visual impressions in their minds. These visual impressions occupied their minds for a while, but after a while this wore off and they continued with their normal lives. The interest in recovering memory, during the exhumation, turned out to be of a transitory nature. Even though they lost interest in learning more about the Francoist past after the effect of the exhumation wore off, it does not indicate that they did not value the exhumation process in itself. When looking back upon the experience of witnessing the exhumation they all remembered how impressive they found it; seeing the corpses and the artifacts, seeing people become emotional, seeing people mourn and seeing people sharing stories about the nine and about the impact of their death on family members *'(...) it was incredible to witness'*.¹²⁸

Besides their own experience of witnessing the event, when looking back they emphasize the meaning the exhumation had for family members. Cristina experienced the exhumation as something very important for the older people and relatives of the nine. She sees it as something that was interesting for the younger generation for a while, but now that it is over, it is over.

*'For the older people it is very important, very important that they are at the cemetery now, because of the knowledge they are there instead of at the countryside. To me, it's not that important. It seems like a good thing to me that they are now closer to the village. Especially for families, it gives them inner peace.'*¹²⁹

¹²⁴ Santiago, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²⁵ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²⁶ Two older men, semi-structured interview, 15-03-2013, Chillón.

¹²⁷ Manuel, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹²⁸ Emilio, semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

¹²⁹ Cristina, semi-structured interview, 21-02-2013, Chillón.

We found that the younger generation is able to separate their own interest in the exhumation, which was founded on curiosity, from the interest and needs of directly related family-members and people from the older generation.

Responsibility

Whether the exhumations are something that should be seen as a political or more of a family matter is indecisive. Some are of the opinion that the exhumation should be, politically spoken, seen detached from its past. For example Santiago and his son think it would be good if the PP and PSOE work together on the recovering of memory and exhumations, and deal with it as a shared past, in order to overcome their division.¹³⁰

These different opinions come down to the issue of responsibility. McEvoy & McConnachie (2012:531-532) and Scheper-Hughes & Bourgois (2004:83-90) have stated that the line between the 'good' and 'bad' is difficult to draw; the so called 'grey zone'. Our informants mentioned that this line is not that difficult to draw within Chillón. The nine were the only ones from the village who were assassinated, they died a political death and therefore it was clear which political side was responsible for their deaths. Our informants mentioned they did not focus on who was responsible for the past atrocities; it is better to leave that in the past. Given the fact that looking at who was responsible has become irrelevant, it is considered better to focus on who is responsible now for dealing with the past. There are different opinions concerning the responsibility to recover memory and carry out exhumations. Almost all of our informants think the government should take more responsibility. For example Julí and Paulí think this is not something they can leave to private organizations or families.¹³¹ Jeronimo agrees with this opinion; right now, families who want to exhume their relatives do not receive the support from the government they should get.¹³² As Suzuki (2012:203) explained, that when states do not help victims to find closure, sometimes non-state attempts might help. Sometimes it is important that the government helps out as well, because there is only so much a non-state organization can do.

David, who works for the ARMH, thinks that the ARMH does a good job, but they could do better when there would be a national database of who is looking for relatives and where people are located. At the moment this is only known per region, therefore it is impossible for some relatives to find their family back. He is of the opinion that the government should be more involved to make this process nationwide.¹³³ Marí and Santiago think it would be good if the PP and PSOE would work on

¹³⁰ Santiago and Jose-Luis, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

¹³¹ Julí and Paulí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

¹³² Jeronimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

¹³³ David (ARMH), unstructured interview, 11-02-2013, on the way to Cordoba.

this together.^{134 135} A good start in the recovering of memory would be that the PP and PSOE would work together is what they both said. These opinions are consistent with what Ramsbotham (2005:234) mentioned about looking at the past; a crucial aspect of looking at the past is looking together at a shared future instead of a troubled past.

Some people from the younger generation do not agree on the point that recovering memory practices should become a shared event on governmental and political level, but do agree on the point that they should support it. Roque was very critical about the political aspect of the exhumations. He believed the exhumation was too politically charged; there was too much political publicity which created a sort of hype. He does believe families have the right to rebury their relatives, but in a more intimate way. In his eyes the responsibility, to request an exhumation, should lie with the family-members, the government has to grant them permission to do this and when the economic situation stabilizes the government should also provide them with financial support.¹³⁶

Overall a lot of our informants of the younger generation think of the exhumations as something that was good for the families and it would be a good thing to continue with it in order to help out families who are looking for their relatives. At the same time they imply the difficulties, because of the political and economic situation and they themselves do not have the interest to get actively involved to get this going. Sara and Marita agree that the responsibility to continue with exhumations lies with the family-members. As Sara and Marita stated; *'We do not have family members that died during the Franco era and did not experience it for ourselves.'* They do not have confidence in the government, as long as the PP is in charge, nothing in favor of these families is going to happen in their eyes.¹³⁷ Emilio agrees with this point of view and added the current economic situation as well: *'Right now, in this situation, our country is unable to help out... financially that is.'*¹³⁸

Future Role for Younger Generations

According to our informants the responsibility to inform younger generations about the past lies with the family and older generations, since not a lot is done with it through education or media. Younger generations blame their 'not-knowing' on the older generations and the lack of attention by educational institutions; they were not properly educated about it. Julí thinks that the younger generations nowadays have the opportunity, possibility and freedom to create more openness concerning this topic.¹³⁹

¹³⁴ Marí, semi-structured interview, 01-03-2013, Chillón.

¹³⁵ Santiago, semi-structured interview, 26-03-2013, Chillón.

¹³⁶ Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹³⁷ Sara and Marita, semi-structured interview, 20-03-2013, Chillón.

¹³⁸ Emilio semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

¹³⁹ Julí, semi-structured interview, 06-03-2013, Chillón.

However, there is not a lot of confidence in the youth; they are looked upon as a generation that does not show any interest in becoming actively involved in recovering memory practices. Melhor nuanced this idea by mentioning that: *'they are not stupid, not one bit (...) If they want to do something with it they can, but it will be in a different way than we did it though.'*¹⁴⁰ Emilio and Roque believe that Spain has to change the entire political body; the youth needs to step up and take more responsibility to start changing things. Directly after that they stated that it is almost impossible for young people to do that, because the older corrupt people make sure that young motivated people will be cut off from any form of power.^{141 142} Changing things on a political level is deemed impossible and at the least a time consuming process, which the recovering memory process cannot afford.

The younger generation believes the recovering memory process, concerning exhumations, to be something families should be responsible for. It is not the entire younger population who needs to do something with it, only the ones related to assassinated people. Roque says:

*'I do not believe that in the future they will continue to recover memory, because the youth is more interested in living the life they have now. I believe the interest in the recovery of memory will decrease with time, the organizations who deal with the recovering of memory might still exist but they will become smaller. The only reason why these organizations will remain intact is because of the families, who want their help with exhuming their family members.'*¹⁴³

A lot of our informants are of the opinion that in the near future the recovering of memories will not continue; there are two different aspects that are crucial in this case. One of them is not enough interest; especially from the youngest generations. As soon as the physical presence of the exhumation was over, the interest in recovering memory decreased as well. There are still some attempts to keep the past alive in the present. Each year on the 1st of May there is a ceremony to commemorate and remember the nine. The next step in the recovering of memory is the plan for a continuation on the book by Jerónimo and Luis Miguel.¹⁴⁴ We will discuss these coming recovering memory practices further in our concluding remarks. The other aspect is a political and economic one. With the economic crisis, there is no money to invest in recovering memory practices, or at least the government does not want to invest any. The PP is in the government and they are not that interested in recovering memory practices.

¹⁴⁰ Melhor, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁴¹ Emilio, semi-structured interview, 05-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁴² Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁴³ Roque, semi-structured interview, 08-04-2013, Chillón.

¹⁴⁴ Luis Miguel, informal conversation, 14-04-2013, Chillón and Jeronimo, semi-structured interview, 12-04-2013, Chillón.

Concluding Remarks

During our fieldwork we found the interaction between the different generations proved to be predominant. Therefore our research focused on the interaction between the young, in-between and old generation. In our empirical chapters we have already intertwined our findings concerning these different generations and linked them to the theoretical concepts we used. In our concluding remarks we will discuss the contemporary debates surrounding memory recovery in relation to our findings. We will also give an answer to our main question: *'How do people from different generations, living in Chillón, Spain, recall the various practices concerned with recovering memories of the Francoist past and how did these practices shape their present opinions concerning the revival of this past in the present?'*

In our theoretical framework we mentioned the difficulty of reconciliation after a civil war. According to Ramsbotham (2005:244) dealing with such a past needs to be done through several cultural aspects: media, education, everyday experiences and collective and individual memory. In Chillón, the Francoist past was not a topic to be discussed in the media or at school. The collective memory about the Francoist past has been suppressed for a long period of time by the government. The only way of transmittance took place within the family and was based on personal memories; this way of transmittance was different per family and generation. Silencing this past did not make people forget what happened; this has been proved by recovering memory practices that have taken place in Chillón since 1987 which started with the placing of the monolith. Practices to recover memories from the Francoist past, which took place within the public sphere in Chillón, all revolved around the nine, their life stories and their burial site. Since there has not been a lot of attention for the Francoist past in the Spanish media nor at schools, we focused on recovering memory practices that have been carried out in Chillón and the way people speak and have spoken about these practices with each other.

We want to emphasize the incredible amount of time that passed before recovering memory efforts concerning the nine could take place. We found out that the location of the nine played a crucial role in preserving this possibility. Information about the approximate location of the mass grave was preserved for almost fifty years by people from the older generations who deemed this location important to remember and eventually transmit their knowledge about it onto younger generations, so that something could be done with it when the time was considered right. The site of *'El Contadero'* proved to be a historically significant place, therefore we agree with Schramm (2011:16) who mentioned the importance of landscapes in keeping the past linked to the present. With the placing of the monolith it also became a site of recognition and commemoration. People

from the older generation marked the building of the monolith as a starting point for the commemoration of the nine. After the monolith was placed, every first of May they would go there with their children and some years later with their grandchildren to commemorate the nine. The younger generation remembers their parents taking them to this yearly commemoration. Even though they all knew who they commemorated, they never really knew much about the people they commemorated. Some parents told their children something about that period and about the story of the nine. They heard about these stories, but could not relate to it, they were just stories.

Different ways of relating to the past also came forward in how different generations responded to the book. The older generation was interested in the book because it commemorated the lives of the nine; it was seen as a tribute, especially by family members. The in-between generation was interested in it because they wanted to learn about the lives of the nine; in order to relate to the stories their parents told them about this period. The younger generation only showed partial interest, they looked at the pictures to see who the nine were and randomly chose parts they glanced over. The placing of the monolith and the publication of the book proved to be of more importance for the older and in-between generations; it gave them some recognition and made public commemoration possible after a lot of years. We found the exhumation to be a next step of crucial importance to recover more information, truth, about what had happened to the nine. The way people recalled this practice showed us that it left the greatest impression on our informants.

It was not until the exhumation that people actually started talking about these topics more publicly; outside the household. We think this means that the physical presence of the bones and the visual aspect of the exhumation played a crucial role in the growing interest in recovering memories of the Francoist past. Especially for the younger generation, previously to the exhumation it was very difficult for them to imagine what the Francoist period must have been like; the exhumation made this past more accessible. On these points we agree with Fernandez (2011:344) that by looking at the past through visual means the illusion of accessibility arises and Ferrándiz (2008 b:5) that an open mass grave tells a story about what happened. We found that witnessing the exhumation made the Francoist past come closer for our younger informants; they were triggered to find out what happened to the nine, because the image of seeing them in the grave occupied their minds at that time. Not much has been written about this visual aspect, so we would like to emphasize that this aspect created accessibility; especially for our younger informants.

The exhumation and ceremony increased the interest of the younger generation in the Francoist past only for a brief moment, because as soon as the physical presence of the mass grave was gone, their interest decreased as well. We can conclude from this that their interest in this past was of transitory nature. The meaning of the exhumation and ceremony was different for other generations. For the in-between generation it meant more clarity and openness about the period

their parents had lived in. The Francoist past had been silenced for a long time and therefore they had never really known what their parents had gone through. For the oldest generation it meant mainly a form of closure with this past, especially for family of the nine. Their relatives were finally at peace at the cemetery. Another important issue for the in-between and oldest generation was that they could see that the youngest generation showed interest in the Francoist past; a past these older generations had lived through. Even though the experience of the exhumation, ceremony and the other previous recovering memory practices, has been different for each generation, it brought these generations together. The recovering of the Francoist past became socially shared, because they started to exchange stories and to talk about it more openly with each other, which created more understanding. Before the exhumation a lot was left unsaid, because much was unknown. After the exhumation this changed, because the older generation and their children, from the in-between generation, got to know more about what happened and could tell more about it to their children. This way their children developed more interest and willingness to know about it. This shows that the in-between generation plays a crucial role in the transmittance of memories of the past; they are the sites of mediation, as has been mentioned by Goertz (1998:34-35) as well.

The ceremony of the reburial made it possible for families to have some inner peace, because of the knowledge that the nine are at the cemetery of Chillón now; closer to the village. This has been described as a more humane way to treat people than leaving them in a random place in the countryside like dogs. The visual aspect of reburial is necessary in order to be able to get closure and mourn (Renshaw 2010:50). For the younger generation the ceremony was an addition to the exhumation, but did not leave such a strong impression as the exhumation did.

An important aspect to keep in mind is the importance of the political situation in Spain and the political preferences people have. We found that the people living in Chillón often referred to the political situation during the Francoist era while revealing their sentiments and opinions to us concerning the recovering of memory. Their present day opinions are still being influenced by their former political sentiments; people believe the recovering of memory has become a political issue on governmental level, because of the parties' still-existing links with their political past. The difference between the older, in-between and younger generation is how and when they refer to political sentiments and the value they give to political differences. The oldest generation experienced the strong political division which dominated their lives during the Francoist past. This is why their political sentiments and preferences shimmer through when transmitting personal stories onto the younger generation. They also value the political background people have very much, some of them only talk about the Francoist past with people who share the same political view. The in-between generation only refers to the political division when they refer to the stories their parents told them and the way they feel these tensions can be still seen within the village among the older generation.

By not talking about political issues with other people who have different political ideas they avoid having discussions and confrontations. The younger generation knows about the political division but only refers to it when they talk about the exhumation. The political background someone has does not play a role for the younger generation. Political backgrounds become less and less important with each new generation. The contemporary debate is about whether or not these practices would revive old sentiments and therefore lead to another political division within Spain, even after all these years. We feel that recovering memory makes people talk about and maybe even discuss the past political division, but this is not able to cause the revival of past political sentiments in a way that it can create a political division within Spain again.

Some of our informants did question the political intentions of the recovering memory practices. The fact that the nine died a political death cannot be overlooked; this is why the implementation of the law provoked tension between politically left and right orientated parties, and people. Some people were afraid of a revival of the 'we' vs. 'them' situation, instead of the created 'us' sentiment. The in-between generation has been and still is the most critical about the intentions of the law and the work of the ARMH, because they question their political agenda. The political discourse, by people who are politically right orientated, surrounding the work of the ARMH and the law of historic memory implemented by the PSOE is based upon the believe that recovering memory practices are only meant for people from the politically left site and that they see it indirectly as an accusation towards the politically right. According to people from the political left, this is not the case, and recovering of memories is meant for everyone, regardless political preferences. Most people we spoke with are of the opinion that the PP and PSOE should start working together and leave their links with their political past behind; this should dissolve the political tension on this issue.

The fact that recovering memory practices in Chillón revolve around recovering the truth about what happened to the nine, has an influence on the opinions of our informants towards the continuation of recovering memory practices. They relate recovering memory practices to finding information about assassinated persons for relatives, to give them some form of closure. We found that most people agreed on a continuation of recovering memory practices, but without political engagement and in a more intimate form. They deem it important to know about these losses, but it is not as important for everyone on an individual level. People we spoke with who questioned the political intentions of these processes mentioned that they would prefer it if the exhumations would be carried out in more private spheres, we found this to be an understatement of what they truly thought about it. They kept mentioning that families have the right to exhume bodies of their relatives, but not in the way they have done it so far. We believe this is a dangerous aspect of the transitional justice paradigm (Ferrándiz 2011:533), because people who are opposed to recovering memory practices are unable to speak. We found out it was not really socially accepted to publicly

admit to be against recovery memory practices, otherwise they would be looked upon by the rest of the village. A lot of our informants are of the opinion that the responsibility to request an exhumation lies with the family and that the government, when it is financially possible, should provide them with financial support.

Our informants believe that the recovering of memory practices should continue, the changes they recommended left aside for a moment, in one form or another throughout Spain, because every family has a right to find out what happened to their relatives and rebury them. All of the older and in-between generational informants we spoke with were pleased with the interest these practices triggered, especially the exhumation, among the younger generation. A difference with before is that the youth now knows more about what happened in the past. So the transmittance of memory has been useful, what the youth does with it is up to them now. The older generation is glad about the fact that the younger generation showed more interest in their past. They now know what happened, which is considered important in making sure that history will not repeat itself. Soon there will be no more living eye-witnesses, so it is important that their interest was triggered before memories will be lost with the passing of time. Our overall finding is that people are positively about continuation of recovering memory practices as a form of education and closure.

The commemoration of the nine, which took place every first of May, will be held this year at the cemetery for the first time instead of the site '*El Contadero*'. This indicates that they still think it is important to remember what happened in Chillón in 1939. *Finca 'El Contadero'* will remain a site of remembrance because of the nine olive trees that have been planted there. For now at least, whether or not this place will remain a site of official remembrance depends on the owners of the *Finca*. As long as they permit to preserve this site, the nine olive trees will function as monumental objects. This will also depend on the willingness and efforts of the people from Chillón to preserve this place. These efforts will keep the recovered memories of the Francoist past alive at least for a while; whether or not the next generations will continue with the commemoration has to be seen. For now, the recovered memories of the Francoist past are part of the present in Chillón.

This conclusion can also be drawn from the existing idea for another book, by Jeronimo and Luis Miguel. They are planning on writing a book on the aftermath of the death of the nine, the impact their deaths have had on their families and the way the past events to recover memories affected these families. This shows that the need to do something with the new gained information after the exhumation is not yet perished. As long as some people have interest in keeping these memories alive, the recovered memories of the past will not get lost; for at least one more generation. What happens after that depends on the willingness of the next generation and if they try to transmit their knowledge about the Francoist past to their children.

Bibliography

Aguilar, P. and C. Humlebaek.

2002 'Collective Memory and National Identity in the Spanish Democracy: The Legacies of Francoism and the Civil War.' *History and Memory*, 14(1/2): 121-164.

Blanes, J.P.

2011 'There was a Time not so Long ago... Accounts and Aesthetics of Memory and Ideology of Reconciliation in Spain'. *Electronic Journal of Theory of Literature and Comparative Literature* 4:29-51.

Boeije, H.

2010 *Analysis in Qualitative Research*. London [etc.]:SAGE.

Carr, R.

2000 *Spain. A history*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Davis, M.

2005 'Is Spain Recovering its Memory? Breaking the Pacto del Olvido.' *Human Rights Quarterly*, 27(3): 858-880.

DeWalt, K. and B. DeWalt.

2011 *Participant Observation: A Guide for Fieldworkers*. Lanham [etc.]: Rowman and Littlefield.

Dwyer, S.

1999 'Reconciliation for Realists.' *Ethics & International Affairs*, 13(1): 81-98.

Encarnación, O.G.

2008 'Reconciliation after Democratization: Coping with the Past in Spain.' *Political Science Quarterly*, 123(3): 435-459.

2012 'Justice in Times of Transition: Lessons from the Iberian Experience' *International studies quarterly* 56(1): 179-200

Fernandez, I.

2011 "The Lives of Corpses: Narratives of the Image in American Memorial Photography". *Mortality: Promoting the interdisciplinary study of death and dying* 16:4, 343-364.

Fernández de Mata, I.

2008 'From Invisibility to Power: Spanish Victims and the Manipulation of their Symbolic Capital.' *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions* 9(2/3): 253-264.

Ferrándiz, F.

- 2006 'The Return of Civil War Ghosts: The Ethnography of Exhumations in Contemporary Spain.' *Anthropology Today* 22 (3): 7-13.
- 2008 'Cries and Whispers: Exhuming and Narrating Defeat in Spain Today.' *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 9 (2): 177-192. Cited in text as: (Ferrándiz 2008 a).
- 2008 'Digital Memory: The Visual Recording of Mass Grave Exhumations in Contemporary Spain.' *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9 (3): 1-23. Cited in text as: (Ferrándiz 2008 b).
- 2011 'Autopsia Social de un Subtiero'. *Isegoría: Revista de Filosofía Moral y Política* 45:525-544.

Goertz, K.

- 1998 'Transgenerational Representations of the Holocaust: From Memory to 'Post-Memory'. *World Literature Today* 72(1): 33-38

Green, L.

- 1994 'Fear as a Way of Life'. *Cultural Anthropology* 9 (2) 227-256.

Groves, T.

- 2012 'Everyday Struggles against Franco's Authoritarian Legacy: Pedagogical Social Movements and Democracy in Spain.' *Journal of social history* 46(2):305-334.

Hirsch, M.

- 2008 "The Generation of Postmemory". *Poetics Today* 29 (1): 103-127.

Igreja, V.

- 2008 'Memories as Weapons: The Politics of Peace and Silence in Post-Civil War Mozambique.' *Journal of Southern African Studies* 34(3):539-557.

Jacobs, J.

- 2011 'The Cross-Generational Transmission of Trauma: Ritual and Emotion among Survivors of the Holocaust.' *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 40(3): 342-361.

Jump, M.

- 2012 'The Role of Archives in the Movement for the Recovery of Historical Memory in Spain. La Rioja: A Regional Case Study.' *Journal of the Society of Archivists* 33(2):149-167.

Labanyi, J.

- 2008 'The Politics of Memory in Contemporary Spain.' *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 9 (2):119-125.

Larson, P.

- 2000 'Religion and Politics in Spain' (Book review) *Journal of church and state* 42(4):862-865.

Loureiro, A.G.

- 2008 'Pathetic Arguments'. *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 9 (2): 225-237.

McEvoy, K. and K. McConnachie.

- 2012 'Victimology in transition justice: Victimhood, innocence and hierarchy.' *European Journal of Criminology* 9(5):527-538.

Moon, C.

2012 'Who'll Pay Reparations on My Soul? Compensation, Social Control and Social Suffering.' *Social & Legal studies*, 21(2): 187-199.

Opotow, S.

2001 'Reconciliation in Times of Impunity: Challenges for Social Justice'. *Social Justice Research* 14 (2):149-170.

Ramsbotham et al.

2005 *Contemporary Conflict Resolution, the prevention, management and transformation of deadly conflicts* Cambridge UK: Polity Press

Renshaw, L.

2010 Missing Bodies Near-at-Hand: The dissonant Memory and Dormant Graves of the Spanish Civil War. In: *An Anthropology of Absence: Materializations of Transcendence and Loss*. Editors: Bille, M. F. Hastrup & Tim Flohr Soren. New York, Dordrecht, Heidelberg and London: Springer.

Rigby, A.

2000 'Amnesty and Amnesia in Spain' *Peace review* 12(1): 73-80

Scheper-Hughes, N. and Bourgois, P.

2004 *Violence in war and peace: An Anthology*. Malden, MA: Blackwell.

Schramm, K.

2011 'Introduction: Landscapes of Violence: Memory and Sacred Space'. *History and Memory* 23 (1): 5-22

Schwab, G.

2010 *Haunting Legacies: Violent Histories and Transgenerational Trauma*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Suzuki, S.

2012 'Overcoming Past Wrongs Committed by States: Can Non-state Actors Facilitate Reconciliation?' *Social & Legal Studies*, 21(2): 201-213.

Thompson, J.

2012 'Is Political Apology a Sorry Affair?' *Social & Legal Studies*, 21(2): 215-225.

Verdery, K.

1999 *The Political Lives of Dead Bodies: Reburial and Postsocialist Change*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Viejo-Rose, D.

2011 'Memorial functions: Intent, impact and the right to remember.' *Memory Studies* 4(1): 465-480.

Websites

ARMH

<http://www.memoriahistorica.org.es/joomla/>, Electronic source

Brounéus, K.

2003 Reconciliation –Theory and Practice for Development Cooperation. *SIDA online rapport: 1-80. Electronic document:*

http://www.pcr.uu.se/digitalAssets/18/18232_SIDA2982en_ReconWEB_brouneus.pdf

Las Políticas de la Memoria

<http://politicasdela memoria.org/>, Electronic source.

Kasten, J.

2013 ‘Campos de Heridas: Castile as Trauma Space in Post-Spanish Civil War Cultural Production’.

Electronic document, <http://www.inter-disciplinary.net/at-the-interface/wp-content/uploads/2013/02/kastentrpaper.pdf>, accessed May 8 2013.

Memoria pública

<http://www.publico.es/espana/403566/localizados-los-primeros-restos-de-nueve-fusilados-en-1939-en-chillon>. Electronic source, accessed January 15 2013.

Federación Estatal de Foros por la Memoria.

<http://www.foroporlamemoria.info/2011/11/el-psoe-de-chillon-considera-%E2%80%9Clamentable%E2%80%9D/>. Electronic source, accessed January 15 2013.

Appendixes

Appendix A: Letter for my Grandfather Pablo

A.1 Original Version in Spanish

CARTA A MI ABUELO PABLO

Ese día amaneció como uno más de los de aquel caluroso verano. El gallo cantó de nuevo en la Aurora y el sol salió por el horizonte una vez más. La vida, esa vida que te atrebataron tan pronto, fue surgiendo poco a poco de entre las casas y las calles, calles que han cambiado tanto desde que te fuiste.

Aquel día de agosto que nunca olvidaré, porque para mí es uno de los días más especiales de mi vida, llegamos a aquel apartado lugar en el campo, donde tú y tus compañeros permanecíais esperándonos desde hacía casi cincuenta años.

Recuerdo no oír nada, no cantaban las cigarras ni sentíamos el murmullo de los pájaros solo el silencio.

Te pedía que me dieras una señal, buscaba algún indicio que evidenciara tu presencia y de pronto las ví, juntas, como protegiéndose unas a otras y aisladas del resto de las que eran como ellas.

Nueve cepas se habrían pasado de entre la seca y arida tierra, gritando al mundo lo que encerraban en sus entrañas.

Confiaba que en un principio pensé que todo era fruto de la casualidad o de mi imaginación pero en pocos segundos ví un detalle que apartó todas mis dudas.

Una de aquellas cepas era más pequeña que las demás y de repente recordé lo que mi abuela siempre me había dicho desde que

era pequeña.

Uno de vosotros nueve era un chico de diecisiete años.

En ese instante supe que estabas allí, junto con tus ocho compañeros.

Al poco tiempo y en el mismo sitio, se colocó un monolito que honraba vuestra memoria y por fin, veintitres años después, se ha hecho justicia y vuestros cuerpos, una vez exhumados, van a ser trasladados a un lugar digno que muestre al mundo para siempre el terrible crimen cometido con vosotros y que dejó huérfanos a vuestras familias.

Hoy estamos aquí para plantar nueve árboles, nueve olivos que representan la vida y la esperanza.

La vida que no podísteis disfrutar y la esperanza que todos tenemos de que algo tan salvaje y atroz, sucedido en este mismo lugar hace setenta y tres años no vuelva a repetirse nunca jamás.

Hasta siempre abuelo, descansa en paz con tus compañeros.

Quiero dar las gracias a todas las personas que han hecho que este sueño sea una realidad. En especial a Julia y Paula Toledo, ~~Luis~~ Higuel y Jerónimo.

M^e José Gómez Mochuel

nieta de Pablo Mochuel Amaro.

A.2 Translation in English¹⁴⁵

Letter for my grandfather Pablo

This day began like one of many other warm summer days. The rooster sang/crowed during the dawn and the sun arose on the horizon once more. Life, this life, which snatched so early and was emerging little by little through the houses and the streets; which have changed so much since you left them. A regular day in August, one I will never forget, because this was one of the most special days in my life, we arrived at a place on the countryside, where you and your comrades remained, waiting for more than fifty years. I remember not hearing anything, not even the crickets, not even the humming of birds, only silence. They asked me if I noticed a mark, we were looking for any indication of evidence of your presence and soon I saw it, together, protecting each other, isolated from the rest of the world. Nine strains in the dry earth, screaming at the world that it would find them. I confess that at first I thought that it was only my imagination, but a few seconds later I saw a detail that took my doubts away. One of the strains was smaller than the other ones and at once I remembered something my grandmother had always told me since I was little. One of you nine was a seventeen year old boy. At this moment I knew you were here, together with your eight comrades. Soon, at this place, they placed a monolith to honour your memory and finally, twenty-three years later, justice has been done and your bodies had been exhumed. You are going to be transferred to a decent place, where you can show the world forever the horrible crime that has been committed to you and left orphans in your families. Today we are here to place nine trees, nine olive trees which represent life and hope. Life, that you have not been able to enjoy and the hope we all have that something this fierce and awful, like what happened at this place seventy-three years ago, will never repeat itself again. Until forever grandfather, rest in peace with your comrades. I would like to thank every person that made this dream reality. Especially Julia and Paula Toledano, Luis-Miguel and Jerónimo.

Maria-José Gòmez Madrid,

grand-daughter of Pablo Madrid Amaro.

¹⁴⁵ Rough translation of free interpretation from Spanish to English by Sanne Terpstra & Diede Versteegen

Appendix B: Illustrative Photographs

Photograph One



A photograph taken by Maria-Jesus on 08-11-2011, during the exhumation in Chillón. She handed this picture to us on 27-03-2013. On this picture you can see the volunteers from the ARMH excavating the bones. Their expertise and precision is apparent in this picture.

Photograph Two



Picture of the Monolith located on top of the former mass grave, at *finca 'El Contadero'*. The plaque with the names of the nine and their photographs can now be found at the cemetery, where the nine were reburied.

Electronic

source:

<http://www.memoriahistorica.org.es/joomla/index.php/component/content/article/1-ultimasnoticias/341-localizan-una-fosa-en-chillon-ciudad-real-con-nueve-hombres-asesinados-el-3-de-junio-de-1939>, picture taken on 26-10-2011 by Europe Press.

Photograph Three



Picture we retrieved from city hall database, we received this picture 13-03-2013 which was taken on 01-05-2012. On this picture the Mayor speaks at 'La Verbena' to commemorate the nine. As you can see, each coffin with the remains of the nine has a paper on it with pictures of the nine. This has been done because of the fact that the remains cannot be identified separately. Therefore the nine have been buried together as well, which you can see on the next photograph.

Photograph Four



We retrieved this picture from the city hall database on 13-03-2013. This picture was taken at the cemetery of Chillón during the reburial of the first of May 2012. You can see the same plaque, which has been taken from the taken-down monolith. Next to the grave you can see the coffins, which contain the remains of the nine. The nine now rest together in this grave.

Photograph Five



We took this picture ourselves on the 3th of March 2013, at the site of '*El Contadero*'. Juli took us to visit the former mass grave, on which nine olive trees have been planted. In the root of each olive tree a letter, written by a relative of one of the nine, has been placed. An example of such a letter can be found in Appendix A.

Photograph Six



We retrieved this picture from the town hall database on 13-03-2013, the picture was taken on 07-11-2011. On this picture you can see remains of the nine including material objects. Seeing the remains personalized the nine for a lot of our informants and told their story.

Photograph Seven



We retrieved this picture from the town hall database on 13-03-2013, the picture was taken on 05-11-2011. This picture is an overview of the nine in their former mass grave. The impact of the picture has a great effect on us; we cannot even imagine the impact it must have had on people who witnessed the exhumation in real life.

Appendix C: Research Summary

C.1 Summary in English

Summary of the Thesis written by Sanne Terpstra and Diede Verstegen:

Terpstra, S. & D.D.G. Verstegen.

2013 'Spain at a Crossroads: The Aftermath of Recovering Memory Practices in a Rural Village in Spain, a Generational Case Study of Chillón.'

This thesis focusses on the aftermath of various practices concerned with recovering memories of the Francoist past in Spain, Chillón. By Francoist past we mean the Spanish Civil War (1936-1939) and the following Franco regime (1939-1975). Our findings are based on ten weeks of fieldwork, conducted between the 4th of February and the 12th of April 2013. One of our goals was to gain insight in the lives of people dealing with recovering memories of the Francoist past in contemporary Spain. Another goal was to see how several recovering memory practices, in particular the carried out exhumation in 2011, have been of influence, and might still be, on our informant's opinions concerning this topic. Our overall goal was to find out differences and similarities for different generations, concerning the recovering of memories of the Francoist past. We divided our informants in three different generations: the youngest, in-between and oldest generation. The main question of our thesis is; *'How do people from different generations, living in Chillón, Spain, recall various practices concerned with recovering memories of the Francoist past and how did these practices shape their present opinions concerning the revival of this past in the present?'*

This research will provide some insight in the perceived necessity of the recovering memory practices in Chillón. Whether it has been necessary according to our informants and whether they feel the need to continue with recovering memories in Spain. It also addresses the notion of temporality, concerning recovering memories of the Francoist past, in the eyes of several generations.

Recovering memories of the Francoist past in Chillón seems to revolve around the history of the nine assassinated republicans in 1939, which were killed a few months after the Spanish civil war ended. This history is of particular importance to the people living in Chillón because it is their own local history. Living together in such a small village means that everyone knows everything about each other, which political side families supported during and after the Spanish civil war and their pursuits at the time. They were not able to talk about these issues in public for a long time. During our time in Chillón, we found that people created a habitat in which they could live peacefully

together by not talking about politics or referring to past events in public and therefore avoiding confrontations. The period of transition towards a democracy, after Franco died in 1975, opened up conversations about the past, but a lot of people were still too scared to talk about it, especially older generations. Talking openly about your political preferences had been dangerous and a taboo for a long period of time; this fear decreased but is still present.

The presence of the mass grave, where the nine were buried, at the property called *finca 'El Contadero'* helped keeping the Francoist past a part of the present in Chillón for over seventy years. After the placing of a monolith at this site, in 1987, lots of people visited this place each year at the first of May to commemorate the loss of the nine by placing floral wreaths. Another event concerning the recovering of memory about the nine was a book, published in 2009, about the nine prior to their assassination on the third of June 1939. People who read it got to know more about the lives of the nine, which made them become more 'alive' in the eyes of the readers. The stories and photographs in it diminished the distance and facilitated the identification and affiliation with the past. For a lot of our informants the exhumation was the most important aspect of recovering memory. Finding out what has happened to the nine and the ceremony of the reburial were considered important in order to find closure and deal with the past.

We found that the way people talk or remain silent about the Francoist past reveals their political view on how to deal with this past. On a familial level, it reveals how the oldest generation experienced the past and which memories they deem important, or not, to share with the younger generations about the Francoist past and why. The memories that are transmitted reveal present day attitudes our informants have towards the past. The interaction between each generation is of importance, but especially the in-between generation is meaningful, because they form the link between the oldest and youngest generation; between the lived and inherited past. We found that the knowledge the younger generation possesses about the Francoist past depends on the stories and information they received from their grandparents, parents and or other people they spoke with about this in combination with the events that have taken place.

Especially for our informants of the oldest generation the political background people have is of great importance, because of the link politics still have with the Francoist past. For the younger generation friendships are no longer based on political backgrounds. The older generation has become milder when it comes to friendships and interfamilial relations between people with different political backgrounds, they feel comfortable with it as long as they do not engage in conversations about the Francoist past in relation to politics. After the exhumation, talking about the past and what happened to the nine moved from within the household towards the streets. Pieces of information, provided by the exhumation, were needed to construct a "more complete" narrative around these deaths. We found family histories to be important for the recovering of memories,

because other sources to draw information from are scarce. When parents or grandparents choose not to tell their (grand) children about the past these will not develop an awareness of the Francoist past and this history will eventually fall into oblivion.

Exhumations are inseparably linked to the recovering of memory and the political situation, because the fact that the nine died a political death cannot be overlooked. Concerning the issue of the recovering of memory, including the exhumations, the PP and PSOE differ a lot. This indicates that the political background of these parties, the clear political division between left and right, presents itself when it comes to discussing themes concerning the recovering of the past. We experienced for ourselves that we could not talk about everything concerning recovering memory, we had to take into account some political sensitivity concerning this topic. At first it seemed that the people from this village are dealing openly with their past, but we found that not everything is out in the open, there are still things left unsaid and unknown.

Interest in recovering memories, during the exhumation, turned out to be of a transitory nature. Even though the younger generation lost interest in learning more about the Francoist past after the effect of the exhumation wore off, it does not indicate that they did not value the exhumation process in itself. When looking back all our informants emphasized the meaning the exhumation had for family members. Whether the exhumations are something that should be seen as a political or more of a family matter is indecisive. Most are of the opinion that the exhumation should be, politically spoken, seen detached from its past.

The fact that recovering memory practices in Chillón revolve around recovering the truth about what happened to the nine shapes the opinions of our informants towards the continuation of recovering memory practices. They relate recovering memory practices to finding information about assassinated persons for relatives, to give them some form of closure. We found that most people agreed on continuation with practices concerned with the recovering of memories, but without political engagement and in a more intimate form. We found that it was not really socially accepted to publicly admit to be against recovery memory practices; otherwise they would be looked upon by the rest of the village. A lot of our informants are of the opinion that the responsibility to request an exhumation lies with the family and that the government, when that is financially possible, should provide them with financial support. All of the older and in-between generational informants we spoke with were pleased with the interest these practices triggered, especially the exhumation, among the younger generation. A difference with before is that the youth now knows more about what happened in the past. So the transmittance of memory has been useful, what the youth does with it is up to them.

For now, the recovered memories of this past are part of the present in Chillon because of the commemoration of the nine every first of May and the olive trees that are planted in remembrance of the nine at *finca 'El Contadero'*. This conclusion can also be drawn from the existing idea for another book; on the aftermath of the death of the nine, the impact their deaths have had on their families and the way the past events to recover memories affected these families as well. This shows that the need to do something with the new gained information after the exhumation is not yet perished. As long as some people have interest in keeping these memories alive, the recovered memories of the past will not get lost; for at least one more generation. What will happen after that depends on the willingness of the next generation and if they will try to transmit their knowledge about the Francoist past to their children.

C.2 Resúmen En Español

Resumen de la tesis escrito por Sanne Terpstra y Diede Verstegen:

Terpstra, S. & D.D.G. Verstegen.

2013 'Los Dilemas de España: Las Consecuencias de las Prácticas para la Recuperación de la Memoria en un Pueblo Rural en España. Un Estudio Generacional Acerca del Caso 'Chillón'.

En esta tesis se centra en las repercusiones las varias prácticas relacionadas con la recuperación de las memorias del pasado franquista en España, en el pueblo de Chillón. El término 'franquista' refiere a la Guerra Civil Española (1936-1939) y el subsecuente régimen de Franco en la posguerra (1939-1975). Nuestros hallazgos se basan en los trabajos de campo realizados dentro de un período de diez semanas, entre el cuatro de febrero y el doce de abril de 2013. Uno de los objetivos era acercarnos a la percepción de la gente que trata a diario en sus vidas con la recuperación de la memoria franquista en la España contemporánea. Otro objetivo era comprobar la influencia que han ejercido y, según los entrevistados, puede que sigan ejerciendo varias prácticas de recuperación de la memoria; en particular la exhumación llevada a cabo en 2011. La meta principal era identificar las diferencias y similitudes entre las diferentes generaciones en cuanto a la recuperación de la memoria del pasado franquista. Por eso hemos dividido nuestro grupo meta en tres distintas generaciones: los jóvenes, los mayores de la generación intermedia y la generación de edad avanzada. La pregunta principal de la tesis es: *'¿De qué manera rememoran la gente de las diferentes generaciones, del pueblo de Chillón, las varias prácticas de recuperación de la memoria del pasado franquista, y de qué modo estas prácticas afectan las opiniones actuales en cuanto al resurgimiento de este pasado en el presente?'*

Este estudio hace una imagen de algunos aspectos de la percibida necesidad de las prácticas de la memoria restablecida en el pueblo de Chillón y acerca esta sensación de necesidad desde el punto de vista de los informantes, y pregunta si esta necesidad de recuperar las memorias sigue existiendo en la España contemporánea. Además, la investigación discute el concepto de temporalidad en la recuperación de las memorias desde la perspectiva de varias generaciones.

En Chillón, la recuperación de memorias del pasado franquista parece girar en torno a la historia de los nueve republicanos asesinados en 1939, tan solo unos meses después de que acabara la Guerra Civil. Los habitantes de Chillón conceden valor a esta historia en particular ya que se trata de su propia historia local. Vivir juntos en un pueblecito tan pequeño significa que todo el mundo se conoce muy bien, desde el bando político al que apoyaba cada familia durante y tras la guerra civil hasta las persecuciones de la época. Los pueblerinos no podían hablar sobre este temas en público

durante mucho tiempo. Durante nuestra estancia en Chillón, descubrimos que la gente ha creado un entorno en el que puede vivir juntos y en paz, evitando conversar sobre política o hechos del pasado en público para no dar lugar a enfrentamientos. En el periodo de la transición, tras la muerte de Franco en 1975, la gente tenía la posibilidad de hablar sobre el pasado. Sin embargo, aún había mucha gente que tenía demasiado miedo de hablar sobre este tema, especialmente entre las generaciones de la edad avanzada. Expresar sus preferencias políticas han constituido un tema peligroso y tabú durante muchos años. Este miedo sigue disminuyendo con el tiempo, pero aún está presente hoy en día.

La presencia de la fosa común donde los nueve fueron enterrados, en una finca que se llama *'El Contadero'*, ha contribuido a mantener el pasado franquista como parte del presente de Chillón durante más de 70 años. Desde de la realización de un túmulo en el terreno de la fosa común en 1987, mucha gente visita este lugar año tras año para llevar coronas de flores y conmemorar de esta manera la pérdida de los nueve. Otro acontecimiento que recupera la memoria de los nueve es un libro publicado en 2009; sobre la vida de los nueve hasta el momento del asesinato, el tres de junio de 1939. Las personas que lo han leído aprendieron más sobre las vidas de los nueve, haciendo que estos permanecieran aún más 'vivos' a los ojos de los lectores. Los cuentos y las fotos disminuyen la distancia y facilitan la identificación y afiliación con el pasado. Una gran parte de los informantes del presente estudio considera la excavación como el aspecto más importante la recuperación de la memoria histórica. Conocer la historia personal de los nueve caídos y la ceremonia del entierro son los dos factores más significativos para que los pueblerinos puedan conformarse con el pasado.

Además, hemos descubierto que la manera en la que la gente habla, o guarda silencio, sobre el pasado franquista nos revela su opinión política y muestra la manera de conformarse con el pasado. En el nivel de la familia, nos revela cómo vivieron este pasado las generaciones mayores y cuáles son los recuerdos más importantes, o los que no tienen importancia para compartir con las generaciones más jóvenes. La memoria transmitida revela la actitud que tienen nuestros entrevistados hacia el pasado. La interacción intra-generacional es de gran relevancia. Especialmente la generación intermedia es muy significativo como forman un enlace entre la generación más vieja y la más joven; entre el pasado vivo y el pasado heredado. Hemos constatado que el conocimiento de la generación más joven tiene de está sujeto depende de la información y los cuentos transmitida por sus abuelos, sus padres y otros individuos de su entorno social, en combinación con los acontecimientos más recientes en la sociedad.

La orientación de la gente de Chillón resulta de gran importancia, especialmente para la generación más mayor, dado el vínculo entre la política y el pasado franquista. En cuanto a la generación más joven se observa que las amistades ya no se basan en afiliaciones políticas. La generación mayor parece ser más tolerante en este caso con respecto a las amistades y relaciones

interfamiliares. Este grupo se siente más comfortable a condición de que no se relacionen el pasado con las opiniones políticas durante una conversación. Tras de la exhumación, las conversaciones sobre el período franquista y las historias de los nueve caídos pasaron de los hogares a las calles. La información recopilada de la exhumación ayudo a reconstruir una narración 'más completa' de los muertos. Los antecedentes familiares, y sus historias familiares, fueron de vital importancia para la recuperación de las memorias, dado que otras fuentes sobre este tema resultaron insuficientes. En el caso de que los padres o los abuelos decidan no contar el pasado a sus hijos o nietos, no se desarrolla la conciencia sobre el pasado franquista y por tanto esta memoria histórica cae en el olvido.

A menudo se consideran las excavaciones inherentes a la recuperación de la memoria histórica y la situación política. La situación política debido al hecho de los nueve, ya que una muerte política no puede pasarse por alto. En cuanto el debate sobre la recuperación de la memoria, incluidas las exhumaciones, el PP y el PSOE son muy distintos. Esto indica que el fondo político de los partidos, la clara división política entre la derecha y la izquierda, surge en las discusiones sobre la recuperación del pasado por ejemplo. Durante nuestra estancia hemos sentido a veces que no pudimos discutir libremente sobre todos los temas de la recuperación de la memoria histórica. Existía la necesidad de adaptar una actitud susceptible concerniente este asunto político. Al principio nos parecía que los habitantes del pueblo de Chillón se tratan el pasado a cara descubierta, después fuimos deduciendo que no todo se ha sacado a luz y que aún queda mucho por decir y por saber.

El interés en la recuperación de las memorias durante la exhumación, resultó tener un carácter transitorio. A pesar de que los jóvenes perdieron el interés en aprender algo más sobre la historia franquista cuando los efectos de la exhumación se hubieron disipado, esto no significa que no valoraran el proceso de la excavación en sí mismo. Todos los informantes de nuestro estudio hicieron hincapié en el significado simbólico de la exhumación por sus familias. Si tenemos considerar las exhumaciones como un hecho político o como un asunto de familia es un caso indeciso, pero la mayoría considera que la exhumación debería ser vista y debatida como un evento independiente y desvinculado de su pasa, especialmente políticamente.

El hecho que las prácticas de la recuperación de la memoria en Chillón giren en torno a recuperar la verdad sobre la muerte de los nueve caídos, esto influye en gran medida las opiniones de los informantes concernientes la continuación de estas prácticas. Los informantes relacionan estas prácticas y la información disponible sobre los asesinados con la historia personal de su propia familia, lo que sirve para cerrar la puerta del pasado. Concluimos que la mayoría de la gente estaba de acuerdo en que se continuara con las prácticas, pero de manera más íntima y sin vinculación política alguna. También llegamos a la conclusión de que no está del todo aceptado socialmente pronunciarse en contra de las prácticas de recuperación de la memoria, y que, de hacerlo en público, uno se expone a la desaprobación por parte de los demás en el pueblo. Una gran parte de los

informantes opina que la responsabilidad de solicitar una exhumación es el derecho de la familia, y que el gobierno la debe apoyo económico siempre que sea posible. Los otros informantes de la generación intermedia y la generación mayor están contentos con el efecto de las prácticas de la recuperación para los intereses entre los jóvenes; especialmente la exhumación. La diferencia es que ahora la juventud sabe más sobre los hechos pasados que antes, lo que presenta el éxito de la transferencia de memoria. Ahora el poder está en las manos de los jóvenes.

A día de hoy, la recuperación de las memorias forma parte del presente de Chillón, gracias a la conmemoración de los nueve caídos cada primero de mayo y a los olivares que se han plantado en la finca '*El Contadero*' como recuerdo simbólico. Esta conclusión se puede extraer también de que ya se habla de publicar otro libro sobre las consecuencias de la muerte de los nueve republicanos, el impacto de su muerte para las familias, y la manera en que los acontecimientos pasados apuntan a la recuperación de la memoria también han afectado a estas familias. Esto demuestra que todavía sigue existiendo la necesidad de hacer algo con la nueva información para que siga existiendo en la sociedad tras de la exhumación. Mientras haya la gente interesada en mantener vivos estos recuerdos, no se pierdan las memorias recuperado; al menos durante una generación más. Lo que pasará en el futuro depende de la voluntad de la siguiente generación por seguir transmitiendo su conocimiento sobre el pasado franquista a sus hijos.